

Indian Hybrid Warfare in Pakistan: Spin off Ramifications for Pakistan’s National Security

Nouman Mubarik

M.Phil. Scholar, Department of Strategic Studies, National Defence University, Islamabad, Pakistan.

Junaid Jhandad

Lecturer, Department of Strategic Studies, National Defence University, Islamabad, Pakistan.

Email: junaidjhandad@ndu.edu.pk

Dr. Asma Shakir Khawja

Associate Professor, Department of Strategic Studies, National Defence University, Islamabad, Pakistan.

Email: asamakhawaja@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The swift technological advancements in the spheres of means of communication, transportation, information technology and military technology have made standard war-fighting methods obsolete, to some extent. The strategic and security atmosphere in the 21st century is most intricate and volatile. Now states, because of the development of weapons of mass destruction and the aggravated influence of non-state actors, fancy to operate in non-conventional and non-kinetic domains. States’ amplified aptitude to blend linear and non-linear tactics against their adversaries has instigated a completely different and complex form of warfare i.e., hybrid warfare. Hybrid warfare envisions the convergence of conventional and non-conventional warfare tactics against an adversary to annihilate it completely or at least to deteriorate it gradually. Indo-Pak ties, that have always been turbulent, have become more complex with the insertion of the hybrid warfare in the equation. Pakistan’s attainment of nuclear deterrence, after the explicit nuclearization of South Asia in 1998, against its conventionally grander rival has brought India to its wits end. Subsequently, India- owing to its strategic paralyses- has been in hunt of different methods to undermine Pakistan’s national security. The surfacing of hybrid warfare has rejuvenated Indian ambitions, as the quintessence of hybrid warfare is to hurl little punches at the opponent without being interlocked in a major war. The hybrid warfare strategy espoused by India against Pakistan is critically threatening latter’s national security. Hence, the research paper aims to underscore foremost threats and challenges to Pakistan’s national security by the virtue of Indian hybrid warfare and put forward viable countermeasures.

Key Words: **India, Pakistan, Hybrid Warfare & National Security.**

Introduction

Conflicts and altercations amongst states are inherent in the structure of international system, (Baylis et al., 2012) in spite of humankind’s constant search for peace. When peace grinds to a halt, war is the outcome. During the course history, war has governed the canvas of international politics. War was always presumed in orthodox sense, with states flexing their military muscles. (Baylis et

al., 2012) But with the upsurge of technical level in realms of information technology, means of communication and military weapons, traditional methodology of war-fighting has expired, to some extent. (Baylis et al., 2012) This does not imply that the nature of war has changed. As Clausewitz articulated the nature of war remains constant only it's character changes. (Clausewitz et al., 1976) The strategic security milieu of the 21st century is transmuting at a brisk pace. The nascent nature of threats, gadgets of fighting and non-military instruments have radically altered the nature of conflicts. Now states have multiple alternatives at their disposal like information warfare, cyber warfare, psychological warfare, propaganda and guerilla warfare to employ against opponent. This has originated the most complex form of warfare: hybrid warfare.

Hybrid warfare is the synchronized application of all constituents of national force including terrorism and criminal activities to achieve political objectives. (McCulloh & Johnson, 2013) It is the synergistic fusion of conventional and non-conventional forces in juxtaposition with terrorism and criminal behavior. The confluence of physical and psychological facets in hybrid warfare has significantly blurred the dissimilarities between kinetic and non-kinetic one, conventional and irregular warfare and violent and non-violent operations. (Mansoor, 2012) Hybrid warfare embodies the essence of unrestricted warfare. According to Frank Hoffman, (Banasiq, 2017) hybrid threat can be termed as: An opponent who concurrently and adaptably, and in a cohesive manner applies the combination of conventional weapons, irregular tactics, terrorism and criminal elements in the battle to achieve its political objectives.

A hybrid force uses various tools to impose hybrid warfare on the adversary. These include: conventional military operations, economic warfare, information warfare, cyber warfare, psychological warfare, diplomatic coercion, propaganda, fake news, terrorism, insurgencies and other criminal activities. Most of these scandalous methods have reflection in Indian war-mongering policies towards Pakistan. (Jaffery, 2020) India has waged hybrid warfare against Pakistan to demean its national security. (Jaffery, 2020) India wants to achieve certain political and strategic objectives by waging hybrid warfare against Pakistan. (Malik, 2020)

Since the division of the Subcontinent, India and Pakistan have been at the loggerheads, most of the time. Both countries have been involved in three full-scale wars of 1948, 1965, 1971 and an armed conflict of Kargil in 1999. (Krolikowski, 2016) There might have been more wars between them, had there been no nuclear deterrence. India has an advantage over Pakistan in the conventional warfare arena because of its conventional superiority. (Khan, 2013) But India's conventional superiority was checkmated with the advent of nuclear weapons in South Asia. Now, India is left with not many options, except hybrid warfare, to undermine Pakistan's national security. The tools used by India in its hybrid warfare against Pakistan are: military adventurism, terrorism, supporting insurgencies and separatist movements, economic coercion, diplomatic coercion, propaganda fake news, and hydro warfare. (Jaffery, 2020)

Indian Hybrid Warfare in Pakistan: Spin off Ramifications for Pakistan's National Security

The main objective of the research article is to outline significant threats and challenges to Pakistan's national security emanating from vicious Indian hybrid campaign. The subject is an automatic choice for a scholarly investigation, given the gravity of threats to Pakistan from India's hybrid warfare. The study endeavors to address these questions: What are significant conventional and non-conventional threats to Pakistan's national security from India's hybrid warfare? What are the objectives India wants to achieve by imposing hybrid warfare on Pakistan? What is the modus operandi of Indian hybrid warfare in Pakistan? And What countermeasures Pakistan requires to effectively tackle these hybrid threats by India?

Elucidating hybrid warfare

The term 'hybrid warfare' albeit attracted many eyeballs in current times, but its footprints can be traced in Peloponnesian War. (Mansoor 2012) Hybrid war has its essence from unrestricted war, as both hybrid and unrestricted war are exempt from rules and restrictions. Hybrid warfare is advertised as the most complex form of warfare as it embodies the application of all elements of national power combined with criminal activities and violence to knock over your opponent gradually. The strategic security milieu of contemporary epoch has changed entirely with the emergence of different non-state actors, military advancements, non-military instruments, and various types of war. This has placed the states into the cath-22 situation with wholly new range of threats and different nature of conflicts altogether, hence, originating the concept of hybrid warfare. From chronological standpoint, hybrid warfare's methodology of merging conventional and irregular operations dates back to centuries. (Simons & Chifu, 2018) Many such specimens can be witnessed in the history of military science. From etymological take, hybrid is a Latin word, meaning crossbreed. (Simons & Chifu, 2018) It is an individual formed from the merging of two genetically different individuals belonging to different species, varieties or races. In terminological sense, hybrid is the amalgamation of elements from different sources and structures. (Simons & Chifu, 2018) The conception that hybrid warfare is the mishmash of guerrilla tactics and the new technology oversimplifies the term and refers only to the non-state aspect of the term. In fact, it is only a pie of the cake. The whole concept embodies many more elements that cannot be overlooked at all. Hybrid warfare can be piloted by both state and non-state actors. States may choose a completely different modus operandi, applying diverse methods across the spectrum fluctuating from traditional armed struggle using non-conventional cyber weapons and information warfare to special services operations, as well as terrorism and criminal activities.

Frank Hoffman, a celebrated hybrid theorist, asserts that hybrid warfare is characterized by "states or groups that select from the whole menu of tactics and

technologies and blend them in innovative ways to meet their own strategic culture, geography, and aims.” (Vaczi, 2016) Hoffman defines hybrid threat as, “Any adversary that simultaneously and adaptively employs a fused mix of conventional weapons, irregular tactics, terrorism, and criminal behavior in the battle space to obtain their political objectives.” (Vaczi, 2016) In a nutshell hybrid warfare can be defined in simple term as the simultaneous application of all tools at disposal which includes: conventional operations, non-conventional operations, fake news, propaganda, diplomatic coercion, economic coercion, cyber warfare, Lawfare, psychological warfare, criminal acts, violence, terrorism and insurgencies to abolish the opponent gradually, or at least its will to fight. (Vaczi, 2016)

Strategic rationale behind Indian hybrid warfare in Pakistan

Before proceeding ahead, it is mandatory to figure out the rationale of Indian hybrid warfare in Pakistan. In pre nuclear era, imbalance in conventional force exacerbated state’s security dilemma. (Leah & Lowther, 2017) But the development of nuclear weapons changed the dynamics by nullifying the numerical superiority of conventional forces. (Leah & Lowther, 2017) The very objective of strategy making changed as Bernard Brodie said: “Thus far the chief purpose of our military establishment has been to win wars. From now on its chief purpose must be to avert them.” (Howard, 1981) Two nuclear armed states avoid altercations and armed conflicts because of threat of escalation of conflict. The fear of mutual assured destruction maintains the required balance of power. No one party can claim victory in a nuclear war, as vulnerabilities are mutual and cost of destroying opponent is so elevated that it is not favored by any rational act. (Howard, 1981) For example, if India is able to exterminate Pakistan through nuclear strikes; but at the cost of losing its major cities like Chennai, New Delhi, Kolkata, Mumbai, and Banglore. Would this loss be acceptable to India? Nuclear deterrence works by instilling the fear in opponent’s mind that consequences of any unwanted action would be unimaginable. (Powell, 1990)

Prior to nuclearization of South Asia, India had an upper hand in the conventional demesne vis a vis Pakistan. But Pakistan’s development of credible minimum deterrence nullified Indian conventional superiority. India and Pakistan were involved in three major wars: 1948, 1965 and 1971, pre nuclear potency. And after the developments of nuclear weapons, they been involved in a single armed conflict in 1999. This demonstrates the impact of nuclear deterrence on the strategic atmosphere of the region. This is annoying for India that a country having such mammoth military and economic muscles, has not been able to stamp its authority in the region. India has been paralyzed strategically by Pakistan’s nuclear deterrence. Now, India cannot flaunt its military prowess and threaten Pakistan by the threats of military adventures. This strategic paralysis of not been able to dominate Pakistan, despite of being better in size and number, gives India the rationale to wage hybrid warfare against Pakistan.

Decoding the objectives of India's hybrid warfare against Pakistan

The objectives India wants to accomplish by waging hybrid warfare against Pakistan are assorted. First, the predominant Hindutva mindset in the power corridors of India deems to take revenge of its past grievances. It appears that many Hindu factions in India are still holding on to the past grudges of being reigned by Muslims. (Marwah, 1979) They consider Muslims 'invaders', who invaded the Indian Sub-Continent and ruled them in an unfair manner. (Gargan, 1982) And when it was their opportunity to rule, because of the dawn of democracy, Muslims started demanding separate homeland- Pakistan. Second, India desires to be an Asian hegemon. According to its thinking, this could earn it a permanent seat in UNSC (United Nations Security Council). (Abbas, 2020) Objective of dominating the region of South Asia was clear even in the mind of first Prime minister of India when he said: "India was a big country destined to play a big role in global politics." (Abbas, 2020) Being an Asian hegemon is a part of its global hegemonic agenda. Pakistan is the only real hurdle in its way, as other countries of this region do not have the material capabilities that could threaten India's hegemonic ambitions. It appears that policy makers in India are convinced by the fallacious logic of getting a permanent seat in UNSC by bullying and exerting influence over its neighbors. (Abbas, 2020) The evolving Indian nuclear doctrine and modernization of its nuclear weapons are clear manifestations of its regional hegemonic aspirations. (Mushtaq & Hashmi, 2012)

Third, India wants to get out of the strategic paralyses, (Akhtar, 2021) which it fell victim to when Pakistan attained nuclear deterrence against it. Prior to Pakistan's nuclear potency, it had conventional inferiority with respect to India. But this conventional leeway, enjoyed by the India, has now been counterbalanced. India in an effort to come out of this strategic disability introduced CSD (Cold Start Doctrine), but to no avail. CSD, based on fallacious basis, envisioned fighting a limited war with Pakistan under the nuclear overhang by increasing the number of strike-forces alongside the border, marking its shift from Sundarji's 'defensive' posture to 'defensive-offence'. (Khan, 2012) Now that spuriousness of Indian CSD is wide-open, it is forced to try out alternative option of hybrid warfare. Fourth, India wants to weaken China-Pakistan collusion by destabilizing Pakistan through its hybrid warfare strategy. (Rehman, 2009) India perceives Sino-Pak economic and strategic ties a threat to its national security. As China is the stronger of the duo, it is unlikely that India will to take on China because of latter's military and economic prowess. So, India very conveniently is targeting Pakistan.

Modus operandi of India's hybrid warfare in Pakistan

After decoding the objectives which India wants to achieve through its hybrid warfare against Pakistan, the study demands to outline the modus operandi being employed by India. Diverse tools are being put in service by India in its hybrid warfare strategy against Pakistan. Following tactics are being utilized by India:

Promoting terrorism and insurgencies in Pakistan.

Propagating terrorism and supporting insurgencies is the go-to tactic, often employed by India to create unrest and destabilize Pakistan. India is trying its best to proliferate terrorism in Pakistan, especially in Baluchistan, this has been confirmed with the arrest of Kulbhushan Jadhav, a serving commander in the Indian Navy, caught red-handed by Pakistani security personnel under the charges of terrorism and espionage in Pakistan's province of Baluchistan. (Elsa, 2019) Baluchistan has always been a central target for India because of its geo-strategic significance. This is not the only case, PTM (Pashtun Tehreek Movement), a movement commenced for the protection of rights of Pashtun community is also being sponsored by Indian intelligence agency- RAW (Research and Analysis Wing)- to create social unrest in the region, as per the statements issued by former DG ISPR Lieutenant General Asif Ghafoor. (Hashim, 2019)

Eight members of Indian High Commission in Islamabad were also expunged from Pakistan In November 2016 because of their involvement in subversive activities and working undercover for Indian intelligence agency, they were also alleged of having contacts with TTP (Tehreek Taliban Pakistan)- a terrorist organization in Pakistan. (Khetran, 2017) Indian patronage of BLA (Balochistan Liberation Army), involved in various terrorist attacks in Pakistan including attacks on Stock Exchange of Pakistan and Pearl Continental hotel in Gwadar, has also been accredited by an Indian newspaper 'The Hindu' when it admitted that BLA commanders have contacts with Indians and they also get medical treatment in India under disguise. (Bhattacharjee, 2019)

Statement given by previous BJP defense minister Manohar Parrikar that India will sponsor terrorism in Pakistan to counter terrorism solidifies Pakistan's claims of India stoking terror in Pakistan. (Nation, 2015) In a recent interview given to an Indian journalist, Karan Thapar, (Yusuf, 2020) Pakistan's National Security Advisor Moeed Yousaf claimed that the terrorists involved in the most horrific attack in country's history on Army Public School Peshawar were being guided from Indian consulate in Afghanistan and the attack on Chinese consulate in Karachi also had Indian connection. DG ISPR Major General Iftikhar and foreign minister Shah Mehmood Qureshi released various audio and video clips to expose Indian state-terrorism in Pakistan. DG ISPR said that India has designed a specific cell under Modi to target CPEC related projects and it has devoted billions of rupees to reunite part-away factions of TTP. (Tribune, 2020)

Indian Hybrid Warfare in Pakistan: Spin off Ramifications for Pakistan's National Security

Diplomatic coercion against Pakistan.

Coercive diplomacy has always been used as a tool by states to achieve foreign policy goals. In inter-state relationships war and diplomacy go hand in hand. But when diplomacy is intermingled with strategic coercion it takes form of hybrid tactic. The most significant aspect of Indian hybrid warfare strategy against Pakistan is to Isolate Pakistan in diplomatic arena. Indian Prime Minister Narendra Modi while giving a speech in southern Kerala state said: "We will isolate you. I will work for that." (Dawn, 2016) India utilized all its diplomatic resources to push Pakistan into the grey list of FATF (Financial Action Task Force) that is taking a heavy toll on Pakistan's already struggling economy, these reservations were also showed by Pakistan's foreign minister Shah Mehmood Qureshi when he feared that Pakistan could be blacklisted by FATF due to lobbying by India. (The Times of India, 2019) India assiduously lobbied to block US' F-16s sale to Pakistan as well. (The Economic Times, 2018) US senator Larry Pressler mentioned in his book that Indian embassy in US lobbied in Senate against the subsidized sale of F-16 fighters to Pakistan. (Iqbal, 2017)

Fake news and propaganda

In contemporary age, fake news and propaganda have become indispensable elements of war-fighting strategy with the evolution of means of communication. (Dawn, 2019) Now the battles are being brawled in information domain. (Prier, 2017) A fake news spread or propaganda against one's opponent is a lot more impactful than using coercive military weapons. Digital platforms, being major sources of information, are breeding grounds for these tactics. India, with its prowess in information technology, (Zafar, 2016) is capable of cashing on these opportunities, if presented. India is running a smear campaign against Pakistan to project it as a terrorist country. (Babar, 2020) Indian attitude of blaming Pakistan for every single incident occurred within its internal territory is testimony to the fact that it is carrying on with a propaganda of tarnishing latter's image in the comity of nations. According to the statistics published by IPRI (Islamabad Policy Research Institute), Indian digital media is involved in methodical propaganda against Pakistan in four major areas: (1) Campaign against Pakistani armed forces, (2) Permeating social unrest within Pakistan, (3) Propaganda on Indian Occupied Kashmir (IOK) and (4) To hamper the growth of CPEC. (The Express Tribune, 2020)

Water as a tool to exert pressure on Pakistan.

Pakistan's three rivers- Indus, Jhelum and Chenab- which it was allocated through Indus Water Treaty of 1960, originates from India. (Gettleman, 2019) It is heavily dependent on its water resources to meet its financial needs, being an agrarian

economy. India, vary of this fact, wants to exploit this opportunity. On many occasions Indian politicians have spoken about blocking Pakistan's share of water, after Uri incident Indian prime minister Narendra Modi said "blood and water can't flow together." (Gettleman, 2019) India is using water as a tool to achieve its political objectives, showing characteristic of hybrid warfare. After Pulwama incident Indian water resources minister tweeted: "Our Govt. has decided to stop our share of water which used to flow to Pakistan. We will divert water from Eastern rivers and supply it to our people in Jammu and Kashmir and Punjab." (Gettleman, 2019) India is using its upstream position to wage hybrid warfare against Pakistan. This could have serious repercussions for Pakistan's economic security, and economic security is directly connected with state's national security. So, it would be direct threat to Pakistan's national security.

Implications on Pakistan's national security

Indian hybrid warfare is posing significant traditional and non-traditional challenges to Pakistan's national security. Traditional challenges are the conventional security challenges and non-traditional are political, economic and social challenges. First important security threat is the possibility of a conventional military operation by India in the guise of targeting terrorist hideouts in Pakistan. Its latest example has been seen in February 2019, when India in a coverup to its security lapse in Pulwama conducted self-claimed 'Balakot strikes' on terrorist camps in Pakistan. (Tripathi, 2019) India tries to legitimize its conventional military offense against Pakistan by portraying it an attempt to curb terrorism in the region.

Second constant security threat is continuous firing and bomb-shelling by India at the line of control. (Raza, 2020) Its recent manifestation was observed, when Indian military troops targeted a vehicle of the UN Military Observer Group in India and Pakistan (UNMOGIP); the matter has been taken to UN by Pakistan for unbiased investigation of the event. (Raza, 2020) Third security threat is the possibility of rebirth of terrorism in Pakistan. Pakistan has already suffered a lot in its war against terrorism. It has only been few years that Pakistan has normalized the situation by conducting operations like Zarb-e-Azab and Radu-ul-Fassad. The human lives lost by Pakistan from 2002 to 2013, owing to various terrorist incidents, are more than fifty-two thousand. (Abbasi, 2013) And the economic loss till 2017 was 126.79 billion dollars, as per the statistics provided by Economic Survey of Pakistan 2017-18. (Mustafa, 2018) These figures depict only the impact that can be quantified, non-quantifiable effects like psychological impact and social impact are much worse. Indian tactics of fanning terrorism in Pakistan as a part of its hybrid warfare strategy can cause resurgence of terrorism, and all the sacrifices made by people of Pakistan and its armed forces could go down the drain.

Fourth security threat is Indian presence in Afghanistan. India has made number of investments in Afghanistan to influence it, some of which includes:

Indian Hybrid Warfare in Pakistan: Spin off Ramifications for Pakistan's National Security

building of Afghan's Parliament in Kabul, reconstruction of Salma dam now known as Afghan-India Friendship Dam, building schools, rehabilitating water reservoirs, universities, hospitals, and upgrading telephone exchanges in some provinces. (Iwanek, 2019) Stable Afghanistan is vital to Pakistan's security concerns. Stability in Afghanistan would not only provide relief to Pakistan from security threats, but would also be crucial, in connecting Pakistan to resource-rich region of Central Asia. (Haidari, 2018) Fighting Indian aggression on two fronts could be a nightmare for Pakistan's strategic and civil policy makers. Therefore, Indian presence in Afghanistan is a serious threat to Pakistan's national security.

The political challenge to Pakistan's national security emanating from Indian hybrid warfare is the contingency of diplomatic isolation. Pakistan is faced with staunch diplomatic challenge in the form of Indian diplomatic warfare against it. (Aditya, 2020) Recent report published by EU Dis info lab 'Indian chronicles', (Shad, 2020) affirmed how India has been operating disinformation campaign through fake and bogus media channels to target Pakistan. Second political challenge for Pakistan is to gather support from international community for Kashmir's right of self-determination. Indian agenda of maligning Pakistan's image by projecting it as a terrorist country which propagates terrorism in IOK is hurting Pakistan's stance on Kashmir issue. (Siddique, 2020) Pakistan needs to internationalize the issue and highlight the predicaments of Kashmiri people at all fora. The task is not straightforward by any stretch of imagination, given the political potency of India and the temptation for global powers to appease India. Any rational actor, obsessed with realist ideology, would be enticed by massive Indian market, forcing it to compromise on lowkey issue like human rights. Additionally, US' Indo-pacific strategy of utilizing India as a balancer against China is another reason of US' appeasement of India. (Ye, 2020) Keeping in view the constraints, Pakistan is faced with an up-hill task of fighting for Kashmir's cause against the political might of India.

Along with political challenges, Pakistan is faced with different economic challenges pertaining to Indian hybrid warfare. The military and political might of any state are directly proportional to its economic conditions. Military capabilities alone cannot preserve the vital interests of Pakistan, while overlooking economic progress. Already brittle economy of Pakistan, with negative growth of 0.4% in 2020 according to report issued by Asian Development Bank (ADB), is faced with serious economic challenges by Indian hybrid warfare. (Asian Development Bank, 2020)

Biggest economic challenge is Indian targeting of CPEC, a flagship project being advanced as a noteworthy component of Sino-Pak economic ties. Pakistan is greatly depending on this mega project to improve its economic conditions. The project has already concluded different infrastructure projects and has given much needed energy security to Pakistan through various energy related projects. And this is only the tip of the iceberg, the project has potential to turn Pakistan's tide, if

materialized completely. CPEC has the potential to cater economic grievances of the people of Baluchistan by improving their living standards and providing them employment opportunities. This would hamper Indian ability to operate in Baluchistan. Additionally, in collusion with United States it is also involved in creating negative propaganda against CPEC by terming it as 'Debt Trap'. (Rokhila, 2019)

Second economic challenge is to not indulge itself in arms race. Pakistan can ill afford to be involved in an expensive arms race, with its economy already in tatters. Pakistan cannot jump on the bandwagon with India in military spending because of latter's mammoth economic size. According to a report published by Stockholm International Peace Research Institute (SIPRI), Indian military spending was \$71 billion amounting to 2.4% of its GDP and military spending by Pakistan was \$10.3 billion amounting to 3.4% of its GDP. (Ahmed, 2020) This illustrates the economic disparity between both countries. Pakistan would be better served if not indulged in arms race at the cost of its human development.

The most important social challenge to Pakistan's national security from Indian hybrid warfare is the threat of national disintegration. Social cohesion is very necessary for Pakistan because of its cultural, ethnic and linguistic diversity. Pakistan having different ethnicities like Punjabi, Balochi, Sindhi and Pakhtun is highly susceptible to the tactics tailored to create divisions among them. Indian support for BLA is an example of supporting separatist movements in Pakistan, that could ultimately result in national disintegration. (Abbasi, 2020) Additionally, India is also attempting to defame Pakistan's army by crafting propaganda that they are involved in human rights abuse in Baluchistan. (Abbasi, 2020) The idea is to sow seeds of hatred in the hearts of general masses against state's institutions. India is also providing support to PTM leaders to create ethnic differences in Pakistan. (Abdullah, 2018) These are the different political, economic and social challenges that Pakistan could face from Indian hybrid warfare strategy.

Conclusion

The strategic security dynamics of this era has changed significantly from previous times. The traditional war-fighting methods have been substituted by the new ones, making security environment complex, then ever before. The innovations in means of communication, transportation, information technology and military weapons have provided states new avenues to explore. In addition to this, the rise of non-state actor has multiplied the volatility of the security environment. Now, states not only need to defend their border from the adversary. But also need to safeguard its political, economic, social and environmental security as well. The ability of states to simultaneously employ different means against their opponent has given birth to the concept of hybrid warfare.

Hybrid conflicts of the 21st century are of different wavelengths altogether. Previously conflicts used to continue in a very set pattern. But these hybrid conflicts are waged in an atmosphere of unparallel security conditions along with

Indian Hybrid Warfare in Pakistan: Spin off Ramifications for Pakistan's National Security

impeccable communication and information capabilities to target the vulnerabilities of the opponent. Hybrid conflicts have the potential to enervate international security because of the availability of plethora of means to states and non-state actors, which can be utilized to submit adversary to its will. It would not be wrong to say that the implementation of hybrid tactics can only be confined by the imagination of the one waging it.

The inclusion of hybrid warfare in Indo-Pak ties has made the already hostile relationship more complex. It is known to everybody that there is no love lost between the two countries. Since the partition of India Sub-Continent three major wars have been fought between them. Although the dawn of nuclear era has stymied the scope of major conventional war, but the frequency of crisis limited conflicts has increased visibly, owing to stability-instability paradox. But one considerable impact of nuclear weapons is that it has nullified the conventional superiority of India vis-à-vis Pakistan. Basically, Pakistan's nuclear deterrence has paralyzed India strategically. This provides India the rationale to wage hybrid warfare against Pakistan. The tactics being employed by India in its hybrid warfare against Pakistan are multi-faceted which includes: conventional military operations, diplomatic coercion, fake news, propaganda and hydro warfare. The Indian hybrid tactics are not only issuing conventional security challenges to Pakistan's national security; but also, political, economic and social challenges as well. Keeping in view the gravity of threats, it is exigent for the policy makers, military strategists and defence analysts to keep themselves abreast of the new tools and tactics of the hybrid warfare in general and of their opponent in particular. Because the victim of hybrid warfare needs equally responsive and effective counter-strategies to counter the hybrid threats. For this purpose, few valuable recommendations have been given in the proceeding section.

Recommendations

- The Sine qua non is to run a campaign to raise awareness about Indian hybrid warfare in Pakistan among law enforcement agencies, governmental circles, state institutions, media houses and general public as well. This can be done through seminars, workshops, webinars, electronic media, print media, social media and by including subjects related to this in the syllabi.
- Full scope assessment of internal security policies and strategies to tackle the challenges posed by different tactics of Indian hybrid warfare is obligatory for Pakistan.
- Media in this epoch has become an important medium to enhance the national security of the state and to demoralize opponent's will to pursue its objectives. In today's era, media functions as an image and narrative constructor. Pakistan must devise a comprehensive media strategy to

expose vicious Indian agenda of waging hybrid warfare against Pakistan. An effective media strategy can bridge the gap between Pakistan's real image and the maligned image portrayed by India in comity of nations.

- The crux of hybrid warfare is to attack the opponent where it is most vulnerable. So, the internal fault lines of Pakistan need to be outlined by the military strategists, policy makers, and scholars. This is not a one-time exercise, as the hybrid strategy keeps on evolving.
- The uplift of the living standards of the people of Balochistan must be ensured. Balochistan is the hub of nefarious hybrid tactics employed by India. It is a breeding ground for hybrid tactics. The grievances of people of Balochistan must be addressed at the earliest. Their economic, political and civil rights must be guaranteed. Although CPEC has been proven a boon for them, but still lot of work remains to be done.
- Economic strength is the foremost pillar of national power. And economic security of any state is directly connected to its national security. Countries running on economic aids, loans and grants from other states or international financial institutions cannot be independent in their foreign policy making. Their sovereignty is conceded to their financial needs. Poor economic conditions also hinder state's ability to spend on defence-related needs. The stature of any state in international community depends on its economic capability. So, if Pakistan wants that its narrative be acknowledged and influential countries side with it, it must improve its economic conditions.
- Pakistan's intelligence agencies must work in tandem with Afghanistan's agencies. A Pak-Afghan joint mechanism to handle Indian terrorism threats originating from Afghan territory is the need of the hour.

References

- Abbas, J. (2020, July 13). India, Neighbors and the Paradox of Hegemonic Ambitions. *Hilal*. Retrieved from <https://www.hilal.gov.pk/eng-author/ambassador-jalil-abbas-jillani/MjM=.html>
- Abbasi, A. (2020, July 1). BLA has known Indian connection. *The News*. Retrieved from <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/680356-bla-has-known-indian-connection>
- Abbasi, N. M. (2013). Impact of Terrorism on Pakistan. *Strategic Studies*, 33(2), 33-68. doi:10.2307/48527612
- Abdullah, S. M. (2018, May 12). Pashtun Tahafuz Movement (PTM): An Indo Afghan joint venture against Pakistan. *Times of Islamabad*. May 12, 2018. Retrieved from <https://www.timesofislamabad.com/12-May-2018/pashtun-tahafuz-movement-ptm-an-indo-afghan-joint-venture-against-pakistan>
- Aditya, G. S. (2020, May 6). Use of "Use coercive diplomacy on Pakistan. *The Statesman*. Retrieved from <https://www.thestatesman.com/opinion/use-coercive-diplomacy-pakistan-1502884862.html>
- Ahmed, A. (2020, April 28). India has world's third biggest defence spending now. *Dawn*. Retrieved from <https://www.dawn.com/news/1552802>

Indian Hybrid Warfare in Pakistan: Spin off Ramifications for Pakistan's National Security

- Akhtar, R. (2020, November 28). India's Strategic Paralysis and Counterforce Temptations. *Pakistan Politico*. Retrieved from <https://pakistanpolitico.com/cf/>
- Babar, M. (2020, November 21). Enemies of CPEC will fail: Standing firm with Pakistan, says China. *The News*. Retrieved from <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/746521-enemies-of-cpec-will-fail-standing-firm-with-pakistan-says-china>
- Banasik, M. (2017). *Security and Hybrid Warfare New Rivalry Paradigm of the Russian Federation in the International Arena*. Beau Bassin: LAP Lambert Academic Publishing.
- Baylis, J., Smith, S., & Owens, P. (2014). *The Globalization of World Politics: An Introduction to International Relations*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Bhattacharjee, K. (2019, July 3). Explained: The Baloch Liberation Army. *The Hindu*. Retrieved from <https://www.thehindu.com/news/international/explained-the-baloch-liberation-army/article28273960.ece>
- Clausewitz, C. V., Howard, M., & Paret, P. (1976). *On War*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Elsa, E. (2019, September 2). The Case of Kulbhushan Jadhav in Pakistan: Everything You Need to Know. *Gulf News*. Retrieved from <https://gulfnews.com/world/asia/pakistan/the-case-of-kulbhushan-jadhav-in-pakistan-everything-you-need-to-know-1.66160866>
- Gargan, E. A. (1992, December 11). The Hatreds of India; Hindu Memory Scarred by Centuries of Sometimes Despotism. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://nytimes.com/1992/12/11/world/hatreds-of-india-hindu-memory-scarred-by-centuries-sometimes-despotism.html>
- Gittleman, J. (2019, February 21). India Threatens a New Weapon Against Pakistan: Water. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2019/02/21/world/asia/india-pakistan-water-kashmir.html>
- Haidari, M. A. (2018, January 26). A Peaceful Afghanistan Key to Regional Connectivity in South and Central Asia. *The Diplomat*. Retrieved from <https://www.thediplomat.com/2018/01/a-peaceful-afghanistan-key-to-regional-connectivity-in-south-and-central-asia/>
- Hashim, A. (2019, April 30). Pakistan Military Warns Pashtun Rights Group Its 'Time Is Up'. *AlJazeera*. Retrieved from <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2019/4/30/pakistan-military-warns-pashtun-rights-group-its-time-is-up>
- Howard, M. E. (1981). On Fighting a Nuclear War. *International Security*, 5(4), 3-17. doi:10.2307/2538710.
- Imran Khan's NSA Says India Expressed 'Desire for Conversation', Pak to Insist Kashmiris Be Party [Interview by 1332729634 977636852 K. Thapar]. (2020, October 13). Retrieved February 2, 2021, from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=gvM80Kyq3HM>
- Iqbal, A. (2017, October 4). US firm lobbied for and against Pakistan over F-16s. *Dawn*. Retrieved from <https://www.dawn.com/news/1361587>

- Iwanek, K. (2019, January 8). 36 Things India Has Done for Afghanistan. *The Diplomat*. Retrieved from <https://www.thediplomat.com/2019/01/36-things-india-has-done-for-afghanistan/>
- Jaffery, S. Z. (2020, June 30). Indian Hybrid Warfare: The Threat Is Real. *The Nation*. Retrieved from <https://nation.com.pk/30-Jun-2020/-indian-hybrid-warfare-the-threat-is-real>
- Khan, Z. (2012). Cold Start Doctrine: The Conventional Challenge to South Asian Stability. *Contemporary Security Policy*, 33(3), 577–94. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1080/13523260.2012.727685>
- Khan, Z. (2013). The Changing Dynamics of India-Pakistan Deterrence. *Pakistan Horizon*, 66(4), 1-19. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/24711512>
- Khetran, M. S. (2017). Indian Interference in Balochistan: Analysing the Evidence and Implications for Pakistan. *Strategic Studies*, 37(3), 112-25. doi:10.2307/48537560
- KRÓLIKOWSKI, H. (2016). INDO-PAKISTANI “HYBRID WAR” FOR KARGI. *Politeja*, 40, 395-414. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/24920214>
- Leah, C., & Lowther, A. B. (2017). Conventional Arms and Nuclear Peace. *Strategic Studies Quarterly*, 11(1), 14-24. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/26271588>
- Malik, H. B. (2020, January 17). Justifying a Pakistani Response to India’s Hybrid Warfare Campaign. *Daily Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.dailytimes.com.pk/541188/justifying-a-pakistani-response-to-indias-hybrid-warfare-campaign/>
- Marwah, O. (1979). India’s Military Intervention in East Pakistan, 1971-1972. *Modern Asian Studies*, 13(4), 549-80. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/312183>
- McCulloh, T., & Johnson, R. (2013). *Hybrid Warfare*. MacDill Air Force Base, FL: The JSOU Press.
- Mushtaq, M., & Hashmi, M. J. (2012). Regional Hegemonic Aspirations of India: A Review of Indian Nuclear Program. *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences*, 32(1), 251–62. Retrieved from citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.700.1707&rep=rep1&type=pdf.
- Mustafa, K. (2018, April 27). Pakistan Sustains \$126.79b Loss in War on Terror.” *The News*. Retrieved from <https://thenews.com.pk/print/309658-pakistan-sustains-126-79b-loss-in-war-on-terror>
- News Report. (2015). BJP Minister ‘Confirmed’ India Promoting Terror in Pakistan, *The Nation*, <https://nation.com.pk/24-May-2015/bjp-minister-confirmed-india-promoting-terror-in-pakistan-aziz>
- News Report. (2016). Modi says India will work to ‘isolate’ Pakistan internationally, *Dawn*, Retrieved from <https://www.dawn.com/news/1285839>
- News Report. (2018). Indian lobby trying to block US’ F-16s sale to Pakistan: Sartaj Aziz, *The Economic Times*, Retrieved from <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/defence/Indian-lobby-tryibg-to-block-us-f-16s-sale-to-pakistan-sartaj-aziz/articleshow/52246171.cms?from=mdr>
- News Report. (2019). Fake news& war hysteria, *Dawn*, Retrieved from <https://www.dawn.com/news/1468925>
- News Report. (2019). Pakistan could be blacklisted by FATF due to ‘lobbying by India’, says Qureshi, *The Times of India*, Retrieved from

Indian Hybrid Warfare in Pakistan: Spin off Ramifications for Pakistan's National Security

<https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/world/pakistan/pakistan-could-be-blacklisted-by-fatf-due-to-lobbying-by-india-says-queeshi/articleshow/68690548.cms>

News Report. (2020). 'Indian digital media engaging in systematic propaganda against Pakistan', *The Express Tribune*, Retrieved from <https://tribune.com.pk/story/2269468/Indian-digital-media-engaging-in-systematic-propaganda-against-pakistan>

News Report. (2020). Pakistan Presents 'Irrefutable Evidence' of India's Sponsorship of Terror to Sabotage CPEC, *The Express Tribune*, Retrieved from <https://tribune.com.pk/news/story/2272201/pakistan-presents-irrefutable-evidence-of-indias-sponsorship-of-terror-tosabotage-cpec>

Powell, R. (2003). Nuclear Deterrence Theory, Nuclear Proliferation, and National Missile Defense. *International Security*, 27(4), 86–118. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1162/016228803321951108>

Prier, J. (2017). Commanding the Trend: Social Media as Information Warfare." *Strategic Studies Quarterly*, 11(4), 50-85. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/26271634>

Raza, S. I. (2020, December 21). Pakistan Asks UN Observer to Probe Indian Attack on Observers. *Dawn*. Retrieved from <https://www.dawn.com/news/1596965/pakistan-asks-un-observers-to-probe-indian-attack-on-observers>

Rehman, I. (2009). Keeping the Dragon at Bay: India's Counter-Containment of China in Asia. *Asian Security*, 5(2), 114–43. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1080/14799850902885114>

Rokhila, A. (2019, September 25). Benefits of CPEC. *The Nation*.

Shad, H. A. (2020, December 18). 'Indian Chronicles' - a New War of Narratives Between India and Pakistan? *The Diplomat*. Retrieved from <https://thediplomat.com/2020/12/indian-chronicles-a-new-war-of-narratives-between-india-and-pakistan/>

Siddique, N. (2020, December 11). Revelations about Indian disinformation network vindicate Pakistan's stance: PM Imran. *Dawn*. Retrieved from <https://www.dawn.com/news/1595035>

- SIMONS, G., & Chifu, L. (2019). "Hybrid Warfare, Lawfare and Information Warfare." In *Changing Face of Warfare in the 21st Century*. ROUTLEDGE.
- Tripathi, K. (2019, February 16). Pulwama Terror Attack: Another Serious Lapse by Indian Security Forces. *Financial Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.financialexpress.com/india-news/Pulwama-attack-another-security-lapse-by-Indian-security-forces>
- Vaczi, N. (2016). *Hybrid Warfare: How to Shape Special Operations Forces* (Unpublished master's thesis). U.S. Army Command and General Staff College.
- Williamson, M., & Mansoor, P. R. (2012). *Hybrid Warfare: Fighting Complex Opponents from the Ancient World to the Present*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Ye, X. (2020). Explaining China's Hedging to the United States' Indo-Pacific Strategy. *China Review*, 20(3), 205-38. doi:10.2307/26928117
- Zafar, M. (2016, July 5). What Pakistani startups can learn from India. *Dawn*. Retrieved from <https://www.dawn.com/news/1268187>
-