

FRAMING INDO-PAK RELATIONS IN PAKISTANI AND INDIAN PRESS POST ABROGATION OF ARTICLE 370 & 35A BY INDIA

Abstract

The study addresses the media framing of Indo-Pak relations after the abrogation of the Article 370 & 35A analyzing the framing of Pakistani and Indian media on the issues including Abrogation of Special Status of Kashmir; Curfew & Human Rights; Protests for the rights of Kashmiris; Cross-Border insurgency; Bilateral trade; Dialogue/Diplomacy and Nuclear threats. The issues are analyzed in context of war and peace framing applying framing theory using content analysis method. Pakistani and Indian newspapers framed the issues in the contexts which suits their government and the nation's narratives as in Pakistan the people were having reservations and they were annoyed over the Indian act but Indian media presented it in peace frame. A harsh tone was there in Pakistani media over the curfew and violations of the human rights whereas the Indian media considered this as a big achievement and supported the act of the Indian government. Pakistan despite the displeasing act of India which also challenged the regional security, urged to support the bilateral trade and normalization of the relations but contrary to this Indian media entirely opposed to have bilateral trade and normalizing the relations favoring war framing.

Keywords: Article 370, Indo-Pak, Kashmir, Trade, Dialogue, War, Peace

Introduction

Media is considered as a key stakeholder in almost all the matters of public concern and it plays a great role to inform the people about the happenings around the globe (Ali & Shahid, 2012). Media pays lot of importance to the Indo-Pak relations as this is a matter of regional peace and security on one end whereas the global peace is also linked with the peaceful India and Pakistan on the other. The media coverage or reporting about Pakistan and India is analyzed in the context of war and peace journalism (Ahmed, 2014; Saleem, 2017 and Yousaf, Elahi & Adnan, 2018). Studies on the media framing and coverage of the Indo-Pak relations is conducted by various researchers and scholars and their key focus remained Kashmir issue/conflict (Riaz & Pasha, 2010; Yousaf, Yousafzai & Ali, 2013; Ali, 2017; Zaheer, 2017; Yousaf, Elahi & Adnan, 2018; Bukhari and Din, 2018 and Nadaf, 2018).

Background and Literature Review

Pakistan and India are having a long history, both remained as a single entity named Sub-Continent but after the partition of the Sub-Continent Pakistan and India became two separate countries (Hussain, 2019). Both are two largest nations in South Asia which are having long history of wars and conflicts as well (Riaz & Pasha, 2010). An environment of distrust has been observed between Pakistan and India (Sattar, 2005). There was a dream to witness a prosperous and peaceful region but unfortunately this dream could not come true due to the regional conflicts (Arif, 1994). Media being an important stake holder is having deep influence over the matters in both countries. It played a role in promoting the war and peace journalism in the region as well (Yousaf, Elahi & Adnan, 2018).

The history is full of conflicts between both Pakistan and India, both went into the wars and conflicts after independence. The issue of Kashmir which has caused the confrontations between both the countries, even the wars started over this issue (Yousaf, Yousafzai & Ali, 2013; Ahmed, 2014; Yousaf, Elahi & Adnan, 2018 and Malik,

* Dr. Zahid Yousaf Chairperson / Associate Professor, Centre for Media & Communication Studies, University of Gujrat, Gujrat, Pakistan

** Dr. M. Haseeb Sarwar, Coordinator / Lecturer, Department of Mass Communication & Media, University of Narowal, Narowal. Pakistan

*** Maryam Sabir, Associate Lecturer, Department of English, University of Narowal, Narowal.

**** Ehtisham Ali, Associate Lecturer, Department of Mass Communication & Media, University of Narowal, Narowal. Pakistan

2019). The war between Pakistan and India started in September 1965, the reason was again Kashmir primarily, Indian forces tried to enter into Pakistani territory violating the international borders but was contained by Pakistani armed forces which led to the Indian defeat at the end (Sattar, 2007 and Malik, 2019).

General elections in Pakistan held in 1970 in its two wings East and West Pakistan and a serious conflict on the basis to attain power started between the leadership of both the wings which resulted in a serious conflict between East and West Pakistan, this was the time India intervened in the internal matters of Pakistan. India supported the East Pakistan which resulted into a war between India and Pakistan. Pakistan lost its Eastern wing due to Indian intervention and more than ninety thousand Pakistani soldiers were made prisoners of war by India (Zaidi, 2017). During 1980s India and Pakistan confronted various times as India tried to capture Siachen glacier in 1984 as result Pakistan sent its forces to counter any type of Indian action in the region, India started Brasstacks exercises during the years 1986-87 as result Pakistan deployed more forces on the borders (Sattar, 2005). In last half of 1980s Pakistan and India came in confrontation due to Kashmir issue and the preparations of war were ongoing during the year 1990 (Chari, Cheema & Cohen, 2007). The year 1999 witnessed the Kargil conflict when both India and Pakistan and circumstances became worst once again (Malik, 2019). In December 2001 attack were made on the Indian parliament and India blamed Pakistan for the attacks which resulted the worse relations (Symond, 2001 and Chari, Cheema and Cohen, 2007).

During 2002 a military standoff was witnessed between the two nations (Khan, 2005). In the year 2008 Mumbai attacks took place resulting the loss of hundreds of people, India blamed Pakistan for the attacks. Surgical strikes were also claimed by India to show her power to Pakistan whereas the cross border attacks and firing was also going on between the two countries (Malik, 2019). During 2016 Indian Air Base at Pathankot attacked and India blamed Pakistan for this attack but after the investigations no Pakistani involvement found. In 2016 Uri attacks were made in India and Pakistan was blamed for this attack which put Kashmir issue on backdrop. In 2016 an Indian serving officer named Kalbhushan Jhadev who was working as a spy in Pakistan captured by Pakistan and he confessed that he has been involved in spreading terrorism in Pakistan (Bukhari & Din, 2018). In February 2019 attack was made in Pulwama, Indian occupied Kashmir which resulted killings of Indian soldiers, India blamed Pakistan for the attacks (Abdullah, 2019). In February 2019 India claimed for launching surgical strikes in Pakistani territory and during same month Pakistan destroyed two Indian fighter jets and arrested one pilot as well while crossing the Pakistani borders (Marlow, 2019). Pakistan left the arrested pilot later on as a good will gesture and peace promotion in the region (Das & Naqash, 2019).

Indo-Pak relations during different time periods as Yousaf, Elahi & Adnan (2018) focused to study the Indo-Pak relations in the context of war and peace framing where the key issues of conflict between the two countries were discussed including the Kashmir issue as most important. The study was conducted by analyzing the framing of the newspapers from Pakistan and India concluding that the Pakistani and Indian press focused on war journalism predominantly. Zaheer (2017) while discussing the coverage of Kashmir issue in Pakistani English dailies says that the focus of the Pakistani media was war oriented. While discussing the Kashmir, terrorism, border issues, water crisis in the national Pakistani English dailies a negative coverage is observed whereas on the issues like trade and economy relatively positive coverage is given by the Pakistani dailies (Yousaf, Yousafzai and Ali, 2013). Ali (2017) presented the framing analysis of the elite Pakistani and Indian press focusing on the Kashmir issue where Indian press focused on the internal security matters whereas Pakistani press focused on the human rights issue.

Kashmir issue and Article 370 & 35A

Kashmir issue is termed as a bone of contention between Pakistan and India which has been a base for the worst relations between the two countries (Singh, 2017 and Malik, 2019). According to Malik (2019) India and Pakistan fought the first war after the annexation of the valley with India by the Hindu ruler of a Muslim majority Kashmir in October 1947 when the Kashmiris rejected the decision of the annexation with India and uprisings in the valley started as result India sent her troops in the valley which later on turned as a serious conflict between Pakistan and India resulting a war like situation in 1948. The situation normalized after the intervention of the United Nations during the same year when the valley was divided into two parts and the control was given to both Pakistan and India but both claimed to have full right of control over the entire Kashmir valley (Hussain, 2000 and Malik, 2019).

The Pakistani administrated Kashmir is enjoying all the rights and no restriction is implemented in the region whereas in Indian occupied Kashmir people are living in vulnerable condition (Shahid, 2018). Article 370 was the base of the accession of Kashmir to join the Indian Union at the time of partition. The article 370 ensures the special status of Kashmir where the law of the citizenship, the property ownership along with the other fundamental rights which no other Indian was entitled to enjoy.

Article 35A allows the legislature of the Jammu and Kashmir the powers to decide about the permanent residency of the people in Jammu and Kashmir and allows the special privileges for the property accusation, jobs,

settlement and scholarships etc. in the state of Jammu and Kashmir. The article also allows to implement restrictions on the non-residents of the state. The articles provided special powers and status to the people of the valley to protect the rights of the residents of the valley (The Hans India, February 9, 2017; Joshi, 2019; Aljazeera, August 5, 2019; Business Standard, August 5, 2019; Geo, August 5, 2019). The article 370 and 35A was removed by the Indian government on August 5, 2019 removing the special status of Kashmir (India Today, August 5, 2019) which opened a new debate and wave of protests across the valley (Aggarwal, 2019; India Today, August 16, 2019 and Business Standard, September 2, 2019).

The objectives of the study are to analyze Abrogation of Special Status of Kashmir; Curfew & Human Rights issue; Protests for the rights of Kashmiris; Cross-Border insurgency; Bilateral trade; Dialogue/Diplomacy and Nuclear threats.

Hypotheses

- H1: Abrogation of Special Status of Kashmir (Article 370 & 35A) is framed in context of war framing by Pakistani newspapers whereas peace framing by Indian newspapers.
- H2: Curfew and Human Rights issue is framed in context of war framing by Pakistani newspapers whereas peace framing by Indian newspapers.
- H3: Protests for Rights of Kashmiris is framed in context of peace framing by Pakistani newspapers whereas war framing by Indian newspapers.
- H4: Cross-Border insurgency is framed in context of war framing by Pakistani and Indian newspapers
- H5: Bilateral trade is framed in context of peace framing by Pakistani newspapers whereas war framing by Indian newspapers.
- H6: Dialogue/Diplomacy/Normalization of Relations peace framing by Pakistani newspapers whereas war framing by Indian newspapers.

Framing theory

The study employs framing concept where the framing of the Indo-Pak relations will be analyzed. The concept has the roots in (Goffman, 1974) framing analysis where the events and incidents were conceptualized in the form of frames. The concept of framing clears that how different issues related to the study are framed as framing allows to analyze the particular narratives by creating the pictures of images of the events through the media coverage (Entman, 2006). The studies by various scholars on Indo-Pak relations already used the frame analysis to analyze the framing of Indo-Pak relations (Yousaf, Yousafzai & Ali, 2013; Ahmed, 2014; Zaheer, 2017 and Yousaf, Elahi & Adnan, 2018) used the framing concept while analyzing the Indo-Pak relations.

Methodology

Content Analysis method is used for the study which allows both qualitative and quantitative analysis of the text or content (Sarantakos, 1988 and Yousaf & Ali, 2012). The study using content analysis allows to be objective and work in a systematic manner to measure the content in both quantitative and qualitative manners (Berelson, 1952). The study is aimed to analyze Indo-Pak relations after the abrogation of the Articles 370 and 35A by the Indian government which eliminate the special status of Kashmir and Pakistan and India faced worst relations once again. The time period of the study is from August 5, 2019 to October 4, 2019. The News Stories on the front pages of the English national dailies from Pakistan and India are analyzed where the Daily Dawn and The News are selected from Pakistan whereas Times of India and India Today are selected from India. The key issues/categories focused by the selected dailies include the following.

- A. Abrogation of Special Status of Kashmir (Article 370 & 35A)
- B. Curfew and Human Rights issue
- C. Protests for Rights of Kashmiris
- D. Cross-Border insurgency
- E. Bilateral trade
- F. Dialogue/Diplomacy/Normalization of Relations

The above mentioned issues/categories are framed in the context of War framing, Peace framing and Balanced/Mixed stance. The stance falls under war framing if there is a context of mistrust and war like situation having no debate for peace process whereas it falls under peace framing if there is a stance towards normalization of the circumstances between the two countries.

Findings

| Newspaper | Daily Dawn | | The News | | Times of India | | India Today | |
|-----------|------------|-----|----------|-----|----------------|-----|-------------|-----|
| | Peace | War | Peace | War | Peace | War | Peace | War |
| Frame | | | | | | | | |

| | | | | | | | | |
|-------------------------------------------------------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|
| Abrogation of Special Status of Kashmir (Article 370 & 35A) | 4 (4.5%) | 17 (19.1%) | 2 (2.7%) | 9 (12%) | 7 (10.9%) | 4 (6.2%) | 12 (14.8%) | 4 (4.9%) |
| Curfew and Human Rights issue | 0 (0.00%) | 11 (12.4%) | 2 (2.7%) | 10 (13.3%) | 12 (18.8%) | 2 (3.1%) | 16 (19.8%) | 3 (3.7%) |
| Protests for Rights of Kashmiris | 18 (20.2%) | 1 (1.1%) | 15 (24.0%) | 3 (4.0%) | 4 (6.2%) | 7 (10.9%) | 5 (6.2%) | 13 (16.0%) |
| Cross-Border insurgency | 3 (3.4%) | 9 (10.1%) | 4 (5.3%) | 12 (16.0%) | 2 (3.1%) | 6 (9.4%) | 3 (3.8%) | 10 (12.5%) |
| Bilateral trade | 8 (9.0%) | 3 (3.4%) | 6 (8.0%) | 4 (5.3%) | 1 (1.6%) | 7 (10.9%) | 1 (3.1%) | 8 (15.6%) |
| Dialogue/Diplomacy/Normalization of Relations | 12 (13.5%) | 3 (3.4%) | 6 (100%) | 1 (1.3%) | 2 (3.1%) | 10 (15.6%) | 0 (0.0%) | 5 (6.2%) |

Table shows that the Pakistani newspapers have given more war framing on Abrogation of Special Status of Kashmir (Article 370 & 35A); Curfew and Human Rights issue and Cross-Border insurgency whereas peace framing towards Protests for Rights of Kashmiris; Bilateral trade and Dialogue/Diplomacy/Normalization of Relations. As compared to the Pakistani newspapers the Indian newspapers has given more war framing towards Protests for Rights of Kashmiris; Protests for Rights of Kashmiris; Bilateral trade and Dialogue/ Diplomacy and Normalization of Relations. Indian newspapers have given more peace framing towards Abrogation of Special Status of Kashmir and Curfew and Human Rights issue.

Test Statistics (Chi-Square)

| Category | A | B | C | D | E | F | |
|----------------|------------|--------------------|---------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| Daily Dawn | Chi-Square | 8.048 ^a | 15.211 ^b | 3.000 ^c | 2.273 ^d | 5.400 ^e | - |
| | Sig. | .005 | .000 | .083 | .132 | .020 | - |
| The News | Chi-Square | 4.455 ^d | 10.714 ^a | 4.000 ^f | .400 ^g | 1.800 ^h | 5.333 ^c |
| | Sig. | .035 | .001 | .046 | .527 | .180 | .021 |
| Times of India | Chi-Square | .818 ^d | .818 ^d | 2.000 ⁱ | 4.500 ⁱ | 5.333 ^c | 7.143 ^j |
| | Sig. | .366 | .366 | .157 | .034 | .021 | .008 |
| India Today | Chi-Square | 4.000 ^f | 3.556 ^k | 4.571 ^j | 5.444 ^l | - | 8.895 ^b |
| | Sig. | .046 | .059 | .033 | .020 | - | .003 |

Table shows the statistical significance of the results for the selected issues/categories where most of the results shows statistical significance as $p \leq 0.05$

Discussion

The study analyzed the Framing Indo-Pak Relations in Pakistani and Indian Press Post Abrogation of Article 370 & 35A by India. It aimed to analyze that how the major issues related to the Indo-Pak relations are framed by Pakistani and Indian English dailies for the period of two months i.e. from August 5, 2019 to October 4, 2019 as Pakistan and India both came on the front foot against each other and the talks of war and use of force against each other also started, exchange of harsh words by the leadership and analysts were witnessed over media. The entire situation was moving towards war as Indian media was supporting the Indian government act to eliminate the special status of Kashmir abrogating the article 370 & 35A whereas Pakistani media was criticizing the act. The Indian media was in support of the Curfew in Kashmir and there was no sympathy towards the violation of the human rights, Indian media claimed that the curfew is to normalize the situation in Kashmir and the abrogation of the Article will ensure more benefits to the Kashmiri people but Pakistani media entirely opposed this stance and talked about lifting of

curfew and granting human rights to the people in the valley. Protests to ensure the rights of the Kashmiri people started across the world where people urged to ensure the rights which was appreciated and supported as peace framing by the Pakistani media, the Indian media criticized the protests and said this would lead to war and rise more conflict in the valley and the region. Cross border insurgency was claimed by media of both countries but Pakistani media talked that ensuring peace in Kashmir would lead to lessen the current situation and urged to settle the issues of cross border insurgency through peace but overall a war framing stance was predominant and Indian media was more in favor of the war framing in this context. Pakistani media supported the narrative of bilateral trade and normalization of the relations to bring peace and prosperity in the region and to counter the circumstances in a positive and constructive manner promoting peace framing but in response Indian media presented a stance favoring war framing. As far as the hypotheses are concerned the hypotheses are well addressed and are proved according to the tables given above.

The study addressed selected issues/categories in the context of war and peace framing, it was found that the newspapers of Pakistan and India framed the issues in the contexts which suits their government and the nations in Pakistan the people were having reservations and they were annoyed over the Indian act to abrogate the special status of the Kashmir and a harsh tone was also there in media over the curfew and violations of the human rights whereas the Indian media considered this as a big achievement and supported the act of the Indian government. Pakistan despite the worst act of India which also challenged the regional security urged to support the bilateral trade and normalization of the relations but contrary to this Indian media entirely opposed to have bilateral trade and normalizing the relations favoring war framing.

References

Ali, Ehtisham, and K. Shahid. "Media and Foreign Policy, A Study of Pak-US Relations in US & Pakistani Press post9/11 Era (2001-2011)." *Lap Lambert Academic Publishing* (2012).

Aggarwal, A. "(August 6, 2019)". Students Protest amendment to Article 370. <https://www.thehindu.com/news/cities/Delhi/students-protest-amendment-to-article370/article28828548.ece> (retrieved September 16, 2020).

Ali, A. "Kashmir Conflict and South Asian Elite Press: A Framing Analysis." *Journal of Politics and International Studies* 3 (2017): 47-62.

Article 370 removed, buy land in Kashmir now. "Photoshopped SMS goes crazy viral online." (2019). <https://www.indiatoday.in/trending-news/story/article-370-removed-buy-land-kashmir-photoshopped-sms-viral-online-1577477-2019-08-05> (retrieved September 16, 2020).

Abhinandan: Captured Indian pilot handed back by Pakistan. <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-47412884> (retrieved March 1, 2019).

Berelson, Bernard. "Content analysis in communication research." (1952): New York: Free Press.

Bukhari, Syed Shahid Hussain, Waseem Din, and Syed Mussawar Hussain Bukhari. "Trajectory of Terrorism & Counter-Terrorism Phenomenon: A Peace Conundrum for Kashmir Dispute." *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences (PJSS)* 38, no. 2 (2018).

Das, N. Krishna & Abu ArqamNaqash. "Pakistan releases captured Indian pilot;confrontation cools". <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-india-kashmir/pakistan-releases-captured-indian-pilot-confrontation-coolsidUSKCN1QI40J> (retrieved March 1, 2019).

Hussain, Ejaz. "India–Pakistan Relations: Challenges and Opportunities." *Journal of Asian Security and International Affairs* 6, no. 1 (2019): 82-95.

Hussain, Ijaz. *Kashmir Dispute:An International Law Perspective*. Rawalpindi: Services Book Club, 2000.

- Joshi, Niki. "A history of Article 370: the scrapping of Jammu and Kashmir's independence and democracy". *University News*. <https://info.umkc.edu/unews/a-history-of-article-370-the-scrapping-of-jammu-and-kashmir-independence-and-democracy/> (retrieved September 11, 2019).
- Kashmir special status explained: What are Articles 370 and 35A? "(August 5, 2019)". *Aljazeera*. <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2019/08/kashmir-special-status-explained-articles-370-35a-190805054643431.html>
- Kerala CM's protest against removal of Article 370 is **political expediency: Ram Madhav**. (September 2, 2019). *Business Standard*. https://www.business-standard.com/article/news-ani/kerala-cm-s-protest-against-removal-of-article-370-is-political-expediency-ram-madhav-119090200032_1.html
- Khan, Ali Zaheer, Khalid Azam Chaudhry, FakharurRehman, and Riaz Ahmed. "(February 27, 2019)". Pakistan Air Force shoots down two Indian fighter jets: one pilot arrested. *Samaa.tv*. <https://www.samaa.tv/news/2019/02/pakistan-air-force-shoots-down-two-indian-fighter-jets-one-pilots-arrested/>
- Malik, Muhammad Sajjad. "Pakistan-India Relations: An Analytical Perspective of Peace Efforts." *Strategic Studies* 39, no. 1 (2019).
- Nadaf, Arif Hussain. "Framing internal politics in a conflict situation: A study of the 2014 election campaign news in the local newspapers in the Indian-administered Kashmir region." *Media, War & Conflict* 13, no. 2 (2020): 111-132.
- Pasricha, Anjana. "(March 1, 2019)". Indian Pilot Captured by Pakistan Returns Home. *voanews*. <https://www.voanews.com/south-central-asia/indian-pilot-captured-pakistan-returns-home>
- Chari, P.R., Cheema, P.I. & Cohen, S.P. (2007). Four Crises and a Peace Process: American Engagement in South Asia*, Brookings Institution Press.
- Riaz, Saqib, and Saadia Anwar Pasha. "Indo-Pak Relations and Pakistani Media." *Paper Series: Margalla Papers* (2010): 71-87.
- Saleem, Awais. "Nuclearization as National Security a Comparative Analysis of Framing and Frame Building in Indian and Pakistani Newspapers." (2017).
- Sarantakos, S. *Social research*. Hampshire, London: Macmillian press. (1998).
- Saeed, Luqman, ShabibHaider Syed, and Roger P. Martin. "Historical patterns of terrorism in Pakistan." *Defense & Security Analysis* 30, no. 3 (2014): 209-229.
- Suicide Attack on Indian Parliament (December 13, 2001). http://news.bbc.co.uk/onthisday/hi/dates/stories/december/13/newsid_3695000/3695057.stm
- Sattar, Abdul. *Pakistan's Foreign Policy, 1947-2005*: Oxford University Press, (2007).
- Scrapping of Article 370 and 35A big milestone for the unity, integrity of India: Amit Shah. (August 16, 2019). <https://www.indiatoday.in/india/story/scrapping-of-article-370-and-35a-big-milestone-for-the-unity-integrity-of-india-amit-shah-1581473-2019-08-16>
- Shahid, Mohsin. (January 4, 2018). "Azad Jammu and Kashmir vs. Indian Occupied Kashmir: The difference". *Global Village Space*. <https://www.globalvillagespace.com/azad-jammu-and-kashmir-vs-indian-occupied-kashmir-the-difference/>
- Sareen, Sushant. *The jihad factory: Pakistan's Islamic revolution in the making*. Har-Anand Publications, 2005.
- Symond, Peter. "Attack on Indian Parliament Heightens Danger of Indo-Pakistan War." *World Socialist Web Site*, December 20 (2001).

Uri vs Pulwama: How govt reacted to the two terror attacks (February 15, 2019). <https://www.indiatoday.in/india/story/uri-vs-pulwama-government-reaction-modi-jaitley-rajnath-1456873-2019-02-15>

What are Articles 370 and 35A? (August 5, 2019). <https://www.geo.tv/latest/244340-what-are-articles-370-and-35a>

Yousaf, Z., Yousafzai, FarishUllah, and Ali, E. "Coverage of Pak-India Relations in the Elite Press of Pakistan (June 2013- August 2013)". *Research on Humanities and Social Sciences*, no. 3(2013):18-22.

Yousaf, Zahid, Haroon Elahi, and Malik Adnan. "War and Peace Framing: the Contextual Analysis of Indo-Pak Relations." *Strategic Studies* 38, no. 1 (2018).

Zaidi, S.A. (October 6, 2017). The promise of democracy. <https://www.dawn.com/news/1360571>

Zaheer, Lubna. "Editorial Coverage of Kashmir Conflict in Pakistani Media." *Pakistan Vision* 18, no. 1 (2017).