
Impact of Benazir Bhutto Death on Performance of PPP and Electoral Politics of Pakistan 2008 -2013

_____ Syed Karim Haider

_____ Sheikh Shaukat Ali

Abstract

Benazir Bhutto the first female prime minister of Pakistan was born in Karachi, Pakistan, on June 21, 1953. She played very important role in the surviving years of Pakistan people party when party was under the struggling under the strict martial law of General Zia Ul Haq. After the death of Zulfiqar ali Bhutto Pakistan people's party future was uncertain but this uncertainty was turned into bright future for the party under the leadership of Benazir Bhutto the daughter of founding father of Pakistan people's party. In 2007 once again clouds of uncertainty was hindering around the party when Benazir Bhutto was killed in terrorist attack. She was bold leader of the nation who just after the end of martial law win the elections and in 1988 and was sworn in as the first female prime minister of Pakistan. At the age of thirty-five, Benazir Bhutto became the first woman and the youngest person ever to head the government of any Muslim nation. Benazir Bhutto came in politics mainly due to her lineage that was, her family's position and political power. Pakistan people's party managed to survive after the death of its founding father Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto because there was his political heir Benazir Bhutto. How Pakistan people's party managed to survive after the death of Benazir Bhutto when there was no leader of such caliber to replace Benazir Bhutto in the party. How the party was managed to survive and won the elections of 2008 and what kind of political challenges emerged for the party are discussed in this study.

Introduction

Pakistan people's party emerged in the political filed of the Pakistan in very crucial time as all the political forces in that time west Pakistan was at the edge of destructions by the military regime. Political leadership of the country was eliminated by the notorious EBDO of Ayub Khan (Pakistan, 1953, p.446)Zulfikar Ali Bhutto a formal ally of military dictator parted hi ways from him and organized his own political party. Pakistan People's Party was the political organization founded by Zulfikar Ali Bhutto in 1967 that is still leading progressive party of Pakistan. The

love for the Bhutto family does not decreased from the heart of common citizens of Pakistan because Pakistan People's Party is the party whose leadership had given sacrifices for them. First elected prime minster of Pakistan Zulfikar Ali Bhutto gave the tongue to speak and idea of human rights and dignity. He built Pakistan from the ruin and made proud nation of the Muslim world. After his judicial murder his wife and daughter became the political heirs of Pakistan People's party. (Esposito, 2002, p. 149)Both women leaded the party with courage and one of them died being paralyzed on the bed for many years due the shocks of her two son's death. Other won was killed in political rally that was against the nine year military rule in Rawalpindi in mysterious circumstances. She was direct line of Bhutto and after her death party passed on to her widow who is not from direct line of succession. After the Death of Benazir, daughter of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto Pakistan People's Party popularity declined with speed and within five years of her death it reached lowest of its life. Promises of batter life, Roti, Kapra, Makan, and democratic politics became are no more attractive due to the emergence of the other political parties with nearly same manifestoes. Bilawal Bhutto Zardari, son of late Benazir Bhutto and Asif Ali Zardari is being seen only hope for the survival of the Pakistan People's party. But time has changed people are more aware of their problems and political performances of Pakistan People's party governments in the past.(*Economic Outlook*, 2008, p. 55) When all political parties are reshaping according to the needs of the country then Pakistan People's party had large number of challenges to once again regain its popularity especially when there is no direct line of Bhutto successor. After eight years of Benazir Bhutto death Pakistan People's party is passing through its crucial time and fighting the battle of its survival.

Hypothesis: performance of Pakistan people's party as political party of Pakistan remain poor after the death of Benazir Bhutto and with the passage of time Pakistan people's party role in national politics has been going to became more limited.

Literature Review

Alan, J. Day, H. (1984).Political Parties of the World. London: Penguin Books provided a brief account of the political parties according to their division into liberal and conservatives, right wing and left wing, democratic and fascist and new and old. Pakistan is one of the international democratic countries in which political participation of the people is made easy through the activities of the political parties to collect the public support and develop an easy model of collecting the public response on the national policies and governing system. In his book Alan and co writer Henry provided brief sum of knowledge of Indian National congress and Pakistan people's party. Pakistan people's party in Pakistan political development

played very central role and actively participated in the political arena of country in late sixties and seventies and afterward too. This work summarizing factual data on all over the world active political parties till 80's and placed within the content of customary constitutional situation in the countries these parties are working along with particular country's brief account. The scope of this book is very broad but have important data linked to Indian and Pakistani political parties as writers tried to provide the beautiful work on political parties including the south Asian region but did not mentioned the causes of rise and falls of these political parties and associations of the leaders with these parties. This book also contributes to greater understanding in that period of the phenomenon of political parties lacking the study of personalities impact on them and dynastic grip of the leadership upon their survival.

28 Munoz, H. (2013). *Getting Away with Murder*. New York: W.W.Norton tells the lead story of killing of Benazir Bhutto who was investigated by the commissioner of the United Nations and is an authoritative account of her murder in suicide attack in Rawalpindi On December 27, 2007. Benazir Bhutto was a brilliant personality and fascinating political leader of Pakistan, the head of a Bhutto political family as the Nehru Gandhi political family in India or the Kennedy family in the United States of America for the importance of their involvement in national politics and icon of democratic struggle and political landscape of their countries. The author of this book tried to find out the real conspirators and killers of the leader of Pakistan people party with the help of the produced evidences in the prosecution of Pakistan judicial system along with the assistance of public opinion about the attack on Benazir Bhutto which has become a mystery same like other murders of the political leaders in the world. As expert of the political matters he tried to explain unexpected role played by the United States of the America in the mysterious killing of the Benazir Bhutto in December 2007, defining the nature of complex relationship between them and their countries. In the minds of the people of Pakistan role of American leadership remain always doubtful regarding the interests of the people and integrity of Pakistan. Witter as political analyst tried to explain the impact of the death of Benazir Bhutto on the international political development as she was internationally well known political personality and leader of the very important country of the south Asian region. In the line of the investigation journalism it is not easy task to collect the evidences and assembled them to make the interrelation and produced the results especially in the states like Pakistan where rate of risk to life of the journalist increased, the effort of the writer in no doubt very admirable. . in the end of his book he make very serious efforts to discuss the mystery of Benazir Bhutto killing but has not compared it with the mysterious killings of the Gandhi family in India and political killings in any other country.

Bhutto, B. (2009). *Daughter of the Destiny*. New York: HarperCollins describe a historical story of the life of very famous politicians and woman political leader of

Pakistan Benazir Bhutto, who was daughter of first elected prime minister of Pakistan Zulfikar Ali Bhutto. In her autobiography she told a story of an uncommon passion and courage. Benazir Bhutto no doubt was brilliant, gorgeous lady and her life was unavoidably attached to her nation of 200 million people. She served the people of Pakistan in different capacities as leader of the Pakistani people against martial law regime of General Zia Ul Haq, opposition leader of Pakistan in National assembly and prime minister of Pakistan. Benazir Bhutto in her auto biography tells the story of girl who fought fight of democracy against curliest dictator of Pakistan history and who bring about the democracy in Pakistan afer long restrictions on the political process in the country. Being a member of the elite class, she had moderate posture in the international community and she was who is liked with the idea of service for the poor and lower class development and betterment of this class. She passed through many difficult periods in which she experienced betrayals and killing of her father and removing from power unconstitutionally. This book has very important data and is also very informative in different domestic and international issues. As an auto biography this book is one sided picture and need to be researched for many developments in the political story of a family.

Research Methodology; Collection of data in any research study is very important. Type of data and techniques of the data collection are dependent on the nature of the study. In this study secondary data is used to present the insight investigation of the facts of the politics of Pakistan people's party after the death of Benazir Bhutto. To present the historical facts the historical model of research are applied and in this study to make an analysis of the personality and leadership role of Benazir Bhutto and impact of her death on the future of PPP descriptive model with analytical techniques of the research methodology are used. Methods of research are depended on the nature of the studies. The nature of this study needs an analytical and descriptive approach for the observation that can lead to the testing of the hypothesis. The objectives of the studies are very important to understand the importance of the study. The objectives of this study are as under

1. To find the impact of the absence of Benazir Bhutto on the politics of Pakistan.
2. To analyze the importance of leadership of Benazir Bhutto for PPP.
3. To discuss the challenges faced by Pakistan people's party after Benazir.

Background

Pakistan people's party took birth On September 16, 1967, when Zulfikar Ali Bhutto with Jalaluddin Akbar Rahim met at the residence of the Rasul Baksh Talpur and announced the formation of a new political party. The foundation of the

Pakistan people's party took place beneath the unprecedented tyrannical military dictatorship of Ayub Khan. First convention of the party was forced to residence of Doctor Mubashir Hassan in place of any public place. Zulfikar Ali Bhutto made efforts to make Pakistan people's party a main stream political force and it emerged and wins its first general election in 1971. After the debacle of Dhaka in 1971 political realm of Pakistan went in the hands of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto. His popularity made the conspirators his enemy and he was overthrown by military dictator in 1977 and hanged in political trail in 1979. The supporters of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto were attracted to the Pakistan people's party because he was promising them of better life condition with Roti, Kapra and Makan and justified distribution of resources of the country and democratic political system. Charismatic personality of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto made the people his faithful as they are still supporting his party despite the fact Pakistan people's party could not deliver according to his promises. (Jalal, 2014, p. 134) New generation of its supporters is not such faithful as Pakistan people's party had no more Zulfikar Ali Bhutto and his daughter Benazir Bhutto

After the judicial murder of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, his daughter Benazir Bhutto led the party. That was very oppressive period as cruelest dictatorship of Pakistan history was crushing any political and social struggle with iron hand but the daughter of Bhutto was confidently challenging him. She also managed to win the general election in 1989 that took place after the horrible death of General Zia Ul Haq, killer of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto. She proved that despite the twelve brutal years of military dictator full of efforts to demolished Pakistan people's Party and name of Bhutto from the political scene of the country, Pakistan people's Party was still living with drastic support of the people of Pakistan. The military establishment was not quite happy with Pakistan people's Party back in power and they did not accepted the decision of the people and started conspiracies against her government and refused to hand over full fledged powers to her. They had fixed their pawn in structure and using him overthrow second elected government of Pakistan people's Party in 1991. She did not lose the heart when military establishment managed to fix another pawn at the seat of prime minister. Two military pawns could not work together and ultimately Pakistan people's Party got a chance to win back in power in 1993 elections. (Chitkara, 1996, p. 14) This time establishment again refused to trust her and continuously maneuvered to weaken her government and ultimately she was overthrown again by her own comrade in presidential seat. Pakistan people's Party had played role as opposition party and its leader Benazir Bhutto faced self imposed exile from 1998 to 2007. Benazir Bhutto leded Pakistan people's party as unchallengeable leader till her death in December 2007 and after her death Pakistan people's party handed over to his widow Asif Ali Zardari and son Bilawal Bhutto Zardari. Pakistan people's Party is facing leadership crisis Of course, as there are

more politically educated and urban supporters. Pakistan people's Party's traditional ideology is still attractive for them but there is large number of its supporters demanding some political and economic achievements. (Haqqānī & Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, 2005, p. 167)

Death of Benazir Bhutto

Death of Benazir Bhutto from the Pakistan people's party prospective was greater below than the death of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto. Because after the death of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto party had his successor from Bhutto family in the profile of his daughter to lead but after the death of Benazir Bhutto the direct line of successor from Bhutto family had broken. People of Pakistan paid tribute to the sacrifice of Benazir Bhutto by polling vote to her party in 2008. Pakistan people's party won the election of 2008 just by getting the sympathy vote due to the sudden death of their beloved leader Benazir Bhutto. Despite the fact Pakistan people's party was in hand of Benazir Bhutto's widow Asif Ali Zardari who had no good words of people of Pakistan, PPP won the elections just as a Farwell to the Benazir Bhutto. Benazir Bhutto was popular leader of the Pakistan when she returned from the exile in 2007. (Vohra, 2013, p. 370) This fact was proved when people after her death never changed their minds and voted to her party if she would be alive she would have won the landslide victory. Who was not happy from her returned in politics and who was not ready to see her back on driving seat of Pakistan remained unanswered questions along with the question that who remained beneficiary of her death? Her murder case was challenge for the government of her political heirs but they remained failing in. there was a will waved in hands of her widow according to that will she handed over the party to her widow Asif Ali Zardari as regent and her son Bilawal Zardari . Bilawal was become chairman of Pakistan People's party and his father as co-chairman of the party till the Bilawal Zardari reach to age. (In Jaffrelot, 2016, p. 74) Bilawal Zardari was renamed to Bilawal Bhutto Zardari just because of the Bhutto family name as people have sympathy for this political family.

Pakistan people's party as political force does not desire to push back Pakistan into 90s so that this is the primary incentive that has inspired Asif Ali Zardari as co-chairman Pakistan people's party. Asif Ali Zardari as president of Pakistan passionately follows his policy of reconciliation hindering out the politics of vengeance in military long run country. PPP Co-chairman Asif Ali Zardari also follows the policy of reconciliation after his end of tenure and setting in opposition towards Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif government. The reconciliation policy of PPP has created a vacuum in political atmosphere of the country which let emergence of Pakistan Tehreek Insaf. In the presence of the Benazir Bhutto it could not be possible for any other political personality to get the space of Pakistan people's party as Imran Khan exploited Pakistan people's party reconciliation policy and characterized

them as Pakistan Muslim League-N's 'b team' and also a governmental friendly opposition. In the presence of Benazir Bhutto Pakistan People's Party would never ever be in such condition. (Paul, 2014, p. 77) Pakistan People's party needed serious and foresighted leadership to bring it out from the indulgence of the rejection.

Pakistan's problematic political landscape

Pakistan is politically immature country as its political parties are weak, dominated by key personalities and having dynastic touch of rule, such situation can be said regrettable. This improbable and problematic state of affairs is being seen as it as in the next coming decade. This is because of military successful interventions in the past to corner the major political parties of Pakistan and its effort to promote favoritism in the political parties. For the political parties of Pakistan to regain what little institutional capacity it will take some time as it was denied before by the military. It is right to explain that the current political problems in Pakistan are not new as the political parties of the countries have historically been measurable. Pakistan military has never provided the space for freedom of political activities and freedom of expression in the public and instead exposed their weaknesses. All the military dictators of the country formed their own political groups or help the politicians to act on their behalf and presented themselves the real men of words. By managing the political parties and handling them in their own interest they never forget to expose them and use them against the interest of the people so that no one can become ready to believe on them in the coming future. (Jaffrelot&Schoch, 2015, p. 337) Ayub khan carved out the convention Muslim league from the corpse of All Pakistan Muslim League whereas General Zia also established Pakistan Muslim league under the leadership of Mohammad Khan Junejo from the rejected functions of the Pakistan Muslim league Convention and Pakistan Muslim League Counsel. Both of these parties deliberately appropriated the name of the Pakistan movement, leading party Muslim league that founded Pakistan. General Pervez Musharraf, who take over in 1999 also formed his own likely hood political party under Chuhdharies of Gujarat and selected the Pakistan Muslim league as his target and gathered the politicians under the banner of Pakistan Muslim League Qaid e Azam. Pakistan political arena has representation of Islamist parties actively taking part in electoral politics and drawing the attention of west. Electoral support of these parties never crossed the one fifth of the total vote but they always remain a threat to the west and civilized world. There are now five principal political parties in Pakistan and two main Islamist parties. With the exception of the Pakistan Tehreek Insaf (PTI) and Jamat-e Islami (JI), these parties have similar weaknesses. Excluding these two parties all parties are run by the dynastic right of succession and depending upon the political personalities and have to democratic spirit within them. Pakistan Tehreek Insaf is also categorized with Pakistan people's party, Pakistan Muslim League-N and

the Muttehida quami movement (MQM) as all these parties are referred as tightly held by the key political personalities. None of these parties are democratically organized with the exception of Pakistan Tehreek Insaf and Jamat-e Islami. All political parties distribute the party tickets according to loyalty for their parties and families and personalities leading the parties rather than an individual's political struggle or ability to manage the government business. In all the political parties it is norm that all the decisions come from the party secretariats in which party constituencies had no representation. In discussing the political parties' manifestoes none of the party is trying to differentiate them from the others as all partyqws444In discussing the political parties' manifestoes non of the party is trying to differentiate them from the others as all party have same of it. (Ullah, 2013, p.75) In all the political parties there is no policy support research to elaborate the policies for the problems of the country and people of Pakistan. Pakistan has lack of a research institute to formulate the policies for the foreign and internal affairs. Pakistan has multi political system and numbers of political parties are regionally based and without national level agenda to promote. This is true of Pakistan people's party is only party having strong political foots in all the federating unites of the federation of Pakistan. In PPP representation of the local castes, clans, ethnicities other entities are existing and the interests of the people from all walk of life are included. Political leaders of all the parties are more interested in the future of their parties instead of the Pakistan and people of Pakistan. All regional political parties are focusing just only the regional interests and preferring the provincial and regional interests over the national interests of the country. In formation of the collation governments political parties never hesitated in the power sucking attitude instead of providing best available talent to serve the nation. Pakistan people's party and the Pakistan Muslim League-N have history to face the army interventions and destabilization of the sitting governments. The army of Pakistan never hesitated to intervene whenever it find necessary to do so and interrupted the political process of change. Acceptance from the people of Pakistan and negligence of the political parties always provided the space to army and army never rejected the ideas to rush in. lack of the leadership qualities in the political leadership never allowed the civilian supremacy over this institution excluding the period of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto. (Fair & Watson, 2015, p. 138) The result of this political history people of Pakistan hardly ever been allowed to be a judge to justified the politicians through the exercise of their right of the ballot box in free and fair elections. Politicians of the country never have thought to be an accountable to the people of Pakistan through elections.

Emergence of PTI a challenge for PPP after Benazir Bhutto

Pakistan Tehreek Insaf had started its journey of politics since 1996. It was a very small party when they led the foundation of Pakistan Tehreek Insaf that was based on the slogan of justice, peace, and humanity. When they started their journey they represented their self as anti-status quo against the existing political parties of Pakistan. Other political parties were family enterprises while Pakistan Tehreek Insaf chief claimed that this party belongs directly to the people, Imran Khan claimed that no one of his family member will benefit from them if they come to power. In 1997 in first general elections, Imran Khan was contesting elections on the seven national assembly seats. Pakistan Tehreek Insaf was not able to secure any seat in the national assembly. Pakistan Tehreek Insaf got around 314,820 votes nationwide and it was 1.7 % of total and in the second general elections in 2002, only chairman of Pakistan Tehreek Insaf Imran Khan succeed to enter in the national assembly. Imran Khan supported Pervez Musharraf in his referendum because he came up with the slogan of accountability of corrupt politicians. Imran Khan has always been criticized as he supported Pervez Musharraf during the referendum in the country. ("Comparative Studies and Regionally-Focused Cases Examining Local Governments," 2016, p. 272) In 2007, when emergency was declared in Pakistan, Pakistan Tehreek Insaf protested against it with the full force and eventually Imran Khan got house arrested. Movement for the restoration of the judiciary helped Pakistan Tehreek Insaf to portray their soft image. Pakistan Tehreek Insaf was able to introduce their ideology in front of the people. Pakistan Tehreek Insaf boycotted the elections of 2008. Pakistan Tehreek Insaf got the fame after they conducted the huge rally in 2011 as large number of young blood from schools, colleges, and universities attended this rally. It was the first time that Pakistan Tehreek Insaf was showing their street power and entered into the mainstream politics. Number of politicians joined Pakistan Tehreek Insaf and it emerged as a strong contender. Main focus of Pakistan Tehreek Insaf during the campaign of elections 2013 was on transparency, end of war on terror, accountability, reforms in the system, and institutional empowerment. Pakistan Tehreek Insaf presented itself as anti-status quo and third force in politics. Pakistan Tehreek Insaf attracted large number of youth and urban middle class. Pakistan Tehreek Insaf changed the dimensions of Pakistani politics. Imran Khan was the first leader after the Zulfikar Ali Bhutto that attracted the youth with their participation in politics. Conventional politics of Pakistan were mostly based on the individual electable, groups, biradaris, Imran Khan challenged the status quos of dynastic politics to some extent. It never happened in the elections history of Pakistan that young men and women from urban middle class campaigning for the candidates. Pakistan Tehreek Insaf successfully reattached the youth and middle class to the political system. In elections 2013; Pakistan Tehreek Insaf gave 25% of its

party tickets to the youth. Pakistan Tehreek Insaf introduced new faces into politics by giving 80% of its party tickets to new candidates. Political jalsas and rallies were famous in Pakistan for their boring speeches and low public interest. Pakistan Tehreek Insaf changed the whole concept of political rallies. Patriotic national songs, participation of families, activism of youth are the part and bundle of politics of new era. Imran Khan Came into politics with charismatic personality and ran the political campaign all over the Pakistan like Zulfikar Ali Bhutto of PPP. Pakistan Tehreek Insaf succeeded to mobilize large number of voters on Election Day and total turnout was 55%, which was highest in the elections history of Pakistan. Imran Khan came into politics with struggle of 17 years of political wilderness. He started new trends in conventional politics and challenged the forces of status quo. Neither the conventional political parties nor the voters took him serious, but at last Pakistan Tehreek Insaf emerged as national party and took second highest vote in elections 2013. (Singer, 2015, p. 162) Unconventional politics of Pakistan Tehreek Insaf changed the traditional politics of dynastic party leaders. Political awakening and activism specially form the youth challenged the old structure of politics in Pakistan. Reforms in health, education, police, and revenue departments were never been top priority of the leaders. After the elections Pakistan Tehreek Insaf took the charge of government in KPK, Pakistan Tehreek Insaf is trying to introduce more progressive reforms in police revenue, health, and education sectors. Now there is an environment of competition between parties which is healthy sign for the democracy in Pakistan. Pakistan people's party emerged from the post-1971 Pakistan as the dominant political party. It has been and remains most firmly rooted among the dominant feudal landlords of rural Sindh. It is the only party that enjoys national standing, although some observers believe that it is becoming more regional following Benazir Bhutto's death. While Pakistan people's party has often purported to have solid "left of center" credentials, it has formed alliances with religious parties when needed. Its founder, Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, actually pioneered the islamization of Pakistan by outlawing alcohol and gambling, declaring the Ahmediyas to be non-Muslim, and by deliberately cultivating cultural ties with Arab states after the loss of Bangladesh in 1971. (Jalal, 2014, p.134) Underscoring the dynastic rather than democratic organization of the party, Benazir Bhutto took over after her father's assassination.

When Bhutto's last will and testament was read following her assassination, she declared that the reins of the party should fall to her college age son, Bilawal Bhutto Zardari. While he completes his studies, the effective leadership of the party fell to her widower Asif Ali Zardari. The party leadership is likely to be successfully transferred to her son, intimating that little is likely to change in Pakistan's largest, most national party over the course of the next decade. After the death of Benazir Bhutto Pakistan people's party secured sympathy votes across the country and form government in center and Sindh along with collation government in KPK. (DeVotta,

2016, p. 44) In 2013 Pakistan People's Party lost the center government but remain successful in Sindh where once again it formed its government.

2008 General Elections

General elections were held on 18 February 2008, in which the PPP (Pakistan people's party) polled the highest votes and won the most seats. On 23 March 2008, president Musharraf said an "era of democracy" had begun in Pakistan and that he had put the country "on the track of development and progress". On 22 March, the Pakistan people's party named former parliament speaker Syed Yusuf Raza Gilani as its candidate for the country's next prime minister, to lead a coalition government united against him. Ever since the 2008 elections, the party has been on a sharp decline in Punjab. In terms of seats in the Punjab assembly, the Pakistan people's party ranks fourth with seven seats, behind the Pakistan Muslim League-N (305 seats), Pakistan Tehreek Insaf (26 seats) and even Pakistan Muslim League-Q (09 seats). The party's abysmal performance in the 2013 general and provincial elections as well this year's local body polls in Punjab only reflect how deep the rot has set in. Not long ago, the Pakistan people's party used to receive good sums in application fees from prospective party ticket aspirants. Not this time though, as the party could not field its candidates on a number of seats for chairmen, most of the old guards preferred to contest independently instead because they fancied their chances as independent candidates. (Hasnat, 2011, p. 65) In Lahore alone, of the total 274 seats of chairmen, the Pakistan people's party fielded 80 and managed to secure one city constituency. This shows where the party of the Bhutto's now stands in Lahore, a city that was once its citadel. To reverse the tide, there is consensus among most office-bearers from all districts of Punjab that now is the right time for the Pakistan people's party to shun its policy of reconciliation towards the Pakistan Muslim League-N. ("Comparative Studies and Regionally-Focused Cases Examining Local Governments," 2016, p.274) And yet, while this might prove to be a necessary step, it is merely the tip of the iceberg.

PPP Performance since 2008-2013

Pakistan people's party had managed some of these achievements when it came into power after the 2008 election of the country just after the death of Benazir Bhutto.

NFC Award

Pakistan people's party had managed national finance award for Pakistan i federation and all provinces were receiving their rights equally. A significant success of the coalition government of Pakistan people's party was the announcement of seventh national finance commission award. In this award the share of provinces was improved in the federal revenue for the provinces. The issue of NFC Award, which was lingering on for the last 19 years, had been resolved with unanimity and accommodating approach of the provinces. ("Pakistan," 2013, p. 418)All the more, four chief ministers and federal representative- minister for finance, had shown much needed understanding and accrued statesmanship to arrive at an acceptable resource sharing formula between federating units and the federal government & amongst the four provinces.

Reaching out Baluchistan

Pakistan people's party government under new leadership focused the politically neglected areas and managed to reach out to Baluchistan. The package of aghaz-e-Haqooq-e-Baluchistan for development of Baluchistan was appreciated initially but latter on it proved as empty slogan. The crisis of Baluchistan remained unsolved during the government of Pakistan people's party and no practical steps were raised to solve the issues of Baluchistan.(Rita Malhotra, 2015, p. 15) There was a lack of vision and capacity in the Zardari government that was the reason no good effort was attempted to heal the blooded wounds of the people of Baluchistan.

Khyber PakhtunKhwa

In the government of Pakistan people's party the name of N.W.F.P (North western Frontier Province) was changed on the demand of the people of the province. N.W.F.P was renamed as KPK (Khyber-PakhtunKhwa) a name identifying the living ethnic group of the province, excluding the Hazara community of this province. This community rejected the proposed name and demanded that they are not Pakhtun so they should be given their own province Hazara by cutting the size of this

province.(DeVotta, 2016, p. 44) But this decision was appreciated by overall population.

Meaningful legislations

Pakistan people's party government after Benazir Bhutto's death managed to pass the some meaningful legislation for the Pakistan, such as the organ donors act. Constitutional reforms, including restoration of 1973 constitutions in its original form, enactment of the 18th, 19th and 20th amendments which provided provincial autonomy, transfer of presidential powers to parliament of Pakistan, smooth setting up of caretaker governments and striking down article 52, 2B of president's power to dissolve the National Assembly (DeVotta, 2016, p. 44)

Constitution empowerment of Gilgit-Baltistan

It may be mentioned that the first major administrative, judicial and political reforms were introduced and Jagirdari system abolished in 1975 during the government of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto. Further democratization of the area was effected during the government of Benazir Bhutto through the Northern Areas Legal Framework Order 1994. The third installment of major reforms order was signed by President Asif Ali Zardari, The name of the Northern Areas of Pakistan has been Gilgit -Baltistan. Gilgit -Baltistan Consolidated Fund and the annual budget would be presented to the Assembly and voted upon as per practice in vogue in other Provinces in the country. Gilgit-Baltistan now has an elected Legislative Assembly which would elect the Chief Minister and a Governor to be appointed by the President on the advice of the Prime Minister. It has its own Public Service Commission a Chief Election Commissioner and an Auditor General, The Chief Minister elected by the Legislative Assembly has assisted by six Minister and two Advisors. (In Parker & In Vaughan-Williams, 2014, p. 370) The Legislative Assembly has twenty four (24) members who have been elected directly besides six women and three technocrats' seats. It has powers to make laws on sixty one subjects

Reconciliation in politics

As started by Benazir Bhutto signing charter of democracy with his political rivals Pakistan people's party after forming government in center and in Sindh had adopted politics of reconciliation and no political victimization policy. The policy of reconciliation with the opposition parties of the president Asif Ali Zardari strengthened the democracy in Pakistan. Pakistan people's party showed enough political maturity to save the democracy. Politics of reconciliation of Zardari became

a deterrent against the martial law. PML (n) and other major parties of the parliament supported the policy of co-existence. In spite of all this political tug of war and political bickering remained the part of the game. (Burki, 2014, p.430)In this atmosphere, Pakistan people's party government enjoyed full friendly opposition.

Abolition of Concurrent List

Concurrent list in constitution of Pakistan was hurdle in the autonomy of the provinces which was unanimously amended to provide more powers in the hands of federating units of Pakistan. Abolition of concurrent list of the Constitution has ensured provincial autonomy to provinces, "devolution of ministries including environment, health, education, agriculture, sports, food, women development, labor and manpower, minority's affairs and others is a great step to make federating units more autonomous". PPP leadership of President Asif Ali Zardari had taken historical steps to implement 18th Amendment into the Constitution in order to shun difference between provinces and for the best interest of the country and nation.(Jaffrelot&Schoch, 2015, p. 184)

Ouster of General Musharraf

First time in history political leadership of Pakistan people's party managed ouster of a general in a peaceful manner from politics as general Musharraf resign by political pressure. On 7 august 2008, the Pakistan people's party and the Pakistan Muslim league (n) decided to force Musharraf to step down and set in motion his impeachment. Asif Ali Zardari and Mian Muhammad Nawaz Sharif announced sending a formal demand or joint charge sheet that he step down, and impeach him through parliamentary process upon refusal. Musharraf refused to step down. A charge-sheet had been drafted, and was to be presented to parliament. It included Musharraf first attack of power in 1999,at the expense of Nawaz Sharif, the PML(n)'s leader, whom Musharraf imprisoned and exile and his second last November, when he declared an emergency as a means to get re-elected president. The charge-sheet also listed some of Musharraf contributions to the "war on terror. On 11 august, the government summoned the national assembly. Pervez Musharraf had to resign on 18 august 2008, under the political pressure of opposition parties and coalition government and thus Musharraf era came to an end. Musharraf, who took control of Pakistan in a bloodless coup d'état in 1999 against a elected political party and was considered the most powerful dictator and a close ally of America especially after the incident of 9/11, was thrown out by the elected political powers in the general elections 2008.(Ishiyama, 2012, p. 163)

Benazir Income Support Program

If one sees some best welfare projects in Pakistan that help needy person at their door step then one never forget Benazir income support programme which was started in the memorial service of Pakistan peoples' party leader Benazir Bhutto. To overcome the problem of poverty and to address the economic issues of deprived people of the country, the Zardari government started Benazir income support programme, Benazir stock option scheme and waseela-e-haq scheme. A suitable financial relief was granted to the poor women. Although these efforts were not according to the expectations of the people but in spite of this a valuable impact was made by these schemes. ("Resolutions," 2014, p. 47) During the government led by Pakistan people's party under the command of Zardari, the salaries of the civil employees and armed forces were increased in each and every budget. In the PML-N government this programme is permitted to continue after 2013 elections.

Reinstatement Of Politically Victimized Employees

The sacked employees reinstatement act 2010 aimed to provide relief to over 9,000 government employees in 25 federal ministries and allied departments, who were inducted during the previous regime of Pakistan people's party (Pakistan people's party), and then terminated in the following government of Pakistan Muslim league-Nawaz (PML-N). The ordinance will apply to those employees who were sacked after the dismissal of the Benazir Bhutto government in Nov 1996. They had been recruited between Nov 1993 and Nov 1996 during the Pakistan people's party's third stint in power. ("Reinstatement of sacked employees," 2012, p. 01)

Free And Independent Judiciary

The general elections of February 18, 2008 raised hopes of a new beginning; everyone started talking about the agenda before the new government. Discussions between citizens are reflective of their wishes and hopes and debate on revival of the constitution and the judiciary had dominated the parleys and had emerged as a major theme both in public and intellectual level debates. At least two aspects of this discussion were needed to be understood: the meaning and significance of the much-repeated slogan "restoration and independence of the judiciary"; and how the nation might get rid of the menace of constitutional deviations. Pakistan people's party government from 2008 to 2013 had been trying for the free functioning of judiciary and sacrifices their Prime Minister Yusuf Raza Gilani (Suba & In Chari, 2014, p. 15).

Chairman Of The Accountability Committee From Opposition

Pakistan peoples' party government changed the rule of business in assemblies and allowed the opposition parties to make opposition leaders as chairman of the accountability committee of National and provincial assemblies for the checks on the governments funds and practices. (Sayed, 2014, p. 05)

President Surrendered His Power First Time In The Constitutional History Of Pakistan

The president Asif Ali Zardari said in an all party's conference that committee would be framed to revisit the 17th amendment and the article 58(2) b. He fulfilled his promise in 2010 when the 18th amendment was passed by the parliament. Co chairman of Pakistan people's party after assuming the office of president of Pakistan voluntarily surrendered his presidential powers to parliament of Pakistan and become formal head of the state accordingly to parliamentary form of governments. (Fair, 2014, p263)

Operation In Swat And Waziristan Against Terrorists

Needless to say that Pakistan was facing with extremely challenging events and was passing through one of its worst critical phases in mid 2008, due to insane extremism but the democratic government of Pakistan people's party had left no stone unturned in restoring order and calm in the country. Terrorists in FATA and adjacent areas were defeated in actions that required much courage while in most of the areas of FATA war against terrorism continues unabated. At the other end, Pakistan people's party collective response remained apt and quick in rescuing and providing relief to the internally displaced persons IDPs victims. (Rashid, 2012, p. 117) Tough and clear stances against terrorism and operation in swat despite opposition by Taliban and pro-Taliban political and religio-political parties along with military operation in tribal areas were very important steps of Pakistan peoples' party government.

Powerful And Independent Parliament

Prime ministers from Pakistan people's party always remained in touch with parliament and made efforts to discuss every matter in parliament and presence of prime minister in each session provide powers to parliament as sole independent institution of peoples. (Fair & Watson, 2015, p. 142) In all the national level issues government of Pakistan People's party tried to discuss them in parliament.

Empowering the Workers through Employees Stock Schemes and Worker Unions

A number of steps were taken by the Pakistan people's party government for welfare of the people of Pakistan employees and worker class. Some of them are as resumption of trade union activities, distribution of shares among 500,000 industrial workers, cheap tractors to farmers through Benazir tractor scheme, increase rural economy from 50 billion in 2008 to 800 billion rupees in 2013. (Khan, 2010, p. 578) Encouraging youth in politics through lifting ban on student unions

Agricultural Reforms

There are number of important decisions and steps taken by the Pakistan people's party government to mitigate sufferings of the people despite terrorism in the country. Record increase in wheat production, increase in salaries of government officials up to 158 percent, disbursement of RS 70 billion among 7.5 million deserving families through the Benazir income support programmed and financial help to 135,000 deserving people by Pakistan baitulmaal. (Ali, 2015, p. 51)

Economic Revival

Pakistan people's party in government made economical revival through a number of important projects, e.g., the Pakistan- Iran agreement on the gas pipeline, agreement with china on Gwadar port to make it operational, increase in foreign exchange reserves from \$6 billion in 2008 to \$16 billion in 2013, increase in export from \$18 billion in 2008 to \$29 billion in 2012, boost in stock market from 5,220 points in 2008 to 18,185 points in 2013 and reduction in interest rate from 17 percent in 2008 to 9 percent in 2013. These measures will have a long term healthy effect on the economy. The floods have caused colossal devastation and loss leaving the economy in tatters by razing large portions of the infra-structure to the ground besides causing loss of tens of thousands of precious lives. But with the support of our civil society and international community, the government of Pakistan had effectively managed to rescue delivering instant relief to the hapless people. The government had been successful in inviting the attention of domestic and international donors towards the bitter situation of flood-hit areas and its victims instead of paying any heed to negative propaganda. Strategies were being chalked out for the early recovery and rehabilitation of the affected people. The overwhelming response both in cash and kind, offered by the international community as international assistance to the democratic government of Pakistan to handle this record calamity was an appropriate response to those who raised misleading questions about credibility and trust. (Haqqānī, 2013, p. 178) It was this show of confidence and trust in the government of Pakistan by the people and the international community, which had forced enemies of democracy to dredge up a frivolous debate which was not conducive at such a crucial juncture of the country.

Freedom of Press in Pakistan People's Party Government

Print and electronic media were deadly against the Pakistan people's party government. They enjoyed entire freedom of expression against the bad governance of government. Zardari government adopted the policy of tolerance and no action against media. There was complete freedom of press to criticize the government and no media house was under pressure or under the obliged policy during the Pakistan people's party in government. ("Issue Information - Title Page," 2016, p. 29)

Completing the Five Years Term of National Assembly

From 1947 to 2013 only one times in the history of 66 years the civilian government of Pakistan people's party succeeded to complete the tenure of five years. However, several questions arise regarding the poor performance of the most corrupt government of Zardari and pm Yusuf Raza Gilani. Economic hardships, terrorism, energy crisis, corruption and bad situation of law and order were the results of the civilian government during these five years. People have to tolerate all these abuses of the government just for the sake of democracy. No positive change in the socio, economic and political conditions of the people was observed during tenure of civilian government. (Balkhi, n.d., p. 42)

Foreign Policy of Pakistan People's Party after Benazir

The president Asif Ali Zardari once in his speech declared the violation of the sovereignty of Pakistan would not be tolerated at any cost. But on other hand, the NATO forces in Afghanistan continued to launch drone attacks in Pakistan. According to some media reporters that drone attacks were being launched with the consent of the government of Pakistan. During the government of Pakistan people's party, foreign nations continued to interfere in the internal politics of Pakistan and Zardari government failed to tackle them. The president Asif Ali Zardari also made a strong commitment to improve the bilateral relationship with India by new measures and initiatives taken for good ties. PPP government started cross-loc trade as a pioneering CBM in Kashmir. But practically, no real and sincere effort was taken by the both neighboring states. Tension increased on borders and more military forces were deployed across the border especially by India after the Bombay attacks. This situation created more hurdles for people to people contacts and traveling. After the Bombay attack, the traveling by air or by road became more difficult between the two countries. Unnecessary hurdles and restrictions were imposed by the Indian side and Zardari government could adopt any policy to normalize the tension. No progress was reported to resolve the Kashmir issue and the Indus water head works. (In Jaffrelot, 2014, p. 18) After losing 2013 elections PPP leadership especially Bilawal Bhutto starting to use strong language in public rallies of Kashmir elections campaign on Kashmir issue.

2013 Election on PPP Five Years Performance

The Pakistan People's Party (PPP) is one of the most influential liberal political parties in the last sixty-nine years. This time it has faced one of its worst defeats in

the elections. Despite being the first civilian government to complete its full five-year tenure, it has failed to win the confidence of the electorate. No other political party suffered as much as the PPP in the recent parliamentary elections. It has barely managed to emerge as the second largest party with 31 seats in the National Assembly. It has retained its stranglehold only in Sindh. Does this imply the beginning of the end of the PPP as a mainstream political party? Will the PPP boil down to just being a regional party?(Afzal&Considine, 2014, p. 132)

PPP's Performance: An Analysis in 2013

This year the PPP has bagged only 65, 6 and 3 seats in the Sindh, Punjab and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Provincial Assemblies. In Baluchistan it could not get even a single one. In the 2008 elections, the PPP, led by Asif Ali Zardari, secured 97 National Assembly seats. After getting 24 reserved seats for women and four reserved seats for minorities, the total number of National Assembly seats for the PPP were 124 in a house of 340. The party formed a coalition government with the help of the Awami National Party (ANP) and the Muttahida Qaumi Movement (MQM) and JUI-F. After surveying the given statistics, one may note the percentage of seats won by the PPP in comparison to 2008 elections. There is a significant drop in percentage of acquiring seats by the PPP. For instance, in a city like Lahore, there is a drop by 22 per cent. Again, in Peshawar, the deterioration can be marked up to 30 percent.(Afzal&Considine, 2014, p.134)

Setting aside the emergence of Pakistan Tehreek Insaf as a popular political force in 2013 elections there are a number of other causes which led towards poor performance of PPP. At top most there was an impact on the PPP leadership after former Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto was assassinated in 2007. Moreover, President Zardari's corruption case is also in the open. The Pakistan People's Party's chairman, Bilawal, son of Benazir Bhutto and President Zardari, could not lead his party's election campaign due to security threats. The Taliban had openly threatened to assassinate him. Bhutto's election campaign was limited to video messages which he occasionally sent from Dubai. Secondly, Pakistan is facing a shortage of over 6000 megawatts of electricity. There has been an absence of a comprehensive energy strategy, as well as a lack of political will to implement unpopular changes. The PPP-led coalition was so heavily plagued with corruption and inefficiency, especially noticeable in the rental power projects, that despite doubling the electricity prices, there was an increase in losses. There was a problem of insufficient revenue to support energy generation, along with low liquidity and high rates of tax default. The leadership assured that the energy crisis would be controlled some six months before the general election but it failed to fulfill its promise. Thirdly the PPP never fanned provincialism to gain political mileage. Despite reservations towards the poll

results and the process of counting, their leaders accepted the projected outcome. Also, the selection of candidates within the PPP, in certain regions, like Karachi, was not ethnic or merit-based. Ethnic diversity being an important factor in Pakistan, the PPP did not pay much heed to it. Lastly, for Yusuf Raza Gilani, vice-chairman of the PPP, the party was reluctant to contest the elections itself but President Asif Ali Zardari rejected the idea. For Gilani, more than differences with leadership, reorganization of the party was necessary. On the other hand, PML-N was campaigning for the charismatic Nawaz Sharif, who is also an experienced Prime Minister. In other words, there was a lack of star performers to represent the PPP. (In Looney, 2014, p. 379-380) Finally the inability to address the increasing violence in the country became a reason for the electorate not to support the PPP. Even during the religious ritual months, law and order was not in control when the PPP was in power. This annoyed the electorate. Being an Islamist country, Pakistan has sentimental attachments to the cause of violence by the extremists.

Malfunxions of Pakistan People's Party Government after Benazir Bhutto

Memo-Gate Scandal and Lack of Benazir Bhutto

The memo-gate Scandal was a controversy which became well known as Mullen memo controversy revolves around a memorandum in which Pakistani civilian leadership addressed to Admiral Mike Mullen the American security chief for ostensibly seeking help of the Obama administration in the wake of the raid on Osama bin Laden to turn aside a military takeover of the civilian government in Pakistan. At first civilian government deliberately denied about such memorandum but latterly declared commission to find out the reality. In the judicial commission report the memo, was proved written by ambassador Hussain Haqqani, acting at the behest of President of Pakistan Asif Ali Zardari, contains an offer to strike a secret deal with the United States of America, much like the various secret deals said to have been struck with US by the Musharraf government. The report further claimed that the motive of the memo was to ensure the Americans that the PPP government of Pakistan was its ally. The matter had been brought to light by Mr. Hussain Haqqani's believed messenger, Mansoor Ijaz, an American Pakistani. In the presence of Benazir Bhutto any such letter to US administration was out of question and the defense of PPP government in this case was also lacking her presence when it trailed in media and judicial commission. The memorandum had enclosed a request to convey a "strong, vital and direct message to Pakistani Chief of Army Staff General Ashfaq Pervez Kayani" that communicates American's demand for him and his former Inter-Services Intelligence (ISI) head General Shuja Pasha to "stop their brinkmanship intended at bringing down the civilian Government of Pakistan". (Hasanie, 2013, p. 33-34) This was great below for the political leadership of PPP and no one can imagine from Benazir Bhutto if she would be there.

Abbottabad Operation and Lack of Benazir Bhutto

Whether Osama bin Laden was living in Abbottabad with or without the military's knowledge was a sometime a big question lasting Pakistan. The world community was asking if it should be considered a case of ineffectiveness or mischief on the part of Pakistan. The government of PPP and all other apologists could encourage the military in pursuit of their own agendas but they was not be able to neither satisfy the international community nor force the military establishment to start a corrective mechanism so that, in the future, Osama bin Laden type terrorists kept away from Pakistan. In fact, the political environment of Pakistan had been so 'militarized' that the Abbottabad operation had turned out to be a blessing for the military. Then the military had proved that it was beyond inquiry and would be more confident to do whatever it wishes. (Gul, 2012, p. 12) This simply means was that the Pakistani state was going to worsen further with no self-correcting mechanism in sight under the government of Pakistan people's party without Benazir Bhutto.

Rental Power Scandal

Pakistan People's party former prime minister and that time minister for water and power Raja Pervez Ashraf was accused taking bribe by misusing his authority during his tenure as the minister for water and power to acquire approval from the Economic Coordination Committee (ECC) and the cabinet for an raise in the down payment to the rental power companies from 7 per cent to 14 per cent, that was amounting to about Rs22 billion. (Gul, 2012, p. 13) Such mega corruption scandal defamed the Pakistan people's party.

Other Bade names for PPP

Pakistan people's party government failed to get good fame under Asif Ali Zardari. The stories of corruption were circulating and there were very serious issues of corruption. Pakistan people's party government totally failed to control the corruption and cases of corruption were not only against the common workers of Pakistan people's party; even the prime minister of the Pakistan people's party government was involved in corruption. The stories of nepotism, favoritism and mishandling ruined the infrastructure of state-owned and state-managed corporations. PIA, Pakistan railways, OGRA, WAPDA and oil and gas development corporation were looted pitilessly. The allegations of corruption were against the politicians of high rank. The situation of law and order remained very disturbed especially in the provinces of Sindh, Baluchistan and KPK and these were the provinces where the coalition governments of Pakistan people's party were working. The position of law and order in Punjab, where the PML (n) was ruling under the chief minister shehbaz Nawaz Sharif was much better. The militant wings of MQM, ANP and Pakistan people's party (liyari gang) were involved in the crimes of target killing, bank looting and kidnapping for ransom. Different mafias and

armed gangs started to occupy the territories of Karachi. The government was not in position to snub these armed groups. (International, 2015, p. 23) It was reported a lot of times that leadership of political parties was involved in corruption and target killings.

PPP Overall Bad Performance

The government of Pakistan people's party failed to overcome the load shedding. PPP government under the political leadership of Asif ali Zardari remained fail to solve the problem of energy crisis in the country. Despite the fact of its failure, PPP government completed its term in power along with the term in President Office. Pakistan people's party also could not give satisfactory relief to the victims of floods of 2010. Social sectors like health and education were ignored. Budget deficits reached at the maximum height during the rule of Zardari government and Pakistan people's party government absolutely failed in managing the finances. Pakistan people's party-led government was found in the violation of fiscal discipline and policies, that was why a couple of times the governor of state bank had to give up his job due to serious reservations. Abbottabad incident marked another question mark on the governance of elected government of Zardari. The tall promises of "roti, kapra aur makan" were ignored. Weakened economy, terrorism, threat to federation, devaluation of Pakistan i rupee, sectarianism and racial conflicts, unemployment, price hiking and increasing number of people below the poverty line were the major proofs of ill governance of Pakistan people's party-led government from 2008 to 2013. (In Looney, 2014, p. 379) At the end of her tenure the Pakistan people's party government had nothing any valuable performance in her hands to go to the people for next term.

State Of Denial

Benazir Bhutto was a liberal Muslim of a Harvard and Oxford privileged class, a 'political mother' to millions, the heir to a political dynasty of his father and a warrior against terrorism, a dutiful wife and in the end, perhaps, a true martyr. She was emerged as a political successor of the Zulfikar Ali Bhutto as a woman political leader after Fatima Jinnah. She was strong political leader who had won the fight with military and civil bureaucracy and proved himself a distinguished leader form the others of his age. The poor people of the country are the focus of the Pakistan people's party as the middle class has never become the target of the party. Poor people of Pakistan are composing the majority population of the country and are shinning the chances Pakistan people's party to make a comeback at any time, because the working class of Pakistan love the party of the Bhutto. Zulfikar Ali

Bhutto being a chairman of the party raised the slogan of roti, kapra, makaan and it is still vibrated with them. Pakistan People's party had been given assurance by the senior brass as the poor people will vote for the party but it is surprising that the Pakistan people's party failed to get votes from poor areas of the country during the 2013, by-polls and local bodies elections. People living in the walled city of Lahore are considered the fort of the PPP as party had facilitated them with the living utilities in its charge in government. Seat of the walled city of Lahore was always won by Pakistan people's party but in this election it lost it. When Pakistan people's party has started to lose its pull and much ground in such poor areas of Lahore along with the other parts of Punjab than it has needed to think about the future of party. (Fair & Watson, 2015, p. 223) But while these realities persist, some Pakistan people's party leaders and workers are not ready to believe that the Pakistan people's party was exhausted from Punjab which was center of power for the party and now in the 2013 elections and subsequently hit further lows in local body elections.

Defections in Pakistan people's party

While the Pakistan people's party leadership in Punjab makes the 2013 elections loss seem like a brief blip, what happened thereafter was particularly instructive: a good number of Pakistan people's party stalwarts from different districts of Punjab bid farewell to the party of the Benazir Bhutto's, most of them joining the Pakistan Tehreek Insaf. Prominent among those who left are Shah Mahmud Qureshi (Multan), Sardar Asif Ahmed Ali (Kasur), Jamshad Dasti (Muzaffargarh), Samsam Ali Bukhari (Okara) and Ijaz Virk (Faisalabad). All those who left, Pakistan people's party cited reservations on Zardari policies. While those who joined the Pakistan Tehreek Insaf accused the Pakistan people's party of having become apologists for the Pakistan Muslim League-N. ("Setting house in order: Bilawal to reorganize party in Punjab," 2015, p. 01) Not many saw a future for themselves in the Pakistan people's party because of its dwindling popularity in the province.

Orphaned Pakistan people's party after Benazir Bhutto

Pakistan people's party, after the death of Benazir Bhutto has become an orphaned as when Pakistan is passing through the political transitional period and political dimension of the political parties are rapidly changing every political party has dire need of visionary leadership Pakistan people's party has none of such in this condition. PPP having long history of the visionary leadership since its birth, it has now deprived from this opportunity and missing the need. All political parties are reshaping themselves according to the required political atmosphere including the conservative's parties also. Ideas of the politics are reshaping and political parties are in struggle to reshape themselves according to these ideas. Pakistan people's party after Benazir Bhutto remained absent from the political arena and suffering from the

lack of leadership. In the presence of Benazir Bhutto there was no need of any third political force as he was only well educated and politically trained leader of the country and there was no any other political leader of her caliber in the country and her party was versatile political entity in which all walk of the citizens of the country was member and representatives. ("Pakistan People's Party now a shadow of its glorious past," 2016, p. 07)

PPP Support of Government in rigging protest

Movement against rigging of 2014 was popularity climax of Pakistan Tehreek Insaf and it was also popularity decline for PPP as its support for the Nawaz Sharif's government. During this long political sit in of Imran Khan large number of PPP workers and leaders left PPP and join Pakistan Tehreek Insaf. The role of the army in the last eight years had been pro-democracy despite having reservations about certain issues, both during the PPP's five years and the PML-N's three year. Yet, it seems some politicians were trying to drag the army into politics. In the present political scenario, there was no immediate threat to the government or democracy. Major parties were convinced that the PML-N must be given full chance to complete its tenure, but they believe that the government should not create a situation of pushing the opposition to the wall. Now, one had to wait and see how Khan, Dr Qadri and Sharif's play their cards in near future. Major opposition parties, including the Pakistan Tehreek Insaf, was not very convinced with Dr Qadri's agenda while parties like PPP feel that he was "unfit" for democracy. ("Looming political upheaval," 2016, p. 08) PPP such feelings did not reflect on the common worker and huge number of them left the party.

Karachi targeting killing

2013 was the last year of Pakistan people's party in power and also very horrific for the people of Karachi in which more than thirty two hundred people were killed in the target killing of Karachi city and ultimately earn bad name for the party. When Pakistan people party sworn into the power in 2008 the series of target killing did not reduce. Number of people had been killing from the Gen. Zia Ul Haq era. Target killing became symbol of the Karachi in the media houses and in the PPP ear of power incidents' of the killing increased day by day and reached on the climax when party was going to fight the 2013 election. Lack of Benazir Bhutto was very clear during these years in the Pakistan political life. Number of political workers targeted and killed in different areas of the Karachi and toll was raised to 268 of the political worker killing in the last year of PPP in power. (Encyclopaedia Britannica, inc,

2013, p. 469)Such number of killings was the failure of PPP leadership when they were in center and provincial power.

PPP: Is there a Hope?

Analyzing the electoral political journey of the Pakistan people party after the death of Benazir Bhutto it is very interesting that just after her death, the results of general election 2008 was showing confidence in the party. If the results of the elections in the 2008 were confidence in the party then how the 2013 election's results will be counted, when a party serving in the center and two provinces lost the election in center and can secure only one province. After the defeat in 2013 election Pakistan people's party became inactive from the politics and often side lined specially after the emergence of the Pakistan Tehreek e Insaf in political arena of Pakistan. Being an opposition leading party, Pakistan people's party has become friendly for the government and the role of the opposition has transferred to the PTI. Political leadership of the country has started the drawing rooms politics neglecting the history of the party street politics. Other political forces especially Pakistan Tehreek Insaf has managed to utilized the vacuum created by political attitude of the Pakistan People's Party. Bilawal Bhutto Zardari the only hope of the Pakistan people's party to regain its lost position in the political field and PPP more than one time launched him but without any success. ("fall and rise of the PPP," 2016, p. 09) Results in the by elections, Gilgit Baltistan and Azad Kashmir are discouraging for the people's party. Change atmosphere of the political arena in Pakistan is demanding something more than the Bhutto name with the leadership.

Conclusion

It can be just summarized that Bilawal Bhutto Zardari can revive and bring around the declining, discredited Pakistan People's Party as its chairman. His father Asif Ali Zardari has become President of the party after the death of Makhdum Amin Fahim. Bilawal Zardari Bhutto took the reins of the PPP on December 30, 2007. Someone seriously explain of his too little part in reinforcing the misleading and damaged image of Pakistan People Party. It is difficult of pointing out Bilawal initiatives and vision, his goals and policies to revive Pakistan people's party and instill new spirit into it and file in the presence of his father Asif Ali Zardari who is now the president of the party. Bilawal seems to be totally ignorant of the ground realities and lacks even basic awareness of the national issues. His behavior is passive. His public utterances are confused during election campaigns in Azad Kashmir or by-elections, interspersed with odd and occasional uncalled for outbursts. In short he doesn't have the basic requirements` of a political leader of his age if the Pakistan

People's party is the party of masses and the People then it should abandon the tradition of compromising attitudes. Being popular leader of the country Zulfikar Ali Bhutto the founder of the Pakistan People's party could remain the chief of the party as long as he wanted to be. After the death of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto his succession by Nusrat Bhutto his widow and later by Benazir Bhutto his daughter was done in affection and as a token of alliance with the Bhutto family. On the other end to keep this position of the party within Bhutto family is absolute negation of the manifesto and ideology for which this party was founded. Critically analyzing the facts and ground realities are not in favor of Asif Ali Zardari as head of Pakistan People's party after the death of Benazir Bhutto. Benazir Bhutto was the daughter of outstanding political leader Zulfikar Ali Bhutto who was assassinated in Rawalpindi on 27 December 2007 in mysterious circumstances. According to her suspicious "Will" whose one page had been made public on the death of Benazir Bhutto, Asif Ali Zardari assumed the co-chairmanship of party with his son Bilawal Bhutto as the chairman. After criticism on his role as co-chairman to Bilawal Bhutto he assumed another political office of the president of Pakistan people's party. As a matter of fact Asif Zardari is not from the bloodline of Bhutto family and has no respect for his role in people's party but he is still carrying the grip on party. All the political analysts are describing the fact that until the Bilawal Bhutto with all powers and decision making authorities Pakistan People's party would not be able to manage for revive.

Notes and References

- Afzal, K. A., & Considine, M. (2014). Democratic Accountability and International Human Development: Regimes, institutions and resources.
- Ali, S. M. (2015). Development, poverty, and power in Pakistan: The impact of state and donor interventions on farmers.
- Balkhi, K. A. (n.d.). Pakistan. *The World Guide to CSR: A Country-by-Country Analysis of Corporate Sustainability*, 288-295. doi:10.9774/gleaf.978-1-907643-09-5_42
- Burki, S. J. (2006). *Historical dictionary of Pakistan*. Lanham, Maryland: The Scarecrow Press.
- Chitkara, M. G. (1996). *Benazir, a profile*. New Delhi: APH Pub. Corp.
- DeVotta, N. (2016). *An introduction to South Asian politics*.
- DeVotta, N. (2016). *An introduction to South Asian politics*.
- Esposito, J. L. (2002). *Unholy war: Terror in the name of Islam*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Fair, C. C. (2014). *Fighting to the end: The Pakistan Army's way of war*.
- Fair, C. C., & Watson, S. J. (2015). *Pakistan's enduring challenges*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Gul, I. (2012). *Pakistan before and after Osama*.
- Hasanie, A. A. (2013). *Democracy in Pakistan: Crises, conflicts and hope for a change*. Place of publication not identified: Authorhouse.
- Hasnat, S. F. (2011). *Pakistan*. Santa Barbara, CA: Praeger.
- Ḥaqqānī, H. (2013). *Magnificent delusions: Pakistan, the United States, and an epic history of misunderstanding*.
- Ḥaqqānī, H., & Carnegie Endowment for International Peace. (2005). *Pakistan: Between mosque and military*. Washington, DC: Carnegie Endowment for International Peace.
- Ishiyama, J. T. (2012). *Comparative politics: Principles of democracy and democratization*. Chichester, West Sussex: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Jaffrelot, C. (2016). *Pakistan at the crossroads: Domestic dynamics and external pressures*.
- Jaffrelot, C., & Schoch, C. (2015). *The Pakistan paradox: Instability and resilience*.
- Jalal, A. (2014). *The struggle for Pakistan: A Muslim homeland and global politics*.
- Khan, N. A. (2010). *Beyond crisis: Re-evaluating Pakistan*. London: New York.
- Looney, R. E. (2014). *Handbook of emerging economies*.
- Parker, N., & In Vaughan-Williams, N. (2014). *Critical border studies: Broadening and deepening the 'lines in the Sand' Agenda*.
- Paul, T. V. (2014). *The warrior state: Pakistan in the contemporary world*.

- Rashid, A. (2012). *Pakistan on the brink: The future of America, Pakistan, and Afghanistan*. New York: Viking.
- Rita Malhotra. (n.d.). *Pakistan Baluchistan*. SAGE Series in Human Rights Audits of Peace Processes: Five-Volume S.
- Sayed, S. A. (2014). *Epilepsy: Stigma and Management from Pakistan's Perspective*. MOJ
- Suba, C. D., & In Chari, P. R. (2014). *Armed conflicts in South Asia 2013: Transitions*. *Public Health*, 1(1). doi:10.15406/mojph.2014.01.00006
- Singer, M. (2015). *The anthropology of infectious disease*.
- Ullah, H. K. (2013). *Vying for Allah's vote: Understanding Islamic parties, political violence, and extremism in Pakistan*.
- Vohra, R. (2013). *The making of India: A political history*. Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe.

Periodicals

- Comparative Studies and Regionally-Focused Cases Examining Local Governments*. (2016). doi:10.4018/978-1-5225-0320-0.
- Economic Outlook*.(2008). 32. doi:10.1111/ecol.2008.32.issue-s1
- Encyclopaedia Britannica, inc. (2013). *Britannica Book of the Year 2013*. Chicago.
- International, B. P. (2015). *Doing business and investing in Pakistan: Strategic, practical* .
- Pakistan*. (2013). *Public Administration in South Asia*, 369-370. doi:10.1201/b14759-21
- Resolutions*. (2014). *Report of the human rights council: 21st session (10–28 September and 5 November 2012)*, 13-81. doi:10.18356/8034d506-en
- Remedies of democracy* (2016). *Performance Improvement Quarterly*, 29(2), 89-89. doi:10.1002/piq.21202

Newspapers

- Looming political upheaval*. (2016, October 10). *Express Tribune* [Lahore].
- Pakistan People's Party now a shadow of its glorious past*. (2016, April 9). *Hindustan Time* [Lacknow].
- Reinstatement of sacked employees*. (2012, June 24). *Dawn Newspaper* [Karachi].
- Setting house in order: Bilawal to reorganise party in Punjab*. (2015, July 2). *The Express Tribune* [Lahore].
- The fall and rise of the PPP*. (2016, July 31). *Daily Time* [Karachi].