

Rao Shahid Mahmood Khan^{*}
Dr. Malik Adnan^{**}
Arsha Saleem Meer^{***}
Dr.Zahid Yousaf^{****}

Conflict and Peace Journalism in South Asia: Role of Print Media in Pakistan - India Relations

Abstract

South Asia has become centre of the globe and stability in the Pakistan-India relations is the key to regional peace, solidity and prosperity as well. Conflict and peace has been important issue for media as well as for the public. This study is focused to analyse the relations between two old rivals Pakistan and India. The study based on the major issues of the two countries. The study focused on the elite English newspapers and the contents related to conflict and peace in the editorial pages of the selected dailies. The study determine that the press from Pakistan shows tilt towards conflict framing; the Indian press present more conflict framing; the peace framing is having less coverage in Pakistani press; the peace framing is having less coverage in Indian press. The study concludes that conflict framing is predominant regarding the conflict and peace framing by Indian and Pakistani press with reference to Pakistan-India relations.

Keywords: Pakistan-India Relations, Conflict and Peace, Journalism, Media, Newspapers

Introduction

Conflict and peace has remained significant feature in determining the very destiny of human kind. With every conflict, there is a solution as well as with every war, there come peace. Mass media of any nation is the most powerful tool of engaging the minds of community. It is equally correct in the situation of Pakistan and India where the society put a lot of confidence in whatsoever is depicted by their domestic media. Conflict and peace has been important issue for media as well as for the public, media has transformed the world into a global village where people should have close and cordial relationship and creating peace and harmony among the nations as world should be a war free place but sometimes war is inevitable (Hussain, I. 2015). South Asian region has become centre of the world for the international powers in various contexts like development and trade but the smooth relations between both Pakistan and India are required to expedite the process of development and progress in the region which would be a key to regional peace, stability and prosperity as well. In past year Pakistan and India were having issues like water dispute, Kashmir issue, border security, terrorism etc. Pakistan and India got independence from the British rule but since independence both countries went in confrontation on various issues among which Kashmir is the core issue which became base for three wars between the two countries having nuclear status (Cheema, P.I. 2004). Media messages are considered as indispensable at present and is having strong impact not only individuals but on the nations as well, this has become base for globalisation as well which has transformed the cultures and traditions as well. Media has become key stake holder in making greater state decisions and even foreign policies of the countries by engaging policy makers of the states (Lee, S, 2010).

Lippmann (1922) stated that image in the heads of the people are created regarding the outer look of the events through press which shows the importance of media in the world. As far as Pakistani and Indian media is concerned it has shown rapid growth during past decade or two focusing on regional and international matters, but for the said countries conflict and peace framing is important as both countries being neighbours and old age rivals came in confrontation various times using the media of respective countries to present their stance in front

* Rao Shahid Mahmood Khan, Assistant Professor, Department of Media Studies

The Islamia University of Bahawalpur Email: raoshahid@iub.edu.pk

** Dr. Malik Adnan Assistant Professor, Department of Media Studies

The Islamia University of Bahawalpur Email: dr.adnan@iub.edu.pk

*** Arsha Saleem Meer, Lecturer Department of Mass Communication

Lahore College for Women University, Lahore E-mail: arsha.saleem@lcwu.edu.pk

**** Dr.Zahid Yousaf, Associate Professor/Chairman Center for Media & Communication
Studies University of Gujrat

of the both nations and world as well, war journalism has been key focus of the media most of the time but media being a key stakeholder is a major component of the peace journalism replacing war in this part of the world. This is an established fact that Pakistan and India both are neighbours and this cannot be changed by any mean, the stability of the region is linked with the relations of the two countries as both are investing billions of rupees on the security on one hand whereas on the other hand both Pakistan and India are having nuclear status as well. The study is focused to understand the coverage of Indo-Pak relations in the leading newspapers of the two old rivals Pakistan and India with reference to conflict and peace framing, as both countries went on confrontation many times and the relations has not been smooth after the independence. The study is focused to examine the representation of conflict and peace issues in Pakistani and Indian press.

Objectives

The objectives of the study are to analyse that how the selected press from Pakistan and India has framed the Kashmir conflict, Water distribution issue, Terrorism export, Cross border firing as conflict framing whereas Culture, Showbiz, Sports, Trade and Peace talks as peace framing. Moreover, it is to analyse that which stance from both conflict and peace framing is on an increase.

Hypotheses

- H1- The press from Pakistan shows tilt towards conflict framing
- H2- The Indian press present more conflict framing
- H3- The peace framing is having less coverage in Pakistani press
- H4- The peace framing is having less coverage in Indian press

Research Question

RQ1- Which frame is presented predominantly by the selected press while presenting Pakistan-India relations?

Literature Review

Media has got primary importance in all fields of life but in conflict and peace media has worked more effectively and efficiently. It has been observed that the media is urged to focus on peace journalism rather conflict journalism. Working on conflict and peace journalism John Galtung was the person who preferred to encourage peace journalism and discouraging war journalism, he presented both war and peace journalism as two entirely opposite frames (Ahmed, 2014). The notion of conflict coverage by media urged to prefer the peace journalism discouraging the conventional war coverage (Galtung 1998). Yousafet. al., (2018) presented the contextual analysis of the leading newspapers related to war and peace journalism that the war journalism is having more coverage in the Pakistani and Indian press focusing on the major issues like water dispute, border issue, Kashmir issue, terrorism, nuclear issue as war frames whereas the show business, trade, sports, arts, culture and visa policy as peace frames. The study concluded that more war framing is analysed than peace framing in the said issues while analysing the editorial pages of Pakistani and Indian newspapers. Youngblood and Harvit (2011) focused on the war and peace journalism in Iraq using content analysis method using Galtung model, war frames were mostly observed using words such as terrorists, extremists and radicalism. As Chung M, Lessman J (2007) concluded that war frame were focused and were preferred by the American media during Iraq war. The photographs of war and peace journalism were focused during same war in Iraq, a critical role in construction of visual news was observed. Moreover, gatekeeping approach in favour of war reporting was analysed in this context by the said services which basically investigated the peace vs conflict journalism. Siraj (2008) presents war and peace framing regarding Pak-India conflict coverage over Kashmir in US newspapers linking Galtung's model using content analysis technique, it was observed that there is dominance of war framing than peace framing but overall Pakistan was covered in more favourable manner than India. Baran & Davis, (2012) stated that media has the potential to cover war and conflict like situations being transparent and bringing the rivals at same table for negotiations. So, conflict and peace related frames are also having importance here and are making meanings and perceptions when the defined frames are analysed on the basis of defined war and peace frames. Frame analysis helps people to understand the issues and events according to their expectations

Theoretical Foundation

The theories employed in the study are the Agenda setting theory, concept of framing and war and peace journalism by Galtung. The agenda setting theory presents that media has strong impact on the society and changes minds of the people regarding events in the society with strong impact (Severin & Tankard, 2000). Media is considered as a searchlight which helps to show a way to the people. The study in hand is focusing on the media agenda setting that how media presents the events and cover them in the form of news stories and rest of the media content. Further, the framing concept is employed which is considered as second level of agenda

setting which presents that how events are presented, projected and framed in the form of media content. The study is based on the framing concept in such a manner that it helps to determine how the selected issues regarding the study in hand are framed by the print media.

Research Design

In this research study the editorial pages of the elite English newspapers from Pakistan including daily The Nation and The Express Tribune whereas Indian Express and The Hindu are analysed from India focusing on the framing of mentioned conflict and peace related from January 1st 2019 to December 31st 2019 are selected for content analysis. The content related to Kashmir conflict, water conflict, terrorism, cross border firing as conflict framing whereas culture, showbiz, sports, trade and peace talks as peace framing. The said categories are analysed into positive, negative and neutral framing. If conflict issue is supported then there is positive conflict framing, if conflict issue is condemned then there is negative conflict framing and if a balanced stance is there then there is neutral conflict framing. If peace related issues are given in a supportive manner then there is positive peace framing, if the peace issues are discouraged then there is negative peace issue framing and if a balanced stance is there then it is neutral stance regarding peace issue framing. In the study every word, sentence and entire editorial or column may be counted. Every selected issue discussed in the content of the newspapers which fall under the study in hand is counted by analysing them into the selected conflict and peace frames. The time duration is important because during the selected time period cross border firing remained continued, the killings in Kashmir, water issue remained continued on one end whereas on the other end an effort to normalise the relations through diplomacy as sports and showbiz diplomacy remained there. The relations faced ups and downs during said time period as blames were also part of debate and it is important to understand that how media has covered the selected issues in context of conflict and peace framing.

Findings

Table 1

Newspaper Coverage to Pakistan - India Relations

Country		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Pakistani Newspapers	The Nation	133	54.1	54.1	54.1
	The Express Tribune	113	45.9	45.9	100.0
	Total	246	100.0	100.0	
Indian Newspapers	Indian Express	105	53.3	53.3	53.3
	The Hindu	92	46.7	46.7	100.0
	Total	197	100.0	100.0	

It shows that the newspaper wise coverage presenting that Pakistani newspapers has given 246 articles (editorials and columns) among which The Nation has given more coverage to Indo-Pak relations whereas Indian newspapers have given 197 articles (editorials and columns) among which Indian Express covered more articles.

Table 2

Conflict and Peace Framing by Pakistani and Indian Newspapers

Country		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Pakistani Newspapers	Peace framing	94	38.2	38.2	38.2
	Conflict framing	152	61.8	61.8	100.0
	Total	246	100.0	100.0	
Indian Newspapers	Peace framing	67	34.0	34.0	34.0
	Conflict framing	130	66.0	66.0	100.0
	Total	197	100.0	100.0	

It shows that the selected Pakistani newspapers has given more conflict framing than peace framing, similarly Indian newspapers also given more conflict framing than peace framing.

Table 3

Opinion Coverage (Editorial and Column)

Country		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Pakistani Newspapers	Editorial	86	35.0	35.0	35.0
	Column	160	65.0	65.0	100.0
	Total	246	100.0	100.0	
Indian Newspapers	Editorial	29	14.7	14.7	14.7
	Column	168	85.3	85.3	100.0
	Total	197	100.0	100.0	

Pakistani newspapers have given more columns over Indo-Pak issues than editorials, similarly Indian newspapers have also given more columns as compared to editorials.

Table 4
Newspaper Coverage Conflictvs Peace Framing

Newspaper		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
The Nation	Peace Framing	46	34.6	34.6	34.6
	ConflictFraming	87	65.4	65.4	100.0
	Total	133	100.0	100.0	
Express Tribune	Peace Framing	48	42.5	42.5	42.5
	ConflictFraming	65	57.5	57.5	100.0
	Total	113	100.0	100.0	
Indian Express	Peace Framing	25	23.8	23.8	23.8
	ConflictFraming	80	76.2	76.2	100.0
	Total	105	100.0	100.0	
The Hindu	Peace Framing	42	45.7	45.7	45.7
	ConflictFraming	50	54.3	54.3	100.0
	Total	92	100.0	100.0	

The newspaper wise conflict and peace framing coverage presenting that Pakistani newspaper The Nation has given more conflict framing whereas The Express Tribune has also given more conflict framing. The Indian newspaper Indian Express has given more conflict framing, similarly The Hindu also showed its tilt towards more conflict framing as compared to peace framing.

Table 5
Editorial and Columns Coverage

Newspaper		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
The Nation	Editorial	44	33.1	33.1	33.1
	Column	89	66.9	66.9	100.0
	Total	133	100.0	100.0	
The Express Tribune	Editorial	42	37.2	37.2	37.2
	Column	71	62.8	62.8	100.0
	Total	113	100.0	100.0	
Indian Express	Editorial	10	9.5	9.5	9.5
	Column	95	90.5	90.5	100.0
	Total	105	100.0	100.0	
The Hindu	Editorial	19	20.7	20.7	20.7
	Column	73	79.3	79.3	100.0
	Total	92	100.0	100.0	

The newspaper wise editorials and columns presenting that the Pakistani newspapers The Nation and The Express Tribune gave more coverage to columns. Similarly, Indian newspapers also presented more columns than editorials. **Test Statistics**

Framing		Newspaper/Country	Opinion
Peace framing	Chi-Square	8.168 ^a	9.447 ^b
	Df	3	1
	Asymp. Sig.	.043	.002
Conflict framing	Chi-Square	11.532 ^c	1.074E2 ^d
	Df	3	1
	Asymp. Sig.	.009	.000

It shows the statistical analysis using Chi-Square resulting that there is significance in the Peace framing as findings of chi-square test newspaper wise is (Chi-Square=8.168; p=.043), the opinion wise (editorial and column) shows significance as (Chi-Square=9.447^b; p=.002). The newspaper wise conflict framing shows significance as well as (Chi-Square=11.532^c; p=.000), the opinion wise significance is also there as (Chi-Square=1.074E2^d; p=.000).

Analysis and Discussion

The study Indo-Pak Relations in the context of Conflict and Peace framing is focused to understand the coverage of the Indo-Pak relations placing the categories into two major framings as conflict and peace framing from January 1st 2017 to June 30th 2017 where the framing of the content including Kashmir conflict, Water distribution issue, Terrorism export, Cross border firing as conflict framing whereas Culture, Showbiz, Sports, Trade and Peace talks as peace framing. The said categories are analysed into positive, negative and neutral framing. If conflict issue is supported then there is positive conflict framing, if conflict issue is condemned then there is negative conflict framing and if a balanced stance is there then there is neutral conflict framing. If peace related issues are given in a supportive manner then there is positive peace framing, if the peace issues are discouraged then there is negative peace issue framing and if a balanced stance is there then it is neutral stance regarding peace issue framing. H1 “The press from Pakistan shows tilt towards conflict framing” which is approved according to (table 2) and is statistically significant (table 6). H2 “The Indian press present more conflict framing” which is approved according to (table 2) and is statistically significant (table 6). H3 “The peace framing is having less coverage in Pakistani press” is approved according to (table 2) and is statistically significant (table 6) and H4 “The peace framing is having less coverage in Indian press” is approved according to (table 2) and is statistically significant (table 6). RQ1 Which frame is presented predominantly by the selected press while presenting Indo-Pak relations? That is concluded that the conflict frame is predominant while presenting the Indo-Pak relations. Statistical analysis using Chi-Square resulting that there is significance in the Peace framing as findings of chi-square test newspaper wise is (Chi-Square=8.168; p=.043), the opinion wise (editorial and column) shows significance as (Chi-Square=9.447^b; p=.002). The newspaper wise conflict framing shows significance as well as (Chi-Square=11.532^c; p=.000), the opinion wise significance is also there as (Chi-Square=1.074E2^d; p=.000). The study concludes that more columns were given by all newspapers from Pakistan and India with maximum negative framing of the conflict related issues but a little bit positive framing of peace issues, overall newspapers presented more conflict framing was observed in the coverage of all newspapers over all selected categories. The study concludes that conflict framing is predominant regarding the conflict and peace framing by Indian and Pakistani press with reference to Indo-Pak relations.

References

- Baran, S. J., & Davis, D. K. (2012). *Mass Communication Theory: Foundations, Ferment, and Future* (Sixth ed.). Boston, MA: Wadsworth Cengage Learning.
- Chander, P. (2003). *India Pakistan; Unending Conflict*. New Delhi: Excel Books publications.
- Cheema, P.I. (2004). *Accelerate The Pakistan India Peace Process*. In Shahid, Imtiaz. (ed). *Contemporary Affairs*. Lahore: Carvan Enterprises
- Chung M, Lessman J (2007) *War and Peace Journalism Frames in Cross National News Coverage of North Korea's Nuclear Test*. Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication.
- Galtung, J. (1998.) *High Road, Low Road: Charting the Course for Peace Journalism*. Track Two, 7 (4). Retrieved from http://www.ccr.uct.ac.za/archive/two/7_4/p07_high_road_lowroad.html

- Hussain, I. (2015). News Framing on Indo-Pak Conflicts in the News (Pakistan) and Times of India: War and Peace Journalism Perspective. *Journal of Mass Communication & Journalism*.2 (1).
- Lee S (2010) Peace journalism: Principles and structural limitations in the news coverage of three conflicts. *Mass Communication & Society* 13: 361-384.
- Lippmann, W. (1922). *Public Opinion*. New York: Macmillan.
- Severin, Werner J.; Tankard Jr., James W. (2000). *Communication Theories: Origins, Methods and Uses in the Mass Media (5th Edition)*, Published by Addison Wesley Longman, Inc.
- Siraj, S. A. (2008). War or Peace Journalism in Elite US Newspapers: Exploring News Framing in Pakistan-India Conflict. Montreal, Quebec: In annual meeting of the International Communication Association.
- Youngblood A, Horvit B (2008). *Peace or war journalism? How The New York Times and The Associated Press framed Iraq in 2006*. Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication, Marriott Downtown, Chicago.
- Yousafet. al., (2018). War and Peace Framing: the Contextual Analysis of Indo-Pak Relations. *Journal of Strategic Studies*, Vol. 38, No. 1