Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan

Volume No. 55, Issue No. 1(January - June, 2018)

Muhammad Azeem^{*} Muhammad Kashif Ali^{**} Ahmad Hassan^{****} Saeed Ahmad^{****}

Revisiting Benazir Bhutto's political services during 1988-1996: An Overview

Abstract

This study attempts to explore, investigate and analyze Benazir Bhutto's political leadership by focusing on her role as a ruler/Prime Minister of Pakistan in 1988-90 and 1993-96. The study will encapsulate political challenges, administrative difficulties and managerial response of Benazir Bhutto; to these issues as the first women Prime Minister of Pakistan. Benazir Bhutto, as a Prime Minister of Pakistan for two terms took significant steps, worked for democratic stability, addressed socio economic challenges and tried to address social issues like women health, poverty and economic deprivation. Her opponents like Nawaz Sharif did not let her to run the governments smoothly and adopted all those tools and tactics which could destabilize her government which was, infact, the main drawback of the power struggle of 1990s. Her governments were dismissed on the pretext of corruption, nepotism and bad governance; however, she managed to rule Pakistan twice besides all these odds which are unique in the history of Pakistan. Therefore, it is of immense significant to understand the leadership qualities of lady leader in a society where women are at the margins and still she emerged as a head of main political party Pakistan Peoples' Party(PPP) and became Prime Minister twice. Her supporters believe that she got charismatic leadership qualities that enabled her to display resilience after her father's death and to emerge as first woman Prime Minister of Pakistan and the Muslim world. Therefore, this study would like to understand how she emerged as a political leader and how she became a head of the party and what traits made her charismatic leader and why she faced challenges and what were the implications of her becoming a lady Prime Minister of Pakistan. Much has already been written on the role of Benazir in the political history of Pakistan but hardly anyone has explained her leadership qualities by adopting any framework and this paper is an attempt to address it. The present author would like to understand the leadership qualities of Benazir Bhutto by applying various theories and approaches; however, the trait theory seems the most suitable in her case. This paper examines such questions as: What were the main characteristics of Benazir Bhutto as a female political leader? What were the major factors which

^{*} Muhammad Azeem, Ph. D. Schollar, Department of History and Pakistan Studies, University of the Punjab Lahore, Pakistan.

^{**} Muhammd Kashif Ali, Lecturer, Department of History, University of Gujrat, Pakistan.

Ahmad Hassan, Lecturer, Department of History, GC University, Sargodha.

^{***} Saeed Ahmad, Assistant Professor, History Department, GC University, Lahore.

contributed to the emergence of Benazir Bhutto as a political leader/Prime Minister? What were those fault lines and challenges which did not let Benzir Bhutto to complete her tenures as a Prime Minister? What were those steps and contributions which made her a charismatic leader?

Introduction:

The role of leadership in politics is essential that unfolds multilavered importance; in welfare, progress, prosperity and dignity of any nation. One can assess that last few decades witnessed, the emergence of some popular female leaders in the global political arena. These female leaders like Margaret Thatcher¹ in British, Golda Meir² in Israel whereas Bandaranaike³ in Sri Lanka, Indra Gandhi⁴ in India and Benazir Bhutto⁵ in Pakistan; assumed powers in smooth, orderly and methodical democratic manner. However, Benazir Bhutto not only confronted with political challenges, dictatorial regime and hardships in her struggle for restoration and strengthening democracy in Pakistan but also faced male chauvinistic politics, orthodox religious ulamas, entrenched military and bureaucratic elites which were hostile to her father's political legacy⁶. Benazir Bhutto is one of the more recognizable world figures, born in a feudal-cum-tribal Sindhi family and her development as a leader, political association and character formation have been remained topic of interest among scholars, writers, analysts as well as layman, yet, her contribution to politics, her austerity to administrative responsibilities as a Prime Minister and formulation of domestic and foreign policies during her premiership; is a more interesting time period and it requires a stupendous commitment to explore, unfold, or to assess its different dimensions. Thus, the period of Benazir Bhutto, as a Prime Minister, during her both tenures (1988-90 and 1993-96), is an important era to understand and to explore her style of governance, her vision and diplomatic approach in foreign policy, her efforts to restore image of Pakistan as a democratic and responsible state in the comity of world. This research is a delying effort to explore and to critically analyze different dimensions of Benazir's both tenures as a Prime Minister of Pakistan.

Trait Theory

In this theory, the motives, attitude, character as well as temperament of a personality and the aforementioned traits are measured in varied timings and duration. However, by applying this theory, one can understand, the personality traits of Benazir Bhutto, her motives, attitude, temperament as well as character. This theory of trait can be helpful to measure Benazir's traits particularly; during her both tenures, in her premiership of Pakistan. The tenure of Benazir Bhutto as a Prime Minister is an important era of Pakistani political structure and democratic stability. Keeping in view the challenges which were being faced by Pakistan during her both tenures in the office of Prime Minister, the administrative response, decisive priorities and managerial skills of Benazir Bhutto, as a ruler/Prime Minister of Pakistan can be gauged in the prism of Trait theory. This theory is helpful to better understand the Benazir Bhutto's contribution and political lapses during her both tenures in office of Prime Minister of Pakistan. In this connection, the trait theory can be applied to unfold as well as to understand the role of Benazir Bhutto as a ruler/Prime Minister of Pakistan 1988-90 and 1993-96. The trait theory explores the administrative skills, political acumen, social attitude and motivational factors of any leader in office of authority while delivering for public welfare, addressing the challenges of national importance and devising strategy to resolve the issues and to steer the country towards prosperity as well as democratic stability.

The above mentioned leadership assessment unfolds that Benazir Bhutto possessed different leadership traits which she demonstrated as a Prime Minister of Pakistan during her both tenures. She also acquired personal exposure from the charismatic leadership of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto who was her father as well as political mentor. The interests to serve the nation and to drive the institution of Parliament towards the supreme and decisive authority; Benazir Bhutto made utmost efforts to transform Pakistan into a democratic and welfare state. She acted, sometimes decisively, to prove her authority and sometimes demonstrated compromises with the other political stakeholders in Pakistan. Benazir Bhutto, in Prime Minister office, exposed different shortcomings and follies as well. Thus, the trait theory can be helpful for the readers to peep into the political leadership and role of Benazir Bhutto in the office of Prime Minister of Pakistan during her both tenures.

There are number of factors which contributed to the emergence of Benazir Bhutto as a leader in Pakistan. Infact, the political legacy of her family, charismatic leadership of her father Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto followed by his controversial execution, created many influences on Benazir Bhutto's political grooming. After the execution of Z.A. Bhutto, his daughter Benazir Bhutto experienced prison and exile, however, she could not remain aloof from political arena of Pakistan. Alongside these events, her educational background at Radcliffe and Oxford University also groomed her leadership and personality. Z.A. Bhutto, during his rule in Pakistan, after assuming his daughter as an expected successor of his charismatic political legacy, made deliberate efforts to groom the political acumen of Benazir Bhutto. For that reason, Benazir Bhutto not only attended and received foreign delegations and leaders during Bhutto reign in Pakistan in early 1970s but also she was accompanied by her father, Z.A. Bhutto, the then Prime Minister of Pakistan, on foreign official tours. This association and experience of politics, with her father, chiseled the political insight of Benazir Bhutto. Later on, after the execution of her father, she became the leader of Pakistan Peoples Party (PPP) and the ray of hope and aspirations for Pakistani masses because the common men were perturbed under the Zia led military rule, absence of democratic culture and leadership vacuum at political arena.

All these events, political developments and exposures transformed the personality of Benazir Bhutto as a young women political leader in Pakistan and she also recalled this grooming in her autobiography. Benazir's education at Harvard and Oxford also expanded her political perception, developed her political outlook as well as worldviews. She narrates the level of fondness and inquisitiveness to learn her first lesson regarding democracy.⁸

After the execution of her father Z.A Bhutto, Benazir Bhutto became the co-chairperson of Pakistan Peoples' Party, the political circumstances were difficult as well as topsy-turvy at that time. As Z.A. Bhutto was nationalist who inculcated the political consciousness in Pakistani people. Similarly, Benazir

Bhutto became the victim of Zia's revengeful oppressive approach towards Bhutto family. However, Z.A. Bhutto's martyrdom raised level of sympathy among masses and also enhanced the political credential of Benazir Bhutto. She exhibited pragmatic approach as a chairperson of PPP and de-radicalized the party. Thus, she transformed the Pakistan People's Party from its socialistic rhetoric towards liberal disposition. ¹⁰

The death of General Zia-ul-Haq, President of Pakistan, in an airplane crash paved the way for election and Ghulam Ishaq who was serving as Chairman, Senate was appointed as Acting President. Ghulam Ishaq also headed the caretaker Government. The Acting President arranged elections in November 1988 and PPP got majority seats in National Assembly. Although, the result of 1988 election could not exclude Benazir Bhutto to form Government, even President delayed to call her to do so, yet, she assumed as Prime Minister of Pakistan on December, 2, 1988. On assuming power as Prime Minister, Benazir Bhutto exhibited political dexterity, showed flexibility and demonstrated the skill to use well bargaining chip and political consensus building approach as well as appeased the military with some compromises; let Gen Aslam Beg as Army Chief, to support the candidacy of the President and to give the military direct role in foreign policy and not to interfere in the internal matters of military. 12

Infact, being the youngest, as well as, first women Prime Minister of Muslim country, Pakistan, marked a new era of governance and civilian rule in the country. Benazir Bhutto, as compared to her father Z.A. Bhutto, after becoming the Prime Minister of Pakistan, was weak politically. On the flipside of the coin, her father was considered unchallenged leader, specifically in foreign policy. However, Benazir Bhutto, domestically, faced the challenging task to ouster the influence of military rule in politics and to set the road for democracy as well as to strengthen the image of Pakistan at international level. ¹³

At domestic front, Benazir Bhutto was also facing myriad challenges; over developed state structure, socio-economic deprivations, regional disparities, vindictive politics and incompatibility among masses hopes and Pakistan Peoples Party response to the public. 14 Further, during her tenure, there were many problems like rampant poverty, endemic unemployment, deep rooted illiteracy and economic bankruptcy. Although, Benazir managed some earlier successes; both national and international fronts; yet, domestically, she released many political prisoner who were arrested by Martial Law regime under Gen. Zia. She also removed some restrictions on media as well as re-instated those Government servants who were removed by Gen. Zia on political grounds. In foreign affairs, Benazir Bhutto wanted to develop relationship with India while the historic Simla Pact¹⁵ on the basis to resolve bilateral disputes. ¹⁶ On the other hand, Pakistani media was considering Benazir Bhutto as immature Prime Minister. Besides these issues, there was an acute imbalance of power between Prime Minister and President Ghulam Ishaq Khan which was looming the existence and stability of her government. Infact, Benazir Bhutto chose the course of action based on; compromises and cooperation. It was also considerable point that Benazir's installation as a Prime Minister and the restoration of civilian rule; did not end the military's role in Pakistan politics and administration. On the very onset, her journey as a Prime Minister, the circumstances were not conducive enough, for a Muslim lady like Benazir Bhutto to cope with the challenges.¹⁷

Her first tenure of premiership 1988-1990 marked in the history of modern Pakistan transition to democracy which hailed with deterioration of civil-military relations. In fact, the major issue was the removal of General Hamid Gul, the then ISI Chief and replacement of Lt. Gen. Shams-ur-Rehman Kallu by Benazir Bhutto which widened the gulf between military and civilian government. Similarly, Pacca Qilla operation, with the solo flight of civilian government, without consulting the army, raised eye brows in top bras of the army. If also demonstrated the lack of communication between military elite and political leadership. Hence, these acts were considered, by the military, as the interference in its professional domain as well as violating the commitment as made before assuming her office as a Prime Minister.

During the first tenure of Benazir Bhutto, the Punjab Government was headed by Nawaz Sharif, as a Chief Minister. At the outset, Benazir Bhutto contributed little for the promotion of politics of accommodation, conciliation and understanding with Punjabi leadership. Later, the PPP stalwarts made different efforts to dislodge the Government of Nawaz Sharif, through various means but in vain. Later on, politics of no confidence motion was started on provincial and federal level. In this scenario, opposition parties, the President and the military took full advantage of this conflicting situation between Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto at the centre and the then Chief Minister of Punjab Nawaz Sharif at Punjab province. These conflicting developments tarnished Bhutto's image that her regime has failed to manage the affairs of the country which paved the way to the President to dismiss her Government.

As far as the economic policies of Benazir Bhutto are concerned, she did not adopt the policy of coherence and left its socialist goals by pursuing the policy of privatization, however, without clarity of purpose. ²² Inflation, unemployment, and stagnation in industrial sector demanded immediate attention as well as policy action to formulate an active economic policy. However, the Government of Benazir Bhutto was indulging to provide jobs to the PPP supporters as well as sympathizers in public sector which was an irritable factor for the bureaucracy and it also increased the inefficiency of Government. In fact, the PPP Government did not formulate any coherent policy to attract foreign investors.

Similarly, when Benazir Bhutto became the Prime Minister in 1988, it was expected that she would not make any radical departure from the previous military regime's foreign policy. Even, to conciliate military, she was agreed that Sahibzada Yaqoob will remain Foreign Minister, however, Benazir Bhutto appointed Tanvir Ahmad as Secretary, Foreign Affairs and operated through him. As far as the issues of strategic significance are concerned, particularly, the relations with Afghanistan and India and the development of new regional alliances, the differences between Military's perception and Benazir's vision and outlook became sharper. As under Zia led regime, the military pursued active role in the process of foreign policy formulation and explored the strategic cooperation and opportunity of economic with Turkey, Afghanistan, Iran and Bangladesh. Military regime also intended to raise Kashmir Issue at International level and to

seek its support vigorously from international community as well as its resolution. Even, Benazir Bhutto wanted to resolve the Afghan issue in the light of Geneva Accord signed by Junejo, former Prime Minister, however, the military considered Benazir's intentions as against the strategic and political interest of Pakistan. This intention of Benazir Bhutto, on Afghan issue, was also a conflicting point on foreign policy option between military and her governance. Infact, it gave misgivings and doubts to the military that Benazir Bhutto did not comprehend fully Pakistan's strategic interests.²³

When her Government was removed in 1990, she began to shift from accepting military hegemonic role towards foreign policy. Even, Benazir Bhutto rendered concerted efforts in order to develop good relations with US as well as to minimize divergence on nuclear issues. Benazir Bhutto skillfully assumes the management as well as conduct of nation's foreign policy actively. ²⁴ The expectations, she has aroused, have been very high, yet her performance as Prime Minister is less than satisfactory, therefore, in August 1990, her Government was dismissed unceremoniously just after 20 months on the charges of corruption. ²⁵

Under the caretaker Government, headed by Moeen Qureshi as a Prime Minister managed to hold election on 6th October 1993; relatively fair and free, under the caretaker government of Moeen Qureshi facilitated the way for Benazir Bhutto's Premiership of second time. ²⁶ As a result of these elections, Benazir Bhutto, after spending three years, as an opposition leader, was re-elected as a Prime Minister of Pakistan on 19th October 1993, while pledging to promote, to strengthen politics as well as tolerance in the country. ²⁷

Firstly, the foreign relations, during Benazir's second tenure, were dominated by three major issues; Kashmir, Pressler Amendment with United States etc. In this connection, Benazir Bhutto visited almost various foreign countries during her second tenure. Benazir Bhutto focused to globalize the Kashmir issue for drawing international attention towards Indian atrocities towards Kashmir, propagated Pakistan image as a moderate Islamic state and try to remove the label of terrorist country which was leveled against its opponents.²⁸ Benazir Bhutto made utmost efforts to improve the Pak-US relations because the Pak-US relations were not cordial during her predecessor Nawaz Sharif's Government. Despite abundance of pressure from US to roll back the nuclear program of Pakistan, Benazir Bhutto refused to show any flexibility on nuclear program of the country.²⁹ It was the Benazir Bhutto's successful foreign policy that some of economic and military sanctions were lifted from Pakistan and Benazir Bhutto succeeded to win the support and sympathy from United States administration. She also expressed her desires to establish smooth, cooperative and good neighbourly relations with India.³⁰

Benazir Bhutto tried her level best to address the deprivations, hopes and aspirations of Pakistani people during her second tenure. In this regard, her Government adopted the three pronged strategy to improve the economic position of the country. Firstly, the Government focused to expand foreign direct investment (FDI). Secondly, it introduced the program of privatization with full vigor. Thirdly, structural adjustments measures were taken; to minimize budget deficit, to broaden tax base, to reduce defense expenditures and to improve tax

collection. ³¹ The Government of Benazir Bhutto also focused to reduce unemployment, inflation and imposed agricultural tax, but, the Government neither control its expenditure nor to render any serious effort to generate revenue, resultantly, the total debt of the country constituted more 80 percent of the GDP during her second tenure.³²

In Benazir's 2nd tenure, her new administration rewarded their loyalists, while appointing them at key positions and posts, like previous Government in Pakistan.³³ In judiciary, Justice Sajjad Shah was appointed as the Chief Justice of Supreme Court by sidelining three senior judges of Supreme Court of Pakistan.³⁴ Besides this, Benazir Bhutto also appointed twenty new judges (from her party sympathizers) in Punjab High Court. Later on, the Supreme Court of Pakistan rejected these appointments of judges and this verdict of Supreme Court became source of confrontation with Government and judiciary.³⁵ During the second tenure of Benazir Bhutto, the army, under General Waheed, was supportive to Benazir Bhutto as compared to her first tenure. The Army also followed the standoff policy in political arena after her re-appointment as a Prime Minister.³⁶

The Karachi turmoil was one of the major reasons which threatened the stability of PPP Government. Infact, there was hardly any agreement, regarding power sharing between MQM and PPP in Sindh which resulted conflicting and deteriorated circumstances of Karachi. Several conflicts threatened the law and order situation in Karachi.³⁷ The Army withdrew from Karachi and replaced by paramilitary troops, thus, leading the worst kind of violence; claimed the life of thousands of people. Further, the hostility between Government and MOM was worsened by the extra judicial killings of MQM members. Hence, during Benazir's second tenure, the confrontation continued between state authorities and MOM. Alongside this, there was an acute lack of political process at local Government level and existence of breakdown of law and order transformed the political scenario in a very volatile situation. The turmoil in Karachi was not only hurdling the Pakistan's economic problems but also remained the source of embracement at national and international level. 38 The Government accused MQM, many times, about the torture and execution of innocent civilians. However, MQM, reciprocally, leveled charges on the Government of custodial killings and extra judicial killings of MQM activists in fake police encounter. MQM adherence staged strong demonstration against Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto when she was visiting Britain and United States. The bitter relations continued between Government and MOM. President Faroog Laghari and the Army pressurized the Benazir Bhutto to negotiate with MQM in order to restore peace and law and order situation of Karachi because many countries of the world has investment in Pakistan. ³⁹ This violence, agitational politics by MQM and unrest in Karachi weakened the position of Benazir Bhutto as a Prime Minister during her second tenure.

The relations of Benazir Bhutto's Government with opposition remained confrontational politically throughout her second tenure. Nawaz Sharif refused to accept the Pakistan Peoples Party's Government legitimacy. Benazir Bhutto was also accused by Nawaz Sharif of conspiracy with President Ghulam Ishaq Khan to overthrow his Government in 1993, 40 because the Pakistan People Party Government did not develop cordial relations with Nawaz Sharif's Government in

1991-93. Therefore, the Nawaz Sharif Government behaved exactly like PPP did against his Government in 1991-93 by using the same tools and tactics.

On 20th September 1996, Murtaza Bhutto, the brother of Benazir Bhutto along with his friends, was killed by police near his Clifton residence. The initial reports described that during encounter, near the Clifton residence of Murtaza Bhutto where the police personals were deputed for checking the vehicles in connection with series of bomb blasts at Karachi, was fired upon by the body guards of Murtaza Bhutto. In returning fire, Murtaza Bhutto got serious wounds. Hence, on his way to hospital, Murtaza Bhutto was died. 41 Benazir Bhutto's relations with President Farooq Laghari was not cordial at that time, therefore, she accused President Faroog Laghari of hatching the conspiracy of the killing of her brother, and against her Government. Later, a meeting was held between the President and Prime Minister. The President expressed his serious concern over the lack of governance, rampant corruption, the persisting confrontation with the superior judiciary and deteriorating economic situation. 42 Keeping in view the prevailing circumstances, it became indispensable for the then President Farooq Laghari to dissolve the Assembly. Finally, he dissolved National Assembly on 5th November 1996, under 58 (2) (b) and overthrew Benazir Bhutto's Government by leveling charges of nepotism, corruption, extra judicial killings and poor governance.

Conclusion

This study tries to understand the character and achievement of Benizir Bhtto as the first lady Prime Minister of Pakistan. She twice became prime Minister of Pakistan. When in this study I applied the trait theory to understand Benazir Bhutto, present author was able to assess that the motives, attitude, character as well as temperament of Benazir Bhutto during her both tenures as Prime Minister under the prism provided by trait theory. The tenures of Benazir Bhutto is an important era of Pakistani political structure and democratic stability. Keeping in view the challenges which she faced during her both tenures in the office of Prime Minister, the administrative response, decisive priorities and managerial skills of Benazir Bhutto. The leadership assessment unfolds that Benazir Bhutto possessed different leadership traits which she demonstrated as a Prime Minister of Pakistan during her both tenures. She acquired personal exposure from the charismatic leadership of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto who was her father as well as political mentor. The interests to serve the nation and to drive the institution of Parliament towards the supreme and decisive authority: Benazir Bhutto made utmost efforts to transform Pakistan into democratic and welfare She acted sometimes decisively to prove her authority and sometimes demonstrated compromises with the other political stakeholders in Pakistan.

She portrays the image of transformational leader by aspiring to transform Pakistan into an economically developed, socially tolerant and modern nation state. The expectations she had aroused were very high, yet her performance as Prime Minister on both occasions remained less than satisfactory. During her both tenures, she faced myriad challenges political entrenchment of military, acute imbalance of power between President and Prime Minister, rampant poverty, endemic illiteracy, deep routed illiteracy and the major drawback

was the vindictive politics of opposition. Her political opponents, like Nawaz Sharif, tried to destabilize her Government by using various tools and tactics. Inspite of all these challenges, hardships and difficulties, she managed to rule twice in a society where male chauvinistic politics were dominating, orthodox *ulamas* were against the ruling of a women and general lull of perception was that lady is always considered to be neglected to accept her order and authority, which is a unique distinction in the politics as well as in the historiography of Pakistan. Her entry into politics and her political leadership ushered in a new era of women activism and participation in various walks of life including politics.

Notes & References

⁴Indira Gandhi (1917-1984) was an <u>Indian</u> stateswoman the first and only female <u>P.M. of India</u> uptill now. She was daughter of Jawaharlal Nehru and belonged to <u>Nehru Gandhi family</u>. Despite her surname <u>Gandhi</u>, she is not related to the family of <u>Mahatma Gandhi</u>. She served as Prime Minister of India from January 1966 to March 1977 and again from January 1980 until <u>her assassination</u> in October 1984, making her the second <u>long serving Indian Prime Minister</u> after her father.

⁵Benazir Bhutto (1953-2007) was the first female Prime Minister who served as Prime Minister from 1988 to 1990 and again from 1993 to 1996. She was the first woman to head a democratic government in a <u>Muslim majority</u> nation. Ideologically, a secularist and a <u>liberal</u> who chaired and co-chaired the <u>Pakistan Peoples Party</u> (PPP) from the early 1980s until her <u>assassination</u> in 2007.

¹Margaret Thatcher (1925-2013) served as <u>Prime Minister of U.K.</u> from 1979 to 1990 and was the long serving P.M. of the 20th Century. One of the eminent Soviet journalists, dubbed Margret Thatcher "Iron Lady", nickname which became associated with her style of leadership as well as uncompromising politics. Being Prime Minister, Margret Thatcher implemented the policies which later, came to be known as <u>Thatcherism</u>.

² Golda Meir (1898-1978) was the <u>fourth Prime Minister</u> of <u>Israel</u>. She was elected as <u>Prime Minister</u> on 17th of March 1969. She was the first and only woman of Israel who hold the office of Prime Minister. Her tenure as PM ended, before, the British Prime Minister Margret Thatcher applied the term as British Prime Minister. She resigned as prime minister in 1974 and died in 1978 of <u>lymphoma</u>.

³Sirimavo Bandaranaike (1916-2000) was a <u>Sri Lankan</u> politician and world's first female head of government. She served as Prime Minister of Ceylon as well as Sri Lanka (three time 1960-65, 1970-77 and 1994-2000) and remained long serving leader of Sri Lanka, Freedom Party. On her husband's assassination, she took over the leadership of Sri Lankan Freedom Party and kept it for forty years until her death in 2000.

⁶ (Ahmad, 2005, p. 20-21; Suvorova, 2015, p. 9-10).

⁷ (Daily Times, December 27, 2017).

⁸ Bhutto, 1989, p. 58-61

⁹ Ziring, 1991, p.179

¹⁰ Pakistan Observer, December, 27, 2017

¹¹ Weiss, 1990, p.433-445

¹² Rafique, 1994, p.71-72

¹³ Burki, 2004, p.78

¹⁴ Bhola, 1989, p. 29

¹⁵The Simla Agreement was signed by Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto (1928-1979), the then President of Pakistan and Indra Gandhi (1917-1984), Prime Minister of India on 2 July 1972 in <u>Simla</u>, the capital city of Indian state <u>Himachal Pradesh</u>. This agreement was approved by the both Parliaments i.e. India and Pakistan. It was the result for resolving both countries i.e. India and Pakistan in order to end the conflicts as well as confrontation. However, it was not cherished in view of the repeated dictatorial regimes in Pakistan and the hostility continued from both ends. both sides.

¹⁶ Majumdar, 1998, p. 635

¹⁷ Rafique, 1994, p. 94

¹⁸ Burki, 1991, p.80-83

¹⁹ The Nation, June 3, 1990

²⁰ Burki, 1991, p.79-80

²¹ Shafqat, 1996, p. 665

²² Daily Nation, December 2, 1989

²³ Shafqat, 1996, p. 655-672

²⁴ Shafqat, 1996,p. 655-672

²⁵ Dawn, 7 August 1990

²⁶ The News, January, 10, 1994

²⁷ Ziring, 1993, p. 1175-1185

²⁸ Shafqat, 1997, p.245-253

²⁹ Pakistan Observer, March 28, 1994

³⁰ The News, July, 25, 1994

³¹ Shafqat, 1997, p. 246-247

³² The News, October, 19, 1996

³³ Shah, 2004, p.170

³⁴ Hussain, January 1996

³⁵ Rizvi, 2003, p. 223

³⁶ Hussain, August, 1996

³⁷ Tahir Amin, February, 1994, p. 143

³⁸ Ahmad, October 1996, p.1035

³⁹ Hussain, July 1995, 24

⁴⁰ Waseem, 1999, p. 73

⁴¹ Ziring, 1997, p.575

⁴² The *News*, September, 28, 1996