

Tian Xuefeng* Mahboob Hussain**

The Implementation of Pakistan Educational Policies in the 20th century: An Analysis

Abstract:

Due to historical reasons, the education of Muslim groups in South Asia is relative weakness. The Partition has aggravated this situation as the abundant educational resources have been transferred to the India Dominance. To reinforce the educational strength, since the independence of Pakistan in 1947 successive Pakistani governments have issued several national education policies and made a lot of substantial work in education development. However, Pakistan's national education policies are often difficult to achieve the expected goals in the process of implementation, leading to the failure of educational policies. This paper analyzes the causes of the failure of educational policies from two aspects. An unstable political environment and stable social culture are considered as the root of the problem.

Key Words: Pakistan; South Asian Muslims; failure of educational policies; education development

As a South Asian sovereign state shaped by the theory of "two nationalities", Pakistan's most basic idea is to ensure the basic rights of Muslims in South Asia. Therefore, since the partition of British India in 1947, the Pakistani government has been continuously improving various indicators at the national education level to ensure citizens' right to access the education and change the overall backward situation of Muslim education in South Asia before the partition. In order to achieve this goal, Pakistan has introduced a series of national education policies since its independence. On this basis, some scholars and academic officials from Pakistan and the United States assessed the implementation of Pakistan's education policy in the middle and late 20th century, believed that Pakistan's national education policy was difficult to achieve the preset goals and hard to implement during this period, there were problems of policy failure and analyzed the causes of its formation in a "western-style". The mainstream view is that Pakistan's internal and external political instability during this period is the root cause of the problem. By analyzing the preset objectives and implementation results of Pakistan's previous education policies, this paper believes there is a phenomenon that the policy objectives can not be achieved, resulting in the failure or partial failure of education policies, and tries to explain the causes of the failure from the perspectives of politics, economy, and culture.

1. The Historical Origin of Educational System in Pakistan

Since the 7th century, Muslims in the Arab region began to immigrate to South Asia, and first entered the hinterland of South Asia (now Sindh province of Pakistan) through the more advanced sailing technology at that time. At the same time, they also brought the Islamic education system into

* Tian Xuefeng, PhD Scholar, Department of History & Pakistan Studies, University of the Punjab, Lahore

** Dr Mahboob Hussain, Professor of History, Department of History & Pakistan Studies, University of the Punjab, Lahore

South Asia. Court schools, family schools, and private libraries are open to the ruling class or high-ranking members of the royal family or aristocracy; The educational institution facing the people at the bottom is Islamic school, It mainly trains clergy or judicial personnel serving in the government. In addition, the mosque also has some educational functions, but it is not a complete educational institution.

Before the British forces represented by the East India Company entered South Asia, the South Asian subcontinent was ruled by the Mughal Dynasty, an empire established by the Turkic Mongols. Compared with Hindus and other religions with a large population in South Asia at that time, it is not enough for Muslims of the ruling class to show an attitude of tolerance and cooperation in governing a non-Islamic country. Substantive measures must be taken to stabilize the rule of the Empire. After emperor Akbar succeeded to the throne, he not only abolished the “incense tax” and “poll tax” for non-Muslims, but also opened officials positions to non-Muslims.¹ Islamic schools are also opened to Hindus or their children. Like other Muslim students, they are exempted from all expenses, including food and accommodation, and systematically learn Islamic religion or related knowledge.

In the second half of the 18th century, the British gradually consolidated and strengthened their authority in the South Asian subcontinent. In contrast, the political power of the Muslim ruling class has been weakened, resulting in the decline of the economy of the Muslim ruling class. Hunter, a British employee of the Indian civil service at that time, believed that the three main sources of wealth for the Muslim ruling class, military appointment, taxation, and judicial or political employment which were dried up during the 18th-19th century, as well since 1872 the door of the army has been completely closed to Muslim gentlemen, the new tax system in 1793 has deprived Muslims of their right to tax.² As for the employment of justice and politics, the old “Mughal Empire administrative system” with Islam as the core and Persian as the medium was replaced by the British modern western administrative system. The British firmly controlled the high-level political management positions, and Muslims completely lost their political power. After the source of wealth dried up, education also lost its source of funds and inevitably began to show a downward trend. According to records, after the East India company-controlled Bengal in the 18th century, the local Islamic education system has been in a rapid decline.

However, Muslims in South Asia have always completely rejected Western knowledge and its modern education system. The upper Muslim ruling elite, with a proud Islamic tradition, is hostile to anything from the Christian world; The Muslim civilians at the bottom tend to conservative Islamic beliefs, are very afraid of being destroyed by Western-style schools, and do not contact them at all under the appeal of local religious leaders. With the increasingly conservative trend, the Islamic education system in South Asia has gradually solidified and began to lag behind the times.³ Although the governor's Government of British India has been committed to improving the cultural level of the Muslim community in India, it has achieved little, In 1882, the Indian Education Commission said “since 1835, the plan to promote British education in the community of ‘Mohammed’ has completely failed. For more than 40 years, Hindustan Muslims are still the most backward group in education in South Asia, which has aroused the pressure and special attention of the Indian governor on Education

¹ Lin Tai, *General history of India*, (Shanghai: Shanghai Social Sciences Press, 2012), 162-167.

² W. W. Hunter, *The Indian Musalmans*, (London: Trubner and Company, 1872), 159.

³ According to the author's survey, some existing Islamic schools in Pakistan today still refuse to teach English or other secular courses, the teaching basically focuses on religion and belief, and some courses have no greater practical value. For example, students are required to recite the Koran, hadith or holy deeds in Arabic, but students cannot understand the content and significance of their recitation because they only learn the reading method in Arabic.

affairs.”⁴ This was not the case until Syed Ahmad Khan launched the “Aligarh movement” to accept the western knowledge and education system in the Muslim community of South Asia. After that, the attitude toward modern education has been improved in Muslim society.

After Muslims in South Asia were deprived of political and military dominance, the economic recession directly led to the rapid decline of education. There are some Islamic schools for the bottom Muslims in the Muslim community, but the number of these schools is actually very small, even less than Sanskrit schools of Hindus.⁵ The economic recession has also led to the reduction of Islamic schools in quantity. Compared with Muslims in South Asia, although Hindus are also afraid of religious interruption, after a series of compromises and struggles, they are more likely to accept the rule of the British Indian government, just as they finally accepted the rule of Muslims. Moreover, the arrival of the British did not change the system of appointment or removal of the bottom officials. Most of these bottom officials were Hindu intellectuals selected by the Mughal Empire to manage the Hindu community. They were able to continue to serve the Indian governor from Britain in these posts, so they were not greatly impacted politically and economically.

The elite intellectual class and education system of Hinduism has not been greatly affected, and to some extent, they have received more material wealth due to the production technology brought by the British. Based on the acceptance of western modern education, Hindus have a faster pace of modernization and better education, The emerging modern Hindu middle class has emerged in the first half of the 19th century.⁶ The Muslim community in South Asia completely rejected the western education system and tended to be self closed, which also led to the degradation of its original education concept and education system. It is based on this situation some Muslim elites called on the Muslim community to accept the western knowledge and education system in order to start the modernization process of the Muslim community in South Asia as soon as possible. After the failure of the Indian National Uprising in 1857, and directly into practical action.

After the partition of India and Pakistan, Bangladesh and Punjab as the largest mixed region of Muslims and Hindus in South Asia were divided, resulting in a large number of immigrants. In the process, Although there are a considerable number of Muslim immigrants entering Pakistan who has a high political, economic status and a better educational background, but also caused the loss of almost all non-Muslim intellectuals in Pakistan. For example, after independence in 1947, the Punjab University in Lahore lost almost all non-Muslim scholars and faculty, resulting in a significant decline in the number of university teachers.⁷ At the same time, there are only a few educational institutions in the territory of Pakistan Dominance after the partition. According to the statistics of UNESCO, after Pakistan's independence, there are only 8413 primary schools, 2190 middle schools and 408 high schools in the country, while there are only 40 colleges and 2 universities at the level of higher education.⁸ In the 1951 census, only 16.4% of the country's literacy rate and less than 30% of primary

⁴ Nurullah and Naik, *A Source Book of Modern India Education*, (London: Macmillan and Company, 1938), 202-203.

⁵ Suresh Chandra Ghosh, *The History of Education in Modern India 1757-2012*, (New Delhi: Orient Blackswan Private Limited, 2015), 7.

⁶ These middle classes have become the “hot goods” in the marriage “market”, and the traditional high caste families, such as “Brahman” and “Shatili”, they married with them one after another, laying the foundation for the emergence of political elites in South Asia. The emerging modern middle class did not emerge in the Muslim community until the first half of the 20th century.

⁷ University of the Punjab official website, “Our History Our Pride,” University of the Punjab, <http://pu.edu.pk/page/show/hist-oryandpride.html> (accessed September 08, 2020).

⁸ the data is from the Pakistan Higher Education Commission.

school enrolment rate.⁹ Therefore, the sluggish development of education in the history of South Asian Muslim communities and the delay on initiating the modern education have resulted in the backward of overall education system after independence, making the newborn Pakistan have a more difficult road of educational development.

2. The Goal Setting and Implementation of Pakistan's Education Policy

Based on the current situation of serious shortage of educational resources and relatively backward overall level of education after independence, in order to ensure the basic rights of Muslims in South Asia, developing education has become an unavoidable task for new Pakistan. At the 1947 national education conference, the “Quaid-e-Azam” Jinnah believed that “the importance of education and the right type of education, cannot be overemphasized... There is no doubt that the future of our State will and must greatly depend upon the type of education we give to our children, and the way in which we bring them up as future citizens of Pakistani... We should not forget that we have to compete with the world which is moving very fast in this direction.”¹⁰ Based on the guiding ideology of this meeting, Pakistan’s education and its relevant departments began to formulate a series of education policies or development plans to promote the newborn Pakistan to get rid of the overall backward status of education as soon as possible.

However, looking at Pakistan's national education policy for more than 70 years, it is a common phenomenon that the implementation of educational policies is confronting the failure to achieve the goal of the policy, the change of the goal and the disappearance of the goal as well the weakness on implementing procedures. Due to the extremely low literacy rate in the early days of the founding of the Pakistan, all previous education policies or plans mentioned to comprehensively improve the literacy rate of Pakistani citizens and gradually “eliminate” illiteracy. Therefore, the national education conference in 1947 focused on basic education and adult education. Apart from the Second Five Year Plan (1960-65), almost all completed Pakistan's national education policies have failed to achieve the preset goal of improving citizens' literacy rate by 2010, and there is still a certain distance between the actual completion and the goal. For example, the 1959 national education policy proposed that the literacy rate of citizens would reach 100% by 1975, but even by 1981, the literacy rate was only 26.17%; The Fifth Five Year Plan (1978-83) proposed to achieve a literacy rate of 100% in 1987, but it did not reach 48% until 1998; The national education policy in 1992 once again mentioned that the literacy rate reached 100% in 2002, while according to the statistics of 2006-07, the literacy rate in the country was only 55%. As for the enrollment rate, the increasing of teaching staff, and the construction of various new universities and colleges, it is also in accordance with the above situation. It is basically unable to achieve the preset goal, and even some of statistics will decline. For example, the literacy rate of Pakistani citizens was only 16.3% in 1961, but decreased by 0.1% compared with 1951.

The policy stagnation caused by non statistics field is reflected in the fact that the policies can not be effectively implemented or promoted. The first Five-Year Plan (1955-60) stipulates that adult education is to cultivate “the most basic reading, writing, listening and speaking, as well as simple scientific practice ability, basic modern social survival ability, basic civic consciousness and

⁹ the data are from the National Archives of Pakistan, and the following data related to Pakistan's education are from the National Archives of Pakistan (Lahore), which will not be repeated.

¹⁰ Ministry of Interior(Education Division). *Proceedings of the Pakistan Educational Conference*. Held at Karachi from 27th November to 1st December 1947.

library.aepam.edu.pk/Books/Proceedings%20of%20the%20Pakistan%20Educational%20Conference%201947.pdf (accessed April 04, 2022).

independent thinking ability”, and it is mandatory for people who cannot read, write and production practice to participate in training, but this mandatory has never been implemented in 15 years.¹¹ A similar situation is the Islamic school reform implemented by the Musharraf government at the beginning of this century. In January 2002, then Pakistani President Pervez Musharraf “vowed” to control the chaos of all Islamic schools in Pakistan, especially the involvement between some Islamic schools and foreign extremist armed groups. The Musharraf government is expected to invest \$113 million in five years to promote “secular” education to enter Islamic schools. However, when 115 Islamic schools refused to accept the “secular” curriculum reform due to potential links with non-governmental armed forces, however, the Pakistani government has not taken any countermeasures and practical actions.¹² Until Musharraf stepped down in 2008, he basically did not make great progress in the reforms of Islamic schools, and all reform policies and plans almost failed.

The “sharp swing” of education policy is also considered by scholars as one of the important manifestations of the Pakistan's education policy could not reach its goals. For example, during the period of the Seventh Five Year Plan (1988-93), informal education widely existing in rural areas was not recognized as a measure of “disseminating education and improving the literacy rate of all citizens”. However, the national education policy in 1992 renewed the requirement of “Reviving adult informal education”, and the national education policy document in 1998 formed an almost “condemnation” evaluation of national formal education, It also advocates “informal education as an important part of national primary education.”¹³ The nationalization reform of the Bhutto government in the 1970s can better reflect the rapid change of this goal. The People’s Party headed by President Bhutto implemented the nationalization reform of education in 1972, nationalized all private schools and their fixed assets, equipment and teachers in Pakistan, and placed all activities such as enrollment and admission, teaching, scientific research and finance under the management of national or provincial governments.¹⁴ However, after the government of Bhutto and his People’s Party was overthrown by the army, the national education policy in 1979 re-stipulated that “individuals or private groups can set up schools, provide appropriate hardware facilities, bear the salaries of teaching staff and assume the management responsibility of institutions.”¹⁵ The new provisions are completely contrary to the policy of nationalization of education,¹⁶ the nationalization policy of education launched by Bhutto Government was equivalent to be completely “abolished”.

Although successive Pakistani governments have formulated a series of education policies after the independence of Pakistan, the relevant education policies have almost not been achieved due to the difficulty in implementation or not reaching the goals which caused the relatively common failure problem. Therefore, the education level of the country is still in a relatively low position in the world. According to the human development report of the United Nations development plan in 2004, Pakistan

¹¹ Wajid Hassan, *Deciphering Pakistan's Education Riddle*, (Karachi: Royal Book Company, 2016), 190-195.

¹² K. Alan Kronstadt. *Education Reform in Pakistan*. Foreign Affairs, Defense, and Trade Division, CRS Report for Congress, December 23, 2004. <https://www.hsdl.org/?view&did=457835> (accessed April 04, 2022).

¹³ Kaiser Bengali, *History of Education Policy Making and Planning in Pakistan*, (Islamabad: Sustainable Development Policy Institute, 1999), 1-23.

¹⁴ Jimenez, Emmanuel, and Jee Peng Tan. “Decentralised and Private Education: The Case of Pakistan.” *Comparative Education* 23, no. 2 (1987): 173–90. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3098985>.

¹⁵ Government of Pakistan, *National Education Policy and Implementation Programme 1979*, (Islamabad: Ministry of Education, 1979), 26.

¹⁶ After the overthrow of the Bhutto government in a military coup, Pakistan army chief of staff Zia Haq supported “denationalization” in policy. In 1979, the Soviet Union invaded Afghanistan, and a large number of external funds poured into Pakistan to set up Islamic schools to support the “Jihad” against Afghanistan, the United States has also provided assistance to Islamic schools and other private schools in Pakistan. As a result, private schools in Pakistan have developed rapidly.

is considered to be the country with “the lowest education index of all countries in the world outside Africa”,¹⁷ It can be seen that the development of national education is still a difficult problem in the 21st century. Therefore, as an Islamic developing country, it is feasible and necessary to look at the implementation and experience of Pakistan's education policy from the length of more than 70 years, and explore and summarize the causes of its policy failure.

3. Analysis the failure of Pakistan's Education Policy

As the implementation and practice of a country's educational concept, educational policy plays a very important role and carrier. Considering the Muslims' modern history in South Asia, the Pakistan is related weakness in educational aspect and this situation need to be reversed by sound implementation of national education policies. However, according to the practice of education policy in the past 70 years, the goal of Pakistan's education policies is always difficult to achieve or fulfill, forming a general issue of failure of education policy. In this circumstance, the failure issue is worth to research not only to promote the efficiency of education policies in Pakistan, but also will provide the experiences for all the developing countries to promote and implement their education policies. For the analysis of the causes of this problem, Local scholars in Pakistan have more summarized it as the result of “unstable political environment”,¹⁸ That is, the “fluctuation” of politics affects the national education policy.

Take the “nationalization” policy of private education as an example. Pakistan was ruled by Ayub Khan's military government in the 1960s, after a decade of relatively rapid economic growth, it also caused serious imbalance in economic development and formed a large gap between the rich and the poor in Pakistani society. After the People's Party headed by Bhutto came to power in the 1970s, it basically as an opposition party toward Ayub's governance and began a comprehensive “nationalization” reform in view of the large social gap between the rich and the poor caste, aiming to “eliminate poverty and discrimination in Pakistan at one stroke.”¹⁹ Therefore, based on the basic political tendency of the people's party, the reform of “nationalization” has naturally been promoted to the field of education. However, the nationalization reform in the field of education did not consult any “experts or scholars in the field of education.” It was a “simple political consideration and behavior”, which caused a devastating blow to “a number of excellent Christian missionary schools and schools under NGOs” in Pakistan.²⁰ The nationalization of education makes the national or provincial governments have to take over the private education institutions that originally operated independently, which makes the Pakistani government more difficult to grasp the financial problems in education. After nationalization, compared with the streamlined and efficient management mode of private education institutions, the government's management is more extensive, which hinders the realization of the Bhutto government's education policy goal of “high popularity and high quality.” By the time of “denationalization” in 1979, a large number of high-quality and long-standing private educational institutions had completely disappeared.

17 Data source: World Bank Group, Pakistan country report, 2004.

18 Refer to Akhtar Hasan Khan, “education in Pakistan: fifth years of Singapore”, 1997. Ghulam rasool Memon, “education in Pakistan: the key issues, problems and the new challenges”, 2007. Kaiser Bengali, “History of educational policy making and planning in Pakistan”, 1999. Saleem h. Ali, “Islam and Education: Conflict and Conformity in Pakistan's Madrassahs”, 2009. Wajid Hassan, “Deciphering Pakistan's Education Riddle”, 2016. Sabiha Mansoor, “Challenge Education Pakistan: Reflections of an Educationist”, 2016. Shahid Siddiqui, “Education Policies in Pakistan: Politics, Projections, and Practices”, 2021.

¹⁹ Ian Talbot. *Pakistan: A New History*, (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2012),110-11.

²⁰ Khan, Akhtar Hasan, and Naushin Mahmood. “Education in Pakistan: Fifty Years of Neglect.” *The Pakistan Development Review* 36, no. 4 (1997): 650. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/41260063>.

The instability of the external political environment also has a continuous impact on the development of education in Pakistan. Since the 1970s, due to the pattern of the cold war between the United States and the Soviet Union, Pakistan has been receiving educational and economic assistance from the Arab world and the United States. A large number of Islamic schools have been established rapidly, and some Islamic schools have even been directly involved in the “Jihad” of the Soviet Arab war. After the “9/11” incident, Pakistan, as the “front-line country” of the world war on terrorism, almost all national forces invested in dealing with the military affairs and aftermath of the war on terrorism. The Islamic schools that developed rapidly through foreign assistance in the last century have also been questioned by the West and are required to carry out reform based on “Western will”. During this period, although the United States provided Pakistan with more than \$1 billion in education assistance to compensate Pakistan for its losses in the war on terrorism, However, the impact on Pakistan's education development is very limited.²¹

On the other hand, due to the ownership of Kashmir, Pakistan and India have maintained an antagonistic and tense relationship since the partition, and may escalate into a local military conflict at any time. Therefore, due to the influence of the external political environment, Pakistan's spending on military and national defense has remained high, and education affairs have to succumb to national security affairs. For a long time, the development of education has been “habitually” ignored. According to statistics, Pakistan's expenditure on education is generally about 2% of GDP, while the expenditure on national defense is usually more than 10 times that of education. In 2004, “Islamabad will spend \$16 on national defense for every \$1 spent on education.”²² Although Pakistan promises to continuously increase its investment and proportion in education, until the latest government budget report shows that Pakistan's defense budget for 2020-21 is still 15.5 times that of education.²³ To sum up, the instability of the political environment is basically established as one of the causes of the failure of Pakistan's education policy.

Although it has been more than a hundred years since Sir said launched the “Aligarh” movement, Muslims in South Asia finally began to reconcile with the western knowledge system. However, the stable social structure and cultural factors existing in the Muslim community in South Asia still reflect a “characteristic” when accepting modern educational ideas or systems. From the perspective of the worldwide trend of “decentralization” of education, the responsibility of developing education in Pakistan has actually always belonged to provincial or regional governments, and even controlled by feudal lords or tribal leaders in some tribal areas. Even today, the Ministry of education of Pakistan is only responsible for the specific education affairs of the capital Special Administrative Region (ICT) and the federal tribal Special Administrative Region (FATA). For a long time, the central government, which has the obligation to coordinate and coordinate the development of national education, has not played its due role, which is one of the important reasons why most national education policies only stay in the text stage.

It was not until the constitutional amendment in 2010 that the responsibilities and obligations of the central government in the development of national education were clearly stipulated for the first time. Based on the trend of making the central government assume more educational responsibilities, the federal government of Pakistan needs to comprehensively develop and promote the healthy growth

²¹ In August 2004, Lee Hamilton, vice chairman of the US “9/11” committee, reported to the Congressional group that the investment of the US Agency for International Development (USAID) in promoting Pakistan's education development is “drop in the bucket”.

²² Data source: Pakistan Ministry of finance, “budget at a glance”, <http://www.finance.gov.pk>.

²³ Finance Division of Pakistan, *Federal Budget 2020-2021*, (Islamabad: Government of Pakistan, 2020), 7.

of national education, but it does not mean to deny the “decentralization” process of education in Pakistan, because the “decentralization” of education is a more effective education management model proved by the practice of European countries. At the level of promoting the overall educational development of the nation, especially the formation of an education system with regional characteristics, Can accurately grasp the actual situation in operation. On the other hand, provincial or regional leaders in Pakistan do not necessarily pay less attention to the development of education in their region than the central government. Different regions have specific needs for the development of education and have always assumed the actual responsibility of education development. In short, in Pakistan’s educational development history of more than 70 years, whether its national education policy meets the specific requirements of this nation plays a key role in the success or failure of education policy. Therefore, even in the context of educational globalization, it is still necessary to respond to “the nation's desire and appeal for education” when formulating educational policies.²⁴

From the design, promulgation, implementation and evaluation of Pakistan's education policy, it reflects the process of an Islamic developing country “nesting” itself into the western modern education development model,²⁵ Its noumenon culture also “tenaciously” plays a role in this process, which often makes the development direction of policy unpredictable. From the highest level of national belief, Zia While meeting with foreign envoys, President Huck suddenly left to attend noon prayers, leaving foreign envoys “at a loss”.²⁶ At the level close to people's actual needs, after a university announced that all English teaching would be replaced by Urdu teaching in the future, the Minister of Education asked the teacher of the English department whether he could tutor his son in English during the tea break.²⁷ This historical and cultural factor is clearly reflected through people’s life, which requires decision-makers to conduct in-depth practical investigation. Therefore, ignoring the historical and cultural factors behind a developing country and explaining the failure of its policy from the perspective of modern western educational science, the conclusion has good generality and universality, but it is not easy to find its deep-seated causes. The reason why we can't summarize the problem in a deeper level is that we can't explore the internal logic of our nation under the western educational science system, and the subsequent policies are more likely to fall into failure again. Accept the educational experience and theories from the world with an open attitude, “listen” to the education needed by the country and the nation, and coordinate between them, so as to find a road suitable for their own educational development.

4. Conclusion

Due to historical reasons, the development of education and the overall level of education of the Muslim community in South Asia are relatively behind the Hindu community in South Asia. During the colonial period of the British Empire, the Muslims in South Asia paid a hard struggle both externally and internally to strive for the right to education. By the time of the partition of India and Pakistan in the mid-20th century, the migration of Hindus has largely weakened the educational abilities and resources of Pakistan. With the scarce educational resources, this new-born country could hardly meet the educational needs of Pakistanis. For this reason, the educational affairs have been instructed to

²⁴ M. Hameed-ur-Rehman, and Salima Moosa Sadruddin Sewani, “Critical Analysis of the Educational Policies of Pakistan,” *The Dialogue* 113, no.9 (2013): 248-258.

²⁵ In fact, before the 1960s, the Pakistani government directly invited American education experts to participate in the formulation of national education policy.

²⁶ Iqbal Akhund, *Memoirs of a Bystander*, (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2002), 353.

²⁷ Sabiha Mansoor, *Challenge Education Pakistan: Reflections of an Educationist*, (Lahore: Lahore School of Economics, 2016), 31.

enhance by several education policies or plans since the new Pakistan government was constituted. Under this situation, the development of Pakistan's education has gone through a process of “develop from nothing”, but the failure of Pakistan's national education policies has still cast a shadow on the supreme concept established by Pakistan: to protect the basic rights of Muslims in South Asia.

The unstable internal and external political environment is an important reason for the failure of Pakistan's national education policy. The alternation of the military government and the democratically elected government, the national temporary military control law that often lasts for several years, the vicious competition of various political interest groups, tense international relations, military conflicts and military actions have made this young country in a mess. On this basis, even if this “unstable” problem is no longer prominent, the “selective neglect” of educational development has also formed inertia, which makes Pakistan's investment in education unsatisfactory and the implementation of educational policies very weak. As the Shahid Siddiqui has concluded the “major reason for not achieving the goals remained lack of political will.”²⁸ The instability of the overall political environment makes all national policies, whether “good” or “bad”, lack the minimum continuity and implementation cycle. Naturally, there will be no special case in education policy.

The deep structure based on national history and culture plays an important role in adapting to the modern management and administrative system. This is also the research angle that policy researchers selectively ignore, because it requires deeper basic knowledge and practical research, will take more time, and may involve other professional fields. Although Pakistan is a unified Islamic country, there are still great differences between its internal regions and regions due to the long-term cultural collision and exchange in history. Promoting its national education development with the only standard or method must face differences, resulting in the failure of policies. In fact, although the term “failure” is often used in the evaluation of education policies, the previous education policies have still played a positive role in the development of education in Pakistan. In short, the Pakistani government's practice of promoting national education development and offsetting the resistance of education reform with the help of modern educational scientific methods and the power of educational globalization is commendable. However, at the same time, there is an urgent need to carry out “localization” to fundamentally solve the failure of universal education policies, so as to realize the modernization of education in Islamic countries, which can not only bring experience to all developing countries in the world, but also important theoretical innovation.

²⁸ Shahid Siddiqui, *Education Policies in Pakistan: Politics, Projections, and Practices*, (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2021), 245.