

Muhammad Asghar*
Muhammad Arshad Rehmani**
Abdul Qadir Mushtaq***

JESUS IS WATCHING: THE RECEPTION OF CHRISTIAN DEVOTIONAL ART IN DOMESTIC SETTINGS

Abstract:

Christian people are less privileged class and considered a poor community in Pakistani society but their dwellings are rich with the population of popular Christian devotional art. This research paper investigates mass-produced modern Christian devotional imagery which is invested with vital meanings in the lives of Christian people in their domestic settings. The images of Jesus Christ and Virgin Mary are one of the most common devotional images today. Aesthetically the devotional images are not worth spending time on. But the devout viewers behold in it, and that they look at it such that it builds up their faith, strengthening their relationship to Jesus Christ. Through an ethnographic survey, this study is first of its kind which identifies visual practices and assumptions about viewing and showing how they contribute to forming and transforming relationships to the icon of Jesus Christ and to sustaining such relationships once formed. In this study it is argued that the popular devotional images contribute to the construction of identity and reality and they help people to make and maintain their secure domestic spaces.

Keywords: *Domestic setting, Devotional image, Beholder, Relationship, Construction of identity.*

Introduction

Since centuries in Christianity, religion and art have shaped one another. Therefore religious art has been an integral part of the everyday life of many Christian families, and of course in Pakistan as well. Here Christians are a small minority

* Dr., Muhammad Asghar Assistant Professor, Institute of Art and Design, Government College University, New Civil Lines Campus, Near Regency Plaza, Faisalabad: Email: sanval25@hotmail.com, Phone: 0333 688 7497

** Muhammad Arshad Rehmani, (Co-Author), MFA (Graphic Design), College of Art and Design, University of the Punjab, Lahore. Email: m_arshad.designer@yahoo.com, Phone: 0332 690 7099.

*** Dr. Abdul Qadir Mushtaq, Assistant Professor, Department Of History & Pakistan Studies, GC University Faisalabad.

constituting approximately 1.6 percent out of more than 20 million of population according to population census 2017¹.

Of these, approximately half are Roman Catholic and half, Protestant. They mostly belong to the poor class of the society. Therefore the majority of them have small dwellings consisting one to two rooms including a corridor (*baraamda*). Many of them perform their ritual religious duties at home and others go to church, which exists in every large colony. Apart from this, there are a number of churches and cathedrals of various Christian denominations around the country (Asghar 2016, 22). This paper investigates popular modern devotional colourful prints displayed in Christian homes in the Punjab and discusses their reception, meaning and the ways they are used. They are important genre of popular religious folk art as well as a medium of popular piety. Similar to the manner in which popular posters of Sufi saints in Sunni (Berelvi) and Shia devotional imagery among members of this sect are used in domestic and public spaces, the Christian community in Pakistan also relies on the images of Jesus Christ and other icons for devotions and prayers.

In Pakistani popular art discourse there has been no serious studies about popular Christian devotional art in domestic settings have been undertaken but in the west except few such as David Morgan (1996, 1998a, 1998b 2001, 2005, , David Halle (1993) whereas research on Islamic devotional portraits (Frembgen 1998, 2006, 2009,) Hindu and Sikh devotional art (Vitsaxix 1977; Anton-Warrior 1986; Pinney 1992; Inglis 1995; Smith 1995) and so on deal with the antecedents of modern prints, their printing history and historical past of their relevant devotional folk art. However in Pakistani context, this topic is still under research and to my knowledge, so far there has been no sociological or psychological study devoted to this field of domestic religious aesthetics in Christian homes. The methodology involved simply in two steps, first; observation and systematically photographing the devotional art displayed in a domestic space, second; eliciting comments from the interlocutors. With the help of local Pastors and Christian friends, I have collected data in more than 200 Christian households in two major cities of Punjab, Lahore and Faisalabad where sizeable Christian community lives particularly in Yohana Abad (Lahore), Warispura in Faisalabad and many other areas. Out of 200 hundred households, 180 were selected for empirical and analytical purpose for this research study. Out of these only few are discussed here. In order to examine the data collected, the interlocutors were asked to describe devotional art they had in their homes. A number of discursive questions about display of devotional art were also asked in order to elicit the interlocutors' interpretations of their religious practice.²

¹ <http://www.pbscensus.gov.pk/>

² This paper is the result of an ethnographic field research which was carried out in various cities and their suburbs of Punjab province for HEC (Higher Education Commission of Pakistan) funded project titled "Identities and Manifestation: The Material Context of Art and Visual Culture inside Domestic and Public Spaces" under Thematic Research Grants Programs during 2016 to 2017. The project was submitted to HEC in October 2017.

In Kenna's (1985) study of Christian iconography she states that the icon is a microcosm of the relationship between the corporeal world, humans and the divine power. Furthermore it is a sacramental form of communication with that divine power. Thus an icon is not simply a picture; it is a copy or a reminder of the original;

--by representing that original in a particular way, it maintains a connection with it, as a translation does with the original text (Kenna 1985, 348).

These icons find a very important place particularly in homes. Many people establish some subjective relationship or even a pervasive dependence on popular devotional art in their domestic environment (Asghar, 2016). In Orthodox and Roman Catholic Christianity, icons and holy cards depicting saints are a fundamental part of the rituals of intercessory prayer and devotional practices. Prayer directed to the pictured Jesus Christ or other saints seeks his or her assistance in securing divine favour (Morgan 1998, 6). Most of the devotional icons were imported from the west. Now these are produced here with a local flavor. The antecedents of these non-western modern portraits of Jesus Christ, Holy Mary and other devotional images go back to the religious paintings of Europe and those have been objects of worship adorning the homes in private spaces ever since Christianity adopted the veneration of images in the sixth century (Belting 1994, 41). This acceptance of the images of Jesus Christ and Holy Mary is also evident in Islamic history. It has been recorded that once the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) was ill. While he lay, his wives came to cheer him up and they enthusiastically told him about the pictures two of them had seen during a visit to a church in Abyssinia. Apparently the Prophet did not consider the enthusiasm of these wives inappropriate. In 630 AD when the Prophet conquered Mecca and he and his *sahaba* entered the Ka'ba to smash all the idols that had been placed there, he protected an icon of the Holy Mary that had been placed there. He held his hands over it to save it while the other statues were destroyed (Sadria 1984, 99). Otherwise all the Christian idols were broken up because they were venerated as idols.

In Christian history, by the end of sixth century images of Jesus Christ and the Holy Mary were no longer uncommon. The images that were painted originally of Jesus Christ and Holy Mary have changed little in the course of centuries. However since then mechanical printing reproduces innumerable copies of those meticulously hand-painted prototypes. In south Asian region, devotional images can be traced to Iranian paintings of the fifteenth century when a biography of the prophets and other literary works were produced. The Iranian iconographical tradition was continued and developed by the rulers of the Mughal Empire (Frembgen 1998, 186). Of course illumination of books and miniature art progressed greatly during the Mughal period. Regarding Christian religious paintings an art historian Gauvin Bailey in his study of Renaissance Art refers to

this at the imperial court of India. Following is the relevant passage, which is otherwise somewhat individualistic Shades of Huntington!³

--- in a non- western region like the Indian Sub-continent there is a traditional view that the appearance of Catholic Devotional art in India during seventeenth century represents Mughal capitulation to western superiority in the face of Jesuit proselytizing. Like early colonial art produced in Latin America, imperial Mughal mural paintings were the creative product of a partnership between indigenous and conquering civilizations (Bailey 1998, 143). Bailey should stick to art and not venture into history. In the 17th century the Mughal Empire was at its zenith of power. The British and French had only made initial contacts with the fabled Mughal Court (Thomas Roe was sent as ambassador in 1615 to the court Jahangir (r. 1695 to 1628) and in 1667 the Emperor Aurangzeb (r.1658 to 1705) allowed the French to open a trading post in Surat). The Portuguese had been in India since 1498, however if they stepped beyond limits strict punitive action was taken against them (in 1613 the Portuguese seized a pilgrim ship. In retaliation the Portuguese port in Daman was destroyed. In 1631 Shah Jahan destroyed the Portuguese town of Port Hoogly because they were indulging in forced conversion). In the 17th century there was obviously no capitulation of any sort as mentioned by Bailey.

Christian religious icons had been introduced by the Portuguese missionaries. The Mughal's had an egalitarian taste in art. There were several icons of the Holy Mary in the Mughal palace and Jahangir kept a bust of Saint Jeremiah. The Mughal patronized and in fact appropriated European style devotional art. They found its pictorial realism a new and useful feature. They regarded this as a universal style. The Mughals used this type of art to provide visual expression of their new syncretic religious ideology, since as Muslim rulers of a Hindu land it was important to show tolerance to the other religions. Catholic devotional art was produced and received in these contexts in India which was radically different to the atmosphere it flourished in, in Europe. In the British particular importance was given to these icons, paintings and statues to ensure that Christians in the colony got these necessary adjuncts to their religion. This tradition continued in the early years after partition when many Britishers and Anglo-Indians continued to hold important jobs in Pakistan and there was a parallel Christian social world. But with growing religious rigidity and particularly the attempt to Islamize the institutions in the end of the 1970s the original middle to upper class Christian population including the Anglo-Indians practically totally left Pakistan and the present Christian are almost all lower class converts and the original Indian Christians. The difference between the previous and the current Christian community is that the previous one particularly identified itself with a British background, the current one is indigenous and what I have seen in the Punjab, very Punjabi. Thus poster art has found more grounding in Christian devotional art and it is considered a secondary, but necessary section of material art.

³ Reference to Huntington's controversial book 'Clash of Civilizations'

The local production of posters is an imitation of western devotional imagery. However, all small icons that people frame are imported. Also there are small, well designed cards of saints. They are displayed in the domestic settings in several different ways. This study discusses the devotional images of Jesus Christ (SI) and Holy Mary that are not just formally diverse but also diverse in the subject they portray and how they function. In Christianity the practice of personifying Holy personages --- even God ---in icons and statues is much more acceptable and deeply ingrained since inception, whereas in Islam it is a primitive devotional instinct in the public that in fact, albeit not realized by the believer, has grown in opposition to the strict concept of '*tauheed*' (the oneness of God directly opposed to all forms of idolatry) and therefore avidly forbidden by some sects. Thus the delineation between symbol and the spirit of the deity is more clarified in Christianity, though even here also the line between the two is very thin and apart from the learned rationalization by deep thinking theologians, like St. Augustine and many others, there is no limiting factor for religious minded Christians to attribute great powers to these religious objects of material art and also high classical art. Of course, the concept that these objects embody the presence of divinity is very common. The difference being that more artistic representations of figural and facial devotional imagery are present in every house of worship and not at all in Islam. The small Christian icons have a definite amulet status as do the cards of saints. Therefore among Christian, visual practices and beliefs that involve gazing at and generating meanings of holy objects are very prevalent.

The Reception and Power of Devotional Images in Domestic Settings

As it is understood, the home as a distinct space invokes a broad yet productive set of ideas about human relationships with spaces that are lived in, even if such relationships are themselves culturally and historically contingent. On one level, the home is a material place, a dwelling in which we live (Jones, 2007; Asghar 2016). The Christian home is a paramount symbol of Christian faith, for many believers, particularly women. This converts it into the primary medium of a family's religious beliefs. Because of the prevalence of better representations of devotional images in public houses of worship and the norm of turning to these in worship, at one undefined spiritual level all these personal and domestic devotional images are part of a local or one might say even a diocese grid. Therefore the significance and power of Christian devotional images in domestic setting resides precisely in its contribution to the social construction of reality (Berger and Luckman 1991), weather in the everyday domain of holy visual and talismanic recipes that guide people daily lives or times crisis or some crucial change. In the latter they play a more vital and dependent function.



Figure 1: Christian and Muslim devotional posters being sold on roadside stall.

Picture: From author's archive.

It has been argued that in many religions such as Islam, Judaism and Christianity, the successions of evangelical and holy personages hold central positions (Werth 1998, 79). Therefore in Christian religion, devotional images enjoy special power and prestige. Sold on the streets of big cities such as in Lahore, Faisalabad, Multan and Rawalpindi, displayed with Muslim devotional images and other mass produced posters, it is hardly surprising that the mechanical reproduction of pictures of sacred entities has become one of the most ubiquitous manifestations of modern religion particularly in south Asia. They are sold on very cheap prices such as Rs. 30 (\$ 0.16) and available in different sizes. Hence they are within the reach of all who want to buy them (figure 1). Some use them as an integral part of wall decorations, but more importantly they serve devotional purposes. All prints including calendars are revered because of the subjects and content they portray. They are found in Christian homes, in Churches, in offices and in schools. Because of their nature of the content, they have fostered a democratic emotionalism, a populist piety of extraordinary proportions in the present age.



Figure 2: Christian devotional icons are displayed and embedded in family photo frames. Picture: From author's archive.

Popular images of Jesus Christ and Holy Merry offer familiar instances of comparable evocation of meanings and they have countless variations but they are instantly recognized by the beholders. As mentioned before, they are an integral part of domestic devotion and are often inserted in framed family photos or kept close to them as shown in figure 2. Here we can also see local religious posters on the wall and imported icons on the mantelpiece. These images have served as powerful symbols in Pakistani Catholic piety because believers have learned from childhood to regard them as illustrations, as deified visualizations of what they profess. Embedded in the family photo frames, the images articulate the social structures of the family's world. I argue that these popular religious images contribute to the construction of identity and reality of the family and they help it make and maintain a secure domestic space.



Figure 3: Christian girls holding devotional posters.

Picture: From author's archive.

According to one female interlocutor, when she sees her family photos with the image of Jesus Christ in it, she believes that her family is directly under the blessings of the Jesus Christ and he is seeing all of them. Definitely this reception of a devotional image provides benediction and protection, as well as assigns status to the family. David Morgan in his study of Christian visual piety mentions that the act of gazing itself contributes to religious enhancement and, indeed, constitutes a powerful practice of belief (Morgan 1998, 3). Similarly several interlocutors I interviewed provided me much data and shared their intriguing beliefs with me that have basically formed this aspect of present investigation.

For instance two women told me that by holding the images of Jesus and cleaning dust from it on a weekly basis gave them comfort and healing (figure 3). The feelings they got from contact with the image gave them retrospective proof of the benefits of this care. The beholder is supposed to touch the real presence of the image of Jesus Christ that lies in the image and the thereby receive the healing power that the Prophet had. The family loves Jesus and Jesus loves them and more importantly these images were given as gifts to them by the parents on their weddings. Therefore it is quite safe to say that giving and receiving such images, displaying them at home and praying before them generates practices of belief and acts of visual piety (Morgan, 1998). Giving dowry on weddings of daughters is an established custom in Pakistani society, therefore in Christian marriages it is a regular practice to give these devotional images that are later framed and hung in the bedroom or other prominent places in the a home (Asgar 2016). Due to their powerful contents they form a collective memory. People believe in Jesus and respond to him because he expresses his divine character in his manner and presence. I argue that the images offer a special linguistic phenomenon; a means of revelation chosen by God as well as a universal channel of communication. They convey information more readily across cultural boundaries.



Figure 4: A Christian living room showing sole icon of Jesus Christ. Picture: From author's archive.

A corridor or (*bramda*) is an integral part of many lower or middle class homes where the family sits comfortably. In lower and middleclass homes the main feature of this space is a television set and an image of Jesus or other devotional icons, as well as family photos and other mass produced posters such as those of beautiful toddlers and scenes (**figure 4**). The focal objects in this room are the television and devotional images. The main bonding and pleasant activities and ritual observances of the family occur here, such as conversation, entertaining guests, relaxation, domestic devotional practices, reading, napping and watching television. Therefore this is the place which is honoured by these images. In fact,

I found that several interlocutors hung posters of Jesus or Mary in their corridor, in the midst of family photographs. The interlocutor of this house explained that the picture of the Jesus Christ in the forefront helps them to gaze at him frequently. During times when they are facing problems it offers assurance to them and helps them to think of how to tackle the situation, always reminding them of his presence. Additionally the baby posters hung above the poster of Jesus were presented as gifts when the wife of the interlocutor was pregnant. There is a common perception in the lower class that for a pregnant women, especially one newly married, to view such cute babies will somehow influence her internally and ensure her baby will be sweet in a like manner. And often, by the same process, for the pregnant woman to view pictures of baby boys she too will have a male child (Asghar 2016, 103). Most families in Pakistan give inordinate importance to having male offspring. Therefore such posters serve as highly auspicious objects for the married couples apart from adding beauty to the room. Several interlocutors told me that they use the image of Jesus in connection with their everyday prayers particularly in their bedrooms where whole the family sleeps (in most of the poorer classes all the family members sleep in one bedroom (figure 5).When it was pointed out that the images of Jesus and Mary are not real but imaginary, each one of the interlocutors replied that of course they knew they were, but they brought comfort, peace and solace to their homes and kept them safe. In their eyes the images have divine powers. This is similar kind of belief that is prevailed in Sunni Barelvi sect in Muslims. I found that not all Christians have these beliefs such as and several Protestants I interviewed. Regarding the practice of praying to the image of Jesus Christ displayed in their homes, one Protestant interlocutor said,“ Although I do love Jesus Christ but I cannot pray to his picture because I do not recognize the manner in which he has been depicted.” Thus in my research I found that many Protestants including Pastors do not display images of Jesus Christ in their domestic settings but they were in favour of displaying posters and other representations of Biblical scenes and verses on the walls of their houses. This is because Roman Christian belief hearkens back to the original ritualistic dogma with its feudal origins. During communion the wine they drink is actually supposed to be the blood of Christ and the wafer his flesh. Thus they are prone to believe a sort of metaphorical reality of theology. Protestantism on the other hand came as a reformation of various illogical aspects in the religion (such

as buying right to sin) that the growing urban middle class couldn't accept, like the right of people to buy pardon from the pope for their sins. However, we can see that among the different sects, both in Christianity and Islam believers, find faith and have expectations of beneficence from verses of the Bible or Quran respectively. On many occasions, I was informed by many informants that the images of Jesus and Merriam and other devotional icons are kissed and venerated with bended knee, they are treated like holy personages who were being approached with personal applications. Like the tradition of several Sufi images whose fame derived from their history and the miracles they performed, venerated in Sunni (Barelvi) domestic and public spaces, the images of Jesus and other devotional icons are mostly displayed and placed on higher locations in the homes because according to many interlocutors their high merit of display, basically lay in their virtue. This is quite intriguing statement and to argue on this is touch upon a delicate issue. The images of Jesus Christ are claimed to embody higher or transfigured beings to deserve the veneration due the holy therefore they have become the objects of symbolic actions. This is because of their visual likeness of what they stand for.



Figure 5: A Christian family is under protection of Jesus Christ through his devotional poster. Picture: From author's archive.

In Christian upbringing from childhood, apart from popular devotional prints, illustrated stories from the bible for children is an important and powerful tool for moulding the child's character. Middle class educated Christian families often provide their children an illustrated book of Jesus Christ. Such colourful literature is instrumental in opening an avenue for religion to the heart of the child. It constitutes an aesthetic commitment to the formation of their character, because, as they say, pictures speak louder than words. Moreover, the use of the image is an effective way of seeding the memory with information that is important to instill a religious group's identity in the mind of a child. According to David Morgan that;

“Images are used to teach children, to ritually observe sacred days and events; to remember heroes and deaths and to study and preserve special knowledge. In each instance the image bears the right information” (Morgan 2001, 12). Another important genre of Christian popular art is devotional calendars, which are meaningfully present across private and public spaces. These calendars permeate the everyday life of people. They often contain devotional themes such as illustrated depictions of Jesus Christ and Holy Mary, Biblical verses, etc. The purpose of these calendars is not only a devotional function and to advertise the product of whatever company has printed it, but also to impart blessings on the company and their product because they have done a virtuous act by distributing these objects that inspire worship. It is interesting to note that after the year ends and the calendar become obsolete many people cut out the holy images and paste them on the walls of their homes. The same practice is done in other religion such is Sufi Islam, Hinduism and Sikhism.

Conclusion

Christians rely on a variety of devotional images and symbols kept in their domestic, public and religious spaces. These include icons, paintings, effigies, holy symbols, etc. In Punjabi society material poster art has come to play an important role in Christian images also particularly in the lives of the poor and illiterate. Christ is a definite form in Christianity that is omnipresent for them. Thus they need such religious visuals and objects to help establish and maintain relationships with the Holy Trinity, most particularly Jesus Christ and also representations of Holy Mary and other saints that some may worship. These evoke deep religious response in them. Kenna's (1985) study of Christian iconography states that the icon is a sacramental form of communication with the divine power. The divine power concealed in the visual image and its dissemination has great power and impact on the public. David Freedberg (1989) has emphasized the power of such images in his master study “The Power of Images, 1989). Thus an icon is not simply a visual; it is a copy or a reminder of the original. “By representing that original in a particular way, it maintains a connection with it, as a translation does with the original text” (Kenna 1985, 348). My research showed that Christians often exchange, discuss and present these devotional visual arts among themselves which further strengthens their social identity.

They use devotional images and objects to create a religious landscape to tell themselves and the world around them who they are. While some educated Christians accomplish the same thing through the exchange of ideas and Holy Scriptures, many prefer to interact with visual and palpable symbols. I would argue here that I do not look down on a primitive sensibility; it has its own beauty, naturalness and sincerity of purpose, it only falters when it comes up against complex situations, competition and interaction with more civilized bodies, institutions and nations finds it hard to grasp abstract concepts, like God, sociology, etc. Thus they respond more to worshipping a definite figure or personality, like these devotional icons. Further an icon embodies these figures in a palpable form and they can feel near to it, because it is something definite. It has the perfume of the love of the saints. Their worship is the identity of the religion of their community and the people they interact with most. After partition the middle and upper class Christians identified with the British. But they gradually all migrated or have passed away. The present Christian community is indigenous and risen to social significance with rise of the lower and lower middle class. Culturally they are very Punjabi. Their sermons are in Punjabi, unlike Muslim sermons, all their psalms and hymns are in Punjabi which gives their social manifestation a double shelled structure, first in their community and then the Punjabi society around them.

References

- Asgar, Muhammad, *The Sacred and the Secular: Aesthetic in the Domestic Spaces of Pakistan/Punjab* (Zurich: LitVerlag, 2016).
- Anton-Warrior, Helga, *Indische Farbendrucke im Besitz des Hamburgischen Museums für Völkerkunde*. In: *Mitteilungen aus dem Museum für Völkerkunde* (Hamburg, 1986), N.S. 16. Pp. 105-148.
- Bailey, Gauvin Alexander, *The Jesuits and the Grand Mogul: Renaissance Art at the Imperial Court of India, 1580-1630*. (Washington: Smithsonian Institution, 1998).
- Belting, Hans, *Likeness and Presence: A History of the Image before the Era of Art*. Trans. Edmund Jephcott. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1984).
- Berger and Luckman, *The Social Construction of Reality: A treatise in the Sociology of Knowledge*. (London, Penguin 1991).
- Fremgen, Jürgen Wasim, *Saints in Modern Devotional-Portraits: Meaning and Uses of Popular Religious Folk Art in Pakistan*. (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 1998).
- Freedberg, David, *Power of Images: Studies in the History and Theory of Response* (London: (University of Chicago Press, 1989).
- Halle, David, *Inside Culture: Art and Class in American Home*. (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1998).
- Inglis, Stephen R., *Suitable for Framing: The Work of a Modern Master*. In: L.A. Babb & S.S. Wadley (eds.) *Media and the Transformation of Religion in South Asia*. (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1995) Pp. 51-75.
- Jones, Elizabeth H., *Spaces of Belonging: Home, Culture and Identity in 20th-Century French Autobiography* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2007).
- Kenna, Margaret E, *Icons in theory and practice: an Orthodox Christian example. History of Religions* (1985) 24 (4). 345-368.
- Morgan, David, *Icons of American Protestantism: The Art of Warner Sallman*. (Yale: Yale University Press, 1996).
- Morgan, David, *Visual Piety: A History and Theory of Popular Religious Images*. (California: University of California Press, 1998a).
- Morgan, David, "Domestic Devotion and Ritual: Visual Piety in the Modern American Home" In: *Art Journal*, Vol. 57, No. 1, *The Reception of Christian Devotional Art* (1998b) pp. 45-54.
- Morgan, David, *The Visual Culture of American Religions*. Eds. David Morgan & Sally M. Promey. (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001).
- Morgan, David, *The Sacred Gaze: Religious Visual Culture in Theory and Practice* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2005).
- Pinney, Christopher, *The Iconology of Hindu Oleographs: Linear and Mythic Narrative in Popular Indian Art*. In: *RES. Anthropology and Aesthetics* (1992) 22, pp. 33-63.
- Sadria, Modj-ta-ba. *Figural Representation in Islamic Art*. In: *Middle Eastern Studies* (1984) 20/ 4, pp. 99-104.
- Smith, H. Daniel, *Impact of God Posters on Hindus and Their Devotional Tradition*. In: L.A. Babb & S.S. Wadley, *Media and the Transformation of Religion in South Asia*. Pp. 24-50. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1995).

Vitsaxis, Vassilis G. *Hindu Epics, Myths and Legends in Popular Illustrations* (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1977).

Werth, Lukas, *The Saint Who Disappeared: Saints of the Wilderness in Pakistani Village Shrines*. In: Pnina Werbner and Helene Basu (eds.), *Embodying Charisma: Modernity, Locality and the Performance of Emotion in Sufi cults* (London: Routledge, 1998) pp. 77-90.