

## **Subversion: Challenging Nations’ Capacity in Pakistan-India Context**

**Ahsan Shah**

*M.Phil. Scholar, Political Science Department, G.C. University Lahore, Pakistan.*

*Email: [syedahsan1994@gmail.com](mailto:syedahsan1994@gmail.com)*

**Sadia Rafique**

*Assistant Professor, Political Science Department, G.C. University Lahore, Pakistan.*

*Email: [sadia\\_july2007@hotmail.com](mailto:sadia_july2007@hotmail.com)*

**Khalid Manzoor Butt**

*Faculty of Humanities & Social Sciences, University of Central Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan.*

*Email: [khalidmanzoor63@hotmail.com](mailto:khalidmanzoor63@hotmail.com)*

### **ABSTRACT**

The qualitative and descriptive study incorporates a coherent idea about the rise of Hindutva nationalism under Modi regimes during 2014 to 2021. How the muscular Vedic culture has been flourished in the modern democratic and secular India? What are geneses of Hindutva extremism? Does the dialectics of religion and politics exist India? Modi ’s reign of terror and targeting the minorities under the slogan of Hindu radical nationalism through the promulgation of coercive politics. The surgical strikes against Pakistan, suppression of minorities and the abrogation of the constitution of India are the prime concerns of the research since Narendra Modi sworn as the prime minister of India. The politics of elections, an emerging role of RSS and its associate wings, Hindu nationalism, escalation of Hindutava extremism towards the polarization of Indian society from a popular democracy to an extremist’s nation in the context of the future Indian politics are the other areas of research.

**Key Words:** Hindutava Extremism, Surgical Strikes, Muscular Nationalism, Kashmir Cage, Citizenship Amendment Act.

### **Introduction**

Hybrid warfare, in contemporary times, is next-generation warfare that will change military affairs and future battles. As a result, security entails the absence of actual or perceived dangers, whether they come from inside the country, outside sources, or existing economic gaps and inequities. (Otaiku, 2018) It has spurred subversion seen as a powerful instrument for undermining a country’s social, political, economic, and cultural potential. Therefore, to successfully cope with such dangers, nations seek power (economic, political, and military) and take appropriate steps to either fend off or reduce their perceived adverse effects, aiming to obtain more and more power.

Pakistan's current danger perception, ignited by modern national security rhetoric, is heavily impacted by subversive techniques, mainly social, political, economic, and cultural ones. India has been intervening in Pakistan's domestic affairs for decades, according to the historical rhetoric of the South Asian subversive environment. The collapse of Pakistan in 1971 and the formation of Bangladesh is a strong precedent, as Indian Prime Minister Narendra Modi acknowledged during his June 2015 visit to Bangladesh. (Khetran, 2017)

The patterns of subversion are not continuous but rather fluctuate with the regional-global environment. It has reinforced Indian motives to undermine Pakistan's internal security dynamics, particularly in Balochistan. Pakistan has raised the issue of foreign interference in her domestic affairs with the international community on several occasions. India has been trying hard to marginalize Pakistan by forging new regional and international alliances and blocks. India uses Pakistan's neighbouring nations against Pakistan by pursuing intrigues and employing subversive measures.

Pakistan has faced hurdles due to the broader notion of subversion. This study has aimed to reflect on Pakistan's security issues to stress the necessity of such an essential issue of examining the subversive techniques used against Islamabad. The study has attempted to attain the following objectives:

- a. To understand subversion applied by India and its impact on Pakistan
- b. To highlight the Indo-Pak environment that is conducive for subversion
- c. To address challenges about Pakistan's national security discourse

Understanding subversion in the context of Pakistan's internal and foreign security dynamics and the post-9/11 surge of terrorism (religious terrorism). Policy-making institutions with a national security influence should understand the current context shaping Pakistan's overall danger assessment. The area of this research has theorized the foundation of the continuous attacks on Pakistan, claiming that "subversion is an effective instrument to undermine Pakistan's social, political, economic, and cultural potential."

### **Significance of the Study**

In many ways, the study is important, and not much effort has been made on this issue so far. With India and Pakistan's troubled past due to frontier conflicts, water issues, and unresolved Kashmir concerns, both compete with new military strategies, but subjection is still essential. This research, therefore, examines subversion and how it affects Pakistan's dynamics of national security. In addition, an effective instrument to damage the nation's social, political, and cultural ability to grasp subversion. Imperatively, it is to investigate whether the environment in India/Pakistan is feasible to subversion and whether Pakistan is friendly or incapable of dealing with the problems of subversion.

The literature following the subversion techniques is reviewed to clarify the topic and qualify the continuing discussion. Although there is enough evidence, the problem of the subversion to the security environment in Pakistan is not

### *Subversion: Challenging Nations' Capacity in Pakistan-India Context*

adequately addressed. Therefore, this study intends to give insight into the subject of inquiry. The general gap in the topic under examination has highlighted the problems of research that correspond to the study's aims.

Subversion has no commonly acknowledged definition, like terrorism and insurgency. The word is so broad that it does not have clear cut meaning, and its use accomplishes little more than communicate the more comprehensive idea that modern systems are vulnerable to all types of clandestine attacks. Subversion as part of a more significant armed terrorist or insurgent operation can lead to violent demonstrations — i.e., incitement of riots —but is not necessarily military. Subversion might be seen as a sort of non-violent terrorism. Subversion of typical directness also may be described as “any illegal action other than through the use of armed force by a segment of a nation's population to topple or expel those that control the country.” (Mohammed, 2009)

More commonly, terrorists and militants use a double-edged sword, with one side of subversion and the armed fight. Subversive measures can be divided into three categories: (a) establishment of Front Groups, the penetration and manipulation of existing political parties; (b) infiltration of armed forces, police forces, and other state institutions, as well as of non-State important organizations; and (c) generation of civilian disturbances by demonstrating and striking public and private property. (Mohammed, 2009)

The study employed the deductive research technique and the qualitative data analysis methodology. Most of the analyses are based on secondary data obtained from secondary sources such as books, research papers, and reports. The focus is confined to Pakistan's national security concerns, which emerge from subversion.

### **Subversion and Dynamics of Pakistan's National Security**

Gone are the days when traditional conflicts on territorial conquests have characterized hostile relations between states. Today, the fight is not about territory control but more for the hearts and interests of the people as per Clausewitz' maxim of war which is that he who wants to continue politics continues conflicts by other methods. (Tulak, 2015) The competition has grown more indirect in many dimensions in several different fronts. It encompasses a more extensive range of political, economic, and psychological spheres to the ultimate complete war.

Low-intensity conflicts become a more feasible alternative – a competition of low intensity means a level of violent engagement short of the whole war. For instance, in the case of Pakistan, Muslim sectarian organizations have relationships with foreign groups and governments. In contrast, Christian churches maintain relations with their parent churches, but many of their education and welfare institutions are also supported outside Pakistan. Moreover, for example, ethnic relations are linked to several groups in Pakistan, India, Pakistan and Afghanistan. (Malik, 2018)

Subversion, manipulating the current differences in civil society, includes polarizing the dissident forces until peaceful resolution venues are considered by the parties involved as closed. Subversion aims at continuing to bleed the enemy's nose so that he stays feeble and cautious. The ultimate purpose of subversion is to erode the state from inside and keep it weak so that the State apparatus cannot operate efficiently and so that the government is forced to make mistakes on excess that will further deteriorate the functions of the state

In many circumstances, the combination of actual racists and artificial racism can trigger the sensation of abandonment and political alienation when a robust ethnic identification is available, and a relative sense of deprivation is present. The MQM, after the 'Muhajir's dissatisfaction,' was emphasized, reinforced the perception of relative lack of Urdu-speaking Sindhis by the quota system in Sindh, which had become 'urban' and 'rural.' (Waseem, 1996) Currently, new provincial movements and demands are seen as the following fault line, which might upset Pakistan's political and social fabric. India is explicitly utilizing the deficiencies of Pakistan.

In addition, the emergence of one radical ethnic party/movement also has a significant impact on other ethnic parties/groups to be created or similarly aggressive to trigger violent ethnic warfare within the enemy state territories. Moreover, Sindh was the prime example where two of the largest ethnic groups turned into fiercely fighting entities. So, because of this significant impact which is eventually put in place, ethnic groupings are appealing targets for subversion. (Kennedy, 1993) The way the issue with the MQM developed in Karachi clearly shows how aggression has an impulse that is difficult to break out. Even when the MQM was part of the ruling class, its followers remained as though they were on the edges of the political mainstream. (Kennedy, 1993)

So, though violence is not the only subversion technique, it usually consists of subversive strategies – including successful propaganda psychological warfare. Preliminary analysis in the RAW of interventionist strategies for India inside South Asian countries showed clearly India's subversion strategy, which mainly isolates ethnic groupings inside its South Asian neighbourhood. (Amin, 1988) The dissident's mentality must first be won over. After all, From then on, violence will be one of the critical instruments – for violent acts and the over-reaction of the state to such actions itself to become the propaganda instruments that the subversive propagandist may effectively exploit.

New Delhi has repeatedly claimed the same was done in India by Pakistan's Inter-Services Intelligence (ISI). However, while India's subversive work was credible through research books about RAWs of Sri Lanka and Bangladeshi scholars and the Jain Commission report, there is still a significant publication to establish Pakistan's subversive rebellion in India. (Agnew, 1994) However, all this illustrates the rising importance of connections between subversion in South Asian nations in ongoing low-intensity wars. It has simply been used by countries such as India. In fact, RAW has earned a credible subversion reputation in neighbouring India's territory in South Asia.

### *Subversion: Challenging Nations' Capacity in Pakistan-India Context*

RAW has developed a multi-faceted Indian media strategy in Pakistan, fostering political subversion and active development of a terrorist network, which operates within Pakistan when the moment is right for RAW. It is one reason why fundamental political disagreement has gradually become a violent form of polarization and subversion. (Agnew, 1994) The local political intrigues did not offer the chance to be rejected, although RAW quickly exploited and introduced a constantly spiraling element of aggression into political debate and struggle in all the countries of South Asia.

Overall, India has already attempted an alternate, indirect and covert method of war by using RAW to destabilize and debilitate the governments of South Asia from inside. In contrast, the international community has increasingly condemned open war as a tool of State policy. Considering the evolving character of the battle in the region, South Asian states shall be prepared as more RAW actions will be planned since politicians are increasingly continuing the conflict, and RAW is developing the other means in South Asia. (Quraishi, 2009)

### **Discourse of Indo-Pak Security Environment**

Pakistan has several security concerns, considering the nature of its current global, regional and domestic environment. In tackling these security concerns, it seems appropriate to divide these difficulties into three groups: external, household, and challenges that are linked to both external and domestic problems, such as terrorism and violence. In addition, traditional and non-traditional challenges to security are also exist.

### **External Challenges**

Since its inception, Pakistan has faced foreign challenges against its territorial integrity. Occasional domestic upheavals and internal subversion further aggravated the situation. There has recently been a three-threat scenario in Pakistan—the persistent danger from India and Afghanistan and a deteriorating internal environment. These happenings have further aggravated the situation after 9/11. Although economic and political changes in South Asia are at a level where the possibilities of normal neighbourly relations may begin to be regarded with hope and optimism, there do not seem to exist enough opposing concepts of normality.

According to Indian perceptions of the situation in Kashmir, Pakistani attempts are mostly to blame for the unrest. It rejects recognizing that the independence efforts of the Kashmiris are an indigenous movement. Moreover, Indian officials claimed that the United Nations resolution had ceased legal and practical, as the Kashmiri people frequently took part in the local general elections. In addition to the disagreement over Kashmir, Siachin, Sir Creek, and water concerns further elevate the hostility among Islamabad and New Delhi. Although the effort of Indo-Pak normalization began in 2004, and meetings of different

agreed groups were conducted regularly for four years, the Mumbai tragedy, followed by Pathan Kot, Uri, and Pulwama, shattered the process. Many South Asians hope that the freshly begun discourse will retain the necessary consistency. (Ghosh, 2008)

The recent events in Afghanistan are the second primary source of external threats. The state of affairs became even more complicated after 9/11. There is no question that the people of Pakistan and Afghanistan have a high affection for one another, but the governing factions make the decisions. Those who appear to take pride in expanding someone else's agenda must be reined in and encouraged to become more patriotic. (Rashid, 2010) Pakistan cannot underestimate the risk of a spillover effect from Afghanistan's political turmoil onto bordering regions. There is substantial credible evidence that foreigners utilizing Afghanistan's land openly promoted and materially backed these subversive activities in the past and continue to do so today.

Since Pakistan's independence, some factors have had a persistent influence on Pakistan-Afghan relations, each of which has significantly impacted the Pak-Afghan store of goodwill. These issues encompass rampant rumours about the Taliban's ties to Pakistan and their periodic adventurism, the Durand Line's status, Indo-Afghan relations, Afghanistan's landlocked nature, the withdrawal of foreign forces (including American and NATO forces), and Afghan leaders' unwarranted critical speeches needlessly maligning Pakistan. Each of these difficulties has had a negative influence regularly

Soon after the horrific events of September 11, 2001, the United States attacked Afghanistan, further complicating an already volatile and confusing situation. Peace, stability, and territorial integrity in Afghanistan are vitally crucial to Pakistan for various reasons. Pakistan cannot tolerate anti-Pakistan segments to enjoy a safe sanctuary in Afghanistan. Pakistan, in reality, favours long-term foreign aid to Afghanistan to ensure the country's economic viability.

### **Internal Security Challenges**

Domestic difficulties in Pakistan are another significant challenge to overcome. Indeed, internal security is a crucial component of every country's national security strategy. Governance issues, political turmoil, a stagnant economy, energy and water scarcity, ethnicity, extremism, and terrorism are the internal problems of worry that have continually marred Pakistani society.

Economic security encompasses not only an optimal level of capability to have a sound economy, but also "adaptability to resist the impact of financial crises, as well as the capacity to deal with and adapt to the evolving forces of globalization in the international environment, and finally, the ability to translate achievements in social welfare into the domestic context." (Ahmed, 2015)

The situation has been worsened by gas and electricity shortages. Pakistan has severe energy shortages despite having vast hydropower potential and coal

### *Subversion: Challenging Nations' Capacity in Pakistan-India Context*

resources. However, it is essential to note that the government is working hard to increase electricity capacity.

India has sown a slew of fault lines in nationalist, sub-nationalist, ethnic, Social, Political, Religious, and linguistic inclinations in Pakistan. This phenomenon has resulted Non-State Actors (NSAs), groups and organizations with the opportunity to pursue their goals. In erstwhile-FATA, needlessly delayed Socio-Economic growth and the state's incapacity to seek progressive integration of the region allowed interested foreigners to take advantage of the situation. As a result, erstwhile-FATA became safe havens for terrorist groups and organizations. (Ahmed D. Z., 2020) According to popular perception, sections of the problems were inherited, and part of them is the result of the move from an authoritarian rule to a democratic government. A lousy economy will negatively influence the allocation of resources to the defence industry.

### **Terrorism**

Terrorism and the ongoing fight against terrorism are among the most significant source of security threats. Because there is no universally accepted definition, so different people and nations have viewed terrorism based on their interests and perceptions. Terrorists may use violence against Americans, according to American officials. To the Indians, this might signify a Pakistani-sponsored terrorist incursion into Indian Illegally Occupied Jammu and Kashmir (IIOJK). To the Israelis, this may indicate Palestinian suicide assaults. To Pakistanis, it could mean Indian armed forces' atrocities and injustices against Kashmiri civilians in the IHK, the instigation of anti-Muslim protests, communal killings of Muslims in which the government apparatus is directly or indirectly engaged in unwanted terrorist activities by skilled foreign agents in Pakistan, and the patronage and reassurance of local ant agonizers. It goes without saying that no country has suffered more than Pakistan in terms of the economic and human loss due to terrorism. According to an estimate, over 80,000 military forces personnel have died due to Pakistan's involvement in terror. Pakistan has suffered material damage estimated to be \$100 billion.

### **Response Mechanism of Pakistan Regarding Subversion**

Subversion can take numerous forms, such as forming front groups to enter and influence established political parties, groups, and organizations. Second, recruiting and executing state institutions such as the armed forces, police, other state institutions, and non-state actors, organizations, and groups. Third, civil protests can be organized through strikes, agitation, and boycotts.

Unfortunately, the Pakistan Response Mechanism was not as important as today, and the phrase hybrid warfare was not fully known until India had already wreaked havoc in this area. Hybrid warfare states used cultural infiltration and influence agents in conjunction with economic pressures, backing local opposition

organizations, misinformation, and criminal/terrorist actions to sow unrest in another state's internal affairs. Subversion strategy entails the clandestine deployment of unmarked soldiers or irregular soldiers, considering hybrid warfare's dependence on cyber capabilities and non-state proxies

Sun Tzu, an ancient Chinese military expert, claimed that indirect combat was one of the most effective means of battling an opponent since it allowed a country to destroy an enemy without physically confronting them, conserving resources that would have been spent to wage a battle. Because India has interfered in Pakistan's domestic affairs for decades, Pakistan has been a subject of Indian subversive design and strategies throughout its history. The international community is fully aware of Mukti Bahini's savage activities in East Pakistan, contributing to Pakistan's fragmentation.

Subversion in Pakistan undertaken by India includes espionage, sponsorship, and support for dissident or unhappy parties. The recent detention and confession of Indian agent Kalbushan Yadav have proved the funding for the Baloch Liberation Army in order to support terrorism in Balochistan and Sindh. Pakistan has implemented the following reaction strategies in light of the problems posed by subversion.

By capturing Kalbushan Yadav, Pakistani security authorities recently discovered an Indian surveillance network. He was active in causing social upheaval and operating as an undercover spy. The China Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) is considered Pakistan's economic lifeline, and India has been disturbing its smooth execution from its beginning.

Both, PM of India Narendra Modi and National Security Advisor Ajit Doval, have tried to legitimize RAW's meddling in Balochistan using the 2008 Mumbai attacks as an excuse. Yadav was caught in Balochistan shortly after Doval's announcement. Yadav went on to say that he intended to meet with Baloch rebels and conduct terrorist actions with their help. The Chinese involvement in Gwadar has been viewed as a challenge to Indian regional supremacy goals, as Gwadar is vital to Pakistan's strategic and economic interests. (Khetran M. , 2016) CPEC's game-changing efforts were the driving force behind India's unfriendly and subversive attitude toward Pakistan. India is involved in Balochistan and other areas of Pakistan, which demonstrates that India wants to destabilize Pakistan and hinder its growth. The Indian espionage network is supporting terrorist actions in Pakistan to destabilize the country and label it a rogue state.

In India and Pakistan, societal attitudes and conduct make a massive difference, and this can be seen in cricket matches, movies and matches, and even among the overseas diaspora. The anti-Pakistan feeling is being projected and promoted at the state level in India through various media and Pakistan-centric policies at all echelons. The MQM's argument, as well as the developing sense among Sindh's Urdu-speaking population that they are being disadvantaged, would fall into this category. Using the title of minority, the Muhajir and marginalized Sindh MQM opposed the state's authority using illegal means, including violence, target killings, and terrorism on behalf of foreign handlers,



### *Subversion: Challenging Nations' Capacity in Pakistan-India Context*

particularly India. These are pressure organizations founded and backed by adversarial state actors to disrupt Pakistan's political, economic, and social stability, erode public faith in the state and government, and impair Pakistan's image and economy.

Political subversion is one of the most common methods employed against adversaries in international politics. Therefore, to undermine the targeted country, this subversion component includes a combination of legal warfare, diplomatic warfare, and other political weapons. Asad Umar, Pakistan's former finance minister, petitioned the Financial Action Task Force (FATF) in March 2019 to remove India as the co-chair of the Asia-Pacific Joint Group. The panel assessed how far the government has progressed in implementing the FATF's action plan. For undermining their political goals, India and Pakistan used to sponsor like-minded organizations, groups, and political parties. (Khetran M. S., 2017) Strategic confinement is a policy that prevents a state from participating in global trade, energy, technology, or military cooperation. Pakistan is now enforcing such a strategy against India by preventing its passage to Afghanistan and Central Asian Republics (CARs) via the Wagha Border, preventing Indian supplies, equipment, and products from reaching the Afghan and Central Asian Republic (CARs) markets. (Javaid, 2016)

The rise of information and hybrid warfare, regarded as the most delicate instruments for subversion, proxies, and insurgencies, has created a plethora of dimensions that continue to complicate an already crowded battle space. The fifth generation of warfare has come in the form of cultural invasion, thanks to the rise of digital technologies such as the Internet, the World Wide Web, the Darknet, digital data, social media platforms, and movies and television dramas. For a long time, the use of weaponized information has been a part of espionage, subversion, propaganda, and counterintelligence. Star plus Indian television shows have significantly influenced Pakistan's cultural fabric, affecting attire, cuisine, and wedding trends.

The difficulty has been worsened by subversive policies and a pattern of India and Pakistan targeting each other's social, political, cultural, and security infrastructure and strategic assets through subversion and proxies by terrorists and non-state armed factions. Due to a long-standing border dispute and the nature of adversarial relationships in which one party seeks to destroy the other, subversion becomes a natural strategy for each of them. Because of the changing nature of combat nowadays, this seems true.

### **Conclusion**

In several aspects, as India and Pakistan conclude their first half-century of creation, they share security concerns, threat perceptions, and the conundrum of power balance. In world politics, new blocks are forming and aligning, but the animosity between Pakistan and India has remained consistent, despite its predictability and, most likely, stability. Subversion remained a potential rather

than a present danger. Law and order issues had become increasingly severe, but the methods for dealing with them had mainly remained the same. Pakistan's security issues, on the other hand, were caused by the country's government and society. Even with a potent military force and effective security system, frequent political breakdown, corruption, inability to establish ethnic and religious identities, and failing to address the citizens' concerns are obstacles that might destroy a state. Pakistan must address and deal with these unpleasant facts as it analyses its ongoing security issue and the world image She intends to present. Pakistan is now experiencing the worst stage of Indian subversion in the recent two decades. Nonetheless, dealing with Indian subversive plans necessitates aggressive action/position by ISPR and the civil-military authority.

## **Recommendations**

### **Internal Dynamics**

To countercultural subversion, seminars, workshops, conferences, talk shows and theatres in cultural context should be frequently arranged by government so that linguistic, sectarian, and other cultural fault lines could be addressed. The role of media becomes important to address exclusiveness of the culture by bringing them into the mainstream aligned with national purpose. Furthermore, with equal distribution of resources could be a viable tool for addressing developmental discrepancies. Initiatives like Aaghaz-e-Huqooq-Balochistan and provincial development projects for the erstwhile-FATA districts should be taken on priority basis by the government. It is essential that students intake in universities should be considered an opportunity to expand social cohesion. On similar grounds, political alliances and ethnic groupings should be brought into main stream. The seed of political subversion depends on cultural, economic, and social discrepancies. Therefore, to address issues associated with political subversion, the state must develop a holistic policy in the national curriculum through Higher Education Commission (HEC) along with Provincial Higher Education Commissions. A culture of tolerance and coexistence should be taught and promoted.

### **External Dynamics**

Multi-cultural societies are considered a viable opportunity for Nation-States Actors. Availability of fault lines in cultural domains allows hostile forces to exploit the harmony in the cultural environment. Therefore, the State of Pakistan should not allow such harmony to be used as a tool of delusion in the national purpose, which our neighbours like India and Afghanistan use as a hybrid opportunity. Currently Pakistan is going through an economic outrage that regional and international forces are very much influenced. It has also allowed international organizations and institutions to twist hand strategy on economic fronts. Pakistan should expose its financial strength at regional and international forums to create a

### *Subversion: Challenging Nations' Capacity in Pakistan-India Context*

climate of economic viability and sustainability. It would address the challenges of economic strangulation which Pakistan is currently going through. Social subversion is a domain which external forces indirectly highlight disharmony in a target state. Pakistan in this very domain is a victim of international propaganda that has been used as an assault against its social fabric. Pakistan's decision to open Kartarpur Corridor was a good move in this domain. Initiatives like such must be explored towards Afghanistan and Iran to protect minorities. It would give the required impetus to Pakistan to highlight natural social space for different ethnic, sectarian and cultural fabrics both at regional and international forums. The most predictable thing in politics / political subversion is its unpredictability. Political subversion in this domain is very much connected with the outlook of regional, international political regimes. The role of Pakistan's diplomacy, media, and Intelligentsia is the key to mediating the vulnerabilities that entangle and isolate Pakistan by using its diplomacy, media, and Intelligentsia in all environments, peaceful or hostile, could help sustain Pakistan in the county of international society. Therefore, a comprehensive policy to achieve medium to long-term objectives should be developed for the integrity of Pakistan in the regional and international political environment.

Last but not least, Pakistan and India have to evaluate their gains and losses during last seventy five years. Now both are grown up nations and many international realities have been changed. Hostilities and wars are not the solution of the problems yet both Pakistan and India, multiply them. They should learn lessons from other countries like France and Germany and settle their bilateral disputes amicably and work jointly for the betterment of their countries and people. They should focus more on human development rather on destructive and negative activities. Both, Islamabad and New Delhi, should have inclusive approach rather than exclusive. Otherwise, there would be a chain reaction of destruction and nobody could be victorious. Both the nuclear powers, having large population would be unable to manage the situation with an appropriate manner so it is need of time to create a win-win situation for them.

### **References**

- Agnew, J. (1994). The territorial trap: the geographical assumptions of international relations theory. *Review of international political economy* , 53-80.
- Ahmed, A. (2015, May 15). *Pakistan's Economy to Grow 5.1pc in 2015: ESCAP*. Retrieved from Dawn: [www.dawn.com/news/1182005](http://www.dawn.com/news/1182005)
- Ahmed, D. Z. (2020). Conflict or Cooperation? The Role of India and Pakistan in Post-2014 Afghanistan. *South Asian Studies*.
- Amin, T. (1988). Ethno-national movements of Pakistan. *Institute of policy studies*.
- Ghosh, S. (2008). *Indo-Pak Composite Dialogue*. Institute of Peace and Conflict Studies.

- Javaid, U. J. (2016). Indian Influence in Afghanistan and its implications for Pakistan. *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan*, 1-12.
- Kennedy, C. H. (1993). Managing ethnic conflict: the case of Pakistan. *Regional & Federal Studies*, 123-143.
- Khetran, M. (2016). Indian Plans to Disrupt CEPC Projects in Balochistan: Options for Pakistan. *Institute of Strategic Studies*.
- Khetran, M. S. (2017). "Indian Interference in Balochistan. *Strategic Studies*, 37(03), 112-125.
- Malik, M. (2018, November 24). *Pakistan's Faultlines and Hybrid War Challenge*. Retrieved from the Nation: <https://nation.com.pk/24-Nov-2018/pakistan-s-faultlines-and-hybrid-war-challenge>
- Mohammed, F. (2009). Exploring Power Politics and Constitutional Subversion in Pakistan: A Political and Constitutional Assessment of Instability in Pakistan. *Loyola University Chicago School of Law International Law Review*, 229.
- Otaiku, A. A. (2018). A Framework for Hybrid Warfare: Threats, Challenges and Solutions. *Journal of Defense Management* , 2167-0374.
- Quraishi, A. (2009, July 26 ). *Indian Army Major-General Runs Terrorist Camps Inside Afghanistan*. Retrieved from Dawn: [www.defence.pk/.../30627-indian-army-major-general-runs-terrorist-camps-inside-afghanistan.html](http://www.defence.pk/.../30627-indian-army-major-general-runs-terrorist-camps-inside-afghanistan.html)
- Rashid, A. (2010). *Taliban: Militant Islam, Oil and Fundamentalism in Central Asia*. Yale University Press.
- Tulak, A. N. (2015). Hybrid warfare and new challenges in the information environment . *Proceedings of the 5th Annual Information Operations Symposium*, (pp. 20-22).
- Waseem, M. (1996). "Ethnic conflict in Pakistan: the case of MQM." . *The Pakistan Development Review*, 617-629.
-