Framing of Women in Politics: A case of Pakistani Elections 2013

Bushra Hameedur Rahman; Abida Eijaz & Rana Eijaz Ahmad*

Abstract

This paper is a content analysis of four major dailies and two political talk shows on the two leading TV news channels of Pakistan during the 2013 Elections. The study examines whether women in politics were portrayed marginally or as active agents in the political process. The paper examines if women were framed by stereotypes and whether they were taken seriously or simply as sensational tokens. Whether during the election campaign they were encouraged to come into politics and for voting? Findings show that the coverage given to women was minimal, and they were not represented as politicians with vision and contributors in political decision making. However, female politicians did not suffer from the cultural stereotype treatment in the news items. In the comparative analysis between Urdu and English dailies, English dailies coverage on women political participation was greater and more positive than Urdu dailies.

Introduction

The general premise is that the image constructed of women by the media is a reflection of society’s view of women. The framing of political women likewise would be an indicator of how women politicians are viewed in society. What must be noted is that the media does have the power to shift traditional perception of women in society.

The construction of women’s identity in public discourse has direct impact on her effectiveness. Media is responsible, to a large extent, for the way her identity is constructed in politics. It is vital to understand how women are represented in political communication to see how women are given equal space in the political sphere (Markstedt, 2007). Current media representation of women politicians is seen to be a major obstacle to achieve equal representation. Previous research has focused on comparisons between coverage of men and women politicians. Female politicians have long complained that the media treats them differently from their male colleagues. In the coverage more emphasis is on women’s clothing and family life (Jenkins, 2002). Most of these findings are for the women politicians in Western democracies. What is missing is how women in politics are framed by the media in the developing countries, where women are generally considered to be oppressed and underrepresented in politics.

*Authors are Assistant Professors at Institute of Communication Studies and Department of Political Science, University of the Punjab, Lahore – Pakistan.
In Pakistan one witnesses a steady growth of women politicians. Pakistan was the first Muslim country to accept a woman, the late Benazir Bhutto, as a head of a state. Women have just not been taking active part in the political parties and but also holding key ministries like law, Education, foreign Affairs, Finance and Economic Affairs, women and development, Science and Technology, and Culture.

To provide context, what follows is a brief demographic summary of the Pakistan political landscape. Pakistan has a population of 187 million people, the male population stands around 96 million and female population around 91 million. According to the Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP) there are 38.8 million male registered voters and 37.6 million female registered voters', two million voters more than 2008.

The National Assembly of Pakistan has a total number of 342 seats, which includes 60 reserved seats for women and 10 seats for non-Muslims. This amounts to nearly 20% in the National Assembly and 18% in the Provincial Assemblies. After the 2013 elections only 17 women were elected on direct seats and account for only 3% of the seats in the National Assembly and four Provincial Assemblies. Of this, 10 members belong to PPP, 3 to PML (N), 3 to PML (Q) and one Independent candidate later joining PML(N). Of these 17 female members, 5 belong to Sindh and remaining to Punjab. There is no single female member from KPK and Baluchistan.

In the 2013 election the turnout was impressive as nearly 50% of the registered female voters cast their votes even in the Federally Administered Tribal Areas, despite some efforts to bar them from voting in such parts as FATA. Women were also more actively involved in these elections as more than 450 female candidates ran for seats in the NA and PA in 2013 compared to 200 in 2008 and even fewer in 2002. The voters’ numbers indicate increasing commitment on part of the female electorate to democracy. Another reason for increased participation could be the efforts of the Computerized National Identity Card Drive.

Election 2013 reflects phenomenal gains for women with increased number of candidates and voters. A large number of first time women candidates were given opportunity to contest elections under different political parties. In the 2013 election, out of the 463 female candidates, 17 women were elected for 324 seats in National and Provincial general seats. According to The Researchers (TR) and Women and Politics in Asia Forum (WPAF) report at the national level in the 111 constituencies 150 women filed nomination papers out of which 60 were on party tickets. At provincial levels for 213 constituencies 313 filed nomination papers and 115 were on party tickets.
Framing of Women in Politics

Analyzing the results of 2013 the report stated that one factor that clearly emerged in Punjab was that the voters cast their votes for the political party rather than the candidates.

The figures show increased participation of women in the political sphere. It is crucial to examine media representation of political women as mediated spaces are critical sites to examine how seriously she is taken in political arena. It assists in understanding the ideological forces operative in assigning a specific meaning and value to women leadership in political action. The study focuses on both English and Urdu dailies of Pakistan as Pakistani English and Urdu media are also a reflection of two parallel class systems in society. The English media caters to the elite class of the society and the Urdu to the middle and lower income groups; therefore it is important to study the dailies of both languages to examine how they framed female politicians and political participation of women in the Pakistani society and setting the social and political discourses on them in the two classes.

Literature Review

Women in politics have frequently protested against the non-serious attitude of the media coverage of female politicians which is reflected in the minimal coverage as compared to men (Kahn, 1994) but also in the way they are portrayed. They are usually discussed in the media for their personality and appearance rather than policy, viability and vision. Media representations of women politicians are more inclined towards dress and appearance than on substance and action. This kind of coverage is mostly done to prevent the voters to recognize them as potential candidates who have any stance on issues (Kahn, 1994). The only issues that their opinions are seriously considered on are issues like abortion or child-care, mainly issues that concern a women’s traditional role as a mother.

This negative portrayal of female political leaders and candidates makes them out as being weaker leaders with no opinion on important issues. This media portrayal of women lacking political agency makes them less likely to be reelected. Furthermore, their male colleagues do not respect them and make it more difficult for them to pass legislation of their choosing (Scheidt, 2014).

It is argued that female politicians are routinely given more attention in the media on their family life, their personal relationships and specifically as mothers. Discussions about women politicians most frequently center around their dress and appearance (Henderson, 1999). There is a pressure on them to continue their roles of wife and mother and now with an extra layer of coverage focusing on their ‘sexual attributes’ (Jenkins, 2006) and they are
expected to play a more effective role compared to their male colleagues and if they fail, they are condemned more than their male counterparts (Haines, 1992).

Tuchman (1978) in her study on symbolic annihilation of women by the mass media, finds omission, trivialization and condemnation as common practices in media coverage given to women. While evaluating, Tuchman’s three points, omission in terms of visibility/invisibility, trivialization in terms of narrow focus, and condemnation in terms of gendered mediation, Gidengil and Everitt (1999) notes that, “a preoccupation with the maternal and familial status of women politicians is consistent with the concepts of trivialization and condemnation when equivalent criteria are not applied, or used to judge, their male colleagues” (p.60).

Women politicians are treated with systemic biases in the television news and have a news value only when they have a combative behavior which again is against their traditionally perceived gender role expectation. That is why politics is perceived to be a male domain.

Even the women incumbency is also endorsed by gender reference in the media. Feehan (2006) in her study on the coverage of four gubernatorial campaigns in newspapers found a positive relationship between incumbency of a female candidate and the quantity of coverage. “Women experienced a disadvantage of receiving a lower number of quotes than the men and this inequality prevents female candidates from speaking to readers directly, in their own words”(p.34). Often women are made to feel that if they are seen in the media it is a gift by some journalists and so they are expected to ‘play the game’ if they want to be seen in the media (Ross, 2003). Media gives little attention to women’s political messages; there is underrepresentation of women sources in the media; and men outtalk women in stories on core political issues (MMPZ, 2013 p. 6), usually, in the public and private media outlets, women in political development stories are covered in four perspectives; ‘political ornaments; party support structures; victims of family baggage; and victims of negative politics and power struggles’, MMPZ, 2012 p.7).

Women politicians are not represented for their political participation, policy making, strategies, vision, and contribution in decision making, it gives a new dimension to the old adage to be seen not heard. Moreover, mass media should avoid picking on polarization while reporting on political women or issues related to women and politics. (Matekaire, 2003).
Likewise, Heldman, Carroll, and Olson (2000) in their study on gender biases in the media coverage of women in politics, in the US presidential election 2000 note that though there was insignificant difference in the amount of coverage in the media given to the election candidates, the cultural stereotypes determine the treatment of news items and was responsible for biased coverage. Media reports gender in politics in such a way that it significantly reinforces the idea that participation in the political sphere is essentially a male pursuit and privilege (Mohammadi and Ross, 1996, p.112). Men are always perceived as bread earners therefore economically self-reliant and women as dependant on them. Their dependency curtails their authority in decision making and mobility. Moreover, women politicians and their coverage is seen as more of a tool to encourage young women to talk about politics but not as a place for women to be in (Drabsch & Wales, 2007).

Exception to this general trend was found in the Media Monitoring Project Afghanistan (MMPA) which monitored the media coverage of election 2009 in Afghanistan for a period of two months starting from November 3rd to December 30th. The report states the trends and patterns of coverage given to women politicians during and post election period. For the governance and politics issues, women parliamentarians participated in talk shows and also took part as news commentators. Women were consulted on social, legal and security issues for their expertise. Media covered Lower House MPs and played a positive role by exerting pressure on government to take on maximum women in the cabinet. One of the interesting findings is that public sector media gave more coverage to women as compared to private sector media. Larson (2011) acknowledges the political space created for Afghan women however, she has apprehensions for using that space.

However, it is also argued that just the increased or positive coverage of women in politics is not enough to improve her identity as a politician. Other institutions also need to integrate their role with the media to improve her status in political arena. The marginalization of gender, ethnic groupings and age also influence on citizens participation in the political arena (Mhlanga and Eaglestone, 2013). The increased number of women in political scene does not necessarily change peoples’ perceptions. It has more to do with the cultural perspectives, empowerment of women, and improved media coverage (Everitt and Gidengil, 2003). There are various structural and functional constrains of a patriarchal society that hinder the participation of women in politics at both individual and collective levels. These include political and social discourses; socio-cultural and functional practices; and political structure and legacy of political institutions (Bari, 2005).
In the study on the participation of Iranian women in politics Shojaei, Samsu and Asayesh, (2010) contend that the success of women in politics is largely dependent on their self-confidence which was mainly determined by their material independence and professional skill. Similarly, Fountaine and McGregor (2002) in their study on the relationship between increased women’s political power and their improved media representations in New Zealand, found a positive relationship between the two variables. They proposed that empowered women can serve as change agents and can significantly affect upon the media coverage of women.

In exploring the relationship between gender based coverage of election candidates in the newspapers and the influence of media, political institutions, and particular contexts while contesting for a political office, Fridkin and Kittilson (2007) maintain that, “in countries where press treatment of men and women is more equitable, party leaders may be more likely to nominate women candidates... political culture influences cross-national variation in women’s parliamentary participation” (p. 3).

However, it is also argued that the institutional mechanisms to support women’s leadership might address gender biases in the distribution power, but they do not guarantee the recognition of gender equality in the cultural sphere of knowledge production and opinion formation. A more powerful engagement is required to give her recognition in women’s leadership competences and achievements in construction dominant ideological frames construction women’s leadership (Skalli, 2011).

In the light of the literature review it is noted that media gives considerably less coverage to the participation of women in politics and even if it does, female stereotypes are given preferential treatment compare to their roles in politics. However, the image of women in developing country like Afghanistan is different from the western countries image in the media. Moreover, the argument put forward is that the way women in politics are represented in the media does not alone change her status in the society but it would be step in the right direction. Other political and social institutions also have to play a role in making discourses of empowered women to change her image both in the society and in the media.

**Research Questions**

RQ1. Did media frame the women in politics as objectified candidates to promote their perception as less competent in political matters?
RQ2. Did media frame the issues of political participation of women during the 2013 Elections?
Methodology

This paper considered all news pages; opinion pages; magazine section and special pages on elections which had reference of women in politics in two English dailies-Dawn and The News and two Urdu dailies- Jang and Express from March 25, till May 25, 2013. Content analyses of political talk shows of the two leading TV news channels of Pakistan, Geo and Duniya, from January 1, 2012 till April 30 2013 was also done.

As it is a study of women politicians and women taking part in politics and political campaigns, two broad categories were made, one of women politicians and other of women participation in politics. To study whether women politicians were framed as objectifying candidates, to promote their perception as less competent in political matters, researchers divided news items into two categories, in which statement of women politicians was referred to and in which only reference to her was made without stating what she said. And to study media coverage on their political participation news items were framed in three categories, women encouraged to go for voting; women taking part in political campaigns; state of women in political parties and in the parliament in Pakistan.

To analyze whether women in politics were portrayed marginally or were substantive who could transform the politics, first those talk shows were identified in which women were present. Then in the talk shows where political women exclusively participated were selected. Furthermore, number of times they were given a chance to speak as compared to their men colleagues was also calculated.

Findings and Discussion

In the selected time period a total of 232 news items (news, columns, editorials, feature and pictures) were on women and politics. Out of these 141 were on women politicians and 91 were on women participation in the political process.
Table 1: Language wise and genre wise coverage on women in politics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Genre</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Urdu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>only picture</td>
<td>19 (16.6%)</td>
<td>47 (39.8%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>News</td>
<td>66 (57.8%)</td>
<td>51 (43.2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>interpretative reporting</td>
<td>8 (7.0%)</td>
<td>1 (0.8%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>opinion page/ Editorials</td>
<td>9 (7.8%)</td>
<td>2 (1.6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Column</td>
<td>1 (0.8%)</td>
<td>9 (7.6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feature article</td>
<td>11 (9.6%)</td>
<td>8 (6.7%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N=232; English n1= 114; Urdu n2= 118

Findings in Table 1 show that more or less equal coverage was given to women and politics in the selected newspaper. However, Urdu dailies gave more coverage (39.8%) to women pictures with no text accompanied as compared to English dailies. One of the reasons for an increased number of pictures in Urdu dailies is that, Maryam Nawaz, daughter of Nawaz Sharif, now the premier of Pakistan, for the first time campaigned for her father in the election. Urdu dailies gave more coverage to her in terms of pictures campaigning for her father. This pictorial coverage did not include any statements but only her picture waving hands to the crowd. It seemed that her presence in the Urdu dailies was more to bring color to the dailies than to give any serious thought to her political participation.

Serious discussion on women in politics can be gauged from the coverage given to her issues in the editorials, features and columns. Urdu newspapers hardly gave any editorial coverage to women in politics whereas; English dailies encouraged women to participate in elections both in terms of right to vote and right to contest elections. They condemned the attitude of the two provinces (KPK and Balochistan) which did not encourage women to participate in election 2013. In English dailies the trend of the features was more on why women need to take part in elections whereas, in Urdu dailies profile of the women candidates was discussed along with other male candidates in different constituencies. The discussion was more in terms of their political contributions as a public figure and never discussed their personal lives.
Table 2: Language wise coverage of Pakistani political women in the four dailies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Statement of women politician</td>
<td>44 (31.2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>25 (42.3%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urdu</td>
<td>19 (23.1%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reference to women politician with no statement       | 97 (68.7%)|

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>34 (57.6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urdu</td>
<td>63 (76.8%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N=141; English n1=59; Urdu n2=82

To study whether women politicians were taken seriously by the media or not, the study examined whether her statements were quoted and discussed. Findings in Table 2 show that in 141 news items on women politicians her statements were quoted only in 44 (31.2%) news items and in 97 (68.7%) news items there was reference to her but she said was not part of the news item. By reference what is meant is that either her name was mentioned or her picture was given with no statement. Though English dailies also gave less coverage to her statements, their attitude towards women politicians was more serious than Urdu dailies. Urdu dailies had 63 (76.8%) coverage on women politicians without giving any reference to what their stance is on different political issues. Only 19 (23.1%) news items gave a reference to what they said on any political issues which were mostly supporting statements to their male counterparts.

Table 3: Language wise coverage of Pakistani women political participation in the four dailies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Urdu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Encourage women to go for voting</td>
<td>4 (7.2%)</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women participating in political campaigns</td>
<td>29 (52.7%)</td>
<td>20 (55.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State of women in political parties and in parliament</td>
<td>22 (40%)</td>
<td>16 (44.4%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N=91 English n1=55; Urdu n2=36

To study whether media encouraged women to have political participation in the election 2013, three categories were made. Findings in Table 3 show that there was hardly any coverage on the issue of encouraging women to go for voting. Only 4 (7.2%) news items were spotted which encouraged women to go for voting and it is their right to do so. These items also appeared in the English dailies and the issue of poor voters’ turnout of women particularly in KPK and Balochistan was discussed. Urdu dailies were completely quiet on
the issue. However, dailies of both languages, gave pictorial coverage of women participating in political campaigns sitting and listening to their political leaders. The dailies also discussed the women representation in the political parties and in the parliament. In the Urdu dailies the coverage was more on the figures rather than on how and women representation in the political parties and parliament should increase. Whereas, in English dailies political parties were encouraged to gave more tickets to women and encourage them to contest elections on general seats.

In the study on Talk Shows in, Geo and Duniya TV channels 490 talk shows were selected in the selected time period. Out of these 490 talk shows, 138 (28%) talk shows, had 145women as participants, 102 were political women and 43 were non-political women participants. In these 118 (85.5%) programs only one woman participated and in 16 (42.5%)programs two women participated whereas three or more than three women participated only in four (2.8%) programs.

Table 4: Frequency of political women chance to speak in talk shows of Geo and Duniya, (January 1, 2012 till April 30 2013)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Frequency of political women turn to speak</th>
<th>No of Talk shows</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Once</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>twice</td>
<td>42 (41%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>thrice</td>
<td>40 (39.2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Four or more times</td>
<td>12 (11.7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All women</td>
<td>8 (7.8%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N=102

To examine whether women politicians were taken seriously or not, number of times they were given a chance to speak was calculated. In 102 talk shows in 42(41%) talk shows she was given a chance to speak twice whereas in 40 (39.2%) talk shows she spoke three times and in 12 (11.7%) talk shows she was given a chance to speak more than four times. In eight (7.8%) talk shows all were women. The findings show that though they were invited but in most of the programs she was either given a chance to speak twice or thrice. In talk shows of nearly 45 minutes, on an average when there are four to five speakers, this was not a poor representation of women politicians in political discussions.

Conclusion

The study set out to examine whether political women of Pakistan were portrayed marginally and suffered from the stereotype images in the media.
Framing of Women in Politics

To study whether women in politics were taken seriously in terms of their stance on different political issues or were their image used only to show her presence in the political scene, a case of Election 2013 was taken, and two Urdu and two English dailies (March 25, till May 25) and two TV talk shows of two leading TV channels of Pakistan were examined.

Findings show that though Pakistani women politicians were not framed as the women politicians of Western countries are framed in their media. They did not suffer from the negative coverage where her clothing and family life was discussed more than her political capabilities (Jenkins, 2006). Media did not give them the cultural stereotype treatment in the news items and was not biased in that way to their coverage (Heldman, Carroll, and Olson, 2000). However, they were also not taken seriously on political issues in the print media especially in the Urdu dailies. In Pakistan, Urdu dailies usually give headline news to the political statements of the politicians; however, in case of women politicians, hardly any headline news let alone any news on her statement on political issues was ever framed. This shows how she was not considered an important policy maker in the political sphere. Her reference was more in the form of a name or in a picture. Though English dailies had a more serious coverage on women politicians than Urdu dailies but that was also far too minimal to have any impact on the identity of women politicians.

Still, in Urdu dailies feature articles on political candidates; women candidates were given coverage in the same way as men while discussing their political contributions or their past records. Women were neither given preferential treatment nor were they brushed aside as females to be taken less seriously.

However, Urdu dailies coverage on encouraging women to take part in the political process was minimal. Hardly any coverage was given to women’s right to vote and be part of the election process. Whereas, English dailies had a more positive attitude towards their participation in politics and their right to vote, they discussed the situation of women voters in different parts of the country. Though her coverage in the English dailies was less but the coverage supported her right to take active part in political process. The articles discussed the situation of women in politics and their political participation seriously and women were encouraged to take part in active politics. Women were encouraged to vote. Government was advised to take all possible steps to encourage women to vote. Constituencies where women voters were discouraged from voting, especially KPK and Balochistan, were pointed out and it was strongly advocated that strong steps be taken to encourage female voters. Positive coverage was given to women who stood independently in the election. Women from KPK who stood on independent seats were given prominence in the English dailies.
Whereas, TV channels coverage on women politicians was far more encouraging than the print media. Though the women politicians were called rarely in the talk shows but once in the program their presence was not marginalized. She was given a fair chance to speak on different political issues.

In brief the findings of the study showed that though women politicians in Pakistan were not portrayed in their stereotype roles first and then as politicians but they were also not taken as seriously in the media as their male counterparts. Their identity as women of ‘substance’ was lacking in the media. They were not represented for their political participation, policy making, vision and contribution in decision making (Matekaire, 2003). Higher visibility of women politicians and voters signals greater political participation but for them to be taken more seriously as important political agents then more serious coverage needs to be given to their opinions on political issues. Till then the argument still stands that the increased number of women in politics and the increased coverage of women in political scene does not necessarily mean that they are empowered political women (Everitt and Gidengil, 2003). The various structural and functional constrains of a patriarchal society needs to be changed at individual and collective levels to accept them as empowered women who are women of vision, intelligence and capable of delivering (Bari, 2005). The political parties along with other political institutions need to provide them with a space to further mainstream them in the political process. The media in either roles, as the one responsible in making discourses on women in politics, or as a reflection of the status of women in the society, needs to look into its role more seriously where the discourses on political women need to be just not of followers but also of leaders.
End Notes


Framing of Women in Politics


Matekaire, T. (2003). *Analysis of coverage of women politicians by the print media in Zimbabwe.* An On-line article retrieved on 20-07-2013 from [www.kubatana.net/docs/media/0301wipsumedia.pdf](http://www.kubatana.net/docs/media/0301wipsumedia.pdf)


The Researcher [http://www.theresearchers.org/Publications/Press%20Release/Nation%20Elects%202016%20Women%20Representatives%20out%20of%20463%20Candidates.pdf](http://www.theresearchers.org/Publications/Press%20Release/Nation%20Elects%202016%20Women%20Representatives%20out%20of%20463%20Candidates.pdf) retrieved on 22.0.14
