A History of Sindh from a Regional Perspective: Sindh and Making of Pakistan

Abstract

Historical literature is full of descriptions concerning the life, thoughts and actions of main Muslim central leadership of India, like the role of Quaid-i-Azam in the creation of Pakistan. However, enough literature on the topic, which can be easily accessed, especially in English, has not come to light on the efforts made by the political leadership of smaller provinces comprising today’s Pakistan during the Pakistan Movement. To fill the existing gap in historical literature this paper attempts to throw light on the contribution of Sindh provincial leadership. There are many factors which have prompted the present author to focus on the province of Sindh and its provincial leadership. Firstly, the province of Sindh enjoys the prominence for being the first amongst all the Muslim-majority provinces of undivided India to have supported the creation of Pakistan. The Sind Provincial Muslim League had passed a resolution on 10 October, 1938, urging the right of political self-government for the two largest religious groups of India, Muslims and Hindus, even before the passage of the Lahore Resolution for Pakistan in 1940. Secondly, the Sindh Legislative Assembly followed suit and passed a resolution in support of Pakistan in March 1943. Thirdly, it was the first Muslim-majority province whose members of the Legislature opted to join Pakistan on 26 June 1947. Fourthly, despite personal jealousies, tribal conflicts, thrust for power, the political leadership in Sindh helped Jinnah to achieve Pakistan. But few leaders of Sindh not only left the Muslim League, denied the two nation theory and ended up with the idea of Sindhu Desh (Independent Sindh vis a vis Pakistan). While investigating other dimensions of the Pakistan Movement and the role of Sindhi leaders this paper will also analyze the inconsistency of some of the Sindhi leaders regarding their position and ideologies. The underlying hypothesis of the paper is that G. M. Syed and few others adopted pragmatic approach towards politics and therefore clashed with those who had ideological foundations. However, two-nation theory on basis of Islam was the driving force which won the case for Pakistan in every Province of India including Sindh but the other approaches had serious implications on the future history of Pakistan.

Introduction

The province of Sindh occupied a key position in Allama Iqbal’s idea of Pakistan and in Quaid-i-Azam’s demand for a separate country therefore, without
its inclusion the establishment of Pakistan might have suffered a blow. Although Sindh, a Muslim majority Province, became a part of Pakistan but it was not an easy task which Muslim League accomplished successfully. The Muslim League had to face number of challenges especially the communal composition of the Sindh Legislative Council, opposition of the Congress, the splinter groups of G.M. Syed⁷ and the clash of personal interests among the Muslim provincial leaders like Ayub Khuhru⁸ and Ghulam Hussain Hidaytullah.⁹ All these challenges were really hard for Jinnah and the Muslim League in their attempt to bring the province of Sindh into the Federation of Pakistan. In a House of 60 members, where heavy weightage of 25:35 had been granted to non-Muslims vis a vis Muslims, Sindh Assembly voted in favor of Pakistan on June 26, 1947 and eventually Sindh became a part of Pakistan. Geographically Punjab and Sindh shared border with the future state of India. Congress and Hindus demanded partition of the Sindh on the same communal basis, on which Punjab and Bengal were being partitioned. The League stood for Sindh’s complete inclusion in Pakistan, therefore, the British allowed Sindh to join Pakistan, without partition. Therefore, there is a dire need to revisit the ideas, thoughts and actions of the main leaders of the province of Sindh in the light of Jinnah papers, Muslim League’s records, Wavell Papers, Mountbatten Papers and other important collections of historical documents.

The underlying hypothesis of this paper is to indicate that though few Sindhi Provincial Muslim League leaders remained more interested in their personal interest rather than working for the cause of the nation, yet overall Sindhi leadership supported the idea of Pakistan and tried to achieve under the leadership of Jinnah. They had been suffering from the personal jealousies, tribal strife and lust for power which were bitter realities of political culture in Sindh. Consequently, not only relations of some political leaders in Sindh collided with the main objective of the Central Muslims League but a serious communication gap between Centre-Province occurred that made the job of the central Muslim League more difficult to bring the Province in the fold of Pakistan. Though, the historical forces forced the Sindh Provincial Leaders to support the demand for Pakistan but personal, tribal and political tussles hampered the progress of Sindh in particular and Pakistan in general. Though there were some isolated voices against the creation of Pakistan, supported for united India in the last days of British Raj, for Sindhu Desh but this study will argue that the driving force behind the support from Sindh for the Pakistan movement were the historical forces, undercurrents of communal feelings and popularity of idea of Pakistan which drove its Sindhi provincial leadership to join the Federation of Pakistan. Therefore, this paper will, hopefully, while revising the general perception about the regional history of Sindh during the last twelve years of the British Raj in India, will help to fill an important gap in our existing historical literature.⁵

Separation of Sindh from Bombay

The province of Sindh, historically speaking, served as a gateway of Islam to India when Mohammad Bin Qasim captured Sindh and made it a part of the Islamic Empire. Since then the province remained under the Muslim rule till the annexation of Sindh by the East India Company in 1843. The British made it a part of the Bombay Presidency in 1847, which reduced it into one of the most ignored province under the Raj. The Muslims, who were in majority, were the
main losers because they remained behind in every walk of life. British policies, illiteracy, feudalism and powerful Hindu community were the key factors behind their backwardness.

The demand for separation of Sindh from Bombay became a bone of contention between Hindus and Muslims though Ghulam Muhammed Bhurgri and Harchandrai Vishindas had initiated the demand for separation of Sindh from Bombay in 1913. The matter of separation assumed a religious complexion when Hindu Mahasabha started a negative propaganda. Agreeing with Mahasabites leadership’s fears for Hindus in the Muslim majority Province, Mohan Karam Chand Gandhi also showed serious concern about the creation of the Muslim majority province in the Nehru Committee meetings. He was feared that the rights of the Hindus may not be best served in Sindh where Muslims would be in majority and therefore demanded political weightage and safeguards for Hindu population. However, Sindh was separated from Bombay Presidency and emerged as a Muslim majority Province on 1st April 1936 under Section 40(3) of Government of India Act, 1935.

Besides, Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah’s strong advocacy for separation of Sindh from Bombay at the Centre, the Muslim provincial leadership of Sindh including Khan Bahadur Ayub Khuhro, Sir Shahnawaz Bhutto and Ghulam Hussain Hidayatullah were also activists in their demand for separation of Sindh from Bombay.

However, Sindh was given a status of a full separate province in 1st April 1936 under the Indian Act of 1935. The Hindu communalists condemned the acceptance of separation by the British Government in their conference held on 26th January, 1936, at Karachi. However, the communal equilibrium was created with the creation of Advisory Committee consisted of Sir Ghulam Hussain Hidayatullah and Diwan Hiranand.

Though the Muslims of Sindh had been experiencing the communal sentiments partly because of regional estranged communal relations and partly due to the tussle between the Congress and League and mainly owing to the changing political landscape of Sindh, Sindh had emerged as a full province where electoral politics had to decide the fate of the people.

Broadly speaking, the Muslim society in India in general and in the Muslim majority provinces of Punjab, Bengal, NWFP and Sindh was divided into two strata - upper class and the lower class. The upper class consisted of landlord, whereas the lower class comprised mostly of peasants, laborers and artisans. In the absence of middle class, voting eligibility, patron-client relations were such factors that most of the Muslim leaders of these provinces belonged to the landed aristocracy. Besides landed aristocracy, Pir and Ulema were destined to play an important role in the future politics of Sindh. These changes helped the Muslim leaders to capitalize their interests in the last years of the British Raj and dominated the political affairs of the Sindh by taking advantage of economic plight of laborers, artisans and Hari (peasants) and lower strata of the society. Two factors anti-imperialist sentiments and anti-Hindu feeling, mainly enabled Muslim League to get the support for the creation of Pakistan, because of the exploitation of the Muslims by the Hindus moneylender and bureaucracy.
Muslim separatism in the province.

The Muslims separatism became more evident after the First World War owing to number of factors. From Sir Syed Ahmed Khan to Sir Allama Muhammad Iqbal, the Muslims had been feeling that the Hindus would use their numerical superiority to politically crush them in India. Their fears proved correct during the Congress Ministries in 1937-1939 and this paved the way for the demand for the partition of India. The plan of partition of India into Muslim and Hindu Zones was first suggested in the Allahabad session of the All-India Muslim League on 29 October, 1930. Allama Muhammad Iqbal put forward his proposal for the making of the Muslim majority provinces in the North-West of India into a single Federation, within or without the British Empire. Subsequently, following Allama Iqbal’s streak, Chaudhary Rahmat Ali, a student at Cambridge, named the proposed federation as Pakistan in 1933.

The projections of the religious notions boosted the idea of a separate homeland. These circumstances led many provincial organizations and political groups to join the Muslim League. In Sindh the movement for a Muslim state was taken as deliverance from the British hegemony. Class conflict coupled with religious coloring enabled the Muslim leadership to claim that a separate homeland would help Muslims to prosper vis a vis the predominance of Hindu businessmen and industrialists in the majority Muslim provinces. Consequently, the peasants, most of the landlords, some of the artisans, merchants and manufacturers rallied behind the Muslim political parties including the Muslim League. The Congress attracted the overwhelming Hindus who were moneylenders, major industrialists, merchants and the government servants.

Role in Pakistan Movement

The Muslim League had become popular with Muslim population in Sindh because of its historic role for separating Sindh from Bombay. Since then the League had transformed into a mass organization. The historic Sind Provincial League Conference was called on 8-13 October, 1938, at Karachi by Sir Haji Abdullah Haroon. Leading Muslim leaders like A. K. Fazlul Haq, Sadullah Khan, Sir Sikandar Hayat Khan, Maulana Shaukat Ali, Nawabzada Liaquat Ali Khan, Chaudhry Khaliquzzaman and Jinnah attended the conference. From Sindh, among others Allah Bakhsh Soomro, Pir Elahi Bakhsh, Haji Abdullah Haroon, Sir Ghulam Husain Hidayatullah, G. M. Syed and Jamal Khan Leghari participated in it. The conference was presided over by Quaid-i-Azam.

Sindh Muslim League and demand for a separate homeland

Following Allama Iqbal and Chaudhry Rahmat Ali’s streak Sir Abdullah Haroon emphasized the need for an independent confederation for the Muslims of India. Jinnah spelled out his concept of Muslims separatism and accused the Congress for dividing them. He warned that this would result in the division of India. Sheikh Abdul Majid Sindhi in his speech, threatened "if the Congress did not concede Muslim rights, Muslims would have no alternative but to fall back upon the Pakistan scheme," and also, "nothing would prevent Muslims from Karachi to Calcutta marching to their self-determination." Sheikh Abdul Majid Sindhi mooted a resolution in the Subject Committee of the Conference that a
separate homeland for the Indian Muslims should be created in the Muslim majority provinces. The conference, suggested to work out a scheme of a constitution under which Muslim majority areas inhabited by Muslims may be given full freedom in the form of a federation.19

The Lahore Resolution and Consequent Developments in Sind

Jinnah was of the view that the major shift in the Muslim League’s main objective should be put such kind of resolution at the national level meeting. Therefore, the Muslim League appointed a committee under Jinnah, to examine the various constitutional schemes.20 The Working Committee after examining the various proposals adopted a resolution which was moved by Mr. Fazlul Haq and seconded by Chaudhry Khaliquzzaman on 23 March, 1940, at Lahore. Sindhi Leaders, namely Khan Bahadur Khuhro, Abdul Majid Sindhi and G.M. Syed participated the meeting and supported the resolution. Sir Abdullah Haroon, representing the Sindh’s Muslim’s voice, in his speech; claimed that Muslims from the Sindh were the first to face this matter, which Muslim League was facing in1938.

Since the Lahore Resolution could be interpreted as an envisagement for the creation of two federations, it was later used by Bengali nationalists who advocated for their independence on the pretext that it was envisaged in the Lahore Resolution. The phrase indicating the quantum of autonomy for the constituent units was also time and again used by the autonomy of Sind, Baluchistan and the N.W.F.P. to voice against the alleged domination of the Centre.21

Despite its ambiguity, the Lahore Resolution was supported by the Provincial League. All the branches of the Sind Muslim League held meetings and adopted resolutions endorsing the demand of Pakistan articulated in the Lahore Resolution. However, the Muslim press of Sind was very enthusiastic about the new demand. The daily Al-Wahid, Karachi, which had earlier championed the Khilafat and separation movement, became the organ of the Sind Muslim League. Having earned popularity and prestige among the Muslims of Sind, for the support extended to their cause, this paper had been instrumental in the mass mobilization for the Muslim League demand.

The Sind Provincial Muslim League Council formed an organizing Committee under G. M. Syed22 to further expanding the work of the organization activities. The Organizing Committee drew up an extensive programme and G. M. Syed undertook a detailed tour of the province, establishing a contact with the masses. During his tour, Muslim League committees and branches were set up in every place he visited. After the formation of the progressive Muslims group headed by G. M. Syed, it appeared that when the Sukkur riots had broken out, the making and unmaking of the ministries had resulted in an indifference of the masses towards the government affairs and increased their miseries and poverty. They, therefore, sought to approach and organize the people in order to get an unshakable hold over the Muslim League organization. The leadership of the Provincial Muslim League at that time was least interested in the organization of
the party. Their only objective was to become as well as to remain minister by hook or by crook.

G. M. Syed showed his immense talents in organizing the Muslim League in the Province. It was because of his efforts that the leaders of the Sind Hari Committee also joined the Muslim League and supported the Pakistan movement. This policy resulted in carrying the slogan of Pakistan amongst the down-trodden *haris* of Sind, who composed bulk of the Sindhi population. The *haris* saw in Pakistan a relief from their indebtedness to Hindu *Bania*s, the allocation of lands snatched by Hindus absentee landlords, the freedom from the feudal corruption and a flourishing future. Therefore, they supported the Pakistan movement wholeheartedly, giving the Sind Muslim League a mass base in the province.

The Sindh League Conference Resolution marked a new departure in League’s thinking which prepared the way for the establishment two years after the League’s ultimate goal of Pakistan in the Lahore Resolution in 1940. Again it was the Sindhi Muslim who championed the cause of separate homeland for the Muslims in India and in this connection G.M. Syed put forth on March 3, 1943 a resolution in the Sindh Assembly which officially passed and endorsed the principles of the Lahore resolution for creation of a separate homeland for the Indian Muslims. This resolution bound Sindh to all India Muslim League and its goal for common cause and purpose. He committed Sindh to Pakistan wholeheartedly, unconditionally without any reservation.

Though Jinnah’s demand for an independent Muslim State based on the Lahore Resolution remained his inflexible stance, but a few times, some of the Sindh Provincial Muslim League leaders hardly expressed their views in line with Jinnah’s demand for Pakistan. When few leaders of the Bengal Provincial Muslim League argued the establishment of an independent united Bengal, handful Sind Muslim League leaders also tended to support the setting up of a sovereign Muslim State in Sindh. However, anti-thesis to two nation theory and the demand for a separate homeland sprouted out in the Sindhi Muslim leadership because of their personal jealousies and bid for higher position in the ministries and the Muslim League party. G. M. Syed pioneered this change of ideology when the Pakistan Movement was in its full swing in Sindh.

**Power Politics: Sindh Ministries**

In Sindh, though many of them were either members of the Muslim League or the Congress, still the Muslim leaders established their own political parties to contest provincial elections because of communal representation in the Legislature. For instance Abdullah Haroon formed Sindh United Party, Sheikh Abdul Majid Sindh formed Sindh Azad Party and Sir Ghulam Hussain Hidayatullah formed Sindh Muslim Political Party. In Sindh after elections, two ministries were headed by Muslim premiers namely Sir Ghulam Hussain Hidayatullah and Khan Bahadur Allah Baksh. As the Muslim members in Sindh Assembly were divided in several groups, both premiers depended for their survival on Hindu support. Congress used this situation and became king maker. To counter the manipulation of Congress in Sindh, Muslim leaders decided to revive the Muslim League in Sindh. The Sind Provincial Muslim League
Conference revived the Sind Muslim League and nominated Haji Abdullah Haroon, Pir Ali Muhammad Rashdi and Sir Ghulam Husain as President, Vice-President, General Secretary, Joint Secretary and Treasurer, respectively.  

After the Conference, in order to form the Muslim League’s Assembly Party in the Sindh Quaid held a meeting with the Muslim members of Sindh Assembly.

The meeting was attended by Allah Bakhsh Soomro, Ghulam Husain Hidayatullah, Mir Bande Ali Talpur, Sir Haji Abdullah Haroon and G. M. Syed and many others. It was decided in the meeting that the Sindh Assembly’s Muslim members should join the Muslim League Assembly Party, which would decide its leader by a majority vote. The Allah Bakhsh group refused to join the Muslim League unless Mr. Soomro was supported by the Muslim League as Premier.

Allah Bux Soomro, (1900-1943) laid the foundation of Sind Ittehad Party and became the Chief Minister of Sindh from March 23, 1938 to April 18, 1940, and March 7, 1941 to October 14, 1942. He had secular approach to deal with the communal tangle in India; therefore, he can be categorized as “a nationalist Muslim”.  

The Muslim League Assembly Party’s leader was Ghulam Husain with Mir Bande Ali as its deputy leader.  G. M. Syed, who had utilized the Muslim League Conference platform in discrediting the Allah Bakhsh ministry, convinced the Assembly Party that during the Budget Session a no-confidence movement should be started in the Sindh Assembly. G. M. Syed moved the non-confidence movement which was supported by Sir Ghulam Husain. But after four days, when the Assembly discussion started, the leader and the deputy leader of Sindh Muslim League Assembly Party joined Soomro ministry. The 29 Muslim members had undertaken to dismantle the ministry but when the voting started only seven members supported it. The position of the Muslim League was weakened by the resignation of the leader and the deputy leader.

In order to gain mass support and also to weaken the Soomro ministry the Working Committee of the Sind Muslim League at its meeting in March 1939 decided to raise the Manzilgah Masjid issue.  The opportunity the League needed to challenge the Allah Bakhsh Government came in 1939 during an agitation resulting from the disputed status of a domed building in the northern Sindh town of Sukkur. This site, Manzilgah by name (meaning a place of rest), was in the Government’s hands but the Sukkur Muslims claimed the building was really a mosque and should be restore to the Muslim community. The Working Committee was certainly aware of the fact that through a similar issue, i.e. Masjid Shaheed Ganj agitation, the Unionist Party of the Punjab had succeeded in curtailing the growing influence of Ahrars and won the provincial elections. Similarly, the Allah Bakhsh ministry, through the agitation on communal lines, could be cornered and isolated from the Muslim masses. A Restoration Committee was formed which called upon all the Muslims of Sind to celebrate the 18th of August as Masjid Manzilgah Day. A satyagraha movement was started from 1st October, 1939.  Hundreds of Muslims were arrested, and occupied the Masjid, right from 3rd October to 19th November, 1939.  So far as the Muslims were concerned, they had decided that until Government gave their final decision, one
way or the other, they would peacefully offer themselves in their thousands for arrest and face all the consequences. On the morning of 19th November, the government arrested the leaders of the movement. The government’s employment of force followed the tragic riots in Sukkur where 151 Hindus and 14 Muslims were killed.

The Hindus felt that Allah Bakhsh ministry is not able to provide security to them and their property. As a result, the Hindu minister resigned from the ministry and chose to sit on the opposition benches. The Hindu Panchayat prepared 21 point demands to safeguard the interests of Hindus negating the Manzilgah agitation, and pressed upon the ministry for the acceptance of the points which Allah Bakhsh refused. The final draft containing twenty-one demands of the Hindus was prepared by Mr. Nihchaldas.

But the Muslim League felt no hesitation coming down from its professed stand and accepted the 21 point demands of Hindu Panchayat. The collaboration of Muslim League with Hindu Panchayat resulted in the formation of a new Assembly Party, the Sind Nationalist Party. The Sind Muslim League went so far in search of office that did away with the Muslim League Assembly Party. After the fall of the Soomro ministry, the Governor invited Mir Bande Ali on 18th March, 1940 to form the ministry. The new ministry included Nehchaldas Vazirani, Muhammad Ayub Khuho, Sheikh Abdul Majid Sindhi, Gokaldas Rai and G. M. Syed.

The Bandeh Ali Khan Talpur formed ministry on 18 March, 1940, as a result of settlements when compromises could not improve the situation created by the communal riots. Through the good efforts of Maulana Azad who was invited, particularly for the purpose by the leaders of the Sind Muslim League, a coalition ministry was formed. Jinnah not only disapproved the Azad Pact but also recommended that it would be better if all the Muslim ministers, including Allah Bakhsh group should join Muslim League. He also advised that in case of Allah Bakhsh’s refusal the League minister must resign from the cabinet. Unfortunately, on refusal of Allah Bakhsh to join the Muslim league party. His ministry was dismissed and was replaced with the Mir Bandeh Ali Khan Ministry on April 18, 1940 and this ministry is known as Muslim League ministry. His ministry was also defeated on March 7, 1941.

Khan Bahadur Allah Bakhsh Soomro was reappointed as Premier of Sindh. He formed the ministry of Ittehad Party which consisted of Ghulam Hussain, Pir Elahi Bakhsh and Pirzada Abdul Sattar. The Allah Bakhsh ministry supported the Quit India Movement and Allah Bakhsh, on the call of the Congress, in public abandoned his titles in protest. Consequently, the Governor of Sindh terminated Allah Bakhsh. To form a new ministry Sir Ghulam Husain was called upon.

At that time Ghulam Husain was not in a position to form his ministry therefore, he negotiated with the Muslim League Assembly Party and some ministries were offered to them, in lieu of their support in the Assembly. There was a difference of opinion in the Muslim League members about accepting Ghulah Hussain Hidayatullah’s offer. Ayub Khuho and G. M. Syed group was in favor to join the ministry but Sheikh Abdul Majid Sindhi group opposed it. However, the Muslim League accepted their offer with this condition that Sir
Ghulam Hussain Hidayatullah should join the Muslim League party which he complied and was successful in forming ministry.\textsuperscript{44}

Muslim League expanded its organization and political activities during the Ghulam Husain ministry. Most of the Muslim members were gathered under the Muslim League. 29 out of 35 Muslim members of the Assembly supported the Muslim League Assembly and thus G. M. Syed moved a resolution in the Sind Legislative Assembly on March 3, 1943 supporting the Lahore Resolution to its demand for Pakistan.\textsuperscript{45}

The resolution was passed by 24 Muslim members. Allah Bakhsh did not attend the session. Out of 60 members, only 27 were present, whereas 11 Muslim members did not attend the session. The Hindu ministers and the Parliamentary Secretary opposed the resolution and it was unique act of the Sind legislature that it was pioneer in supporting the Lahore resolution and the demand for Pakistan as 29 members out of 35 Muslims members supported the resolution.

Quaid-i-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah, after realizing the seriousness of the situation, decided to visit the province of Sindh in June 1943. He brought a couple of change to avoid misunderstandings among the provincial leaders and the smooth running of provincial and party mattes. In this regard, he asked Ayub Khuhro to relinquish the seat of president of Muslim League branch of the Sindh and he appointed G. M. Syed as President of the Sind Provincial Muslim League.

G. M. Syed acted as Chairman and Yusuf Haroon as Secretary of the Reception Committee in the Muslim League’s annual session which was held in Karachi on 24th December, 1943.\textsuperscript{46} Thirty-first Session of the AIML was held at Karachi with Jinnah as President and G.M Syed as Chairman. In the welcome address, G. M. Syed explained the thought of the leaders of Sindhi Muslims about the partition of India.

\textbf{Rivalries/ Personal Jealousies}

In the beginning of 1940 the government of Allah Bksh was still in power but due to communal rivalries it seemed difficult that government would stay longer because before the session of Assembly two Hindu ministers resigned due to the pressure from their community. However Allah Bakhsh tried to continue without the support of these ministers and he himself took the portfolios of his departed ministers. Despite of all his efforts the Assembly was three weeks old when his government faced a defeat during voting session on making an amendment in a bill. Due to this loss he presented his resign to the Governor.\textsuperscript{47}

But governor did not accept his resign and asked him to stay on until a new government could be formed. This state of affair in Sindh province encouraged the political intrigue as many other political groups and parties tried to gain control of new government. Khuroo as leader of the Muslim League also tried to capture the ministerial office. Haroon who was president of Sindh League also instructed the party leadership not to enter in an alternate coalition ministry as the result will be jeopardizing of Muslim interests. But Khuro was in favor of making coalition government and he was successful in persuading Harron and Quaid-i-Azam to make government with Hindu Independent Party.\textsuperscript{48}
The political situation in Sindh remained fluid for many weeks because Allah Baksh was trying to keep his crippled government, while other parties were trying to negotiate with each other for power. Finally in March a new party took shape with the name of Nationalist party but basically it was expedient of two Assembly parties. This alliance had the serious backing in Assembly which this party was managed to convert into majority support by winning over Mir Bandeh Ali with the promise that he would be next Chief Minister so with this majority Party asked Mir to form the new government.\(^49\) New cabinet consisted of six ministers in all, four Muslims and two Hindus. The main task of this Assembly was to take the challenge of healing the province’s communal wounds. Its new Chief Minister also alluded that this new ministry would work for communal peace. Due to this stance of party there was a hope that this government would survive very long but Graham the Governor was hardly optimistic that this government would work for last because he had no trust on the weak leadership of Mir Bandeh Ali.

Same views were expressed by G.M. Syed that Mir Bandeh Ali was a gentleman, honest and harmless but he has lack of leadership qualities.\(^50\)

This government introduces the bill of joint electorates and passed it on 1 April, 1940. This bill was against the ideology of separate electorate. This passage of bill showed the weak strength of Muslim League and absence of Haroon’s interest, and created vacuum which was filled by Sheikh Abdul Majid, Khuro and Syed. Though joint electorate issue created split in the ranks of Sindh League because Haroon wanted to keep electorate separate as was the all India League’s policy while Syed and the others were thinking about communal peace and were supporting joint electorate. But Haroon was the influential one so on 19, 20 and 21 April the League took a hard line position over the electorate issue. These meetings not only reaffirmed the Lahore Resolution but also laid stress over the separate electorates.\(^51\)

Although League had favored the separate electorate but its confidence over the government was weak because at one point they were satisfaction for the government but they were also criticizing government for the Manzilgah issue. On the other hand Haroon and League ministers were in tussle which made the positions of these ministers vulnerable. Due to this vulnerability and weak leadership of Mir it was difficult that League would form any new ministry in future. By the end of summer the ministry was very weak even G.M. Syed who was education minister, wished to resign and also approached Allah Baksh to form two cabinets so that the former chief minister could join hands with the League but he refused by saying this he would accept this offer only when Mir Bandeh Ali will retire and Khuro will resign from the ministry altogether. The political situation was unstable in Sindh throughout the month of October because Hindu Independent Party was also regretting in making government with League.\(^52\)

This political deadlock was sorted out with the involvement of Moulana Azad as he was told by Congress leaders that main reason of political instability is the disunity among Muslims\(^53\) so he suggested that Allah Baksh would become Chief Minister but the acceptance of this settlement did not end the intrigue between the parties. At that time G.M. Syed was the one who persuaded Allah Baksh to join the cabinet without delay. After sometime there was issue between
Haroon and Syed on the Azad Pact, and because of this issue G.M. Syed resigned. Now it was clear that Sindh League was in trouble and Jinnah’s presence was needed to solve the problems, so when Jinnah arrived in Sindh, he quickly observed that the main causes of Sindh’s trouble were the unsatisfactory behavior of League ministers. So he suggested that new elections should be observed but this was turned down by the Governor of Sindh. Due to Jinnah’s untiring efforts League got boom which made Congress fearful so they approached Allah Baksh and offered their support to make him Prime Minister if he would leave Mir Bandeh Ali’s ministry but G.M. Sayed on hearing this, approached Allah Baksh quickly and offered him ministry on behalf of Muslim League but Jinnah and Haroon asked him to offer his services for reorganizing the Muslim League. Meantime Khuro was also busy in building his own politics he also wrote to the League’s president a formula for the ministry formation proposed by Allah Baksh but Jinnah’s patience was losing due to ceaseless pattern of Sindh’s politics. According to Sikandar Hayat, Jinnah asked Leaguers to band together and submit to League’s authority so again a new ministry was formed under Allah Baksh in which Muslim League was in opposition.  

One of the main features of the provincial leadership was their personal and tribal jealousies and at that time what was mattering in Sind was the struggle for office. G. M. Syed claims that the ideological clash he had with the other Muslim League leadership is baseless. It may be categorized that the tussle was mainly because of personal interest or vested interest or tribal or economic and local. Unfortunately, a rivalry started between Khuhro and Syed groups to get the control of the Muslim League party, because of the expected Provincial League elections in June 1943. The enrollment of primary membership started on a massive scale and new branches were formed in remote areas. The two groups tried to dominate the entire organization, which resulted in brisk competition between the two groups.

G. M. Syed wanted to control all provincial affairs of the Muslim League party including the nomination of the candidates for the forthcoming elections. Besides, he rigorously started criticizing his own ministry which could not be approved, either by provincial or the central Muslim League party.

The supporters of G. M. Syed moved a no confidence move against Ghulam Hussain Hidayatullah and as a result, the ministry was defeated by 25 votes (including 14 of Muslim League Assembly Party).

The Sind Parliamentary Board called applications for January 1946 elections. G.M. Syed wanted to finalize most of the applications for the elections. But other leaders did not like his authoritative attitude and therefore the case was referred to the central working committee. When Jinnah tried to impose the party discipline, G. M. Syed reacted strongly, which was considered as indiscipline on G.M. Syed’s part. He said “Mr. Jinnah had placed before me only two alternatives; either unconditional surrender before his commands, or the paring of
the ways, I made my choice and parted from him”. But G.M. Syed may have miscalculated his strategy; chose wrong timings for rebellion but his integrity and sincerity were beyond doubts.  

Anyhow the Sind Muslim League contested all the 35 Muslim seats and got 28 candidates elected. The other 3 Muslim seats went to a Nationalist Muslim group headed by Maula Bakhsh Soomro.  

The party position in the new Assembly was:

- Muslim League: 28
- Congress: 21
- Progressive League: 4
- Nationalist Muslims: 3
- Europeans: 3
- Labor: 1

A coalition was formed between the Syed group, the Congress and the nationalist Muslims party to contest the elections. This division in the Muslim League proved fatal because the Muslim League could not continue in power because of no confidence movement by the opposition.

In fact, Sir Francis Mudie, the Governor of Sind, called upon Ghulam Husain to form the ministry. There was a bigger surprise waiting for the whole province when it was announced that the Governor had called upon Sir Ghulam Hussain to undertake the formation of the ministry. On 19th March, 1946, in the session of the Assembly, the opposition moved a no-confidence motion and in order to save the ministry, the Speaker of the Assembly resigned so that his vote may be exercised in favour of Ghulam Husain ministry. This move was countered by the threat of Deputy Speaker, Miss Jethi’s resignation. G.M Syed was very active in removing the Ghulam Husain’s ministry even he also requested Governor of Sindh to remove Ghulam Husain because he could not get vote of confidence. Ghulam Husain resigned and a constitutional deadlock crept in the Assembly. The Governor dissolved the Assembly and ordered re-elections.

The 1946 elections provided an opportunity to the Muslim League to organize the Muslims of Sind around it and gain support for Pakistan demand. The elections reflected the alignment of the forces in the province with a Muslim majority. They indicated that the non-Muslim League organizations had little influence among the Muslim masses, and that the National Congress had lost its hold on the middle strata of Muslims and was restricted to Hindu support only. The Muslim intelligentsia followed the League’s lead and supported the Muslim separatism and the demand for Pakistan. The momentum on the Pakistan demand was so high that even the anti-Muslim League candidates could not dare to oppose the Pakistan Scheme.

In the re-elections of December 1946, Sind Muslim League showed its real strength and won 33 out of the 35 contested seats, whereas the Congress won 20 seats and the rest went to Europeans and the Jami’at. The Sind Muslim League set all forces and resources at its command to win the elections. Ghulam Husain Hidayatullah, a Muslim League leader, once again became the Premier of Sind. Although, there were 25 members of the assembly who were aspirant of
becoming premier, but Quaid-i-Azam ensured Sir Ghulam Husain’s premiership, thinking him the most suitable leader at that time.69

When the British Cabinet Delegation reached India to find out the communal settlement and to retain unity of India, the Muslim League decided to convene a convention of the Muslim legislators to come up with the unambiguous demand for Pakistan. The convention of the Muslim League legislators, Central and Provincial, was held on April 7-9, 1946, at Delhi.70 A Subjects Committee was constituted, consisting of 10 per cent of the legislators in each province. Sind was represented on the Subjects Committee by Haji Ali Akbar Saheb, Agha Badruddin and Mahmud Haroon. The Subjects Committee took five hours to discuss the draft of the Open Session. On April 9, 1946, the Open Session of the Convention solidly passed a resolution which clearly showed that Pakistan was envisioned to be a single independent state, thus amending the Lahore Resolution of 1940.

So when all the efforts to keep India united under Cabinet Mission Plan arrangement failed,71 the British government announced Partition Plan on June 3, 1947. In a radio broadcast on the same day, Jinnah gave his approval to the Plan and the Council of All India Muslim League formally accepted the Plan on June 5, 1947.72 After the announcement of the Partition Plan and its subsequent acceptance by the All India Muslim League, the Legislative Assembly of Sindh met at Karachi on June 26, 1947 and passed the following resolution:

“The Assembly resolves that the province will not participate in the existing Constituent Assembly, and hereby decide to be in new separate Constituent Assembly, referred to in paragraph 4, subparagraph (b) of the British government Plan of Division of India”.73

Thirty-three votes were in favour and twenty against the resolution. One Congress member, who had not taken oath because he wanted to keep his Central Assembly seat, and two nationalist Muslims, Muhammad Khan Khoso and K.B. Moula Baksh, did not attend the Assembly Session. The three European members abstained. Thus the Resolution was passed and Sindh became 1st province to join the federation of Pakistan.74

Conclusion

Muslim League encountered enormous challenges in Sindh such as the communal composition of the Sindh Legislative Council, Congress opposition, G.M. Syed’s splinter group and clash of personal interests between provincial Muslim leaders, Ayub Khuhru and Ghulam Hussain Hidaytullah.75

A number of factors together with the introduction of modern education, emergence of political parties, Khilafat Movement, Hindu revival movements and the movement for separation of Sindh from Bombay had awakened the Muslims of Sindh and enabled Sindh’s Muslim leadership to attempt to become free of Hindu money-lenders and the British raj. However, their job was made difficult
by their own vested interests. It was the working of provincial autonomy under the Government of India Act 1935 which put the political, religious and other leadership to test in the churning waters of Sindhi politics. Political parties and their leaders suffered from personal jealousies and many amongst them had a very pragmatic approach towards their personal interests in politics. When their pragmatism clashed with the ideological theory of the central leadership of the Muslim League, essentially, Quaid-i-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah, they either revolted or compromised but could not accept the two-nation theory in reality. G.M. Syed was the prime example amongst such opportunists. Although, Muslim political forces in Sindh overwhelmingly favored the creation of Pakistan, however, many of the main political actors in Sindh were dead-set against any transgression of their personal interests even for that noble cause. The colonial legacy of factionalism in the Sindh Muslim League leadership continued for some time which created tensions between the Center and the Province. G. M. Syed carved out of small but solid niche of scholars and ‘progressives’ when he raised the slogan of Sindhu Desh after his expulsion from the All India Muslim League membership in 1945. In fact it was Zulifiqar Ali Bhutto who can be considered as having carried forward the legacy of Jinnah because it was he who, for the first time in the post-1947 period, truly won the hearts of West Pakistanis, including the Sindhis, for championing their causes through his progressive ideas. Thus centrifugal elements were eventually curtailed in Sindh. Though Z. A Bhutto’s Pakistan People’s Party has been in power for last many years but now new actors including Mohajar Qaumi Movement, Pakistan Tehrik-i-Insaf and others, have come into play, because of new dimensions in the province of Sindh particularly demographical changes in the main cities, and are playing their respective, constructive roles in the Sindh politics.

Notes & References

2Ghulam Murtaza Shah (popularly known as G.M. Syed) was a Sindhi politician of politician. He played a prominent and progressive role in Pakistan movement. Allen Keith Jones, Politics in Sindh (1907-1940): Muslim Identity and the Demand for Pakistan (Karachi: OUP, 2003), 19.
3Khuhrro was an outstanding leader but he interfered too much in other Ministers’ Department. Therefore he was generally unpopular in the ministry. He was Sindh’s first premier in 1937. Allen Keith Jones, Politics in Sindh (1907-1940) Muslim Identity and the Demand for Pakistan, 32.
6He was a Hyderabad based barrister and jagirdar and was member of Bombay Presidency Muslim League. He was also in favour of separation of Sindh. Allen Keith Jones, Politics in Sindh(1907-1940) Muslim Identity and the Demand for Pakistan, 12.
7There were a number of suggestions regarding future of Sindh and one such suggestion was that Sindh should be absorbed in the Punjab province. The British government also admitted that Sindh was an autonomous territorial unit who was not expecting much from Bombay government.
8Allen Keith Jones, Politics in Sindh(1907-1940) Muslim Identity and the Demand for Pakistan, 24.
The Hindus dominated in business, government services and even in the educational establishment of Sindh. On 20 August, 1932, a meeting of the Sindh Azad Conference presided over by Sir Shahnawaz Bhutto decided to celebrate September 16, 1932 as a 'Separation Day' all over the Sindh. Therefore, 'Separation Day' was observed with enthusiasm and meetings were held in all major cities in support of the demand of the separation of Sindh against which the Hindu communalists campaigned.

11 The fears of Hindus about their vulnerability increased when Sindh was separated from Bombay and was raised to a full province. The Hindu Muslim riots increased, particularly after the outbreak of Majid Manzilgah dispute. Ahmed Saleem, Partition of India: The Case of Sindh Migration (Islamabad: Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI), 2004), 1-29.

12 Sir Lancelot Graham became the first Governor of Sindh.

13 The above mentioned factors led to the formation of Sind Hari Committee, which was established in 1930. It demanded from the government that state lands should be allotted to haris the Lloyd Barrage areas as 'harapgrants'.


15 K. K. Aziz has recorded a number of acts that the Congress ministries adopted which were viewed as anti-Muslims in India. The adoption of Bande Mataramas the national anthem by the Congress, legislation prohibiting the killing of cows, and the compulsory teaching of Hindi in schools outraged the Muslim. The League also took advantage of the fact that many of the Congress ministries failed to take account of the national, religious and linguistic makeup of the various areas under their authority. K.K. Aziz, History of Idea of Pakistan, Vol 1. (Islamabad: National Commission on Historical and Cultural Research, 1978).

16 After realizing that Hindu dominated everything the Muslim elite class in Sindh visualized their emancipation from the hegemony of Hindus.

17 The Hindus dominated in business, government services and even in the educational establishment of the province. But there was also a fairly ambitious section of big Sindh Muslim industrialists such as Haroons, Currimbhoys and Allah Bakhshs.

18 Quaid hoisted the flag of AIML and various resolutions were made that Raja Mehmudabad and Sir Currimbho, Ibrahim would be appointed as treasurer of fund committee. In this meeting there was a veiled reference of idea of Pakistan when Haroon addressed with this conference. It was also recommended to review and revise the whole idea of Indian Constitution so that an honourable status should be provided to the Muslims. Riaz Ahmad, All India Muslim League and Creation of Pakistan: A Chronology (1906—1947), (Islamabad: NHCR, 2006), 68.

19 The resolution submitted in the Sindh Conference was of paramount importance because if we compare it with the Lahore Resolution, it seems clearer in its demand for a separate homeland. However, the central Muslim League leadership agreeing in principle with the essence of the resolution thought that this kind of resolution should be passed at the national level. Therefore, the draft resolution was not approved by the Subjects Committee, but it recommended the revision of 1935 Act and to suggest a new constitution suitable for Muslims of India.

20 Working Committee at its meeting held on 26 March, 1939. Ahmad, All India Muslim League and Creation of Pakistan, 77.

21 The Lahore Resolution dealt with two questions of federation and communalism in accordance with the ‘Two Nation Theory’. The Lahore Resolution was far from simple because the historians have interpreted it in more than one way. The ambiguity of the Resolution was the result of the fact that it actually was an exercise accommodating in one document, a number of divergent schemes and proposals. Anyways, the Muslim League leaders while adopting the Resolution held the idea of two separate federations of Muslim provinces and the States but the Lahore Resolution was amended in April 1941.


23 These Committees were formed to instill a coordinated effort to counter the exploitation of the Hari community of Sindh Province, and for those exploited, oppressed and subjected to unreasonable exaction to be provided with a platform for joint action against the Jagirdar’s and zamindars. Ahmad Salim, Peasant Land Rights Movements of Pakistan, (Islamabad: Sustainable Development Policy Institute, 2008), 11.

24 Peasants of Sindh Province.

25 He was member of working committee of AIML at that time..Riaz Ahmad, All India Muslim League and Creation of Pakistan, 122.
In the second session of League G.M. Syed was also present among those who were on dais. Syed

After the enactment of Government of India Act, Sindh was granted provincial autonomy and thus

This party was formally inaugurated on 9 June, 1936 at residence of a merchant Sir Abdullah Haroon with the aim to uproot the rural indebtedness, oppression and corruption but growth of this party was slow and irregular. Allen Keith Jones, Politics in Sindh (1907-1940) Muslim Identity and the Demand for Pakistan, 48-52.

This party was established in a joint meeting of Karachi Khilafat Committee, Sindh Hari Association and Sindh branch of Jamiat Ulema-i-Hind held in Karachi in September, 1935. Sheikh Abdul Majid Sindi was made its provincial leader. Allen Keith Jones, Politics in Sindh (1907-1940) Muslim Identity and the Demand for Pakistan, 39.

This party was formally inaugurated on 9 June, 1936 at residence of a merchant Sir Abdullah Haroon with the aim to uproot the rural indebtedness, oppression and corruption but growth of this party was slow and irregular. Allen Keith Jones, Politics in Sindh (1907-1940) Muslim Identity and the Demand for Pakistan, 48-52.

This party was formally inaugurated on 9 June, 1936 at residence of a merchant Sir Abdullah Haroon with the aim to uproot the rural indebtedness, oppression and corruption but growth of this party was slow and irregular. Allen Keith Jones, Politics in Sindh (1907-1940) Muslim Identity and the Demand for Pakistan, 48-52.

This party was formally inaugurated on 9 June, 1936 at residence of a merchant Sir Abdullah Haroon with the aim to uproot the rural indebtedness, oppression and corruption but growth of this party was slow and irregular. Allen Keith Jones, Politics in Sindh (1907-1940) Muslim Identity and the Demand for Pakistan, 48-52.

This party was formally inaugurated on 9 June, 1936 at residence of a merchant Sir Abdullah Haroon with the aim to uproot the rural indebtedness, oppression and corruption but growth of this party was slow and irregular. Allen Keith Jones, Politics in Sindh (1907-1940) Muslim Identity and the Demand for Pakistan, 48-52.

This party was formally inaugurated on 9 June, 1936 at residence of a merchant Sir Abdullah Haroon with the aim to uproot the rural indebtedness, oppression and corruption but growth of this party was slow and irregular. Allen Keith Jones, Politics in Sindh (1907-1940) Muslim Identity and the Demand for Pakistan, 48-52.
Direct And Indirect Impacts Of Terrorism On Youth In Pakistan

Riaz Ahmad, All India Muslim League and The Creation of Pakistan: A Chronology (1906-1947), 130.

Allen Keith Jones, Politics in Sindh(1907-1940) Muslim Identity and the Demand for Pakistan, 146.

Ibid, 147.

This new government was formed on 18 March, 1940. G.M. Syed, Struggle For a New Sindh, 71.

Allen Keith Jones, Politics in Sindh(1907-1940) Muslim Identity and the Demand for Pakistan, 151.

Ibid,156.

G.M. Syed, Struggle For a New Sindh, 90.

“Jinnah wrote a letter to Sir Gulam Husain Hidayatullah on 16 August 1944 that they should all put an end to these private controversies which would let the Muslim leaders of Sindh.” Sikandar Hayat, The Charismatic Leader: Quaid-e-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah and the Creation of Pakistan, (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2014), 307.

Allen Keith Jones, Politics in Sindh(1907-1940) Muslim Identity and the Demand for Pakistan, 168.


In 1946 for the provincial Legislative Assembly total 70 applications were received for 35 Muslim seats

The issue was on the selection of candidates for the elections of 1946 as M.A. Khuhro wrote a letter on 3 October 1945 to Quaid that all candidates were the favorite of G.M. Syed and he also invited Quaid to come to Karachi to avoid the rift. M.A.Khuhro to M. A. Jinnah, Quaid-e-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah Papers, Z.H.Zaidi(ed.) August 1945-31 March 1946) vol xii, 216-217.

G.M Syed, Struggle for New Sindh, 186.

M.S.Korejo, G.M. Syed An Analysis of his Political Perspectives,19.


Ibid, 195.

Ibid, 203.

On 25 March 1946 voting was held for the ministry of Sir Gulam Hussain in which 30 votes were against government and 29 were in its favour. Even Mir Bandy Ali who was from Muslim League he voted against Muslim League ministry. RoznamaInqalab,(Lahore) 27 March, 1946.

RoznamaInqalab, 12 July, 1946.

RoznamaInqalab, 12 December, 1946.

He again became premier of Sindh on 23rd January, 1947.

Sir Gulam Hussain was lucky enough that he was the person who became premier of the first Sindh Province and was the last premier in the colonial British period.

Riaz Ahmad, All India Muslim League and The Creation of Pakistan: A Chronology (1906-1947), 162.

British government wanted Sind Muslim League to take part in Constituent Assembly but Governor of Sindh Sir F. Mudie in a letter to Wavell also surrendered by saying that he will do what he can but he is not so hopeful. Sir F. Mudie (Sind) to Field Marshal Viscount Wavell(Extract) L/P& J/262:ff 3-3,489. Transfer of Power Papers. Herr Majesty’s Stationery Office , London.


Lari, A History of Sindh,209.

Ibid.

Ayub Khuhro was an outstanding leader but he interfered too much in other Ministers’ Department. Therefore he was generally unpopular in the ministry.