
Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto and Indira Gandhi: A Brief Comparison

_____ Imran Khan

_____ Syed Karim Haider

Policy making process of the state is deeply affected by the psychology of the leaders along with impact of their emotions and ideology and this argument is supported by study of the Individual level in international relations. In Pakistan and India policy making process is always under the influence of the Individuals instead of governments and this feature and school of thought is quite applicable for these two nations. This study explores the life and political career of two prominent leaders of Subcontinent one from Pakistan, Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto and other from India, Indira Nehru Gandhi and analyzes how the historical circumstances of their era shaped their characters in a manner that made them uniquely prepared to confront the number of political challenges that they faced during their tenure as Prime Ministers. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto was first elected prime minister of Pakistan who served from 1971 to 1973 as a president and 1973 to 1977 as a prime minister of Pakistan and Indira Gandhi was Prime Minister of India from 1966 to 1977, and 1980 to 1984 in her 2nd term until her assassination. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto and Indira Gandhi were seemingly destined to rule over their countries in such a way that one looking following other in their internal and external policies. These facts need to be brought in light for the understandings of the past and cooperation in future between two nation forwarding towards the hostility in nuclear age.

Introduction

Pakistan and India are two hostile nations of the subcontinent and bad neighbor to each other as since the partition there are lot of disputes and problems that made the relations between them sour. People in India and Pakistan has been experiencing wars and peace accords between two states during their journey as neighboring

nations. People living in the subcontinent might be listened about the differences between their homelands and leaderships but they had little listened about the similarities. There were two political personalities in Pakistan and India who had lot of common in their personalities, life style, public and political life and fate. This study will provide the psychoanalysis of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto of Pakistan and Indira Gandhi of India. The political journey of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto and Indira Gandhi will be discussed in the light of their internal and external policies and impact of their leadership on the course of politics along with their leadership style. What is legacy of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto in political life of Pakistan and Indira Gandhi in political life of India will be discussed. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto started his journey as politician as member of the legislative council in 1957¹ just like as Indira Gandhi who started her journey as member of the Indian National Congress and in 1959 elected as president of party in 1959.² Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto in Pakistan was arrested and sent into jail just after his removal from power in 1977 and.³ Indira Gandhi in India were also imprisoned just after her fall of power by her political opponents⁴ Indira Gandhi was like minded to socialists in economic policies and she introduce reforms on the socialist model during her era of power in India.⁵ Whereas in Pakistan Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto was also close to the socialists in his own party and introduced reforms in the economical systems on socialist model.⁶ In charismatic leadership quality Indira Gandhi emerged as sole representatives of their nations after 1971 war and just in six years seemed her down fall due over estimation of her popularity graph in 1977.⁷ Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto of Pakistan also emerged as leading political personality after the dismemberment of Pakistan in 1971 and became victim of his policies and ruling style.⁸ Land reforms, labor policies, nationalization and nuclear program are the legacy of the Bhutto in Pakistan and in India Nationalization, constitutional reforms and nuclear program is legacy of Indira in India. In 1975 emergency was enforced in India by Indira Gandhi that had exposed the authoritarian style of her governance and her quest of re election her down in 1977 and she had to face jail after her removal from power. Indira Gandhi managed to come back in Prime Minister Office in 1980 but her policies led towards her death in 1984 by her own body guards.⁹ In Pakistan Bhutto enforced martial law in three big cities and used un-necessary force against the protestors and made way clear for direct military interference in politics. Bhutto quest for re election in 1977 bring him down as protest against the allegation of rigging provide the excuse to military intervention and he was arrested and sent into jail. Bhutto never came out of jail and was killed in judicial vendetta in 1979.¹⁰ Both showed extra ordinary leadership skills during their years in power, decreased the poverty level in their countries. In tasked oriented leadership style Bhutto crushed the rebellion in Baluchistan by military operation, used the theme Aam Aadmi and eradication of poverty to gain vote and cheated the elections to regain mandate. Bhutto also in tough and shrewd qualities of leadership did not become ready to leave the country to spend remaining life in exile for life and just after the

release from jail organized the rallies and criticized the martial law authorities.¹¹ Indira Gandhi in India crushed the Sikh rebellion by military operation, used the theme Ghariabi Hatao (eradication of poverty) to gain vote and cheated the elections to regain the power in the task-oriented leadership style. In the tough and shrewd qualities of the leadership Indira Gandhi never gave up the hope and quest to regain power in imprisonment and just after her release she organized rallies in her support.¹² Bhutto has used state power to eliminate his opponents then in India Indira Gandhi also did the same with her opponents. Indira Gandhi used force against protestors during currency crisis, in Pakistan Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto also used force against the protestors during the rigging allegations¹³. As good leaders of their countries Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto and Indira Gandhi were leaders with good moral values and integrity to their cause. Their style of governance was autocratic but empathetic and listening to others with the extra qualities of motivating, charismatic and appealing styles. They provided the legacy of transformational and everlasting impact of politics.

Hypothesis; The legacies of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto and Indira Gandhi transcend time, in terms of the impacts they each had on democracy and bilateral relations of Pakistan and India. They were leaders of contemporary times and they drew upon similar principles in their quests to lead their nations. While their causes were divergent to each of their motherland, they inspired similar reverence among their followers, ultimately standing as inspiration nationwide.

Literature Review;

Indira Gandhi was killed in her house not by any external enemy but by her own body guards in the presence of tight security. HarperCollins Publishers in 2010 presented classic and non-partisan biography Indira Gandhi presenting her one of the most formidable political figures of the 20th century of India. She served her nation for sixteen years and in power she made space in the community of popular leaders of the world. She was one of the influential leaders of India after Nehru and Gandhi. She was brought up in the environment of Indian nationalism under the shadows of her father Jawaharlal Nehru a freedom fighter and first prime minister of India. When political culture of India was under male-dominated society and complex environment Indira Gandhi emerged as woman leader of India. Katherine Frank the writer of this book explained how old stalwart of Indian national congress were of mind that Indira could not survive in Indian political culture. But she proved them wrong and left deep print of her personality on Indian politics. She attracted the new and abandoned segment of the Indian society in politics by new slogans and policies. She served with confidence as prime minister of India in such way that slogan like "Indira is India" were introduced by her fans in politics. Author shed light on her personal life by including her childhood, love marriage and family life along with the political life as prime minister, opposition leader and prisoner. She made

some mistakes in power along with number of good decisions and one the mistake caused her sudden killing in 1984.

First elected prime minister of Pakistan Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto was hanged in 1979 by military regime. Victoria Schofield discussed the life and work of Bhutto and said that Bhutto was most popular and fascinating leader in the political history of Pakistan. Bhutto emerged as popular leader of the Pakistan after dismemberment of the country in 1971. He gave constitution to country unanimously in 1973 and served as prime minister of Pakistan for nearly five years. He set directions of the country by his policies and vision and became victim of his some policies and political attitude. In power he became leading personality of Pakistan and introduction to his country. Pakistan's dismemberment was result of long evasion from election and Bhutto wanted to seek fresh mandate in 1977 to continue the process of the elections that was started in 1971. Bhutto in military dominated political culture tried to introduced popular leadership model and empower the layman of Pakistan. His political legacy in Pakistan's politics is still alive and relevant. The Cassel publishers in this book of 1979 presented the very important aspects of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto personal life and analysis his political role as popular leader of Pakistan. Book tells how he was the most powerful politician, the highly educated, highly intellectual and unique personality in the political arena of Pakistan. Bhutto was admired as finest orator at international community forum. That's why despite the number of Bhutto's flaws and human weaknesses, the masses of the Pakistan respect him till date. This book is very important to analyze the role and services of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto as fascinating political leaders of the third world and Pakistan.

There is common culture and shared history between Pakistan and India as both has experienced British colonial rule till 1947 as a part of British India. In the history of bilateral relations both Pakistan and India has been accusing each other for cross border terrorism and insurgencies along with tedious peace processes and four wars since 1947. This book is a very important data for researchers in which writer has provided theoretical inconsistency of bilateral relations of two nuclear states of subcontinent. Discussion for examining differences between Pakistan and India for understanding the politics of conflict and peace processes between two neighboring is good effort of the Duncan McLeod a vesting lecturer in Bristol university of Britain. Rutledge publisher in this book "India Pakistan; friends, rival or enemies?" fills the very important gap in the literature on the topic of Pakistan and India relations by analyzing the question of identity in the international community. For the better future of south Asia it is direly needed to present new ideas about the nature of India and Pakistan relations. What happened in past between India and Pakistan and what will be in future is very important for the people of south Asia.

Research Methodology; Collection of data in any research study is very important. Type of data and techniques of the data collection are dependent on the nature of the

study. In this study secondary data is used to present the insight investigation of the facts of the politics of Pakistan and India. To compare the two or more variable the comparative model of research are applied and in this study to make a comparative analysis of the personality and leadership role of Indira Gandhi and Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto comparative model with analytical techniques of the research methodology are used. Methods of research are depended on the nature of the studies. The nature of this study needs an analytical and comparative approach for the observation that can lead to the testing of the hypothesis. The objectives of the studies are very important to understand the importance of the study. The objectives of this study are as under

1. To find the resemblance in leadership models of Pakistan and India.
2. To find the link between leadership of Indira Gandhi and Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto.
3. To find impact of Indian politics on political culture of Pakistan.

Parallel lives

Indira Nehru Gandhi was born in Allahabad on 19 November 1917 in a Kashmiri Pundit family. She was daughter of a prominent freedom fighter of India against British rule and first prime Minister of India Pundit Jawaharlal Nehru. She started her education career from Pune University by passing matriculation degree and after it for higher secondary education she went to Shantiniketan in West Bengal. Her father was interested in her higher education and on the advice of Gandhi She was sent to Switzerland for higher education and after to oxford university London.¹⁴ She during her stay in Switzerland helped with her ailing mother Kamala Nehru and in 1936 returned to India. Her mother could not survive from the long ailment and died and during this incident Nehru was facing British Empire by imprisonment. She decided to marry her class fellow Feroz Gandhi despite his father's objections in 1941.¹⁵ After her marriage she gave birth to Rajive Gandhi in 1944 and Sanjay Gandhi in 1946. Her husband took part in active politics and elected Member of Parliament in 1952 elections and became hard liner to the corruption in her father in law government. Indira Gandhi career as politician started when she was introduced by her father Jawaharlal Nehru in Indian National Congress and in 1959. Indira Gandhi became president of Congress in 1959 but just after her first national level introduction her husband Feroz Gandhi died in 1960. She continued to learn the politics from his father by serving him as private secretary till his death. Indira Gandhi after the death of Nehru emerged as strong contender of the Congress leadership and at the beginning of his political career she was reputed as dumb girl. Indira Gandhi's selection for the highest post was perceived to be pathetic enough

that regional party bosses could control and a woman could be an ideal instrument for the Syndicates of the party. But with the passage of time she gained the reputation of ruthless opponent and skillful politician. Her role in politics was important and was tried to satisfy with assignment of ministerial portfolio in Lal Bahdur Shastari government. She emerged as shrewd politician and contender of candidature of prime minister in her party Indian national congress after the death of Lal Bahdur Shastari in 1966.¹⁶ She served as prime minister of India from 1966 to 1977 and again in 1980 to 1984 with interval of 1977 to 1980 of junta Dal government. During these years she was recognized as most influential, powerful and charismatic politician of the country.¹⁷ Zulfikar Ali Bhutto was born on January 5, 1928 to the last prime minister of state of JunaGarh Sir Shah Nawaz Bhutto of Larkana Sindh. Zulfikar Ali Bhutto went to school for matriculation in Bombay's Cathedral High School. His father was interested in his higher education and he sent him abroad in 1947 where he joined the University of Southern California. After it in 1949 he went to the University of California at Berkeley to complete his degree with honors in Political Science.¹⁸ Zulfikar ali Bhutto was interested in law education so in June 1950, he got admission Oxford university London like Indira Gandhi. Zulfikar Ali Bhutto was attractive personality and he in 1951 decided to marry Nusrat Ispahani. After two year of his marriage Benazir Bhutto was born in 1953 and in the same year he was called to Bar at Lincoln's Inn. Zulfikar Ali Bhutto on his return to Pakistan became practicing Lawyer at Dingomal's. Murtza Bhutto was born in 1954 just one year after the birth of Benazir Bhutto and Sanam Bhutto in 1957 and last one Shahnawaz Bhutto in 1958.¹⁹ The career of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto as politician was started when Iskindar Mirza introduced him in politics. He sent him in UNO to represent Pakistan in 1957 and 1958. He was honored to the position of federal minister of commerce in 1958 under Iskinder Mirza pre coup government. He continued his political career by developing working relationship with military regime. He was assigned the ministry of works for that he served till 1960 and after it he was trusted with ministry of foreign affairs where he got chance to introduce himself at international arena. He successfully assessed the situation in 1966 and resigned from the post of minister of foreign affairs in 1966.²⁰ After his resignation he decided to organize his own political party and in 1967 foundation of Pakistan people's party was announced by him. He emerged as shrewd politician and leader of his own political party during the years of 1967 to 1969 when he took part in the agitation against the Ayub Khan regime. His party emerged as majority party of West Pakistan along with the Awami League of Shaikh Mujeeb Ur Rehman in East Pakistan. Refusal of military Junta to transfer the power to elected representatives resulted in civil war and ended with Indian attack and dismemberment. Dismemberment of the country provided the chance to lead the nation in 1971 as his party emerged as majority party in remaining part of the country. He forced military leader Yahiya Khan to resign and became civilian chief martial law administrator,

president and after it prime minister of Pakistan. During these years he was recognized as charismatic political figure and powerful and influential leader of the nation.²¹

Supporters of Indira Gandhi and Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto were captivated by their energy, eloquence and qualities of leadership whereas the critics loathed and accused them of being egotistical and authoritative to others. During their time at the leading role in power they reigned vigorously and became polarizing figures of political life of their countries, venerated by their followers and vilified by their critics. The era of their power in their countries' history labialized by contradictions; they were democratic leaders who set aside the democratic values in democratic political systems and declared the state of emergencies.²² In India Indira Gandhi violating the democratic norms and tradition of the country decreed the state of emergency and ruled the nation for nearly two year from 1975 to 1977.²³ Whereas in Pakistan following the Indira model in Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto also handed over three big cities of Pakistan; Hyderabad, Lahore and Karachi to army by enforcing martial law and overthrew two elected governments of Baluchistan and Khyber Pakhtunkhaw then N.W.F.P by enforcing governor rule. In Pakistan that time of 1972 to 1977 is remembered as the brutal use of force and suspension of basic human rights and violation of civil liberties.²⁴ In India period of 1971 to 1977 and 1980-1984 was associated as suspension of basic human rights and violation of civil liberties and extra use of state force in civil matters.²⁵ Under the leadership of Indira in India and Bhutto in Pakistan government had committed atrocities at such level that cast a dark shadows over their legacies and tarnished their reputation.

Different Personalities

Indira Gandhi remained fail to manage the victory in elections of 1977 and was imprisoned by the newly established government of Janta Dal in 1977. In the prison she developed a strategy to face the public and deliver apology for her past negligence. When she came out from the jail she started the public rallies and addressed the large crowd in different parts of the country. In her massive campaign she managed to force the Janta Dal government for midterm elections. In 1980 she returned in power and ruled the country till her murder in 1984.²⁶ Whereas Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto managed to win the elections of 1977 and retain the power but a protest for the inquiry of rigging in few constituencies were mishandled by him. This protest against rigging turned into anti Bhutto campaign and provided the chance to military for intervention. Bhutto remain fail to resolve the issue through dialogue and martial law was enforced in 1977. Bhutto was sent into jail and from the prison he could not develop the strategy to deal with martial law authorities. He under estimated the martial law regime and just after his release on bail from jail he set on public rallies. In his addresses to the public rallies he left no

doubt in the minds of the military junta that any chance of power in Bhutto hand will bring serious threats for their lives. In this environment martial law authorities put Bhutto against the bars from where he never returned alive. He was sentenced to death in murder of his political opponent's father during his era of power in 1979.²⁷

Economic policy of Indira and Bhutto

Indira Gandhi in 1969 introduced policy of nationalization and nationalized the 14 banks in 1969 because according to the record of the Reserve Bank of India (RBI), between 1947 and 1955, 361 banks went bankrupt. Its mean 40 banks per year 'failed' in India and all such banks were privately owned. Political motive of the nationalization was also mindful at that time as Indira Gandhi wanted to punish her political opponents as according to her assessment private bank owners were in cahoots with the Swatntra party of India. She also punished the opponents within the party by sacking finance minister Morarji Desai and congressmen supporting him by nationalization.²⁸ She was re elected in the elections of 1971 in response to her nationalization policy. she in her third term as prime minister resume the process of nationalization and nationalized the insurance industry along with cotton, refining, copper, coal and steel industries in the name of protection of rights of the working class and employment. She also put remaining private industry under the strict regulatory control. In 1973 after 1971 war with Pakistan Indira Gandhi nationalized the oil companies in response to their refusal to supply fuel to Indian air force and navy.²⁹

Following the Indira steps in India, Zulfikar Ali Bhutto in Pakistan started nationalization policy in 1972 by nationalizing the heavy chemical, mechanical and electrical engineering industries along with insurance, cotton, refining, and coal and steel industries in the name of labor and employee welfare. He also follow her in nationalization of the banking and petroleum sector by decreeing the nationalization of private banks, shipping petroleum company's products along with marketing of petroleum. If in India Indira Gandhi nationalized 14 banks in Pakistan Bhutto nationalized the 13 banks in Pakistan.³⁰ The reason of nationalization was the socialist economic model for Pakistan and punishment for the old rivals in Ayub Khan Regime. After dismemberment of Pakistan in 1971 growth rate was in declined and Bhutto adopted the policy of devaluation of rupee by 120 per cent just to meet the foreign export needs. After 1971 war with India foreign export of Pakistan was under stressed as Pakistan lost great foreign exports by losing East Pakistan.³¹ Pakistan doubled its foreign exchange reserves by devaluation of rupee. This was on the line of Indira Gandhi who in 1966 devalued the rupee 57 percent drastically to cover the stressed spending on military due to war with Pakistan in 1965. Due to devaluation of rupee Indian rupee exchange rate was Rs 7.50 to 1 US dollar in 1966 as against of Rs 4.76 to 1 US dollar previously.³²

Political Slogan of Roti Kapda aur makan

If anybody from middle class in subcontinent will be questioned by insurance company what are three basic needs of human beings he must reply Roti, Kapra Aur Makaan. Former Prime Minister of India, Indira Gandhi coined the term Roti Kapra Aur Makaan as an election slogan in the late 1967. This political slogan connected well with people. The slogan was appreciated across the border and further cemented in the minds of people of India and Pakistan when a Bollywood movie was made by Manoj Kumar, 'Roti, Kapda aur Makaan. In Pakistan Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto coined the same slogan of Roti Kapra and Makaan to address the rural population of Pakistan in his election campaigns. ³³Indira Gandhi during her election campaigns continually used the term together the support of rural and poor segment of the society. Roti, kapda aur makaan' had been biggest slogan of the Indian socialism as this slogan remain so far humanity and basic needs of the human beings for interminable generations.³⁴

Foreign Policy of Indira Gandhi and Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto

Impact of the personality on the foreign policy making process and decision making is most contentious. It is the leaders who make decisions not state and foreign policies of the modern world has been under the shadows of leadership motives, believes and personal backgrounds. Depending on the constraints of the international political system and domestic political structure the personalities are important to make understanding about the foreign policy of any state. Indira Gandhi assumed the office of Prime minister in 1966 along with foreign affairs and in very next year 1967 she arranged an international summit of Non Align movement in New Delhi to introduce herself with international community and raised her statue in world community to send a message of third world leadership.³⁵ Just like as Indira Gandhi, Bhutto raised his political status in the international community and delivered a message of third world leadership. Relations with United States in Indira Gandhi era remain in condition of not good too bad as after 1965 war with Pakistan United sates of America suspended all kinds of aid. Indira visited US in 1966 and met the President Johnson, who promised the resumption of suspended aid. But opposition parties in India stop the materialization of aid for India. India relations with US again came on point of no return when India sign defense treaty with USSR in 1971.³⁶ In 1974 relations were improved by hennery Kissinger visit of Delhi but strained just year after in 1975 when state of emergency was enforced in India. She continually made efforts to better the relations with Arab states and Iran by firm support of Palestine cause. India tried to disassociate from the cold war and adopted the policy of non alignment but during Indira years India went closer to USSR by

signing defense treaty in 1971. USSR in 1974 negatively reacted on Indian nuclear test but refrained to further actions same like India negatively reacted in 1979 USSR direct invasion of Afghanistan but refrained from further actions. India relations' with china during Indira Gandhi era remained cold as china fully supported Pakistan in wars of 1965 and 1971 against India. China also continued border disputes with India along with inferences in Nagaland, Mizoram, Naxalites and other extremists inside India. ³⁷Pakistan relations with United States faced sudden changes during the reign of Bhutto era. In Pakistan Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto assumed the office of Prime Minister in 1973 and in very next year 1974 he also arranged international Summit of Organization of Islamic cooperation (conference) in Lahore. US relations were flourishing during Yahya Khan regime as Pakistan brought US and China close but US enforced sanctions against Pakistan during the war with India in 1971. Bhutto diversified relations with US and left SEATO and CENTO defense pacts labeling useless. He announced the china and Arab countries as alternate to US and laid the foundations of independent foreign policy. He negotiated with India and Indira Gandhi agreed to release prisoners of war and sign peace treaty of Simla. Bhutto also improved relations with Iran and Afghanistan by exchange of visits. USSR relations with Pakistan remained strained during cold war era as Pakistan joined US camp but in Bhutto era relations positively developed by Bhutto through leaving SEATO and CENTO and visit to USSR which resulted in aid for Pakistan by USSR. ³⁸Whereas Pakistan and China relations boosted in Bhutto era both country worked closely on number of issues. Bhutto played central role to arrange US president Nixon visit to China and china was allotted seat in UN. China used veto power in favor Pakistan to keep out Bangladesh from UN and refused to establish diplomatic relations until Pakistan had not recognized it. China also not resumed diplomatic relations with India until Pakistan had not resumed in 1976. ³⁹Foreign policy of Bhutto as a whole was independent same like as foreign policy of Indira Gandhi.

Use of force in National security policies of Indira and Bhutto

If in India Indira Gandhi enjoyed the popular support as democratic leader then in Pakistan Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto enjoyed the same popular support as democratic leader. But unfortunately both of them were in favor to use forces for the resolution of internal uprisings and dealing the civilians. Indira Gandhi at home for the purpose of national security and integrity used the policy of use of force in dealing with the separatists in different parts of the country. In 1966 separatists movement in Mizoram area was on full swing when Indira Gandhi took the charge of Prime Minister Office. Air strikes on civilian population by Indian air force were first time happened in Indira Gandhi era this operation lasted for nearly five years. She order the Indian armed forces to launch full might military operation in the Mizoram

region of south east India and crushed the uprising. This operation lasted for nearly five years and after the separation of East Pakistan as Bangladesh uprising in Mizoram region reached to its end. In the area of Nagaland Indira Gandhi responded to uprising in 1971 with military operation and crushed the separatists. She developed the strategy of targeted operations in the area and during emergency she crackdown on the separatists and in 1975 signed Shillong Treaty to empower the region and bring uprising down. ⁴⁰Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto sworn in 1971 and faced the major challenges of insecurity as after the dismemberment of the East Pakistan, separatist movement started in west Pakistan regions of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Sindh, Baluchistan. Bhutto till 1973 tried to handle the situation of uprising and insurgency through police and civil armed forces but situation could not be controlled. He then overthrew the provincial government of Baluchistan and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and enforced governor rule. He banned the national people's party on the recommendations of Nawab Akbar Khan Bugti governor of Baluchistan and launched military operation against the insurgents of the area. He arrested nearly all MNAs, MPAs from the Baluchistan and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa area and set up tribunal to charge them with treason. ⁴¹Adopting Indira Gandhi model he also used full might of military and air strikes against the civilians. The tribunal worked till the removal of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto from power by Pakistan army.

Nuclear race and role of Indira and Bhutto

Nuclear race in south Asia started with the Test No. 6 a code name of nuclear capability test of China in 1967. Indira Gandhi was serving as prime minister of India and she described the nuclear test of China as direct threat for security of India. Meanwhile India and china relations were not good as they had fought war in 1962 on boundary dispute. In response to the China Nuclear program Indira Gandhi authorized the development of nuclear arms in 1967. During the cold war India adopted non alignment policy but the nuclear test of China forced the India to seek help from any one of the two leading powers of cold war. India before china nuclear test had strategy of independent security out of bipolar system. India had civil nuclear technology and within seven years of the nuclear armed program India developed nuclear weapon in 1974 and Indira Gandhi ordered to test the capability in same year. ⁴² India as big military power against China was suitable to USSR and USA so the reaction to the nuclear test was normal and no condemnation was against India excluding Pakistan. Pakistan reaction about the Smiling Budha a codename of Indian nuclear test in Pokhran region of Rajasthan was as prime minister of Pakistan Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto described it as intimation for Pakistan security. He launched massive campaign against nuclear test of India and made announcement 'We will eat grass or leaves even go hungry but will get nuclear power'. After massive scale

protest in Pakistan, Indira Gandhi sent explanatory letter to Bhutto and described the nuclear test for peaceful purpose. Pakistan after 1974 started its quest for nuclear weapon and despite the US pressure and sanctions developed nuclear weapon nearly ten years later. India and Pakistan joined nuclear club officially in 1998 making nuclear tests. ⁴³So Indira Gandhi developed nuclear program of India for military means in reaction to the China's nuclear test and Zulfikar Ali Bhutto developed nuclear program of Pakistan in reaction to the Indian nuclear program.

Constitutional Reforms

The Constitutions of India and Pakistan are fundamental laws of their countries and the foundation on which all other laws are made and enforced. Constitution can be also defined as set of principles to define the structure of the state and describe as supreme law of the land. Constitutional reforms are considered implicit in the very nature of a Constitution. All the democratic constitutions have to be particularly responsive to varying condition because the government founded on basic principle of popular sovereignty. It is duty of the popular government to make amendments in the constitution by asserting fresh will of the people as that will change. Such change occurred in India and Pakistan and democratic leadership of both countries remain active in making amendments in constitutions according to the will of the people. In India, Indira Gandhi introduced very important Constitutional reforms during her era of power. After assuming office of prime minister in 1966 she along with the other basic reforms introduced constitutional reforms. She introduced 18th amendment in 1966 and continuously amended the constitution till 1984 and number of amendments was raised to 50 in 1984 when she was killed. In 1966 when Indira came into power she faced uprising in different parts of the country for political rights on the basis of languages, race and cast. To address the issue she introduced 18th amendment and started the process of new states and up gradation of the status of the states and union territories. Furthermore the 21st Amendment address the language problem by including the Sindhi language in regional status languages and 22 Amendment was introduced in 1969 for the Creation of new autonomous state of Meghalaya. ⁴⁴In 1969 another important Amendment was 23rd amendment that increased the period of 20 years for nomination of Schedule casts and tribes along with Anglo Indian in legislatures. Whereas in the 27th Amendment of 1971 she made certain provisions for North-East Frontier Agencies to include them in Arunachal Pradesh & Mizoram states. As 31st Amendment raised the number of Lok Sabah seats for the representation of the newly established states and states with less than 60 million populations from 525 to 545. ⁴⁵Whereas the 32nd Amendment in 1973 Indira Gandhi made for the special provisions related to backward area of Telegana region of Andhra Pradesh. Indira Gandhi was very

energetic in her first year of power and she on the recommendation of the Indian election commission introduced the 19th amendment in 1966 and abolished the election tribunals and authorized the high court to trail the election petitions. Indira Gandhi in her period of power introduced some amendments regarding the judicial system 20th amendment was to upheld the pause in Uttar Pradesh judiciary. She also empowered the parliament by introducing 24th amendment to make Compulsion for President of the India to give his assent on affirmed the Right of Parliament to amend any part of constitution through Constitutional Amendment Bill of 1971. ⁴⁶In 1974 regarding the parliamentary reforms 33rd amendment was made to provision related to the resignation of MPs and State legislatures to address the issues of resignations of law makers under other than genuine reasons. Indira Gandhi also subverted Supreme Court decisions in 24th and 25th amendments in protection of the fundamental rights of the people. 29th and 30th amendments was also in the series of 24th and 25th Amendment against the ruling of Supreme Court of India in which Kerala Land reform act was empowered to overcome the Supreme Court orders in this matter and provisions related to Supreme Court of India in civil cases. In 1974, 34th amendment in Indian constitution was also regarding the land holding and was made on the recommendations of the chief ministers' conference. In 1971 with 26th amendment she brought to an end the titles & special privileges of former rulers of princely states of India. She curtailed the powers of bureaucracy by 28th amendment and abolished special privileges of Indian Civil service officers & empowered Parliament to determine their service structure in 1972. In 1974 Indira Gandhi took extra ordinary steps to expansion of India and attack the semi autonomous states of Sikkim and introduced 35th amendment to exchange the protectorate status of Sikkim to union state and one year later in 36th Amendment assigned the Sikkim a full fledge state status in Indian union. Region of Arunachal Pradesh was empowered with 37th amendment by changing the status of Arunachal Pradesh Assembly from advisory council to legislative assembly in 1975. ⁴⁷In June 1975 Indira Gandhi had promulgated emergency in India under the constitutional provision of 351 (1) of Indian constitution. In emergency she started once again process to curtail powers of judiciary by introducing 38th amendment providing full and final authority to President in center and governors in federating unites in the matter of issuance of ordinance. She also introduced the 39th Amendment in the constitution and declared the matter disputes among president, prime minister and lawmakers beyond the jurisdiction of Supreme Court. In 40th amendment Union of India was authorized to own all mineral and underground resource of sea to avoid any dispute between unions and unites of the union in 1976. In same year Indira Gandhi raised the limit of retirement age of the Indian member of the public service commission. One year after the emergency in India Indira Gandhi made another amendment to cover up the her act of promulgating emergency and extend the period from six month to one year. ⁴⁸In 42nd Amendment she bring basic changes in constitution and added

Socialist values along with, secular principles and principle of national integrity in Preamble of the constitution along the Fundamental duties of the citizens of India. In the process of the judicial reforms Indira Gandhi created of All India Judicial Service. She also included the extension of president rule from six months to 1 year as it was need of the time for her survival. She also in this amendment increases the tenure of upper house of Indian parliament Lok Sabha and State legislature assemblies from 5 to 6 years. She by this amendment made compulsory for President to act on the advice of Council of ministers and in this way she made cut on the powers of president. Elections held in 1977 and emergency was lifted in India with elected government of Janata government came into power. Janata party government continued the process of amendments in the constitution and in 43rd, 44th and 45th amendments restored many clauses of constitution changed in Indira Gandhi era. Indira Gandhi in midterm elections made come back in power in 1980. She introduced reforms in constitution and brought 46th amendment to make tax reforms in 1982. Two years later in 47th amendment Indira Gandhi introduced land reform and once again acted to restore law and order but this time in Punjab. For emergency in Punjab she made 48th amendment to crush the rebellion of the Sikh.⁴⁹ State government of Punjab was dissolved and president rule was enforced to handle the law and order situation in Punjab. In 49th amendment that was also introduced in 1984 tribal region of Tripura was empowered. In 1984 an important 50th amendment was introduced in the constitution by defining the rights and duties of the people serving in the intelligent agencies and forces.⁵⁰ This amendment was made to bring check on the intelligent agencies. In same year Indira Gandhi brought 51st Amendment in the constitution to empower the schedule tribes of four mini states of Indian union from north eastern region by providing seats to them in the parliament.⁵¹ This was the last amendment by Indira Gandhi as she was killed by the security Guard in revenge of operation blue star in Punjab in 1984.

If we compare the constitutional reforms by Zulfikar Ali Bhutto in Pakistan he also did much in this regard. Bhutto sworn in as president and chief martial law administrator of Pakistan in 1971, there was no constitution in the country. To run the state business LFO was being used as alternate to the constitution. Bhutto became first and last civilian chief martial law administrator of Pakistan. Bhutto rule as chief martial law administrator was rejected by opposition parties and people of Pakistan. He after assuming office set up commission to develop provisional constitution for Pakistan so that he could lift the martial law in Pakistan. He issued presidential order to hold the national assembly session. In that session he proposed the assembly to draft an interim constitution before new constitution of Pakistan. National assembly of Pakistan adopted an interim constitution in April 1972 and martial law was lifted. 1972 constitution was presidential constitution and Bhutto sworn in as president of Pakistan in April and set up new commission to draft permanent constitution for Pakistan. Constitutional .Bhutto lifted martial law and

sworn in as president of Pakistan in 1972. He set up another constitutional commission in 1972 to develop new parliamentary constitution for Pakistan. That commission in 1973 presented the recommendation and assembly session was called on in April 1973 to approve the constitutional bill. ⁵²The legislating assembly of Pakistan approved the constitution for Pakistan in April 1973 after that president of Pakistan in approved the constitution. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto on 14 August 1973 promulgated the new parliamentary constitution and sworn in as prime minister of Pakistan. He was architect of new constitution that had to work in coming days of Pakistan. Pakistan is currently running through its third constitution of 1973 as before it 1956 and 1962 constitution remained fail to functioned in Pakistan. During his era in power he continually amended the constitution till his removal from the power by military rule in 1977. He introduced amndements in the constitutions according to needs and will of the people. ⁵³He introduced first amendment in the constitution and excluded Bangladesh from the federation of Pakistan; Because Bangladesh in 1971 was separated after civil war and war with India from Pakistan. Pakistan had no choice other than to accept the newly born country.

After the promulgation of 1973 constitution, Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto in May 1974 through the first amendment changed fourteen articles and first schedule of the constitution. Bhutto targeted the political parties by imposing restriction on the parties not to act against the national interests and made them mandatory to declare their source of Income. ⁵⁴Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto also focused on the territories excluding the provinces like FATA and set up commission in 1974 to amend the constitution and change the status of FATA. A commission for recommendations was set up under the supervision of interior minister Abdul Qayum Khan in 1974. Bhutto himself was busy in OIC summit in Pakistan and could not fulfill his wish to include the FATA in Khyber Pakhtunkha due to internal unrest

Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto introduced second amendment in the constitution in September 1974 to obtain himself the power to transfer of judges from one court to another court. He also resolved the religious issue of Qadianis and declared them non Muslim on the popular demand of the people of Pakistan and movements involved in the protest. He like Indira Gandhi increased the powers of executive to arrest and detain the personals involved in anti security activities by introducing the 3rd amendment. This amendment was same like as the article 351(1) in Indian constitution to authorize the executive to impose emergency in the country. Indira Gandhi activated the article 351(1) and imposed emergency in 1975 but Bhutto instead of this handed over three big cities of Pakistan; Hyderabad, Karachi and Lahore. This action of the Bhutto once again started the process that led toward the martial law as military once again got courage to involve in the politics. In November 1975 Bhutto introduced 4th amendment in the constitution to curtail the judiciary powers to intervene in the executive matters to protect the fundamental rights of the people. He misused the powers to detain his political opponents and send them behind the

bars. High courts were active in accepting the bails of the political detainees and by this Bhutto removed the hurdle and continue the practices of targeting his political opponents.⁵⁵ Zulfikar Ali Bhutto deprived his political opponents from the fundamental rights and right of fair trial and trapped in himself when he was deprived from fair trial. Bhutto set bad examples for future and became victim of these amendments after only two years and was hanged in false trap of murder. He continued to curtail the judiciary powers and amended the constitution in September 1976 fifth time. He made difficult for the judiciary to functioned independently as in this amendment he barred the judiciary to take notice on the violation of fundamental rights of the citizens by the executive. He was intentionally grabbing the powers and was destroying the other institutions of the government. Being the part of parliament he was in position to control the parliament and leading the executive was able to crush any rebellion. Through parliament he paralyzed the third branch of the government by making amendments and imposing more and more restrictions on judiciary. Bhutto just after six months of Fifth Amendment introduced the sixth amendment to further paralyzed the judiciary and on personal like dislike fixed the age of retirement of the judges of the high court and Supreme Court. In his last year in power Zulfikar Ali Bhutto introduce 7th amendment in the constitution may 1977 in which prime minister was authorized to held referendum to prove his popularity and supreme court was restrained to take up the issues pertaining the armed forces.⁵⁶ After one and a half months, sixth amendment in the constitution was introduced on January 4, 1977 in which alterations were made in articles 179, 195, 246 and 260. Under these amendments further curbs were imposed on the independence of judiciary and retiring age of the Supreme Court and High Court judges was fixed at 65 and 62 years, respectively.

March 1977 was the month in which elections were held in Pakistan and India. Results favored Bhutto in Pakistan and rejected Indira Gandhi in India despite the fact both were running on the parallel lines of policies. Results of 1977 election in India were accepted but in Pakistan opposition rejected the results and protest was launched against the results. To handle the protest of the opposition parties Bhutto offered the opposition to take the decision of popularity from the people through referendum. There was no space of referendum in the constitution and Bhutto brought the 7th amendment and created space for referendum in it.⁵⁷ These amendments were just like amendments of Indira Gandhi's amendments in Indian constitutions to make his position more strong and crush the opposition.

Analyzing the Social Reforms

Indira Gandhi in India introduced many social reforms to make better living standard of the people of India. India was a big country regarding its area and population

when it came into beings in 1947. With the passage of time size of population increased along with poverty level. Jawaharlal Nehru as founding father of the nation was well aware from the needs of the people and he from the beginning focused the social reform. Indira Gandhi as predecessor of Nehru continued the reforms and in her era of power she introduced much new reform according to the needs of the society. She faced opposition from the rivals within the party after the death of Jawaharlal Nehru dispute of succession in Party lead towards the feud. In 1966 Indira Gandhi announced equal rights for all citizen and abolishment of Privy Purse and privileges for the rulers of local Indian states. Indira Gandhi was opposed by the swatantra party the number of local states rulers had joint it to stop Indira from coming into power.⁵⁸ Indira Gandhi came into power but remain fail to implement her agenda regarding the equality of all citizens as upper house of Indian parliament rejected the idea. In 1971 elections Indira Gandhi again came into power and she abolished the Privy Purse and privileges through amendment in the constitution. In the Indian Parliament, Indira Gandhi stated that the concept of Privy Purses and special privileges were incompatible with an “egalitarian social order.”⁵⁹ In Pakistan Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto introduced many reforms and in 1972 he introduced land reforms to follow the model Indian land reform of 1956 in which he enforced restriction on the individual holdings to 300 acres of un-irrigated and 150 acres of irrigated land.⁶⁰ He ordered to take over the excessive land holdings without paying compensation.⁶¹ He developed policy for labor reforms in July 1972 and guarantee the fundamental rights of the workers like right of security service, association, pension and insurance along with benefits for children and families. Bhutto as visionary leader also introduced the industrial and corporate reforms in which he nationalized the basic industry of steel, metal, heavy machinery along with the public utility, power generation and companies of gas and oil. His reforms drastically brought the changes in the life of the ordinary people. He also contributed in social change by introducing the reforms in education, health and law sectors of Pakistan.⁶² Social culture of Pakistan and India are same so in the past policies to develop the social condition of the people has been adopted nearly in same line

Conclusion

Majority population of Pakistan and India is living below the poverty line and any state level initiative for peace will be in the service to them. India and Pakistan with number of similarities in their political, social culture should learn from the experiences of each other as they did in past. India as big population and area had more opportunities to make experiences and access their results for the development of future plans. Pakistan on the other side should learn from India and take advantage to develop its policy by taking in mind the Indian experience in

political, economical and social sectors. There are number of problems that are being faced by the people of India and Pakistan in contemporary and the solution of their problems not be more different in practice. Leadership of India and Pakistan must have to develop the policies providing the early solution of the problems and must share their experiences with each other. In past leadership of India and Pakistan had adopted similar policies for the similar issues in their states and succeeded in number of fields. When both nations are running on the parallel lines in modern age then they must accept the fact that solution of their problems lies in the cooperation and sharing of experiences.

Notes and References

- ¹Ekbal, Nikhat. *Great Muslims of undivided India*. Delhi: Kalpaz Publications, 2009. 125
- ²Dommermuth-Costa, Carol. *Indira Gandhi: daughter of India*. Minneapolis: Lerner Publications Co., 2002.75
- ³Preston, Ian. *A political chronology of Central, South and East Asia*. London: Taylor & Francis, 2005. 102
- ⁴Ibid, 219
- ⁵Palacuppiramaniyan, Es. *The art of business leadership: Indian experiences*. New Delhi: Response, 2007.92
- ⁶Mass, Leslie Noyes. *Back to Pakistan: a fifty-year journey*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 2011.92
- ⁷Mathur, Birendra P. *Ethics for governance: reinventing public services*. London: Routledge, 2014.134
- ⁸Hussain, Akmal, and Ponna Wignaraja. *The Challenge in South Asia: development, democracy and regional cooperation*. Tokyo: United Nations University, 1989.230
- ⁹Nair, Partap. *The double factor*. New Delhi: Jaico, 2013.
- ¹⁰Zagorski, Paul W. *Comparative politics: continuity and breakdown in the contemporary world*. London: Routledge, 2009. 309
- ¹¹Singh, R. S. N. *The military factor in Pakistan*. Olympia Fields, IL: Lancer, 2009.66
- ¹²Saran, Renu. *Great personalities of the world*. New Delhi: Diamond Pocket Books, 2008.223
- ¹³Swami, Praveen. *India, Pakistan and the secret Jihad: the covert war in Kashmir, 1947-2004*. London: Routledge, 2012. 140
- ¹⁴Jayakar, Pupul. *Indira Gandhi, a biography*. New Delhi, India: Penguin, 2000. 47
- ¹⁵Saran, Renu . *Indira Gandhi: Great Woman Of India*. New Dehli: Daimond Book, 2001.23
- ¹⁶Gupte, Pranay. *Mother India: a political biography of Indira Gandhi*. New York: Penguin Books, 2011.256-259
- ¹⁷Vohra, Ranbir. *The making of India: a historical survey*. Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe, 2013.218
- ¹⁸Taseer, Salmaan. *Bhutto: a political biography*. London: Ithaca Press, 1979. 20-29
- ¹⁹Wolpert, Stanley A. *Zulfi Bhutto of Pakistan: his life and times*. New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1993. 29-34
- ²⁰Rajagopalan, Rajesh, and Atul Mishra. *Nuclear South Asia Keywords and Concepts*. Taylor and Francis, 2015.83
- ²¹Pike, Francis. *Empires at war: a short history of modern Asia since World War II*. London: I. B. Tauris, 2011. 356

-
- ²²Tambian, St. Leveling crowds: ethnonationalist conflicts and collective violence in South Asia. New Delhi: Vistaar, 1997.196
- ²³Jnopathy , Varalakshmi . Indira Gandhi: Woman of India's Destiny. New Delhi: Vikas Pub. House, 1987.77
- ²⁴Cloughley, Brian. A history of the pakistan army: wars and insurrections. New York, NY: Carrel Books, 2016.231
- ²⁵Jayapalan, N. History Of India(from National Movement To Present Day), Volume 4. New York: Atlantic, 2012.347
- ²⁶Vohra, Ranbir. The making of India: a historical survey. Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe, 2013.237
- ²⁷Bahadur, Kalim. Democracy in Pakistan: crises and conflicts. New Delhi: Har-Anand Publications, 1998. 38-40
- ²⁸Ānānt, V. Kīrṣṇā. The Indian Constitution and social revolution: right to property since independence. Los Angeles: SAGE, 2015. 178-180
- ²⁹Ibid
- ³⁰Brass, Paul R. Routledge handbook of South Asian politics: India, Pakistan, Bangladesh, Sri Lanka, and Nepal. London: Routledge, 2013. 235
- ³¹ibid
- ³²Pike, Francis. Empires at war: a short history of modern Asia since World War II. London: I. B. Tauris, 2011. 372
- ³³Kaliya, Ravi. Pakistan: from the rhetoric of democracy to the rise of militancy. London: Routledge, 2012.115
- ³⁴Priya Joshi. The 1970s and its Legacies in India's Cinemas. London: Routledge, 2014. 38
- ³⁵Patnaik, Saroj K. United Nations, India and the new world order. New Delhi: Mittal Publ., 2004.93-93
- ³⁶Bandyopadhyaya, J. The Making of India's Foreign Policy . New Dehli: Allied Publishers, 2003.252
- ³⁷Ibid, 253-254.
- ³⁸Blood, Peter R. Pakistan: a country study. Whitefish, Mont.?: Kessinger Pub., 2004. 251
- ³⁹Ibid
- ⁴⁰Bass, Gary Jonathan. The Blood Telegram. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 2013. 23-26
- ⁴¹Singh, R. S. N. The military factor in Pakistan. Olympia Fields, IL: Lancer, 2009. 65-66
- ⁴²Perkovichich, George . India's Nuclear Bomb: The Impact on Global Proliferation. London: University of California Press., 2001.146-161
- ⁴³Chakma, Bhumitra. Politics Of Nuclear Weapons In South Asia. Place Of Publication Not Identified: Routledge, 2016. 40-45

-
- ⁴⁴Singh, Mahendra Prasad. Federalism in south asia. Place of publication not identified: Routledge, 2016. 22-24
- ⁴⁵Bhardwaj, R. C. Constitution amendment in India. New Delhi: Vikas Publishers, 1995. 140-170
- ⁴⁶ Ibid, 255
- ⁴⁷ Ibid, 569
- ⁴⁸Pylee, M. V. Constitutional amendments in India. Gurgaon, Haryana, India: Universal Law Publishing, an imprint of LexisNexis, 2012. 266-270
- ⁴⁹ Ibid, 270-278
- ⁵⁰Kumar, Rajesh. Universal's Guide to the Constitution of India . New Dehli: Universal Law Publishers, 2011.230
- ⁵¹ Ibid, 231
- ⁵²Khan, Hamid. Constitutional and political history of Pakistan. Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2012. 480-508
- ⁵³ Ibid
- ⁵⁴Ramakrishnan, Nitya . In Custody: Law, Impunity and Prisoner Abuse in South Asia. Karachi: Sage Publishers, 2013.169
- ⁵⁵ Ibid, 170
- ⁵⁶Shastri, Amita, and A. Jeyaratnam Wilson. The post-colonial states of South Asia: political and constitutional problems. London: Routledge, 2015. 46-47
- ⁵⁷ Ibid
- ⁵⁸Mitra, Iman Kumar. Accumulation in post-colonial capitalism. Singapore: Springer, 2017. 143
- ⁵⁹Tai, Hung-chao. Land reform and politics a comparative analysis. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1984.291
- ⁶⁰Jaffrelot, Christophe, and Gillian Beaumont. A history of Pakistan and its origins. London: Anthem Press, 2004.77
- ⁶¹Jaffrelot, Christophe. The Pakistan paradox instability and resilience. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016.22
- ⁶² Ibid