

- Zahid Yousaf<sup>\*</sup> Rao Shahid Mahmood Khan<sup>\*\*</sup> Arsha Saleem Meer<sup>\*\*\*</sup> Malik Adnan<sup>\*\*\*\*</sup>

### Discourse on United States in Print Media: Image Construction in English Newspapers of Pakistan

#### Abstract

Researchers had reviewed the United States image in prominent Pakistani English press. Three newspapers; daily Dawn, The Nation and The News were selected for this study. These prominent papers have been valued as the elite broadsheets of Pakistan and the logic for their choice has their high circulation. The study has implemented the systematic sampling method. The verdicts of the material were fascinating enough to observe the very straightforward difference in the strategy/ philosophy of these newspapers. Results have exhibited that overall United State perception exposed is destructive. Since the investigator has anticipated this study to fetch some lawful and trustworthy results. Three major zones had acknowledged for the investigation was; the Financial issue, War on Terror and Pakistan-United States Government associations. Daily Dawn, have tried to shape a positive image on certain matters, so far the predominant belief sounds negative. The image is probably has nurtured by US frosty strategies touching Pakistan.

**Key Words:** Print Media, United States, Image Construction, English Newspapers

#### Introduction

All nation states are being interdepending to each other for their enlargement and durability, for that, it could be rigid to discover any self-governing state. The liability of such concerns has exaggerated the image of nations in the form of reliance. When there had been justice in terms of certain concerns only then it was imaginable to victory the faith of other states. Nevertheless, of how critical interdependency was for states it did not guarantee equivalence into the terms of mutual anxieties. Consequently, image just the once offended was hard to reconstruct. Different grounds of communication such as electronic and print media not only had countless significance in our everyday life but also a boundless source of attainment information about entire world. The position of the media could be measured in the means of foreign policies, it also had a countless influence on the decision making supremacy of the publics. Mass media had persuaded people to become more conscious of every events and practices that were changing entire societies. United States of America is one of those countries which had been fronting undecorated image complications for so long. It was commonly supposed that American's image had taken an extreme descendent after the shocking events of 9/11. There were many causes, which worsen the image of United States in the Islamic world commonly and specifically in Pakistan. Pakistan-United States associations had gone through many segments from the very beginning. No doubt the affiliation between two nation states has gone through anarchy, right now United States has been as workmate of Pakistan. Armed cooperation platform in two states had continued during 1965 Indo-Pak Combat. As President Lyndon said in 1965, that negated arms supply over Pakistan, the dealings between both states had started to get poorer. The political relationship between two countries began in twentieth October 1947. Regardless of United States being uninformed to be stirred up in the forthcoming containers in South Asia Pakistani organization attempted to make the systems solid between United States and Pakistan. So in the opening correspondence of United States in Pakistan were unfamiliar and not very much perfect. Later, September 11 episode on U.S, Pak had presented full sponsorship to US for strike back against psychological warfare inside the electorate. President Musharraf had introduced President Bush Pakistan's far reaching backing and had turned into an enthusiastic partner of against fear mongering coalition. In 2006 U.S in January 2009, in the wake of joining the workplace U.S President Obama was mindful more on battle in Afghanistan than different concerns. After September 11 Pakistan and United States affiliations had been in various tracks and from that point forward United States had demonstrated an incredible consideration in the region. Most likely the United States organization had encouraged Pakistan from multiple points of view the primary protest of United States government help needed to convey military guide to supplement America's combat in Afghanistan. Regular citizen help had been conveyed to Pakistan by United States was in next to no sum as looks at to the military help had been conveyed by United States government keeping in mind the end goal to help them battle war against psychological oppression. Thusly the recognition of United States was truly negative in the brains of the greater part of the Pakistani people. Many Pakistani prominent newspapers had convicted the U.S senseless interruption over government substances that facilitated in forming a point of view in Pakistani people against U.S. Pakistani mass media also condemned negative U.S policies against Pakistani government. Pakistani Print media had held U.S accountable for the Pakistan ongoing

---

\* Dr. Zahid Yousaf Associate Professor/Chairman Center for Media & Communication Studies University of Gujrat

\*\* Rao Shahid Mahmood Khan Assistant Professor, Department of Media Studies The Islamia University of Bahawalpur Email: [raoshahid@iub.edu.pk](mailto:raoshahid@iub.edu.pk)

\*\*\* Arsha Saleem Meer, Lecturer Department of Mass Communication Lahore College for Women University, Lahore, E-mail: [arsha.saleem@lcwu.edu.pk](mailto:arsha.saleem@lcwu.edu.pk)

\*\*\*\* Dr. Malik Adnan, Assistant Professor, Department of Media Studies The Islamia University of Bahawalpur

circumstances by criticizing the US policies and policies against Pakistan. This examination had reviewed the picture of the US in Pakistani driving English first class daily papers. This perusing was foreseen to think about the US picture in the publications of the first class English daily papers as far as their pitches and edges. This examination likewise proposed to consider that how the print media talked was building US picture.

#### **Research Objectives**

The central objectives of research were followed:

- Find the depiction of United States of America in Pakistan press media
- Evaluate attention of Pakistan Press media on United States of America frame either it is promising, disapproving, or unbiased.
- Examine the Pakistan press media homilies mainly reproving or escalating the United States portray.
- Calculate usage of frames vary amongst News, Dawn and Nation while building the image of United States over Pakistan.
- Realize the attention arrangement of the three diverse papers on United States image concerning the Economic matter, Combat on Terror and Pakistan-United States administration relation.

#### **Literature Review**

Haqqani (2005) had presumed that Pakistan and United states association was always in distress, even they were friendly to each other. United States had known major governor of Islamic politics in beginning when United States had constructed appointment with Pakistan. Pakistan was subsidiary United States on war but that time relationship between them was not perfect. Kronstadt (2005) was thinking Pakistan was compulsory for United States involvement in Asia by consistent, distinct and productive rising. He had more deal with those United States topmost officials appreciate Pakistani administration for its constant alliance on daily basis but they had still tentative about assurance to United States' interests. Otterman (2003) said that President Musharaf had grasp United States requests for backing after 9/11, only to verify that Pakistan was sufficiently to United states but there were still mix-ups about Pakistan which can never be finished. Recently in (2010) Khan.J had recommended that relation between Pakistan and United states had very passionate history which had been communicated over about sex decades. Having disparate policy, sometimes unfortunate strategy interest made this relation realized through many appointments and separation.

Mekasha (2008) had determined internal policy build virtuous image internationally if it had gone smoothly and people in that country considering it. National and international media had played a big role in screening an image of a state. National media of a country had shown a state good image but international media had independence to display what they wanted according to their finding.

According to Haq & Khan (2008) sharing edge with Afghanistan at a great ratio and Khan also mark out Pakistan work together on terrorism as a partner as well as drone attacks in Pakistan and also supports human rights and international laws.

Ayoub & Ahmed (2013) according to them there was misconception after 9/11 in United States and Pakistan and both operated together to beat the terrorist accomplishments. Pakistan compensated Afghanistan for being a neighbor. During coverage of Pakistan United states presented a positive image.

Arif J Golan and Mortiz (2014) according to them, where media has played his role to provision globalization at the same time media also care biasness to their sponsors, media professionals and other professional journalist were not obliged who were working in this country and other countries support from doing this too. It had been all but four respondents had too undesirable image about professional journalist of United States and their relationship with Pakistani professional journalist. The replies had ranged United States journalist and their officials being too unintentional behavior for being ignorant about how to deal with media organizations of Pakistan and Pakistani media journalists. Critical conditions had faced by both countries because of limited collaboration between Pakistani and United States professional journalist.

#### **Framing Analysis**

Framing as indicated by Ettman (1993) has a sort of a spread conceptualization relying on setting particular as opposed to the by and large legitimate operationalization. Whatever its exact utilize, the idea of confining reliably offers an approach to portray the intensity of an imparting rendition. In this way, by utilizing confining examination, this investigation should get a handle on how English daily paper publications have been surrounded the picture of US on differing issues, as it is being positive, troublesome or unbiased. It will have additionally to draw out a similar examination among three daily paper articles, how they have been delineated US as indicated by their daily paper arrangements.

#### **Hypothesis**

1. Dawn had outlined more optimistic frame of United States on financial concern related to The News.
2. Dawn had outlined more optimistic frame of United States on financial concern related to Nation.
3. The News had outlined additional undesirable frame of United States on the concern of Combat on terror related to Dawn.
4. Nation had outlined additional undesirable portray of United States on the subject of Combat on terror as linked to The News.
5. The Nation had outlined additional undesirable portray of United States on Pakistan-United States relations as associated to Dawn.

#### **Materials and Methods**

The study will project at analyzing the representation of US in the prominent English newspapers of Pakistan with applying systematic sampling from 1<sup>st</sup> January 2018 to 31<sup>st</sup> December 2018. Editorials and articles of daily Dawn, The News and The Nation had been selected for examine. While conceptual description had specified the meaning of the notion and it was especially vital when conducting a content analysis. The researchers had used the selected variables for current study; Economic issue, Investment

and Trade, Assistance and Congressional Activities, Legislation and Trade, War on Terror, Pakistan United States Government relation.

**Result and Findings**

The editorials and articles had been contained in the examination was 136 from Dawn, 133 from The News and 228 from The Nation. So the aggregate quantities of articles were 497. Each third publication had been possessed from the aggregate populace. Likewise, 144 productions had been assigned through proficient assessing method from the three day by day papers; thirty-nine articles from Dawn, forty from The News and sixty-four from The Nation.

**Hypothesis: One**

**As compared to The News, Dawn had framed United States on economic issues more positively.**

The comprehensive outcomes had indicated that Dawn had not have any publication on monetary issues in regards to the United States while at the same time The News had encircled negative picture of United States on exchange and venture issues with nearly whole of its substance. In any case, The News had confined the US adversely in 55.6 percent of article substance 22.2 percent emphatically on help activities.

The measure of United States scope in publication subjects in both the daily papers had been small, particularly in Dawn. By and by, it had been genuinely apparent that The News had encircled United States contrarily on monetary related issues. This has conveyed bolster for H1.

**Table 1: Correlation of encircling of Dawn and The News on financial issue**

Financial Matters						
Classes	Trade + Share		America Assistance + Congressional Act		TRL	
Border	Optimistic	Pessimistic	Optimistic	Pessimistic	Optimistic	Pessimistic
Dawn	0%	0.0 0.0%	0.0 0.0%	0.0 0.0%	0.0 0.0%	0.0 0.0%
The News	0.0%	1 100.0%	2 22.2%	5 55.6%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%

**Hypothesis: Two**

**As compared to The Nation, Dawn had framed United States on economic issues more positively.**

The outcomes had indicated that Dawn had not had any article on monetary issues with respect to the United States. In the meantime The Nation had not confined United States on exchange and venture issues. Notwithstanding, The Nation had surrounded the United States adversely in 63.6 percent article substance United States Assistance and Congressional Deed and 100.0 percent over contrarily on TRL.

Measure over United States scope in publication substance in both the daily papers had been fairly short, particularly Dawn as it has no articles related to monetary matter in it. All things considered, it had very obvious that The Nation had encircled United States contrarily upon monetary connected subjects.

**Table 2: Correlation of the confining of Dawn and The News on monetary issue**

Financial concerns						
Categories	Trade + Investment		America Assistance + Congressional Act		TRL	
Border	Optimistic	Pessimistic	Optimistic	Pessimistic	Optimistic	Pessimistic
Dawn	0.0 0%	0.0 0%	0.0 0%	0.0 0%	0.0 0%	0.0 0%
The Nation	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	7 63.6%	0 0.0%	1 100.0%

Daily papers had not walled us in on financial issues to an endless degree as they had shielded different themes on the grounds that the United States-Pakistan monetary relations were very little tough and it is all the more comprehensively located as two-sided peace improvement in the area separated from financial advancement. Notwithstanding Pakistan's numerous attentive monetary challenges, United States was constantly more worried of Terror matters. So the exploration has indicated that explanation for the less scope on the financial issue was a result of the lesser measure of thought on this theme by United States. In financial subject Dawn had

confined United States unbiased, as United States helped Pakistan was monetary subjects and Dawn methodology was generally objective with no fractional and enthusiastic concerns. Likewise, The News and The Nation were more touchy and nation situated, anyway endeavored to depict United States picture negative, even in a few issues, where they could be unbiased or positive. Monetary ties between two nations were dependably in unequal circumstance, never steady and balance. Joined States was constantly more worried about the war on dread issue, and by remembering this issue, they endeavor to offer Pakistan financial help. Pakistan was getting support from the United States as it had progressed toward becoming supporter in the alleged "War on Terror."

**Hypothesis: Three**

*As compared to The News Dawn had enclosed United States on War on fear more harmful.*

Results had enlightened that Dawn had encompassed logically 58.3 percent negative picture of US then The News 36.4 percent on Pakistan-US Security Cooperation matters. The outcome had demonstrated that there were more negative housings 34.6 percent against United States in the ordinary Dawn than positive edges 3.8 percent on Worldwide and Nationwide Terrorism subject. Of course The News in like manner had more negative edges on US 12.5 percent by then the positive edges 6.3 percent in Worldwide and Nationwide Terrorism subject. On Drone strikes matter The News had surrounded the United States more unfavorably 75.0 percent by then Dawn 66.7 percent. Of course, the two daily papers had delineated the picture of United States contrarily than emphatically. Be that as it may, the measure of negative article substance in both the daily papers had been an incredible same. In any case, it had been very evident that Dawn narrowed United States all the more adversely on War on dread related subjects The News. Day break, which was premier English daily papers in Pakistan, had exhibited incredible number of negative casings towards US and its approaches against Pakistan. First light had acknowledged extraordinary essentialness and firm methodology towards portrayal of the picture is United States on War on dread issue. The examination had additionally demonstrated that the positive casings of United States in Dawn and The News had stayed low. Dawn had indicted the United States methodologies against the war on dread as US had consolidated Pakistan as a unidentified reinforcement since it had begun shelling Afghanistan in 2001. The United States responsibility with Pakistan was essentially focused on the war on fear; anyway it was not restricted to it. Pakistani individuals had made gigantic forfeits in current years in the battle in inconsistency of psychological warfare and it was believed to be a direct result of United States. We required reexamining the basics of our bond with the US to get enhanced clearness. The articles delineated that war on fear was the purpose for the radicalism in Pakistan that is the reason they had surrounded United States all the more contrarily in their publications. Consequently the relationship between the two nations was required to recommence on the point of war against fear based oppression.

**Table 3: Examination of the surrounding of Dawn and The News on War on fear**

Classes	War against terror					
	Pak- America Security Cooperation		Worldwide and Nationwide Terrorism		Drone assaults	
	Optimistic	Pessimistic	Optimistic	Pessimistic	Optimistic	Pessimistic
News	0.0 .0%	4 36.4%	1 6.3%	2 12.5%	0 0.0%	3 75.0%
Dawn	0 0.0%	7 58.3%	1 3.8%	9 34.6%	0 0.0%	2 66.7%

**Hypothesis: Four**

*As compared to The News, The Nation had enclosed United States on War on fear more harmful.*

The outcome had detailed that the Nation had laid out increasingly 48.8 percent negative picture of United States then The News 36.4 percent on Pakistan-United States Security Cooperation. Additionally, The Nation had sketched out United States progressively 53.6 percent adversely then The News 12.5 percent on Worldwide and Nationwide Terrorism. On Drone assaults concern The Nation had confined United States increasingly 77.8 percent adversely then The News 75.0 percent.

The examination of The Nation always had laid out negative picture of Unites States on War on dread issue. The Nation had extensively utilized more negative casings seeing Unites States when contrasted with Dawn. The investigation revealed that Pakistani tip top press had illustrated the Unites States exceedingly negative, especially in the issue of war on fear. Another purpose for the contrary casings while in transit to United States was on account of Pakistan government and individuals had been endured "unfathomably" since the war on dread issue. In spite of the fact that Pakistani government had constantly upheld United States in the war against psychological oppression yet at the same time their disparities on different subjects were clear and fundamental. Extra examination likewise had shown huge part on encircling that Dawn on financial issue did not depict United States at everything except rather in War and fear issue, it had plot United States contrarily.

**Table 4: Contrast of the enclosing of The Nation and The News on War on fear**

War against terror	
--------------------	--

**Discourse on United States in Print Media: JRSP, Vol. 57, No 3 (July-Sept 2020)**

Classes	Pak-America Safety Collaboration		Worldwide + Nationwide Violence		Drone assaults	
	Positive	Negative	Positive	Negative	Positive	Negative
News	0.0 .0%	04 36.4%	01 6.3%	02 12.5%	0.0 0.0%	03 75.0%
The Nation	3 7.0%	21 48.8%	4 14.3%	15 53.6%	1 11.1%	7 77.8%

**Hypothesis: Five**

**Contrasted with Dawn, the Nation had confined US on US-Pakistan Government connection more negative.**

The finding had endorsed that The Nation had enclosed the United States dynamically 50.0 percent antagonistically on United States-Pakistan Administration association concern; however Dawn kept it progressively 28.6 percent strongly. Other than the Nation 60.0 percent and Dawn 100.0 percent together had encompassed United States conversely on Nuclear Weapons and Missile Proliferation matter. On Democratization and Human Rights issue The Nation had walled us in dynamically 50.0 percent antagonistically where as Dawn encompassed everything the all the additional unequivocally 33.3 percent. Incredibly the two daily papers had encased the picture of United States contrarily and furthermore decidedly. Anyway the measure of negative article substance in the country was more than in Dawn. In any case, it had been similarly evident that The Nation had encircled United States all the more contrarily on US-Pakistan Government connection associated concerns than Dawn. The United States had been taking care of Pakistani government authorities as though they were being estimated by Washington, while the two nations were limited in a value-based association in light of shared doubt. Subsequently the daily papers had an essential measure of negative edges.

**Table 5: Contrast of the enclosing of *The Nation* and *Dawn* on United States-Pakistan Administration relation**

Categories	America-Pakistan Administration ties					
	America-Pak official meetings + agreements		Nuclear Weapons + Missile Propagation		Democratization + HR	
	Optimistic	Pessimistic	Optimistic	Pessimistic	Optimistic	Pessimistic
Nation	03 11.5%	13 50.0%	01 10.0%	06 60.0%	01 10.0%	05 50.0%
Dawn	2 28.6%	1 14.3%	0 0.0%	1 100.0%	2 33.3%	0 0.0%

**Discussions and Conclusions**

The key concern of the inquiry had to learn the explanation of United States in Pakistan press and to evaluate attention of Pakistan Press on United States picture; whichever it was disheartening or heartening. Investigator had calculated editorial and articles of selected newspapers on America image concerning the financial concern, War on Fear and Pakistan - America Administration relation. Many researches was grounded on United States image had exposed that United States was fronting insightful image predicament. United States individuals had also become wide conscious of their mark in the domain. Even though United States was attempting to re-establish its nation picture by involving with public work and serving states in blow condition, but its authoritarian policies had well-adjusted its kind and helpful conducts. The outcomes disclosed that United States was enclosed as 'foe' by the leading English Pakistan media. After Sep/ 11 Pakistan's administration was combined with United States on war against terrorism and United State had elevated the sanction on external support along with the exclusion of check which had been employed on Pakistan after 1998 nuclear outburst. The impacts was depicted that the Pakistani columnists did not rely upon United States strategies. A similar response could be seen in United States media where American media likewise did not concede. The finding had exhibited that Newspapers had not surrounded United States on financial subjects, as it were, as they had shielded different themes, in light of the fact that the United States-Pakistan monetary relations was very little strong and it is all the more comprehensively located as shared peace progress in the locale separated from financial advance. The second suggestion that "Day break had surrounded United States on monetary issues all the more decidedly as connected to The Nation" had been acknowledged. Yet, the choices of the table one and table two had displayed that the plan setting strategy is three daily papers was very surprising from each other. It was regularly to assume that Urdu and English daily papers in Pakistan include of comparative plan and they encase the issues in the comparable way. Day break has delineated US sure picture of United States while the News and the Nation spoke to the United States picture adversely on financial issue. The measure of United States scope on financial in perspective substance in both the writers had been very low, particularly in Dawn it was just a single publications and it was impartial. Then again, it had been genuinely clear that The Nation encircled US adversely on financial related issues. Regardless of

the way that Pakistan had serious financial issues, United States was constantly more worried of frenzy issues. That is the reason financial issues had been given lesser measure of dedication by the daily papers articles.

Subsequently, the third confirmation that the "Dawn had sketched out United States on War on fear was more negative as related to the News" had been perceived. By and by, it had been very expression from tab three that Dawn sketched out United States all the more contrarily on War on dread partnered worries than the News. Subsequently, the fourth proof that "The Nation sketched out United States on War on dread all the more adversely as it was identified with the News "had been additionally recognized. It is very obvious through table four that The Nation was plot United States all the more adversely on War on fear partnered issues than the News. Pakistan was being remunerated guide from the United States as it had progressed toward becoming related in the supposed "War on Terror." However, it had been an extreme connection between two nations as on the one side the United States assistance had been obviously little of the value Pakistan had been spending in the war; on the other, the US had been putting futile weight on Pakistan, continually invigorating from the legislature and individuals of Pakistan to accomplish increasingly for them. No positive article was gathered on war on dread issue. The positive casing was seen just on advance activities and Pak-US relations. Despite the fact that Dawn surrounded United States picture positive in a few focuses as it was normal in theory one and two yet it likewise did not favored United States in numerous issues. It was found that Dawn had tried to be nonpartisan and good towards United States yet as where United States was against Pakistan and its techniques, the arrangement of Dawn had striated towards United States. The News and the Nation were being unbendable towards United States. The quantity of negative casings was by and large constantly high in the News and the Nation articles. The investigation has exposed Pakistani press had confined the US exceedingly negative, especially in the matter of war on dread. Another purpose for the antagonistic casings toward United States was on account of Pakistan government and individuals had been experienced "unfathomably" since the war on fear issue. In spite of the fact that Pakistani government had dependably been thoughtful with US in the war against psychological oppression yet at the same time their disparities on different issues were obvious and rudimentary.

### **Conclusion**

Both countries had commonness in unrelated issue but terrorism had conveyed them closer more than on any other problem. Hostility violence had converted a vital nationwide consciousness for both countries and the immediacy of battle operations requires close collaboration and coordination. Even though Pakistan was termed as partner of US, but still the research study on editorials content had proved this in the opposite way. Same trend was perceived while conducting this particular research study. There was been only Dawn who offered the favorable image of US, but still its overall coverage had negative. Encouraging content had established just in monetary and trade concerns. The overall conversation had revealed that although after the 9/11 episode government of Pakistan had approved pro American foreign policy but Pakistani media had not follow it and America was to clearly frame negatively in the elite Pakistani press. To recover the excellence of media coverage of US–Pakistan relations, the two governments shell have been to first become more translucent in their transactions with each other.

### **References**

- Amos, T. A. & Kahneman, D. (1981). The Framing of Decisions and the Psychology of Choice, *Science*, New Series, Vol. 211, No. 4481; American Association for the Advancement of Science.
- Ali, M. (2009) US Aid to Pakistan and Democracy, Policy Perspectives , Volume 6; Institute of Policy Studies, Islamabad.
- Baek, K. (2007) U.S. Foreign Policy and Media Framing: A Content Analysis of U.S. Newspaper's Coverage of the Nuclear Tests in North Korea and India. Paper presented at the International Communication Division of the Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication, Washington, DC.
- Berger, P. L. and T. Luckmann (1966), *The Social Construction of Reality: A Treatise in the Sociology of Knowledge*, Garden City, NY: Anchor Books.
- Berelson, B. (1952). *Content Analysis in Communication Research*. Glencoe, IL: Free Press.
- Bolach, B.Q. (2006) Engagement & Estrangement in US-Pakistan Relations : The Dialogue – Quarterly Research Journal. Page 28-29
- Boddewyn, J. J., and K. Marton. (1978). *Comparison Advertising*. New York; Hastings House Publishers. Hotelling.
- Chang, Y. and Chang, K. (2003). World Editorials on the September 11 Terrorist Attacks: Integrating News Flow Analysis in International Communication and Framing Analysis. Paper Presented at the Annual Meeting of the International Communication Association, Marriott Hotel, San Diego, CA.
- Ceren, O. (2006) A Burkean Theory of Media Effects: Toward a Non-Salience Theory of Framing, Paper Presented at the Annual Meeting of the International Communication Association, Dresden International Congress Centre, Dresden, Germany.
- Choi, J. (2003) The U.S. Press's Construction of North Korea As Part of the "Axis of Evil, Paper Presented at the Annual Meeting of the International Communication Association, Dresden International Congress Centre, Dresden, Germany.
- Eilder, Christiane & Luter, A., 2000. Germany at War: Competing Framing Strategies in 'German Public Discourse', *European Journal of Communication*. 15(3): 415-428.
- Entman, R.M. (1993). Framing: Toward Clarification of a Paradigm. *Journal of Communication*, 43 (4), 51-58.
- Gamson, W. A., & Modigliani, A. (1987). Media Discourse and Public Opinion on Nuclear Power: A Constructivist Approach. *American Journal of Sociology*, 1, 1-37.
- Gamson, W. A. Modigliani, A. (1989). Media Discourse and Public Opinion on Nuclear Power: A Constructionist Approach. *American Journal of Sociology*. 95(1), 1-37.
- Gamson, W.A. (1989) 'News as Framing: Comments on Graber', *American Behavioral Scientist* 33(2): 157-61.
- Gitlin, T. (1980). *The Whole World is Watching: Mass Media in the Making and the Unmaking of the New Left*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Goffman, E. (1974). *Frame Analysis*, Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Haqqani, H. (2005). The United States and Pakistan: Navigating a complex Relationship: [http://carnegieendowment.org/files/haqqani\\_testimony\\_07-2005.pdf](http://carnegieendowment.org/files/haqqani_testimony_07-2005.pdf).
- Iyengar, S. (1991). *Is Anyone Responsible? How Television Frames Political Issues*. Chicago. IL: University of Chicago Press.