

Muhammad Iqbal Chawla\*

## **ERA OF “RECONCILIATION” IN PAKISTAN, 2006-2017: A CRITICAL REAPPRAISAL**

### **Abstract**

*This paper deals with an era of unusual political development which can be described as the ‘era of reconciliation’ from 2006 to 2017. This era was unique in Pakistan’s history because it brought closer all political parties for restoration, protection, and continuation of democracy in Pakistan. However, after a decade this period, sometimes also can be characterized as the era of the Charter of Democracy (COD,) seems to be losing its relevance because of surfacing of anti-democratic forces. Therefore this paper traces the causes, events and the deep impact of the policy of ‘reconciliation’ and also touches upon why and how it seems to be coming to an end. As a national leader Benazir Bhutto had political acumen and she propounded the “Philosophy of Reconciliation” after having gone through some bitter political experiences as a Prime Minister and leader of the Opposition. Both Benazir and Mian Nawaz Sharif learnt the lesson when they were sent into their respective exile by General Musharraf. Having learnt their lessons both of them decided upon strengthening the culture of democracy in Pakistan. Benazir not only originated the idea of Reconciliation but also tried to translate her ideas into actions by concluding the ‘Charter of Democracy’ (“COD”) with other political parties especially with the Pakistan Muslim League (hereafter “PML (N)”), in 2006”.*

### **Introduction**

Asif Ali Zardari<sup>1</sup> as PPP<sup>2</sup>’s main leader tried to implement this philosophy after the sudden death of Benazir Buhtto and particularly during his term as President of Pakistan (2008-2013). The general elections of 2008 did not just bring back democracy but also smoothed the means for newer and more polished political traditions in Pakistan. Therefore, this paper exclusively deals with the contextualization and implementation of “Philosophy of Reconciliation”<sup>3</sup> as expounded by Benazir Bhutto, Nawaz Sharif<sup>4</sup> and Asif Zardari. The main focus of this paper will be on efforts of political leaders particularly Mian Nawaz Sharif and Zardari to establish alliance governments both at the federal and provincial levels in 2008 and then again in 2013. The hypothesis of this paper is that thanks to ‘COD’ Asif Ali Zardari successfully completed his tenure through the formation and working of the coalition governments both at the centre and in the provinces. It is to be significantly noted that following the election of 2013, the process of transfer of power from PPP to PML (N)<sup>5</sup>, unlike on previous occasions, occurred

---

\* Prof. Dr. Muhammad Iqbal Chawla, Dean, Faculty of Arts & Humanities, Professor and Chairman, Department of History & Pakistan Studies, University of the Punjab, Lahore.

without feelings of resentment and bad feelings. By the same token, Mian Nawaz Sharif made efforts to carry out the policy of reconciliation and thus allowed PPP government to form Ministry in Sindh and PTI<sup>6</sup> in KP<sup>7</sup> and BNP in Balochistan so that political culture of tolerance should further strengthened. Most of the historians have not yet paid enough attention towards the role of Zardari and Nawaz Sharif<sup>8</sup> in the political affairs of Pakistan from 2008 to 2017 and this paper is aimed at dealing with that aspect only.

### **Philosophy of Reconciliation: Origin and Development**

The history of Pakistan is replete with the tussles of democratic forces and dictatorial elements in which the former came with ballots while the latter had bayonets. That conflict claimed lives of many Pakistanis but most importantly of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto whose death has become known as ‘judicial murder’.<sup>9</sup> However, his family, especially his wife, Nusrat, and daughter, Benazir in her two tenures as the prime minister, continued its efforts to fight against dictatorship and for restoration of democracy in the country. In spite of challenges originating from outside the country, she followed an independent foreign policy. Moreover, internally also she faced many challenges which interrupted both her tenures as the Prime Minister. After the takeover of General Musharraf and long exiles abroad for both Nawaz Sharif and Benazir, the two political leaders wisely concluded that in the past they had been used against each other by anti-democratic forces. Following this realization, both promised to work together against the anti-democratic forces and for strengthening of the democratic set-up in the country.

Determined to turn Pakistan into a moderate, pluralistic and democratic Pakistan Benazir Bhutto undertook steps to change the fate of the poor, women and religious minorities. Javed Laghari states that Benazir followed in the footsteps of her father but that there was change with continuity. She was always open for dialogue and reconciliation<sup>10</sup> with her opponents because she did not let off but forgot who were directly or indirectly involved in her father’s demise.<sup>11</sup> Her signing of a charter of democracy with Nawaz Sharif was also done in the same spirit.<sup>12</sup> But in the meantime adopting a realist approach above she also signed a National Reconstruction Ordinance (NRO)<sup>13</sup> with Musharraf to restore democracy in the county but anti-democratic forces and Islamist extremists combined forces which resulted in her murder.<sup>14</sup> Benazir Bhutto was the person who was versed in the densities of the conflict from both sides. No doubt she was a renaissance woman who provided a way out.<sup>15</sup>

### **Pakistan *Khappay*: Federation Intact**

Benazir’s tragic and sudden death on December 27, 2007, created a political vacuum which was filled by Asif Ali Zardari. He, therefore, emerged as the PPP’s new leader and in the same vein, he tried to settle the provincial and national affairs as well. It was alleged by Zardari and Bilawal Bhutto<sup>16</sup>, Benazir’s son, that the establishment along with a few political leaders had engineered Benazir’s assassination and bomb blast in Rawalpindi. The true picture of the events at Liaquat Bagh was by far much more gruesome as the planning for the Liaquat Bagh tragedy had been decided earlier and enemies of the State were adamant that the event was going to be a successful prelude to the separation of Sindh from the federation.

Benazir's assassination threatened both the federation and the country's democracy process.<sup>17</sup> At that time of trial and stress, Asif Ali Zardari appeared to be the only hope for those who knew his political insight and acumen. Because of the gigantic stature of his demised wife, he had been the most under-rated leader in politics till then, however, once challenged with responsibility he proved himself the right person at the right time. When the province of Sindh was practically burning and the federation of the Pakistan was at stake, Asif Ali Zardari spelled out the Slogan of "Pakistan Khappay, Khappay".<sup>18</sup> And this slogan worked because turmoil and panic in Sindh came to an end. The loss of Benazir Bhutto would have shattered the People's Party into factions and interest groups if Asif Ali Zardari had not become the co-chairman of the Party along with Bilawal Bhutto. After reorganizing the Party he took bold decision of contesting the general elections of 2008. The principal test for Asif Ali Zardari was how to best guard democracy in Pakistan.<sup>19</sup>

### **'Reconciliation' in Practice**

Zardari might not have been the smoothest, best-spoken individual but he took effective steps specifically regarding the joint government for the survival of the democracy by bringing into play the true meaning and essence of the 1973 Constitution. His steps were meant to strengthen the federation while also giving power to the parliament and masterpiece of Zardari's various steps was his vision and intention of taking every party on board and formation of a coalition government instead of sailing all alone.<sup>20</sup> Following Benazir's assassination, PPP Co-chairmen Asif Ali Zardari and Bilawal Bhutto declared 'Democracy as the best revenge'.<sup>21</sup> They promised that they would pursue the wisdom of Benazir Bhutto and won't let the country's democratic processes to be either weakened or harmed. It was because of his leadership qualities that his Party won the elections of 2008 and during elections it was orally agreed upon between PPP and PML (N) of Nawaz Sharif to follow the guidelines adopted in the "Charter of Democracy" even after Benazir's demise.<sup>22</sup>

"Politics of Reconciliation" and "Charter of Democracy" were principles enunciated by Benazir and pushed forward by Zardari and Mian Nawaz Sharif after the murder of Benazir in 2007.<sup>23</sup> Nawaz Sharif had lost hope under Musharraf government and wanted to boycott elections but Zardari urged him to contest elections in any case and promised him to carry out together the COD in letter and spirit and thus when his turn came Zardari proved himself as political leader of highest order.

### **Zardari as a 'Coalition-builder':**

Asif Ali Zardari is considered, in his party's circle, a negotiator of the highest order with his own style and used this powerful tool for settlement rather than confrontation. After getting majority in the National Assembly, Zardari visited Nawaz Sharif's near Lahore and Nine Zero, headquarters of MQM at Karachi, and invited both parties for working with him in a friendly environment. He signed an agreement with Pakistan Muslim League (N) for joining him in the Central Government; the agreement was called The 'Murree Declaration' signed in 2008<sup>24</sup> between the two main parties of Pakistan that paved the way for formation of coalition government in the centre and at provinces. Thus Yousaf Reza Gilani

became a Prime Minister in the history of Pakistan with complete consensus between the two main political parties on 25 March 2008.<sup>25</sup>

In the general election of 2008, Pakistan People's Party along with Pakistan Muslim League (N) won the maximum number of seats<sup>26</sup> and emerged as the leading party with PML N as the runner-up especially in Punjab.<sup>27</sup> After such a long undemocratic system which was set up by Pervez Musharraf now was the ideal time for the shoring up of democracy. So Zardari consulted and took aboard all major political parties for the efficient process of government and democracy in centre as well as in provinces.<sup>28</sup>

Zardari announced that he and his party would follow suit the traditions of Z. A. Bhutto and Benazir Bhutto to deal with the political challenges the party facing at that moment for the formation of governments at national and provincial levels. He said that he would continue the tradition of dialogue and discussion with all parties as adopted by Z.A. Bhutto and Benazir Bhutto. Zardari further stated that he would follow the teachings of these two martyrs in addressing multi-faceted administrative questions through discussion, deliberations, and dialogue.

First, he appreciated Pakistan Muslim League's (Nawaz group) gesture of joining the federal government and both leaders agreed on forming an alliance-based administration.<sup>29</sup> They also agreed to the restoration of those 60 judges in April 30, 2008, who had been suspended by Pervez Musharraf.<sup>30</sup> In provincial assemblies where the PPP was not a leader in seats Zardari generously supported coalition-building thus setting a new precedent.<sup>31</sup> Although Nawaz Sharif and Zardari were old political rivals but they exercised to shelve their personal differences after the 1999 military takeover and for the continuity process in country.<sup>32</sup> After the death of Benazir Bhutto, Nawaz Sharif boycotted the election but for the sake of democracy, on the persuasion of Zardari, he participated in the General elections of 2008. Although Zardari and Nawaz Sharif had differing opinions on the restoration of the removed judges still they collaborated for strengthening of democracy by introducing the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment<sup>33</sup> in the Constitution. Ishaq Dar (PMLN) and Raza Rabbani (PPP) played important roles by not only removing the amendments in the constitution introduced by General Pervez Musharraf's administration especially the seventeenth amendment.<sup>34</sup> They also attempted to minimize the chances of a military coup by adding clauses to the Article 6 in constitution of Pakistan. The government of Punjab played a helping hand in taking care of the Internally Displaced Persons of Swat. Taking into account the fact that Nawaz Sharif's Muslim League was not the part of Joint Government, he still stood steadfast behind the Pakistan People's Party to safeguard the Democracy.

In following the spirit of reconciliation, Muthidda Qaumi Movement<sup>35</sup> was also included in the coalition government in Sindh. PPP was in a majority and could have formed government without the inclusion of MQM but it adopted the philosophy of reconciliation and offered MQM to become a part of the Sindh Provincial Government which they happily accepted. Adoption of this political model also set a new tone in Pakistani politics.

### **Friendly Opposition**

The philosophy of reconciliation did not have a smooth sailing because when the coalition governments with the PML (N) at the centre and in the provinces could not work satisfactorily, PPP urged the PML (Q) to join the central government as a coalition partner. In the first phase, the PML (Q) was considered an arch enemy of the PPP government. During the election campaign, PPP declared Chaudhry brothers and Pervaiz Musharraf as the persons behind the murder of Benazir Bhutto and issued hate speeches and statements. In turn, Chaudhry Shujaat Hussain and his cousin, Pervez Ilahi, accused Zardari for the murder of his wife. But after the unsuccessful experiment of coalition governments with PML (N), PPP preferred to entice PMLQ in becoming a part of coalition government at the centre, an offer to which the PMLQ leadership responded positively. Zardari said, "Through dialogue, we will also find a solution to the political challenges faced by the coalition government today".<sup>36</sup> Zardari thus showed commitment to the philosophy of reconciliation and tried his level best in engaging political adversaries. Not only did both form a coalition government after making proper adjustments in the allocation of ministries in May 2011 but also the head of the PML (Q) Chaudhry Shujaat Hussain declared "We will contest next senate election together with Pakistan People's Party."<sup>37</sup> The Muthidda Qaumi Movement also decided on re-joining the governing coalition in both Sindh and Centre in October 2011. These steps attracted criticism from the opposition because he compromised the philosophy of reconciliation.

According to the Murree Agreement all the parties voted for the Prime Minister Yousaf Reza Gilani along with the formation of coalition governments at the Centre and in Punjab.<sup>38</sup> The initial step by the coalition Government was the declaration of accusation against General Musharraf till his resignation.<sup>39</sup> Before the process of impeachment started General Musharraf stepped down in 2008 and left a space to be filled up by Zardari as President.<sup>40</sup> A special committee consisting of coalition government members held at the Parliament House to conclude the draft resolutions to present it in provincial assemblies. In continuation, the president was asked to gain vote of confidence from the members of the House or be ready to face prosecution.<sup>41</sup> Both leaders also showed solidarity regarding the Swat Operation. Zardari chose to become president of Pakistan and he was cooperated by Mian Nawaz Sharif on 6 September 2008.

After becoming Co-chairman of the PPP and also the president of Pakistan, Zardari made all-our efforts to turn the Parliament of Pakistan into the country's supreme political institution.<sup>42</sup> Therefore, he worked for building and elevating the somewhat depleted image of the country's leading political institutions. This was during Z. A Bhutto's period that 1973 constitution was unanimously passed by the parliament in 1973 and after that, the passage and implementation of 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment is another milestone and it was done under the guidance and leadership of Zardari.<sup>43</sup> The parliament eliminated the touchy Article 58(2b) that was inserted during Zia period in 1985 and helped reinstate the parliamentary character of the government. Zardari believed that Benazir Bhutto's philosophy of Reconciliation was the key to political success<sup>44</sup> adopted refined measures which developed a political culture for smooth running of democratic set-up which ultimately stabilised democracy and strengthened the federation in Pakistan. Even though the most powerful civil president of Pakistan Zardari preferred to transfer

all powers to parliament and provinces for the protection and promotion of democracy and federation, yet he lost general election in 2013 because the imperatives of the electoral process were different from Zardari's sincere intentions to promote the culture of democracy in Pakistan. His reforms helped him become the first president of Pakistan in the history of Pakistan who completed his constitutional term as President of Pakistan. He showed tremendous maturity and responsibility during the general elections of 2013 and wholeheartedly accepted the defeat in the election and peacefully transferred power to PMLN without any delay and reservation. The Zardari's policies helped to reconstruct the political set-up in the country and after assuming due power introduced numerous reforms for the regions, including FATA, Aghaz-e-Huqooq-e-Balochistan, and the National Finance Commission Award, and the Gilgit-Baltistan autonomy. Thus through the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment<sup>45</sup> and subsequent amendments, democracy and federation were fortified.<sup>46</sup> After the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment passed on 4 April 2010 parliament was strengthened than ever before. Through an undisputed acceptance of 7<sup>th</sup> National Finance Commission Award (7<sup>th</sup> NFC Award) the financial issues which used to create gulf and bitterness between centre and the provinces were addressed. These reforms would not have come about without Zardari's of reconciliation.

After the successful completion of his 5-year constitutional tenure, Zardari organized general elections which were termed as free and fair. It brought mixed results for the PPP in provinces where his party lost to the opposing Pakistan Muslim League (Nawaz). He respected the mandate and handed over the power to the winning party in a purely democratic way without any delay on September 8, 2013.<sup>47</sup>

### **Causes of Eventual failure of the 'Policy of Reconciliation'**

The policy of 'reconciliation' did not have a smooth sailing as a number of controversies cropped up immediately after the formation of the coalition government. Coalition governments of PPP and PML(N) in the centre could not work properly even for a few months as Nawaz Sharif alleged that PPP government had failed in ending corruption and improving the economy.<sup>48</sup> In Punjab, it worked for two years where PPP leaders came up with a long list of complaints against Mian Shahbaz Sharif's policies and plans<sup>49</sup> which in the eyes of the PPP leaders were unsuitable for PPP's interest.<sup>50</sup> Zardari and Nawaz Sharif also differed over the restoration of judiciary which subsequently Zardari was forced to restore after great pressure from Mian Nawaz Sharif's 'long march'. But a most unpleasant incident took place when Mian Nawaz Sharif appeared in the Supreme Court and petitioned against existing government about the inquiry of Memo-gate scandal on 23 November 2011. Despite all these unpleasant happenings, Zardari was successful in completing his five-year term of office and Mian Nawaz, as a mature and responsible person, played the role of a friendly opposition leader.

PML (N) succeeded PPP in the general elections of 2013 and continued with the traditions set by the government of Zardari of letting majority parties in Sindh, Balochistan, and KP to form coalition governments. Mian Nawaz Sharif himself formed a coalition government in the centre though he had a heavy mandate and

could have formed government single-handedly. When Nawaz Sharif's government faced serious threat from the PTI leader Imran Khan and PAT leader Dr. Qadri, both of whom had stormed Islamabad to dislodge the government. At that moment, it was the PPP leadership in the national assembly led by Zardari which supported Mian Nawaz Sharif and saved his government. In this way, Zardari helped save democracy which otherwise would have derailed.

The Panama scandal of 2016 proved fatal for Nawaz Sharif as the Supreme Court dismissed him from his post of the Prime Minister's post due to concealment of facts about his *aqama* (work permit of Middle East) and salary which he had been receiving from the firm established by his son, Hussain Nawaz. At that moment PPP bitterly criticized Mian Nawaz Sharif and reminded him of his unpleasant role in the case of Gilani's (the PPP prime minister) removal from the same Supreme Court on a petty issue. On top of it all, Zardari once had gone to that extent against the establishment that he declared that he would cut it to its actual size defined in the constitution of Pakistan, but very recently he joined hands with Dr. Tahir-ul-Qadri and Imran Khan who are alleged to be supported by the Pakistan establishment. Mian Sahib alleged that Zardari's acts were prompted by the Pakistan establishment. In fact, it is alleged that it was establishment that caused misunderstandings between the leadership of PPP and PMLN about the 'memo-gate scandal'; Dr. Asim and Ayan Ali cases. Anyhow, in all these cases Mian Nawaz Sharif seemed to be made failed by external forces which wanted to control or derail democracy. At present, the philosophy of reconciliation adopted mainly by Zardari and Mian Nawaz Sharif seems to have been replaced by the old philosophy of dislodging the government of adversaries for grabbing power by hook or by crook. Anti-democratic elements again seem to be overpowering the democratic parties and political leaders when could be a bad omen for continuation of democracy in Pakistan.

### **Conclusion:**

Democratic culture needs both continuity and change both of which, however, never allowed in Pakistan. Benazir, like her father, followed the philosophy of Reconciliation to ensure democracy in Pakistan. She and Nawaz Sharif along with other political party's leaders concluded COD that helped them in restoring democracy and paved the way for continuation of democratic processes in Pakistan. Zardari, one of the most underestimated leaders of the Pakistan, succeeded his wife Benazir Bhutto after her murder in December 2007 as leader of PPP and endeavoured to implement the 'philosophy of Reconciliation' through his several measures and despite number of controversies between him and Mian Nawaz Sharif, he remained successful in completing the term of office of parliament and his presidency. In a nutshell, both Zardari and Nawaz Sharif, as described in great detail in the main text above, have tried their best to save democracy in the country although the present trend between the two leaders is a return to the atmosphere prior to the COD. This time, Zardari seems to have working against the philosophy of reconciliation for unknown reasons. However, it needs to be seen what the future will hold for democracy and political parties in Pakistan.

## Notes & References

---

<sup>1</sup> Asif Ali Zardari, (born July 26, 1955, Karachi, Pakistan), politician who served as president of Pakistan(2008–13) and de facto leader of the Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) following the assassination of his wife, former prime minister Benazir Bhutto, on December 27, 2007. <https://www.britannica.com/biography/Asif-Ali-Zardari>

<sup>2</sup> The Pakistan People’s Party is a left-wing, socialist-progressive political party of Pakistan. Since its foundation in 1967, it had been a major and influential political left-wing force in the country and the party’s leadership has been dominated by the members of the Bhutto family. Its centre of power lies in the southern province of Sindh. [www.ppp.org.pk](http://www.ppp.org.pk)

<sup>3</sup> This theory was floated by Hegel where he assigns his political philosophy the mission of “reconciliation”; “philosophy as reconciliation”. However, he uses the term “reconciliation” (Versöhnung in German) within the context of a critique addressed to Emmanuel Kant concerning the dichotomy that the thoughts of the latter create between individual autonomy (liberty) and the wellbeing of the state (in the moral sense of the term: Sittlichkeit). The role of political philosophy, according to Hegel, consists in demonstrating that veritable individual freedom is only achieved through the political, economic and other structures of the state. This is the process of integration of the individual into the state which Hegel calls “Versöhnung.” Paulin Manwelo SJ, “The theme of reconciliation in political philosophy”, *Promotio Iustitiae* 103, 2009/3, 17. <http://www.sjweb.info/documents/sjs/pjnewarticles/103-1-02ENG.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> Muhammad Nawaz Sharif, born on December 25, 1949, is a Pakistani businessman, politician and founder of who served as prime minister in 1990–93, 1997–98, and 2013–17. <https://www.britannica.com/biography/Nawaz-Sharif>

<sup>5</sup> Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz

<sup>6</sup> Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf.

<sup>7</sup> In 1901, the British carved out the northwest portions of Punjab to create the Northwest Frontier Province (NWFP), which was renamed Khyber Pakhtunkhwa in 2010.

<sup>8</sup> Nawaz on 12 May 2008 announced that the ministers from PML-N would resign from the Federal Cabinet on 13 May 2008 anyhow, here affirmed that PML (N) would not sit on the opposition benches and would continue to support the coalition government of PPP. Hamid Khan, *Constitutional and Political History of Pakistan*, (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2017) 53.

<sup>9</sup> *The Daily Dawn*, September 06, 2014.

<sup>10</sup> Benazir stresses not only the need for ‘Reconciliation’ between West and Islam but also within Islam especially between Sunnis and Shias. [http://pu.edu.pk/images/journal/history/PDF-FILES/17-Paper\\_54\\_2\\_17.pdf](http://pu.edu.pk/images/journal/history/PDF-FILES/17-Paper_54_2_17.pdf)

<sup>11</sup> Javaid Laghari, *Reflections on Benzair Bhutto*, (Karachi: Szabist, 2008).

<sup>12</sup> Naheed S. Goraya, “*Journal of South Asian Studies*”, 24 (2009): 368-371.

<sup>13</sup> It was signed on 5 October, 2007 to promote national reconciliation, foster mutual trust and confidence amongst holders of public office and remove the vestiges of political vendetta and victimization, to make the election process more transparent and to amend certain laws. <https://www.ilo.org/dyn/natlex/docs/electronic/81786/88957/F1317068946/pak81786.pdf>

<sup>14</sup> Hussain Haqani, “Bhutto Legacy”, *Wall Street Journal* (2007):



<sup>15</sup> Benazir believed that the war on terror cannot be won without mobilizing the people of Pakistan and restoring democracy in Pakistan. Benazir, *Reconciliation: Islam, Democracy, and the West*, "*Indus Asian Journal*"<sup>21</sup> (2009) :

<sup>16</sup> PPP Bilawal Bhutto serves as the Chairman of the *Pakistan People's Party* and presides over the party's executive committee. [www.ppp.org.pk](http://www.ppp.org.pk)

<sup>17</sup>The news of assassination of Benazir Bhutto brought about chaos across the country, and a handful person exploited the volatile situation in the country as the general public especially the supports off PPP were badly hurt with this shocking news. They started damaging the government and public property especially in Karachi and some parts of the interior Sindh. So much so few centrifugal forces in Sindh tried to exploit this situation by demanding Sindh Desh-a complete independence of province of Sindh.

<sup>18</sup>Zubair Ahmad, *Pakistan Khappay*, (Islamabad: Qasim Naeem Printer, 2008),7.

<sup>19</sup>Ibid

<sup>20</sup>*Daily Dawn*, March 10, 2008.

<sup>21</sup>Arif Nizami, "Democracy the Best Revenge", *Pakistan Today*, Lahore, July4, 2015.

<sup>22</sup>*Daily Dawn*, Lahore, May 02, 2013.

<sup>23</sup>*Daily Dawn*,24 June 2012

<sup>24</sup>*Daily Dawn*, 23 May 2011.

<sup>25</sup>Gilani became Prime Minister and took oath from Musharraf on 25 March 2008. Federal Cabinet consisted of 24 Ministers including ministers from coalition partners.

<sup>26</sup>Details of the elections and its results can be found in Hasan Mohammad, *General Elections in Pakistan 1947-2012* (Lahore: Mavra Publishers, 2012)

<sup>27</sup>Ghazi Salahuddin, "Is PPP Done and Dusted", *News Line*, November 2017. <http://newslinemagazine.com/magazine/ppp-done-dusted/>

<sup>28</sup>In Punjab Shahbaaz Sharif formed a coalition government with the help of Pakistan people's which worked from on 8 June 2008 to 25 February 2011.

<sup>29</sup>*Los Angeles Times*, February 22, 2008

<sup>30</sup>"The Pakistani Lawyers' Movement And The Popular Currency Of Judicial Power", *Harvard Law Review* . Vol. 123, No. 7 (MAY 2010) . <https://www.jstor.org/stable/40648496>

<sup>31</sup>The coalition cabinet was formed between PPP and ANP in NWFP (currently known as KPK); where Amir Haider Khan Hoti of ANP became chief Minister.

<sup>32</sup>Salman Masood, "Nawaz Sharif, Pakistan's Prime Minister, Is Toppled by Corruption Case" . *The New York Times*, July 28, 2017. <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/07/28/world/asia/pakistan-prime-minister-nawaz-sharif-removed.html>

<sup>33</sup>Zia ul Haq(1977-1988) had the Eighth Amendment passed in 1985 to empower himself to dismiss the Prime Minister and dissolve the assemblies at his discretion. This was provided under the infamous clause 58 (2) (b) of the amended constitution. The provincial governors enjoyed the same discretionary powers. The amendment also gave powers to the President to appoint services chiefs and provincial governors at his discretion. Maqsudul Hasan Nuri, Muhammad Hanif and Muhammad Nawaz Khan, *Eighteenth Amendment Revisited*, 26.<http://www.ipripak.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/01/18th-amend.pdf>

<sup>34</sup> Gen Pervez Musharraf (1999-2008) had the 17th Amendment passed by the Parliament on 31 December 2003 amending Article 41 of the constitution to enable an incumbent President to seek another term through a vote of confidence from the National Assembly instead of fresh contest between candidates as required under the Constitution of 1973. Dr. Maqsoodul Hasan Nuri, Muhammad Hanif and Muhammad Nawaz Khan, Eighteenth Amendment Revisited, 27. <http://www.ipripak.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/01/18th-amend.pdf>

<sup>35</sup> The *Muttahida Qaumi Movement (MQM)* is a secular political party in Pakistan that was founded by Altaf Hussain in 1984. *Dawn*, April 02, 2013.

<sup>36</sup> *Daily Pakistan Today*, Jan 5, 2011

<sup>37</sup> *Daily Dawn*, 9 January, 2012

<sup>38</sup> S. Mushfiq Murshed, “New Government, Old Problems”, *Criterion Quarterly*, November 5, 2012 in Vol 3 No 2 // 0 Comments <http://www.criterion-quarterly.com/new-government-old-problems/>

<sup>39</sup> Mubashir Zaidi and Laura King, Special to The Times, August 08, 2008

<sup>40</sup> Nadim Ahmed, *Aur Musharraf Chaley Gay [And Musharraf is gone]* (Lahore: Sabih Publishers, 2008), 45.

<sup>41</sup> *Daily Dawn*, 10 Aug 2008.

<sup>42</sup> <http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/interactive/2012/01/20121181235768904.html>

<sup>43</sup> *The Telegraph*, <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/asia/pakistan/7545477/Pakistan-president-Asif-Zardari-gives-up-constitutional-powers.html>

<sup>44</sup> Sheri Rehman said the government is pursuing a policy of reconciliation enunciated by slain PPP leader Benazir Bhutto to take the country out of the crisis it faced. *Dawn*, 21 April 2008

<sup>45</sup> . Maqsoodul Hasan Nuri, Muhammad Hanif and Muhammad Nawaz Khan, Eighteenth Amendment Revisited, 26. <http://www.ipripak.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/01/18th-amend.pdf>.

<sup>46</sup> *Dawn*, Sep 9, 2014.

<sup>47</sup> *Daily Dawn*, 9 Sep 9, 2014.

<sup>48</sup> *The Tribune Express*, 25 February 2011

<sup>49</sup> PPP alleged leaders of the Punjab that Shahbaz Sharif that he had given 13 ministries to PPP and 25 ministries were to PML-N, principally, there must be ratio of 40:60 in case of coalition government. The coalition partners had a long list of complaints against the Shahbaz Sharif's attitude towards his cabinet members: he was holding more than 15 ministries, the Aashiana housing scheme, Sasti rotli, Yellow Cab scheme, Metro Bus Service, Laptop Schemes was started without consultation with his cabinet ministers.

<sup>50</sup> Syed AsifJah Jaffery, *Khad-e-Punjab Mohammad Shahbaz Sharif [ The servant of Punjab Muhammad Shahbaz Sharif ]*(Multan, Sohni Dharti Publications, 2011), 44.