

## Impact of 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment on Party Politics in Pakistan

\*Shahbaz Ahmad Bhatti\*

Muhammad Ahmad Qadri\*\*

Dr. Muhammad Iqbal Chawla\*\*\*

Dr. Maqbool Ahmad Awan\*\*\*\*

### Abstract

*This research is based on the analysis of the 18th amendment and its influence on party politics in Pakistan. In doing so, the researchers have gone through multiple types of research already conducted in this area. Further, multiple TV programs and debates conducted on this topic were studied for a deeper analysis. The researcher then came up with his analysis. It was concluded by the end of the research that the 18th amendment has a positive impact on the democratic norms of the country and any attempt to abolish it is strongly refused by the political parties.*

### Keywords:

Eighteenth amendment, party politics, constitution, Pakistan, politics, parliament

### Introduction

The main purpose of this paper deals with the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment and its effects. The 18<sup>th</sup> amendment has drastically changed the center province relation and the paper focuses on the very debate of the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment. The political transition in Pakistan led towards mature political developments and ultimately led towards the completion of consecutive terms of governments. The PPPs' tenure proved worth full in the sense that it has given new phenomena of reconciliatory politics. Zardari tried to make a coalition government earlier with PML-N and later on with MQM and PML-Q. In 2010, the passing of the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment was much celebrated by all the factions of society and other political spheres. The parliament was made empowered and the presidential powers were curtailed. The debate on the 18<sup>th</sup> constitutional amendment has been in momentum in the country since that has been made part of the constitution. Arguments are being made for and against it, so in these circumstances, it is necessary to review this constitutional amendment impartially and convey the truth to the readers through an impartial comment. Specifically, it is significant to spotlight the impact it has made on the party politics in the country. In April 2010, parliament almost unanimously approved the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment to the Constitution, which ended the existence of a strong presidential power as well as a strong center. Asif Zardari, the then president, signed the amendment depriving himself of the right to dismiss the government at his discretion and call new parliamentary elections. As a result, the prime minister has become the full-fledged head of the executive power, whose government relies on a vote of confidence in the lower house of parliament, elected by direct, secret, and universal suffrage. The country has returned largely to the original version of the constitutional order, approved in 1973. The then-president surrendered his powers as head of state, but stood as head of the PPP, and headed the coalition government. The changes that have taken place in the amendment are generally assessed positively within the country and abroad. One significant aspect of this amendment is that democracy is assumed to be back in the country.

### Background

Though basically, Pakistan was supposed to be a democracy, and the political elite, including national elders, has been trying to make it a stable democracy, but this could not happen in true letter and spirit. The political history of Pakistan has been mostly dominated by army rulers, and now and then, army heads have been heading the country by overturning the democratically elected governments. This is assumed to be one of the key reasons for political instability in Pakistan. Although there have been democratic governments in different intervals, still, the

---

\* Shahbaz Bhatti, Phd Scholar, Department of History, University of the Punjab Lahore

\*\* Prof Dr Muhammad Ahmad Qadri, Former Dean Faculty of Arts and Social sciences, University of Karachi

\*\*\* Prof Dr Muhammad Iqbal Chawla, former chairman, Department of History, University of the Punjab, Lahore

\*\*\*\* Dr Maqool Awan, Assistant Prof, Department of History and Pakistan Study, University of the Punjab Lahore

true democracy was curtailed by one of the army rulers, decades back i.e. by shifting the powers of dissolving the parliament in the hands of the president. Against this backdrop, while army heads have been holding the presidency more often, the powers of dissolving parliament too have been in their hands. So, despite having democracy in short intervals, that has not been a democracy in the true sense. But, after the eighteenth amendment in the constitution, this power of the president was removed. Moreover, previously, the power was more in the hands of the federal government while the provinces were not autonomous. The eighteenth amendment shifted the powers to the provinces while making them much more autonomous. These changes have made a significant impact on party politics in Pakistan<sup>1</sup>.

The constitution of any country is considered to be the most sacred document, of which, human beings are the makers. Man-made laws can be amended by a two-thirds majority of the parliament keeping in view the changing times. It is unthinkable to change the law. Now that the federal and provincial governments are not on the same page to deal with the aftermath of the Coronavirus epidemic, this epidemic has been strengthened. The public health sector should be handed over to the federal government so that it can work under the same policy to provide medical facilities to the people living in all the provinces of the country. The lack of a uniform education system is acutely felt in the country<sup>2</sup>.

A new world is emerging where the governments of each country have to focus on strengthening the public health structure for their people. The condition of the public health sector in Pakistan is very bad; the public sector hospitals are better for the people. Treatment is not available, there is a shortage of good doctors and staff, medicines are very expensive, treatment in private sector hospitals is very expensive, there is a lack of good laboratories and many people die before they reach the hospitals. There is a need to formulate a very cohesive national health policy for the people so that a common man can get better treatment. As the result of the eighteenth amendment which shifted the powers to the provinces, provinces are in a much better position to elevate health standards and improving overall public health<sup>3</sup>.

The basic premise of this research is that the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment has impacted the party politics of Pakistan by giving them more freedom and faith in provincial authorities. In this context, very limited literature has been produced that could help the researcher in analyzing the scenario in-depth. That is why this literature review is limited and based on very few articles that were written on the relationship between Pakistani politics and the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment<sup>4</sup>.

According to the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment, if the provincial government gives its authority to the federation or any official, it will have to get it ratified by the provincial assembly. The share cannot be less than the last NFC award, given to the provinces by the National Finance Commission. Some critics condemn the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment and others have a very positive impression of it. Of critics, Adeney (2012) is of the view that the biggest flaw of the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment is that it was included in the constitution for political purposes. Its purpose was not to strengthen the federation at all. But according to Ahmad (2010) had this been the case, it would not have been possible for MPs to express their views. If it had been debated for 57 days like the Eighth Amendment, then all the factors would have come to light and then the impression of amending through the back door would not have arisen. Bukhari and others (2013) presented all the facts to the readers, now it is up to them whether they are for or against the repeal of this amendment, but the Constitution of Pakistan is a symbol of security and strength. That spirit must be maintained. This soul must be reformed or uprooted if it is harmed by any modification, action, or attitude<sup>5</sup>.

What is the significance of amending the constitution? How it is formed and how it is maintained is not a problem of the people who, at every age, live a very painful life suffering from poverty, inflation, unemployment, lack of civic amenities, and deprivation of social injustices. They are forced to live and for them, it is a problem of the country's elite. On the other hand, there is a young generation who do not know much about the country's

---

<sup>1</sup> Arshad, F., Chawla, M. I., & Zia, A. (2018). Re-contextualizing the 18th Amendment: Working of Federalism in Pakistan. *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan*, 55(2).

<sup>2</sup> Adeney, K. (2012). A step towards inclusive federalism in Pakistan? The politics of the 18th amendment. Publius: *The Journal of Federalism*, 42(4), 539-565.

<sup>3</sup> Chawla, M. I., & Ullah, A. (2018). The Politics of Pragmatism in Pakistan: A Case Study of the Pakistan People's Party. *Pakistan Journal of History and Culture*, 39(1).

<sup>4</sup> Ahmad, R. (2010). The Endemic Crisis of Federalism in Pakistan. *Lahore Journal of Economics*, 15.

<sup>5</sup> Nishtar, S. (2011). Health and the 18th Amendment. Retaining national functions in devolution: heart file.

political history and struggle for independence due to the current outdated education system. Now that the country's political parties are waging a war of words over the revision of the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment, it is also a bitter truth that on the very first day of the adoption of the Constitution, the late Zulfikar Ali Bhutto declared a state of emergency in the country and suspended the fundamental rights. So far, 34 amendments have been made to the 1973 constitution, 10 times passed by the National Assembly through an Act of Parliament and 24 times by presidential decrees<sup>6</sup>.

In the light of the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment, all legal framework orders issued during the rule of former military ruler General Pervez Musharraf, which were issued without any legal authority and any legal justification, were revoked, along with the 16<sup>th</sup> Amendment to the Constitution Act, 2003. Later it was also canceled. NWFP was renamed Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Repealing and suspending the constitution was declared serious treason. Every citizen of the country was given the right access to information. Every child up to the age of 16 is to be provided with free education by the state. The President was obliged to dissolve the Assemblies on the advice of the Prime Minister. The National Economic Council, headed by the Prime Minister, was established<sup>7</sup>.

It is also worth mentioning here that with the approval of the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment, the Parliament of Pakistan had created a new and commendable consensus for the law and political framework of the country which gave independence to the Parliament, the Prime Minister, the judiciary, and the provincial governments. Although these changes provide ample opportunity for the country's political parties to seriously address the key economic and security issues faced by the country, the full impact of many of the changes as a result of these amendments will come to the front as time goes by<sup>8</sup>.

Politicians have realized that with the strengthening of the democratic process, the short-term political advantages of military intervention against their political opponents have been overcome. Since its independence, provincial autonomy has been a settled issue in Pakistan's political and constitutional history. The country has not paid due attention to the five military laws and the long losses of the ruling elite in the administration of power. Since 1973, the country has been defined by two wings (West-East Pakistan)<sup>9</sup>. The extension of General Ayub's regime to 1969 damaged the political part of the country with falsifications such as the EBDO (elective bodies disqualification ordinance). In the dark years of the 1970s, the morale of the military dropped and former Prime Minister Zulfikar Ali Bhutto was again accused of controlling the country. Pakistan disintegrated after the 1971 war, Bangladesh emerged due to a lack of support and problems of poor governance. In 1973, taking into account the historical shortcomings, a constitution was first created and all the calculated measures were corrected. For comparison: the parliamentary constitution of 1956, along with its charter, was an illuminated document for the administration of the country's provinces. But surprisingly, Z.A. Bhutto was deceived, and martial law was declared in July 1977<sup>10</sup>.

The 1973 Constitution established a fully parliamentary form of government in the country. Former President Zia-ul-Haq abolished Article 6 and feared the death sentence from the judiciary. He had to get the legal power to rule the state. Country and security blockade to legalize their illegal actions. By applying presidential decrees and an interim constitutional decree (ACP), General Zia had amended the constitution and granted the president more power at his discretion by applying Article 58.2 (B). Errors in the constitution lowered the rationale for the country's political stability and its participation was denied, on the condition that politicians assumed that the Pakistani People's Party had boycotted the 1985 elections without the party. Until the nineties, the mixture of powers passed from hand to hand. However, in 1997 former Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif repealed the eighth amendment to the constitution and made the thirteenth amendment. The game was not over yet, a blow was struck and the eighth amendment was reintroduced in the shadow of the 17<sup>th</sup> amendment brought by the general, director of

---

<sup>6</sup> Hussain, M., & Kokab, R. U. (2012). Eighteenth Amendment in the Constitution of Pakistan: Success and Controversies. *Asian Social Science*, 8(1), 81.

<sup>7</sup> Fair, C. C. (2011). Why the Pakistan army is here to stay: prospects for civilian governance. *International Affairs*, 87(3), 571-588.

<sup>8</sup> Islam, F. U. (2013). The 18th amendment in the 1973 constitution. *The Dialogue*, 8(2).

<sup>9</sup> Chawla, M. I., & Ullah, A. (2018). The Politics of Pragmatism in Pakistan: A Case Study of the Pakistan People's Party. *Pakistan Journal of History and Culture*, 39(1).

<sup>10</sup> Hussain, M., & Kokab, R. U. (2012). Eighteenth Amendment in the Constitution of Pakistan: Success and Controversies. *Asian Social Science*, 8(1), 81.

martial law Musharraf; Political activity in the country ended once again. Former politician Sharif was arrested and former Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto was expelled from the country<sup>11</sup>.

The whole scenario of repealing and ratifying new constitutional amendments had disturbed the main political parties such as the PPP and the PML (N). In 2006, both sides signed the London Democracy Charter, Nawaz and Bhutto abstain from military intervention and maintain weak martial law regimes, thus not supporting the military in political and military activity. The vision of the signed letter was to improve the democratic structure of the country and erase the traces of the dictators in the constitution. Thus, the PNP, which came to power in the 2008 general elections, made 18 changes for the first time in the history of the constitution, more than 102 articles were included in the constitution. The main changes in the amendment were the increase in the powers of the provinces to gain control over the required element, the removal of the 17<sup>th</sup> amendment, and the modification of the form of the country's 7<sup>th</sup> NFC award. This was the first time in the history of Pakistan when President Asif Zardari transferred his powers to the parliament and appointed parliamentary supremacy. In 2010, there were major changes in the constitution, the provinces recognized autonomy and changed their name to Islamic Democratic Pakistan<sup>12</sup>.

The 18<sup>th</sup> amendment was accepted and implemented within 10 days. This was a turning point and a threat to the authoritarian government and its hegemony in another region, such as Balochistan. Instead, they complained that the provinces were appropriately obtaining a portion of their natural resources; This problem was solved by an amendment that expanded their mandate on health, education, curriculum, and more than one percent of GDP control in every province. This change solved the country's unresolved crisis and created a powerful federation in the country called Pakistan's New Constitutional Software. This research bridges the gap between the previously produced literature on the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment and the present scenario of the country by shedding light upon the impact that the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment had on the party politics of the country<sup>13</sup>.

The main purpose of the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment, which was passed during the PPP regime in 2010, was to restore the constitution in its original form in the form in which it was prepared by the same party back in 1973. This amendment is the longest one to the Constitution of Pakistan: it has resulted in eight changes to the Constitution. Such a far-reaching change required the efforts of all political partners. That is why the Parliamentary Committee on Constitutional Reforms, which drafted the amendment, had representation from all major political parties. It took nine months for the committee to discuss the projects and to get the opinion and approval of all the political parties. This modification was passed by all 17 parliamentary parties at the National Assembly agreement. Nevertheless, soon after the National Assembly adopted it, controversy erupted over the Amendment<sup>14</sup>.

The main point of discussion on this amendment is one: the distribution of resources and legislative powers between the center and the provinces. Critics of the Eighteenth Amendment believe it has "weakened the center without empowering the provinces." Critics argue that the provinces do not have the resources and capacity to take on new responsibilities. Some argue that the transfer of power was so sudden that it led to a tug-of-war between the federal and provincial governments, leading to ambiguity and an equal government<sup>15</sup>.

PML-N leader and former foreign minister Khawaja Asif have said that the 18th amendment was passed in 2010 and the issue of provincial autonomy was resolved so the resolved issues should not be touched upon<sup>16</sup>. A meeting of the Pakistan Muslim League-Nawaz (PML-N) was held recently in Lahore under the chairmanship of Shahbaz Sharif in which the NAB Amendment Ordinance including the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment was considered. Sources said that PML-N has decided to oppose any change in the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment. According to sources, the meeting

---

<sup>11</sup> Ahmad, R. (2010). The Endemic Crisis of Federalism in Pakistan. *Lahore Journal of Economics*, 15.

<sup>12</sup> Shah, A. (2012). The 18th Constitutional Amendment: Glue or solvent for nation building and citizenship in Pakistan?. *The Lahore Journal of Economics*, 17, 387.

<sup>13</sup> Siddiqui, S. (2010). 18th Amendment and education. Retrieved January, 4, 2013.

<sup>14</sup> Siddiqui, S. (2010). 18th Amendment and education. Retrieved January, 4, 2013.

<sup>15</sup> Arshad, F., Chawla, M. I., & Zia, A. (2018). Re-contextualizing the 18th Amendment: Working of Federalism in Pakistan. *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan*, 55(2).

<sup>16</sup> Chawla, M. I., & Ullah, A. (2018). The Politics of Pragmatism in Pakistan: A Case Study of the Pakistan People's Party. *Pakistan Journal of History and Culture*, 39(1).

unanimously decided that the 18th amendment is part of the constitution and the PML-N is not in favor of changing it<sup>17</sup>.

But, unfortunately, the country's ruling party and all opposition political parties seem to be engaged in a political war instead of uniting to fight the epidemic. In this critical situation, the leaders of the ruling PTI now say the federal government was weakened by the 18th Amendment, and the provinces were strengthened due to which the federal government was unable to play its role in the fields of education and health. The huge sums given by the council to the provincial governments are also being misused and they are not even willing to give an account of it. PTI says the government is preparing a draft law to revise the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment to the Constitution, which will be consulted with opposition parties. Opposition parties, on the other hand, have fired at the PTI leaders' proposal<sup>18</sup>.

During the broadcast of Pakistani television channel ARY, it was reported that the government was considering amendments to the NFC Award and the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment. Local-level parties are outraged by the news, while national-level parties have also refused to be part of any such plan. However, some quarters believe that the PPP and the PML-N may be in favor of such changes due to 'expediency'. But such impressions have been rejected by both parties<sup>19</sup>. PPP leader and former MNA Chaudhry Manzoor, while giving his opinion on this, told DW Urdu, "There is no question that we support any such amendment. The 18th Amendment has strengthened the federation and we will resist any attempt to weaken the federation. The government has not contacted us and even if it does, we will not talk about the change."

On the other hand, PML-N Leader Senator Mushahidullah Khan has termed the impression that Shahbaz Sharif has given any assurance to the Establishment in this regard as wrong. "We think it's crazy to tamper with the Eighteenth Amendment. We will strongly oppose any change. The government has not contacted us in this regard". The amendment ushered in a new era of consensus-based governance rather than bullying. Not only is there no question of martial law now, but the federal government has lost the power to impose emergency in any province, as it did in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa during the first PPP government against NEP and Balochistan governments, in Sindh. This was done in the second government of PML-N and the fourth government of PPP at the federal level by imposing Governor's Rule in Punjab<sup>20</sup>.

Contrary to the relatively mild response of national parties to the issue, nationalist parties are furious. PTM leader Dr Saad Alam Mehsud said that the 18th amendment was the first time for the betterment of the provinces. "Fifty-six, sixty-two, and nineteen-seventy-seven constitutions have always benefited Punjab. The three provinces continued to collect 87% of the revenue but before this amendment, Punjab continued to spend 80% of the revenue. After this amendment, the provinces got a better share in the NFC and that is why the performance of Murad Ali Shah is also better. He added that the government was not announcing the NFC award. "According to the 18th Amendment, it must be announced every year. Now they are talking about change, which could have a strong reaction in the smaller provinces, and they will talk of secession"<sup>21</sup>.

Usman Kakar, leader of the Pakhtunkhwa Milli Awami Party, believes the move is a possible attempt by the PTI to meet the Establishment's wishes. "But whether it is done at the behest of the military or the agencies or the behest of someone else, it will have such a dangerous reaction that no one can even think." The federation will be jeopardized by any such attempt," he said, adding that the establishment was against the amendment from the outset. When the amendment was passed, they called it more stringent than Sheikh Mujibur Rehman's six points, but the amendment helped to reduce the sense of deprivation in the provinces. The grievances of the provinces could

---

<sup>17</sup> Nishtar, S. (2011). Health and the 18th Amendment. Retaining national functions in devolution: heart file.

<sup>18</sup> Musarrat, R., Ali, G., & Azhar, M. S. (2012). 18th Amendment and its Impacts on Pakistan's Politics. *Journal of Sociological Research*, 3(1), 1.

<sup>19</sup> Siddiqui, S. (2010). 18th Amendment and education. Retrieved January, 4, 2013.

<sup>20</sup> Hussain, M., & Kokab, R. U. (2012). Eighteenth Amendment in the Constitution of Pakistan: Success and Controversies. *Asian Social Science*, 8(1), 81.

<sup>21</sup> Musarrat, R., Ali, G., & Azhar, M. S. (2012). 18th Amendment and its Impacts on Pakistan's Politics. *Journal of Sociological Research*, 3(1), 1.

be reduced by making the Senate more independent, but a change in the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment would be a prelude to disaster<sup>22</sup>.

Leading Baloch politician Hasil Khan Bizenjo believes that some elements are trying to convince the people that the amendment is not good for the country. “The PTI needs a two-thirds majority to change that, which it does not have. This is to prepare the ground and convince the people. But any such attempt would be strongly condemned. No one, including the PPP and the PML-N, will support it. On the other hand, Chairman Jai Sindh Front Abdul Khaliq Junejo said that no good should be expected from PPP and PML-N<sup>23</sup>. “Both parties have been bargaining with the Establishment in the past and I still would not be surprised if these two parties do not compromise with them on the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment. If this happens then this raw rope of the federation will also be broken”<sup>24</sup>.

As recently as 2018, the PTI government supports the creation of the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment in the region and criticizes its role in some parts. Prime Minister Imran Khan also supports the presidential regime, while his party’s manifesto expresses the transfer of power from below according to the institution of local government. At the first parliamentary meeting after the blockade, the foreign minister accused the People’s Party of using the SINDH CARD, then discussed amendment 18 and suggested reviewing the weak parts of the change. In response, the opposition criticized Shah Mahmud Qureyshi’s statement and said the government was embarrassed by the coronavirus outbreak, that the prime minister did not have a strategy to solve the COVID-19 problem. Former Prime Minister Shahid Khaqan Abbasi asked ministers to submit documents confirming measures to fight the coronavirus and also said that if the 18th amendment is the main reason for the spread of the virus, we will leave<sup>25</sup>.

The main conflict for the federal government is the failure of states in various areas such as healthcare, but the appointment by the federal government of a healthcare professional. Therefore, in such a context, it is difficult to manage the additional costs of the institutions required of the federal government. The Pakistani government, Tehrik Insaaf, is trying to take power from the provinces in favor of the establishment to centralize power, manage finances. Or, on the second page, the institutions do not need the provincial governments because they influence the regions, and the provinces employ military personnel to support them and leave voluntarily whenever they want to take responsibility for a difficult job for them. Constitutionally or jointly, the PTI government wants to solve the problem of renegotiating the allocation of NFC and withdraw some organizations from the provinces to control the cost of the system. The ruling elite plays an important role in supporting the PTI at all stages to control provincialism<sup>26</sup>. As for the distribution of the PTI during the two years of power struggles. Finally, the general propaganda against Amendment 18 is an interesting debate in the Pakistani political environment. The PTI government will soon have to face the consequences of the violent opposition reaction. It is now recognized that PPPs will never commit to renounce Amendment 18 because this is due to the sacrifice of their respective parties and almost all provinces benefit from it<sup>27</sup>.

## Conclusion

Without a doubt, the eighteenth amendment has made a very significant impact upon party politics in Pakistan. On one hand, the powers were handed back to the parliament, the real representative of the people of Pakistan, while on the other hand, the provinces are much more autonomous now as compared to the past. As a result, the political parties focus more upon their respective provinces instead of being greedy towards center. Today, Pakistan is a central majority federation with an important ethnic region and a small number of units. Lessons learned from the experiences of other federations remind of the perils of major ethnic regions. The dangers

---

<sup>22</sup> Shah, A. (2012). The 18th Constitutional Amendment: Glue or solvent for nation building and citizenship in Pakistan?. *The Lahore Journal of Economics*, 17, 387.

<sup>23</sup> Chawla, M. I., & Ullah, A. (2018). The Politics of Pragmatism in Pakistan: A Case Study of the Pakistan People’s Party. *Pakistan Journal of History and Culture*, 39(1).

<sup>24</sup> Musarrat, R., Ali, G., & Azhar, M. S. (2012). 18th Amendment and its Impacts on Pakistan's Politics. *Journal of Sociological Research*, 3(1), 1.

<sup>25</sup> Hussain, M., & Kokab, R. U. (2012). Eighteenth Amendment in the Constitution of Pakistan: Success and Controversies. *Asian Social Science*, 8(1), 81.

<sup>26</sup> Arshad, F., Chawla, M. I., & Zia, A. (2018). Re-contextualizing the 18th Amendment: Working of Federalism in Pakistan. *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan*, 55(2).

<sup>27</sup> Siddiqui, S. (2010). 18th Amendment and education. Retrieved January, 4, 2013.

posed by the main regions are aggravated by a small number of provinces. Although Pakistan has faced many challenges, its federation's design has fueled discontent with central and dominant Punjabis. Decades of underdevelopment, exploitation and neglect cannot be corrected by Islamabad's declarations and it will take at least a generation before significant change occurs. It is difficult to be optimistic about the prospect of democratic consolidation in Pakistan, but there appears to be an understanding among leading politicians that short-term relations with the military and its rivals are counterproductive in the long run (although this understanding is confirmed by a commitment for political survival rather than for democratic consolidation). However, the fact that these conflicts and injustices are so deeply rooted in Pakistan's discourse and the success of politicians in reaching an agreement makes it possible that the reallocation of resources is not chosen. It also appears to be accepted that groups should be recruited from major government agencies. But is this "too late" story? Has underdevelopment and systematic marginalization of parts of provinces gone too far to correct any significant possibility of integration within a single generation? Furthermore, the problems of economic development in Pakistan as a whole, the need to reform local government, eliminate corruption and promote good governance cannot be ignored.

## Bibliography

- Adeney, K. (2012). A step towards inclusive federalism in Pakistan? The politics of the 18th amendment. *Publius: The Journal of Federalism*, 42(4), 539-565.
- Ahmad, R. (2010). The Endemic Crisis of Federalism in Pakistan. *Lahore Journal of Economics*, 15.
- Arshad, F., Chawla, M. I., & Zia, A. (2018). Re-contextualizing the 18th Amendment: Working of Federalism in Pakistan. *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan*, 55(2).
- Bukhari, S. M. H., & Faisal, M. (2013). A Comparative Study of Federalism in Pakistan after 18th Amendment and USA. *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences (PJSS)*, 33(1).
- Chawla, M. I., & Ullah, A. (2018). The Politics of Pragmatism in Pakistan: A Case Study of the Pakistan People's Party. *Pakistan Journal of History and Culture*, 39(1).
- Fair, C. C. (2011). Why the Pakistan army is here to stay: prospects for civilian governance. *International Affairs*, 87(3), 571-588.
- Hussain, M., & Kokab, R. U. (2012). Eighteenth Amendment in the Constitution of Pakistan: Success and Controversies. *Asian Social Science*, 8(1), 81.
- Islam, F. U. (2013). The 18th amendment in the 1973 constitution. *The Dialogue*, 8(2).
- Musarrat, R., Ali, G., & Azhar, M. S. (2012). 18th Amendment and its Impacts on Pakistan's Politics. *Journal of Sociological Research*, 3(1), 1.
- Nishtar, S. (2011). Health and the 18th Amendment. Retaining national functions in devolution: heart file.
- Shah, A. (2012). The 18th Constitutional Amendment: Glue or solvent for nation-building and citizenship in Pakistan?. *The Lahore Journal of Economics*, 17, 387.
- Siddiqui, S. (2010). 18th Amendment and education. Retrieved January 4, 2013.
- 18th Amendment in the Pakistani Constitution. (2018).  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=HT1xqa5LFzM>