Direct and Indirect Impacts of Terrorism on Youth in Pakistan

Abstract

Since its independence from the British in 1947, Pakistan has been facing several internal and external security challenges, for example the conflict with India, insurgency in East Pakistan etc. A combination of such challenges led to its disintegration in 1971 when Pakistan’s eastern part became Bangladesh. The country’s direct involvement in the Afghan-Soviet War is a major reason of contemporary security troubles, such as terrorism and religious extremism. Nonetheless, a major wave of terrorism surfaced after 2002. Since then, terrorist attacks have indiscriminately targeted places like market places, hotels, religious and social gatherings, schools, mosques, public venues etc. As this trend has continued for well over a decade, it is timely to assess the impacts of terrorism on the country and the future generation – youth. This paper explores both direct and indirect impacts of terrorism on Pakistan and its youth.

Key words: Terrorism, Violence, Economy, Trauma, Youth, Pakistan

Context

Pakistan is located at an important geo-strategic position in South Asia. It shares its eastern border with India and northeastern border with China. The country also borders Iran on its southwest side, and Afghanistan runs along its western and northern edge. The Arabian Sea is at Pakistan’s southern boundary. According to the Economic Survey of Pakistan (2014), the population of Pakistan is 188.2 million with 96.28% Muslim and 3.72% belonging to other religions. Among the minorities, the country has Christians (1.59%), Hindus (1.60%) and Qadianis/Ahmadis (0.22%). There are five major ethno-regional communities in Pakistan: Balochs living in Balochistan; Muhajirs and Sindhis mainly living in Sindh; Punjabis living in Punjab; and Pushtuns living in KPK, Balochistan and Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA). The country also has some other religious and sectarian groups such as Kalasha, Parsis, Sikhs and Shia sects (Ismailis and Bohras).

There are multiple issues responsible for conflicts in Pakistan, such as gender, religion, caste, language and international issues. Facing resurgence of nationalists, religious and sectarian insurgency at home, volatile neighbouring Afghanistan to the west, insurgency-ridden Kashmir to the north, and an ongoing conflict with India, places Pakistan in a very critical situation. The reasons for this
are widely manifested in the form of under-developed democratic institutes, dominance of military and political monopolies of landed and capitalist elite, which are lessening space for peaceful resolutions of conflicts, having the potential of turning violent and threatening the federal structure of the country. In this picture, it is to be pointed that the civil society is relatively weak and has little space to influence the course of policymaking. There is also a presence of various regional, sub-regional and local identities against a weak national identity. Since Pakistan’s creation in 1947, governments have failed to promote a collective national identity. The absence of such a national character was also a major cause of East Pakistan separating to become Bangladesh in 1971. It is quite evident that in the presence of such structural flaws, Pakistan is receptive to conflicts of various forms at various levels.

Pakistan faces multiple local and foreign challenges. Internally, there are violent security problems in the form of religious extremism, terrorism, political violence, and sectarianism. With regard to external factors, there has been an ongoing rivalry with India, which has led to three major wars between the two countries. Since the US invasion of Afghanistan in 2001, the situation in the country has produced fresh security challenges for Pakistan, for example, Pakistan has been hosting around three million (1.6 million officially registered and the remaining are unregistered) of Afghan refugees. The so-called ‘war on terror’ has another internal dimension and that is in the form of continuous security operations in the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) by Pakistani troops and drone strikes by the US. In 2013, the Pakistan Army launched Operation Zarb-e-Azb. As a consequence of this operation, around 614,934 families left their home temporary and 309,171 families are desperately waiting to return to their homes.

The 16 December 2014 brutal terrorist attack on an Army Public School in Peshawar that killed 141 students and teachers and left 121 wounded is one of the worst attacks in the country’s history. Since the September 11 terrorist attacks on the US, Pakistan’s alliance in the war on terror and its struggle against terrorists continues to cost the state and its people. The country has lost over 52,000 lives in addition to a heavy economic loss of US$ 102.51 billion over the period 2002 and 2014. From Waziristan to Karachi, people are living under constant threat. Youth, the most vulnerable group is both directly and indirectly affected by the rising insecurity. There is a dire need to understand and address the challenges of terrorism for preventing youth from involvement in the heinous crimes of terrorism.

---

Impacts of Terrorism

Terrorism is a major problem having direct links with other challenges in Pakistan. It is also a challenge that has been growing. *Global Terrorism Index of 2014* ranked Pakistan at number three, after Iraq and Afghanistan.\(^\text{10}\) This report points to the severity of the problem of terrorism in Pakistan. Islamabad joined hands with Washington and other international partners to eradicate terrorism. However, there are no evidences available suggesting Pakistan’s achievements in this struggle.\(^\text{11}\) Nonetheless, the country continues to face serious impacts of terrorism. With the US invasion in Afghanistan, Taliban slipped into the Pak-Afghan border region – FATA that provided strategically vital location for covert attacks on the US and its allies in Afghanistan. To prevent cross border infiltration, Pakistan deployed its troops into the border region for the first time and launched military operation against the unwanted elements of the Taliban.\(^\text{12}\)

The focus of this section is to discuss impacts of terrorism on Pakistan. Pakistan is amongst the countries affected by multifaceted terrorism, which is manifested in the form of domestic terrorism (ethnic clashes), international or state sponsored terrorism, sectarian terrorism, and Jihadi terrorism. The focus of this paper is to look at the impacts of terrorism of all kinds. While there are similarities among the localised forms of terrorism, the international terrorism, which has grown in intensity across the country since the 9/11, is often seen destroying Pakistan’s international image.\(^\text{13}\) Such unbridle terrorism and instability place Pakistan on number 10 in the list of fragile or failed states.\(^\text{14}\)

Due to security operations in FATA, the human displacement continues. However, in terms of the background of conflict-induced displacement, it is important to underscore that it has been ongoing for the past eight years. The major displacement occurred in three major phases. Firstly, in August 2008, 109,654 families migrated due to a conflict in Bajaur and Mohmand Agencies.\(^\text{15}\) Later in April 2009, an estimated 2.8 million people were displaced because of operations in Malakand division of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (ICG 2010, 2). In October 2009, a new wave of clashes began in Mehsud dominated areas of South Waziristan uprooting 71,124 families.\(^\text{16}\) And recently, a new wave of displacement following operation Zarb-e-Azb in June 2014 with 102,047 families.\(^\text{17}\) The unending cycle of violence and conflicts in Pakistan increase security challenges for the nascent democratic state. According to the United Nations Children’s Fund (UNICEF) in Pakistan, “the speed and size of


237
displacement stretched government’s humanitarian capacities to the limit”.18 People from all regions of FATA have been affected by terrorism (See table 1).

**Table 1: Data of IDPs (February 2015)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Total Registered Families</th>
<th>Registered Return</th>
<th>Total Balance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bajaur</td>
<td>86,407</td>
<td>72,895</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FR-Tank</td>
<td>2,256</td>
<td>1,852</td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Khyber</td>
<td>176,396</td>
<td>11,260</td>
<td>86,107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kurram</td>
<td>56,122</td>
<td>21,937</td>
<td>25,865</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohmand</td>
<td>48,954</td>
<td>36,759</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Waziristan</td>
<td>102,047</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>100,527</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orakzai</td>
<td>48,656</td>
<td>8,660</td>
<td>29,615</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Waziristan</td>
<td>94,096</td>
<td>4,443</td>
<td>66,681</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grand Total</td>
<td>614,934</td>
<td>157,806</td>
<td><strong>309,171</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The government on several occasions tried to resolve the situation with the Taliban through non-violent means, but those arrangements could not work due to the brutal measures of the terrorists. Considering the increasing number of casualties, civilian and non-civilian, the government reached a ‘Peace Accord’ with various factions of local Taliban, without involving the local population but that proved to be counterproductive. Soon after the deal in January 2012, Tehreek-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP) assassinated 15 earlier kidnapped personnel of Pakistan’s Frontier Constabulary.20 The much enthusiastic peace talk with Taliban ended when the militant Taliban executed 23 frontier constabulary personals, forcing the government to take military action in FATA, North Waziristan.21 Consequently, the operation Zarb-e-Azb has been launched in North Waziristan.

---

Direct And Indirect Impacts Of Terrorism On Youth In Pakistan

Developmental and policy issues

Terrorists find justifications for their acts in conditions of deprivation, corruption and relating issues.\textsuperscript{22} Therefore, international community has also diverted their attention towards the issues of poverty and bad governance in countries like Pakistan.

As evident from the case of Pakistan, it is not an easy task to prioritise focus on a particular age group of people because terrorists have not discriminated against any particular age group. Nonetheless, considering the crucial significance of involving youth in the development of the country, it is very important to guide the process of youth policy development and implementation at provincial levels. So far, only the Government of Punjab has developed a youth policy, which has not yet been implemented. In such policies, a primary focus should be on protecting youth from the impacts of terrorism. There is a need to create a policy paper at a national level not only focusing on protecting youth against terrorism but also from its impacts, such as psychological, economic, social, etc. Young people between the ages of twelve to thirty do most of the terror acts.\textsuperscript{23} According to Shelley, unemployed youth with little prospect of future are engaged in terrorism and suicide bombing.\textsuperscript{24}

Current demographics of Pakistan demand policymakers to pay more attention to youth development. The country is home to an estimated 103 million people under the age of 25 years, including 36 million within the age group of 15-24.\textsuperscript{25} Youth from different socio-economic backgrounds has been seen involved in terrorist activities in Pakistan. As reported, around 5,000 youth received militant training, including 350-400 as suicide bombers in FATA. Some 300 potential suicide bombers were arrested in Malakand division of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.\textsuperscript{26} Terrorism and militancy have shuttered all aspect of secured human life in the country. Terrorists have not spared the police stations, military convoys, judicial centers, \textit{hujras}, public gathering, schools and health centers and polio vaccinations teams.\textsuperscript{27} The state institutions and agencies have failed to respond to the crises. The disengaged and disconnected youth needs to be brought into mainstream through constructive activities.

**Brain drain**

The rising physical and economic insecurities in Pakistan are causing a major brain drain. Insecurities in both traditional and human security sense are the push factors while pull dynamics are freedom, economic opportunities, social, political and religious liberties, peace and security in foreign countries.

A widespread fear of violence is a major outcome of terrorism and it is a major source of increase in the number of emigrants from Pakistan. Whoever can afford is migrating to countries, such as the US, Canada, UK, Australia, New Zealand and many other European destinations. Parents, especially from FATA, are sending their children to the Middle East to escape from violence at home. There is a severe drought of policies focusing on retaining Pakistani talent within the country. According to a *Daily Times* report (5 July 2009), nearly 3,500 Pakistan’s medical graduates were found jobless and most of such talented youngsters moved abroad. Since 2005 the number of migrants reached at 4,156,957, including 29,377 engineers, 9,040 doctors, 5,795 teacher.28

Terrorism has been negatively affecting Pakistan’s economy for a number of reasons, such as lack of FDI and failure of local industry etc. This ultimately is affecting youth due to rising unemployment rate. Unemployment in the Pakistan and even in other South Asian countries is due to lack of absorption capacity.29 This critical economic situation demands increase in employment opportunities by using all factors of production. *Economic Survey of Pakistan* reveals an increase in unemployment from 5.1% in 2007-08 to 6.2% in 2012-13.30 Unemployment is not the only reason of pushing doctors and other professionals outside Pakistan. A report published in *Daily Nation* (9 October 2008), suggested that terrorism and attacks on doctors are also major causes of brain drain in Pakistan. The data of the Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Pakistan shows that, since 2002, there has been threefold increase in migration to foreign countries.31 The countries such as Saudi Arabia, UAE, USA, UK, GCC countries and the EU countries are home to majority of Pakistani migrants. In the last five years, 2.7 million people have left the country in search of fortune abroad (*The Express Tribune*, 23 December 2013). The positive aspect of migration is that the country receives huge amount of remittances. Pakistan is second biggest receiver of remittance after India in South Asia. It received $ 1,289.46 millions for the year 2013-14, equal to 20 percent of the imports.32 It is important to mention that this trend of migration in search of jobs abroad has been going on ever since the establishment of Pakistan in 1947 (See figure 1), but it has significantly increased since 2001-02. Thus, terrorism and related reasons can be seen as contributing factors.

---

This brain drain is also happening due to the country’s present image and the level of economic development. According to Javaid, “Due to terrorism, polarization and lawlessness no one is ready to invest in the country”. According to Pakistan’s Board of Investment, FDI declined from US$5,409.90 million in 2007-08 to US$1447.3 million in 2012-13. This proves that the country having such a huge market is no more a favourite destination of foreign investors. Consequently, unemployment levels have increased – a phenomenon that affects youth (See figure 2). Facts relating to youth unemployment are alarming in Pakistan. According to a newspaper report, roughly 60 percent of Pakistan’s youth is unemployed. The same report also suggested that the youth unemployment rate is seven percent – comparing to the overall unemployment rate of five percent in the country. In addition, if we agree with Irshad’s point that unemployment is a major cause of militancy and brain drain then the above facts deserve a greater attention from policymakers.

Figure 2: Unemployment in Pakistan (percentage) 2007-08 to 2012-13

Poverty and deprivation

War on terror continues to affect Pakistan’s economy. *Economic Survey of Pakistan 2013-14* explains both direct and indirect impacts of terrorism on Pakistan. The survey found that, during ten years between 2001 and 2011, the direct and indirect costs of war on terror amounted to US$67.93 billion (See figure 3). By March 2014, it reached to US$ 102.51 billion (Rs. 8,264.40 billion). The crippling economy is supported by domestic and international debt. Constant increased occur in debt as has reached to 15,534 billion at the end of March 2014 from the last fiscal year by 8 percent. The mounting debt predicts future that is more critical if not utilized in productive project.

*Estimated based on nine month actual data (July-March).*

Due to lack of employment and educational opportunities, there is an increase in the involvement of youth in criminal activities. With increase in intensity of terrorist acts like kidnapping for ransom has increased. Terrorists are influencing not only the common people but also the business community and well-guarded politicians. Prominent figures such as sons of former Prime Minister Yousaf Raza Gilani and former Punjab governor have been kidnapped. Another example is that of when Vice Chancellor of Islamia College University Peshawar was released after several years after held hostage by terrorists (Haider and Anwar 2014). The businessmen in the economic hub of Pakistan (Karachi) have been kidnapped and released after paying millions in ransom.

Poverty eradication is an ongoing mission for the government of Pakistan and numerous international agencies, in particular the United Nations. However, a

---

39 Ibid.
41 Ibid, p. 132.
significant progress can only be made through development in the country, which has been constrained owing to challenges in the form of security and economic crises. The Global Financial Crisis (GFC) of 2008 also affected the economy of Pakistan with decline in exchange reserves, increase in twin deficits and fall in overall economic growth. The GDP growth declined from nine percent in 2005 to two percent in 2009.\textsuperscript{43} Before GFC, poverty had fallen to 22 percent but the economic crisis again increased that roughly 40 percent of the total population in 2009.\textsuperscript{44} Unfortunately, this has continued to happen, as Pakistan’s economy has not since recovered due to both internal and external factors, like GFC, poor governance, corruption etc.

According to Joshua, “poverty and deprivation” have driven hundreds of Pakistani youth towards terrorism.\textsuperscript{45} It is often discussed by scholars that poverty is the root cause of terrorism in Pakistan because it forces parents to send their children to madrassas (Islamic seminaries) where free of cost education is provided.\textsuperscript{46} As there are hundreds of madrassas in the country that are breeding grounds of terrorists; therefore, there is a causal link between deprivation and terrorism. A renowned Pakistani scholar, Moeed Yusuf, explains the links of poverty with terrorism in Pakistan:

Overwhelming majorities of radicalized youth are found to have a strong sense of being discriminated against and are alienated from the larger society. This in turn is believed to be a function of socio-economic deprivation. Poor education standards, lack of economic opportunities, and unequal access to avenues for social and economic mobilization are usually presence in countries that undergo radicalization among the young. The problem is often accentuated in societies which exhibit cultural polarization. Unfortunately, Pakistani society displays virtually all these symptoms.\textsuperscript{47}

There is a widespread understanding among the policymakers in Pakistan and beyond on the linkages between poverty and terrorism. Hina Rabbani Khar, former Foreign Minister of Pakistan, also pointed out the significance of eliminating policies and practices that alienate people and make them easy victims of exploitation at the hands of extremists.\textsuperscript{48} Marginalisation of certain segments – structural violence – is seen as a major cause of terrorism and extremism. We find

\textsuperscript{44} Ibid, p. 128.
the evidence for that if we look at places having strong presence of terrorists, such as FATA. This is a semi-autonomous region of Pakistan and long has been neglected in national developmental projects. Consequently, in FATA 45 percent of the population lives below the poverty line – higher than 40 percent at national level.49

Social deprivation in FATA has forced many young people to take arms and join Taliban. Youth can present severe threat if proper opportunities are not provided.50 It is still not clear if, since 2001, due to terrorism and counter-terrorism, the involvement of youth in terrorism has increased. Nonetheless, mainly due to terrorism/security challenges, a number of crises have surfaced in Pakistan. Among these challenges are problems linked to terrorism, for example economic crisis that have been party caused by reducing foreign investment in the country. Several industries, including the under-developed tourism industry has completely collapsed because of direct attacks on foreign tourists or due to the presence of insurgents in tourist spots within KP, such as the Malakand region.

There is a large portion of youth involved in terrorism to take revenge. This case is seen as a cause of an increasing number of youth from FATA launching terrorist attacks across Pakistan. According to a report published in the News (15 August 2013), youth from FATA was involved in an Eid Day (9 August 2013) attack on a mosque in Bhara Kahu, Islamabad. The monetary aspect of such risky job cannot be ignored. It is believed that the facilitator of terrorist attacks are getting huge sum of money, as each of the facilitators of Bhara Kahu mosque attack were supposed to get PKR 2.5 million.

Psychological Issues

People are feeling very insecure in Pakistan and this general feeling can be observed by analysing people’s behaviours. Terrorism is unlike traditional warfare because sometimes it is difficult to classify terrorists. The identification of terrorists is also difficult because there are diverse understandings of ‘terrorism’. Consequently, there is a lack of consensus on defining terrorism at global levels because one country’s freedom fighters are terrorists for another country.

In the case of Pakistan, it is also the invisibility of terrorists, which has spread the feelings of insecurity in the minds of the masses. This emotion has triggered some psychological problems, such as anxiety, depression etc. These problems are mostly identifiable among the youth because in some parts of the country they have been victims of direct and indirect exposure to terrorism. On the whole, everywhere in the country and everyone is experiencing indirect impacts of terrorism via mainly electronic media. According to a study conducted in Karachi, 91.5 percent university students were exposed to terrorism through TV channels.51 In addition, almost in all parts of the country there have been terrorist attacks; therefore, no one feels safe because even in the capital city, which is supposed to

be highly guarded, there have been terrorist attacks. Nevertheless, the level of insecurity is very high in places where people witness terrorism on regular basis e.g. Karachi, Peshawar, FATA, Quetta etc.

Changes in people’s behaviours can be studied to find out the seriousness of psychological issues, especially among the youth – the future of a country. Stress levels range from mild to strong among the youth in Pakistan. A research found 65.8 percent university students under mild stress in Karachi - the city's history of violence was reported as a cause of “resilience” among the youth.52 It is an astonishing fact that even under a lot of emotional stress caused by rising insecurity in Pakistan; people are not facing mental breakdowns. A study conducted on behaviours of youth found a reason of that, “youths are turning to religious groups to address their grievances”.53 This also reflects that the youth of Pakistan are turning to religion for dealing with their anxieties.

Growing Hatred

In the post 9/11 era, in general, people have developed negative feelings that are expressed via growing pessimism with regard to the future of Pakistan. A lot of actions of the US, for example drone attacks, Osama bin Laden operation etc., within South Asia, Pakistan and the Muslim world have triggered serious anti-US and even anti-West feelings among Pakistanis.54 These feelings are similar to the agenda that have been propagated by religious extremists; therefore, many people are vulnerable to exploitation at the hands of extremists groups. In addition, in aid dependent economies like Pakistan, drone attacks reflect the “helplessness” of the governments.55 People have already begun to talk on the uselessness of the newly democratic government of Pakistan Muslim League-Nawaz (PML-N) because the government has failed to produce a consensus towards a policy on drones or relations with the US. The masses continue to feel powerless because nothing has happened with regard to the overall improvement of security in the country. People continue to feel helpless and this feeling is triggering some psychological emotions, for example of hopelessness, that according to Michael (2007, 39) give way to terrorism.

The issue of drones is complex and demands a close investigation. The matter of drone strikes is an ongoing affair that continues to violate sovereignty in some countries, for example Afghanistan, Pakistan, Yemen and Somalia. What the US policymakers do not understand is the backlash of drones. Boyle (2013, 1) is of the view that the Times Square attack was a direct outcome of drone strikes in Afghanistan and Pakistan. From Pakistan, there has been a strong protest against drones. At international levels, debates are focusing on the legality of drones under international and domestic law. On 13 August 2013, at the inauguration of Centre for International Peace & Stability (CIPS) in Islamabad, United Nations Secretary General Ban Ki-moon emphasized on the significance of bringing the use of

54 Ibid, p. 492.
armed drones under international law (Daily Dawn, 2013). A report, ‘Living under Drones’ (2012, 80-81) reveals that people are under constant psychological fear, suffering from insomnia, sleeplessness, emotional itemisation, fainting, anxiety, stress and loss of appetite. The buzzing of drone over the head as experienced in Waziristan is constant massage of death from the sky. The people avoid social meetings like Jirga, funerals and marriage parties due to the fear of attack. Drones have increased insecurity by targeting social gathering places -- hujras, schools, markets, houses, mosque and madrassas resulting in socio-political and economic insecurities.

No one likes to leave his home and it is a genuine human feeling. In the case of Pakistan, as has been explained already, the government launched security operations for eradicating terrorism in places like Swat and FATA. Consequently, millions became homeless in the country by 2010. The process of IDPs return has not been completed because some parts are still faced with a lot of violence. However, wherever it is possible, IDPs are returning to their homes because there is no better alternative than living in own homes. This desire is evident from the return of 66,000 IDPs to their homes in Kurram, South Waziristan and Bajaur, in July 2013. With this homeless population, there emerged general challenges of paying for accommodation, food etc. A study on IDPs living in Peshawar explored that displaced persons, living either in camps or outside, face many challenges; however, the challenges of IDPs outside camps are greater because they have to find their own accommodation. IDPs are feeling increasingly vulnerable due to increasing home rents and food prices. Thus, IDPs have been exposed to some unique challenges causing extra psychological problems because their displaced lives were not made easier by relevant authorities. Hundreds of IDPs were reported to be facing with the problems of unemployment because they did not have proper documentation, for example, the National Identity Card. This has added to the level of grievances, especially, among the youth from conflict-affected areas, against the state.

Conclusion

The manner in which terrorists have affected the lives of millions, both directly and indirectly, in Pakistan is a mere reflection of the gravity of the problem. There have been frequent terrorist attacks in major cities like Karachi, Peshawar, Quetta, Islamabad and Lahore; therefore, a general feeling of insecurity has spread across the masses. Firstly, this insecurity continues to have negative impacts on the economic development in Pakistan because foreign investment has decreased causing an increase in unemployment. Secondly, people in general, are feeling powerless and stressed by combination of factors like terrorism, poverty, unemployment, corruption and others. The stress levels have been visible among the youth who are finding a remedy in religion for addressing their psychological

60 Ibid, p. 18.
Direct And Indirect Impacts Of Terrorism On Youth In Pakistan

troubles. Finally, a combination of both direct and indirect impacts of terrorism is having long-lasting developmental impacts on Pakistan, which is also evident by a massive brain drain in the country. Considering the fact that the country is home to a large portion of youth, there is an urgent need of devoting extra consideration to the special needs of youth under the present scenario, which is dominated by widespread terrorism.

References


