

Iman Saleem Bukhari*
Sobia Khurram**

Defining Organizational Effectiveness of Third Sector Organizations in Pakistan: A Case of Primary Education Sector

Abstract

The paper explores the conceptual definition of organizational effectiveness of third sector organizations (TSOs) specifically working in primary education sector in Pakistan. The study has identified basic conceptual definition, dimensions, parameters and criteria to measure organizational effectiveness generally and specifically with reference to primary education sector. The study embraces the qualitative research design to get its findings. The data is collected by in-depth interviews of key informants who are experts in the field of third sector. The paper discusses that defining organizational effectiveness of TSOs is quite a challenging task, as the orientation of the concept is multidimensional. However, it identifies achievement of goals and objectives, governance, strong integrated management practices and trust of public as significant factors defining organizational effectiveness of third sector organizations in Pakistan. Moreover, training and development of teachers, strengthening of education sector, increasing literacy rate and quality improvement are certain factors defining organizational effectiveness relevant to NGOs working in Education sector (primary) in Pakistan. It can be said that no best definition is there to define organizational effectiveness of third sector organizations in Pakistan. It requires extensive theoretical and empirical research to define organizational effectiveness of TSOs in Pakistan. This paper recommends that there is a need to have integrated and indigenous frameworks and tools to measure effectiveness of third sector organizations at different functional areas in Pakistan.

Key words: Third sector organizations (TSOs), Organizational effectiveness, Multidimensional, Goal attainment, quality improvement, Non-governmental organizations (NGOs)

Introduction

Third sector organizations (TSOs) are increasing swiftly in all countries in the world. Their number is snowballing day by day even in Pakistan. Third sector organizations in Pakistan are trying to provide cushion to government in terms of delivering services to the general public at different functional areas including health, education, advocacy, human rights, child welfare, water and sanitation, environmental protection and preservation, special education, micro-credit, rural support development and others. Growth and mushroom expansion of third sector organizations create a need to investigate the outcomes, end results i.e. effectiveness of these organizations at different functional areas.

It also raises a question whether these organizations are actually effective in terms of delivering their services or their existence and expansion have some other hidden agendas. To measure the effectiveness of this sector, firstly it is needed to conceptualize the definition and dimensions and indicators of effectiveness of TSOs operating in Pakistan. This study aims at conceptualization the meaning and basic definition of organizational effectiveness of third sector in Pakistan operating in basic education sector in Pakistan. The objectives of the current study are to define organizational effectiveness of TSOs in Pakistan in general and to define organizational effectiveness of TSOs working in primary education sector in Pakistan in particular. The study attempts to identify key dimensions, parameters and criteria explaining and measuring effectiveness of TSOs in this regard.

Background

* Iman Saleem Bukhari, Institute of Administrative Sciences, University of the Punjab, Lahore

** Sobia Khurram Institute of Administrative Sciences University of the Punjab, Lahore

Defining Organizational Effectiveness of Third Sector Organizations in Pakistan: JRSP, Vol.58, No1 (Jan-March 2021)

It has been reviewed from the literature that defining and analyzing the organizational effectiveness of third sector organizations is the major challenge for researchers, theorists as well as practitioners (Cameron, 2015). The underlying reason is that ultimate goals, objectives, structures as well as procedures within these non-governmental organizations are quite different from public and private organizations (Herman & Renz, 1998, 1999). Many different approaches and models are found in literature which defines the effectiveness of TSOs including Goal attainment approach; Internal processes approach, multiple constituency approach, System resource approach (Hossein, Ramezanehghad, Yosefi, Sajjadi, & Malekakhlagh, 2011) and Stakeholder's responsive/feedback approach.

Goal model of organizational effectiveness was considered widely accepted, as it was understood that organizations have goals which they want to achieve (Pfeffer, 1982). Cameron (1986) proposed alternative approach to organizational effectiveness while presenting seven different models. This includes internal processes, system resource, multiple constituencies, competing values, legitimacy and fault driven etc. (Cameron, 1986). Stakeholder's responsiveness and their expectations were proposed as the basic criterion of effectiveness for individual managers as well as for nonprofit organizations operating in different functional arenas (Speckbacher, 2003; Tsui, 1994). One of the study conducted in 2019 analyzed organizational effectiveness of TSOs by unpacking the relationship between TSOs governance and organizational effectiveness while taking role volunteers' organizational identity and their organizational commitment as mediator (Zollo, Laudano, Boccardi, & Ciappei, 2019).

A model presented by LeRoux and Wright (2010) identified Nonprofit Organizations' (NPOs') professionalism, workload and output, unit cost and efficiency, outcomes, client or customer satisfaction, external audits, and industry standards and benchmarks as the key indicators of NPO effectiveness (LeRoux & Wright, 2010). Board effectiveness, managerial effectiveness, resource effectiveness, financial effectiveness, environmental effectiveness and program effectiveness were some of the main dimensions identified by the researchers to conduct research in 69 NPOs in Turkey (Tayşir & Tayşir, 2012). This study tries to induce the concept of effectiveness of TSOs in Pakistan with specific reference to primary education sector.

TSO Effectiveness in Education Sector

Third sector organizations are delivering at various areas where government has to play its role such as health; education; advocacy etc. According to survey conducted by Pakistan Centre of Philanthropy in 2012, it has been estimated that about 24% certified TSOs in Pakistan are delivering their services in education sector. Moreover, it has been found in the literature that third sector organizations took the role of gap-filling in education sector where government did not pay heed to provide adequate services. Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) in such terms can be considered as "service providers".

Nevertheless, NGOs are not only considered as service providers instead they are also involved in planning, implementation and serving as watchdogs of government in rural as well as urban areas. Education provision is actually the task of ministry of education in any country. However, lack of concern, capacity, vigilance and weak role of state hinder the successful delivery of services to public (Ulleberg, 2009). In such circumstances third sector jumps into interface and try to play their role in delivering services such as education. TSOs are serving in education at primary (Arbab, 2006), secondary and even in higher education in the form of trusts and foundations all over the world and in Pakistan as well (Shah, 2018). Special education is also the area where NGOs play their role. In order to improve the delivery of primary education, TSOs implement different strategies like public private partnership, teacher's training, and community support to schools, curriculum development, developing human resources for the education sector etc. (Kolleck, 2019). Moreover, TSOs are becoming increasingly involved in school improvement initiatives and scholars observe that they are progressively exerting power on schools and educational systems worldwide (Berkovich & Foldes, 2012; Eyal & Yarm, 2018; Kolleck, 2016; Yemini, Cegla, & Sagie, 2018).

Third sector organizations have been playing a central role in education of demoted groups in developing countries since 1980s (Lakshmi, 2018). Effectiveness of non-profit sector organizations working in education sector can be analyzed at management level and program level (Balduck & Buelens, 2008) in order to check their internal management processes as well as the accomplishment of mission (what they are pursuing) and analyzing the

Defining Organizational Effectiveness of Third Sector Organizations in Pakistan: JRSP, Vol.58, No1 (Jan-March 2021)

stakeholder's feedback. Rob Vos (1996) identified certain indicators of organizational effectiveness which can be contextualized to education sector i.e.1). Input indicators: In case of education it would include the number of teachers, school buildings, teaching materials supplies and the cost and level of expenditures (public and private) on education, student/teacher ratio, average cost per student. 2). Access indicators: Geographical distance to school facilities, family and cultural background of students, foregone earnings of individuals and households, and direct private costs of education (fees, utensils, uniforms, etc.). 3). Output indicators: Enrollment rates and retention rates; rise of skills and knowledge of graduates. 4). Outcome indicators: Higher labor productivity, better health and enhanced capabilities of an individual to participate in modern society (Vos, 2011).

After reviewing the literature on nonprofit organizational effectiveness, it has been realized that one-dimensional model cannot define the effectiveness; instead we need multi-dimensional approach comprising response from all stakeholders of the organization. Education sector is the main pillar of the society and if some set of organizations (TSO) are serving in it, then their effectiveness in terms of delivering services need to be defined. New public management paradigm (Osborne, 2010) also encourages the participation and involvement of third sector in delivering services with the government. In such circumstances, Third sector organizational effectiveness in education sector in Pakistan needs to be defined and contextualized in light of existing above reviewed literature and according to facts and data available regarding their existence and functioning.

Methodology

The study adopts a qualitative methodology to reach findings. The qualitative data is collected by conducting interviews with 15 key informants who are experts in the field of third sector by asking open ended qualitative questions to have clear understanding regarding the study and for expediency during analysis. Face to face in-depth and telephonic interviews are conducted to have a detailed investigation about the phenomenon. NVIVO 12 was used for the analysis of qualitative data of the research study. The data is analyzed and presented in the form of research paper to have clear overall picture of definition of organizational effectiveness of third sector organizations working in education sector in Pakistan.

Findings and Discussion

Defining Organizational Effectiveness of third sector organizations is significant in the context of Pakistan. Study responses led to the development of the following major themes and findings of the study.

1. Defining Organizational TSOs in Pakistan

Respondents were asked to define organizational effectiveness of third sector organizations in Pakistan. Most of the respondent said that defining organizational effectiveness is quite tricky. According to one of the respondent, *“We cannot simply quantify the parameters on which we can define the organizational effectiveness of nonprofit organizations in Pakistan. Every NGO determines its criteria of effectiveness by contextualizing according to their needs, goal and objectives”*. During qualitative analysis, major identified theme defining organizational effectiveness was achievement of goals and objectives.

1.1 Achievement of Goals and Objectives

One of the respondent said, *“We can see organizational effectiveness in regards to operation of the organization. Organization effectiveness is important for the TSO's in a sense that if the goals and objectives set by the organizations are achieved. Ultimately how beneficial are the programs and activities for the public and the target people show the organizational effectiveness. If organization is successful in attaining its goals then its efficiency is good and it is effective.”* Similarly, another respondent said, *“For third sector organization to be effective there should be clear objective, even if it is at small scale but it should be achieved fully.”* Another respondent very articulately differentiated between the effectiveness of government organizations and third sector organizations, *“Basically there are three kinds of organizations, Government sector organization, profit organization and third sector organizations. In government sectors to be effective there rules, regulation and their implementation is important. But in TSO we have board of governors. For TSO to be effective, whenever you set a milestone to achieve*

Defining Organizational Effectiveness of Third Sector Organizations in Pakistan: JRSP, Vol.58, No1 (Jan-March 2021)

a goal, when you achieve that milestone then you are successful and effective. So yes, for any department in TSOs to be effective it is very important to monitor them and set achievable goals and milestones and then finally achieving them ensures the effectiveness of good organizations. TSO's main purpose should be to provide their services effectively."

1.2 Governance and Management Practices

Second theme identified by the respondents explaining TSO effectiveness is governance and management Practices. One of the respondents said, *"I believe organizational effectiveness is more to do with governance and management practices of organization. When we say governance we mean policy making, implementation and focusing more on strategic aspects of the organization. When we say about management then it is more related to the execution part of that policy that has been formulated which involves all the key functions of management including the leadership, resources, and human resource particularly. Input as well as output."* Similarly another respondent said that, *"organizational effectiveness can be seen as having a sound governing body, sound managing body as when you know you are being evaluated your organization performs well."* Moreover, few of the respondents considered this topic under the realm of social construction.

1.3 Social Construction

In the interviews, respondents were asked about their understanding about the concept of organizational effectiveness. In response to it, generally most of the respondents of the study considered nonprofit organizations' effectiveness as an abstract concept and they specified it as a social construction. As one of the respondents said, *"Ah....., I think this topic and concept is built upon the understanding and perception of the people running any particular NGO, I cannot have specific definition of third sector organizational effectiveness."*

1.4 Multidimensional

One of the respondent said, *"Nonprofit organizational effectiveness is multidimensional and will never be reducible to a single measure."* Moreover, another respondent said, *"We need multiple dimensions, indicators and factors required to explain organizational effectiveness of third sector organizations working internationally as well as nationally across the world."*

1.5 Trust of Public

Trust of public i.e. stakeholders which are the end-beneficiaries of their concerned nonprofit organizations is termed as effectiveness by some of the respondents. One of the respondents asserted that, *"our effectiveness is trust of the public in us, our goodwill and credibility is ensured only when our end-beneficiaries are satisfied."* Similarly another respondent asserted, *"We work for public and for their betterment. So, there trust and satisfaction on our organization makes us effective and efficient in terms of delivering services."*

Definition of Organizational Effectiveness		
Achievement of Goals and Objectives	Social Construction	Trust of Public
Governance and Management Practices		
	Multidimensional	

Figure 1: Nodes explaining definition of Organizational Effectiveness of TSOs in Pakistan

It is evident from the figure that most of the respondents highlighted achievement of goals and objectives as a major theme defining third sector organizational effectiveness in Pakistan. Governance and management was also considered significant theme in explaining the concept. Moreover, a few respondents identified organizational effectiveness of TSOs having multidimensional nature and related it with the idea of social construction. Very few of the respondents took public trust as a theme elaborating the concept. This depicts that Goal Model is applicable in explaining the third sector organizational effectiveness in Pakistan (Pfeffer, 1982). Literature advocates that most of the researchers explained TSO effectiveness in terms of goal attainment approach (Scott & Davis, 2017). We can apply stakeholder’s approach or stakeholder’s responsiveness model (Speckbacher, 2003; Tsui, 1994) in explaining the theme of trust of public. While the theme of governance and management practices identified in findings gets its support from the literature signifying internal procedure model (Herman & Renz, 1999; Hossein et al., 2011). From the findings, it can also be said that this concept of organizational effectiveness of TSOs is multidimensional (Herman & Renz, 1999; Sowa, Selden, & Sandfort, 2004) and it gets difficult to associate some specific measures or indicators with organizational effectiveness of nonprofit organizations in Pakistan.

2. Dimensions of Organizational Effectiveness

Respondents were asked to name certain generic dimensions explaining TSO effectiveness in Pakistan. Most of them responded that, “*For effectiveness in an organization system should be aligned with the overall goal of the organization. Employee’s dedication, system management, integration of systems, design of measurement, organizational structure, quality speed-up, monitoring and evaluation are a few dimensions of organizational effectiveness.*” After running qualitative analysis on NVIVO 12, following results were achieved depicting that most of the respondents identified social impact of the organization as the significant dimension explaining third sector organizational effectiveness.

2.1 Social Impact of the Organization

Social impact of any nonprofit organizations was identified as major theme elucidating the dimensions explaining TSO effectiveness by the respondents. As one of the respondents said, “*Basically three things are very important for an organization to be effective: What the organization is gaining from the society? And what impact the*

Defining Organizational Effectiveness of Third Sector Organizations in Pakistan: JRSP, Vol.58, No1 (Jan-March 2021)
organization's working has on the society? How the system helps influence and motivates society? Similarly another respondent said, *"If the programs are beneficial for the public then they are effective. Effectiveness is all about governance and management as stated earlier."* Another respondent claimed, *"Third Sector Organizations are usually measured in terms of its effectiveness by gauging the impact that they produce."*

2.2 Integration of Systems

Findings of the study depict that majority of the respondents mentioned integration and coordination of internal management systems as one of the significant theme related with the concerned topic. One of the respondents claimed, *"Organizational effectiveness can be seen through program delivery, handling workload, good administration, professionalism and setting an example for others by giving the best quality services."* Similarly another respondent said, *"Customer satisfaction from the purpose you are serving. At micro level we will see it department wise, which include internal systems and their integration and management. Moreover, we focus on how our internal systems are processing and benefitting our beneficiaries"*.

2.3 Employee Motivation

Employee or volunteer motivation and commitment with the organization are very important for smooth functioning of any nonprofit organization. Most of the respondents during an interview highlighted employee motivation as an important factor or dimension explaining organizational effectiveness of TSOs. As one of the respondent said, *"hnmmm....I think if our employees means paid staff as well as volunteers are satisfied and loyal with our organization, then we will work efficiently and effectively and our performance will be better."*

2.4 Professionalism

Professionalism was also identified as dimension of organizational effectiveness by few respondents. One of the respondents explained that, *"we consider organizations as effective when all the stakeholders contribute and deliver assigned duties at proper time and resources."*

Dimensions Explaining TSO Effectiveness	
Social Impact of Organization	Employee Motivation
Integration of Systems	
	Professionalism

Figure 2 Nodes Explaining dimensions of third sector organizational effectiveness in Pakistan

Defining Organizational Effectiveness of Third Sector Organizations in Pakistan: JRSP, Vol.58, No1 (Jan-March 2021)

It is manifested from the findings that social impact of the organization (Epstein & Yuthas, 2017) is considered significant dimension explaining organizational effectiveness of TSOs in Pakistan (Arvidson & Lyon, 2014). Stakeholder's responsiveness and feedback model seconds this finding. Moreover, integration of systems of organization means where all units of third sector organizations operate together. The System theory of an organization explains this phenomenon that how systems within an organization are integrated and operate in an external environment (Rice, 2013). From the findings of the study, employee motivation or satisfaction was identified as significant theme explaining dimension of organizational effectiveness of TSOs in Pakistan and its significance can be traced in literature as well (Baruch & Ramalho, 2006; Packard, 2010). Professionalism was highlighted as a dimension of organizational effectiveness by very few respondents and it has also been considered as an important indicator of management effectiveness of NGOs in literature (Tayşir & Tayşir, 2012).

3. Organizational Effectiveness of Third Sector Organizations working in Education Sector in Pakistan

During the interviews, respondents were asked how they define organizational effectiveness of nonprofit organizations working in education sector in Pakistan. In response to this question, certain dimensions of organizational effectiveness were found specifically relevant to education sector in Pakistan. One of the respondent said, *"Well, it's again having a good policy, sound system and unshakeable principles to be effective. Giving away services in a best manner those maximum students can take advantage."*

3.1 Monitoring and Evaluation

Most of the respondents identified monitoring and evaluation of programs, projects, employees, and the performance of children as an important theme defining organizational effectiveness of NGOs working in education sector in Pakistan.

3.2 Training and Development of teachers

Training and Development of teachers play a significant role in efficient delivery of services i.e. education to children. Findings have also supported this claim and many of the respondents identified it as an important theme of the study. As one of the respondents said, *"Basically we work to improve the literacy rate in Pakistan through a diverse range of services: curriculum development, textbooks and children's publications, model school development, teacher training, youth promotion, career counseling and student assessment and evaluation."*

3.3 Strengthening of Education System and Improvement in Literacy Rate

Moreover, other themes that were investigated through interviews include *strengthening of education system and improvement in literacy rate* at primary level at schools. One of the respondents asserted, *"As I myself is part of NGO sector, what I have observed over the years is that cooperation, integration and strong system of the organization leads towards effectiveness. Education system in Pakistan is no more a basic need it has become business. Different institutes are trying to earn as much profits as they can in the name of education which often lacks quality. So for NGO's it is really important to give quality education and think of it as a service not a business."* Similarly, another respondent claimed, *"we believe that if our NGO is contributing towards improving current education system of Pakistan and becoming a source to elevate the literacy rate of country, then we claim that our organization is working effectively."*

3.4 Reduction of Child Labor and Quality Improvement

Similar but few numbers of respondents identified reduction of child labor and quality improvement of education services by the TSOs as a dimension explaining organizational effectiveness. One of the respondent said, *Organizational effectiveness of nonprofit organizations in education sector can be seen by quality of education provided and to what extent awareness is created in all areas of Pakistan."*

Organizational Effectiveness of Education Sector		
Monitoring and Evaluation	Strengthening of Education Sector	Improvement in Literacy Rate
Training and Development of Teachers	Reduction of Child Labor	Quality Improvement

Figure 3: Nodes explaining Organizational Effectiveness of Education Sector in Pakistan

This figure depicts that monitoring and evaluation of programs, projects and student assessments were significant according to many respondents. However, key finding of the study is strengthening of education system which was proposed by many of the respondents. It is actually observed in practice as well as in literature that many NGOs working in basic education in developing countries work for building infrastructure of schools, strengthening of education system by capacity building, changing attitudes, creating networks and trying to entertain as many students as they can (Miller-Grandvaux, Welmond, & Wolf, 2003).

4. Parameters of Organizational Effectiveness of TSOs working in Primary Education

After asking about the definition of organizational effectiveness of third sector in education sector, respondents were asked to identify certain parameters on which organizational effectiveness of TSOs is scrutinized at different levels. In response to it, certain significant parameters were highlighted. It included *strong management systems, quality improvement, increasing target areas, student retention rate, satisfaction of stakeholders, increasing literacy rate and scholarship follow-up*.

4.1 Strong Management Systems

All of the above discussed themes were identified by most of the respondents, only *scholarship-follow-up* idea was proposed by very few respondents. One of the respondent said, “Parameters regarding education sector can be identified as strong management system; Quality curriculum and its continuous development; Satisfaction of the students and their parents; increasing literacy rate; Quality improvement and the area covered where schools are not open.” Similarly another respondent asserted, “In my point of view, parameters regarding education sector can be identified as students’ retention rate- how many students retain and continue studies; scholarship follow-up- how many students receiving scholarship, are producing good results and continuing their studies; ensuring sustainable model- trying to sustain a model, helping one time does not serve the purpose, so complete education program for a student must be designed; maximum area covered ;increased literacy rate and quality improvement.” Moreover, another respondent emphasized the same aspects, “we strongly ensure about our organization that how many students are facilitated with free education? How many students are retained for longer periods and getting higher education? How they are contributing in the market? How organization is increasing the literacy rate? How many of our students and their parents are satisfied? How much people trust in an organization?” It can be inferred from the findings of the study that NGOs mostly believe that if their management systems are strong, they are

Defining Organizational Effectiveness of Third Sector Organizations in Pakistan: JRSP, Vol.58, No1 (Jan-March 2021)
 improving the quality of education by redesigning the curriculum of schools and if their respective organizations are able to retain students for pursuing their education, then they are working effectively.

4.2 Satisfaction of Stakeholders

If students, parents and other stakeholders are satisfied then they are effective. Most of the respondents identified satisfaction of parents and students as significant parameters of organizational effectiveness. As one of the respondent said, *“When we take education then there are different set of indicators as compared to other sectors for instance health or other areas of work. Education indicators are more complex in nature because we have multiple stakeholders. Our stakeholders are the students, then parents of our students and then the job market to which our students are providing services, and furthermore the society overall, therefore, it’s very difficult to identify the domain of stake holders. When we talk about organizational effectiveness then we need to include all of these stakeholders that are the recipients of the services of education.”* Similarly another respondent asserted, *“Our organization specifically focuses on the feedback and suggestions of parents.”*

4.3 Increasing literacy rate

Increasing literacy rate of Pakistan and reaching and increasing target areas where education can be accessible to every child were identified as are the parameters of Organizational Effectiveness. As one of the respondent said, *“For education sector, increase in literacy ratio, provision of quality of education, gauging employee performance towards goal, team work, strong management and analyzing student enrollment are the parameters.”* Similarly, another respondent said, *“Parameters regarding education sector can be identified as increasing literacy rate, increasing target areas where facilities and access of education can be reached and improving quality of education.”*

Parameters of Organizational Effectiveness of TSOs working in Primary Education in Pakistan				
Strong Management Systems			Satisfaction of Stakeholders	Increase literacy rate
Maximum Targets areas covered	Student Retention-rate and enrollment	Scholarship Follow-up		

Figure 4: Nodes explaining parameters of Organizational Effectiveness of TSOs working in Primary Education in Pakistan

It can be inferred from the above discussed findings that strong management system in which TSOs plan, execute and monitor their all activities is identified as major parameter of effectiveness (Anheier, 2014). Stakeholder’s satisfaction (positive-negative feedback ratio) is extensively discussed perspective with reference to organizational effectiveness (Packard, 2010; Tayşir & Tayşir, 2012).

5. Criteria to Measure Organizational Effectiveness of Education Sector (Basic)

Defining Organizational Effectiveness of Third Sector Organizations in Pakistan: JRSP, Vol.58, No1 (Jan-March 2021)

In order to have more clarity in terms of identifying parameters of organizational effectiveness of TSOs operating in basic education sector in Pakistan, respondents were asked to identify criteria to measure organizational effectiveness specifically related with their organizations. In response to it, certain indicators were pointed out which strengthened the findings related with parameters of Organizational Effectiveness.

According to the findings, *monitoring and evaluation of resources, time, performance of teachers, performance of students and goals achievement* were recognized as the major criteria to measure organizational effectiveness of TSOs working in education sector. Moreover, SWOT analysis was done in some NGOs to measure their effectiveness. Few of the respondents talked about student-teacher ratio as criteria to measure Organizational Effectiveness of third sector organizations operating in primary education sector in Pakistan.

5.1 Goal Attainment

Most of the respondents identified goal attainment as an important criteria to measure organizational effectiveness with respect to their concerned organizations. Evaluation of accomplishment of mission, objectives and targets are tangible measures to gauge *performance of any TSOs operating in primary education in Pakistan*. One of the respondent said, *“We consider ourselves working effectively, when our stated objectives and goals at start of the year get accomplished at the end of the year.”* Similarly, another respondent asserted the same fact, *“Organizational effectiveness is all about mission and targets accomplishment.”*

5.2 Performance Evaluation of Teachers and Students

Performance evaluation of teachers and students is identified as important criteria to measure organizational effectiveness of TSOs. One of the respondents said, *“To measure the effectiveness we have the following criteria; we have teacher evaluations forms through which performance of teachers is checked; student evaluation forms; results obtained by students after exams; doctors, engineers and other produced in market; number of students who continue their education and performance of students in job market.”* Similarly another respondent highlighted similar indicator with more elaboration, he said, *“yes we measure organization effectiveness on different basis such as: Identification of organizational domain and evaluation of clients, resources and timeframe utilized for execution and delivery of program. Moreover, we focus on internal assessment criteria, external effect of organization, analysis of weaknesses, strengths, opportunities and core areas. Our concern is on the monitoring and evaluation of the performance level of organization and on the measurement criteria of performance and after evaluation what is the ratio of problems existing, for we need to redefine certain things”.*

5.3 Student-Teacher Ratio

Student-Teacher ratio is one of the significant indicators of organizational effectiveness in Education sector. These indicators identified for third sector are also applicable to other sectors of society i.e. public and corporate sector.

Criteria to Measure Organizational Effectiveness of Education Sector (Basic)		
Goal Achievement	Performance Evaluation of Teachers and Students	Student-Teacher Ratio

Defining Organizational Effectiveness of Third Sector Organizations in Pakistan: JRSP, Vol.58, No1 (Jan-March 2021)
Figure5: Nodes explaining criteria to measure Organizational Effectiveness of Education Sector in Pakistan

Different TSOs working in Pakistan specifically in primary education sector are very diverse in terms of their mission, vision and objectives. Some of them are working to increase enrollment rate of students i.e. focusing on street child labor. Some others are focusing on retaining certain number of students at certain standard of classes. However, findings of this study support the fact with the literature that whatsoever the mission would be, TSOs are considered effective when they effectively achieving their goals. Performance evaluation of stakeholders is another significant theme identified in this study. Performance evaluation of teachers and students help in gauging performance of their respective organizations. Performance management is an important function of human resource management which helps in achieving strategic goals of the organization. After discussing all findings with literature, it has come to know that defining organizational effectiveness is a big challenge and no comprehensive definition exist that fosters and depicts organizational effectiveness

Conclusion and Recommendations

Defining Organizational Effectiveness of third sector organizations in Pakistan is quite a challenging task. In order to define effectiveness, different questions were asked from key informants working in TSOs operating in education sector in Pakistan. It may be noted that based on the analysis of the findings and results of the study, organizational effectiveness is a multidimensional concept especially with reference to third sector and most of the NGOs define their effectiveness differently.

Generally the implications and theoretical underpinnings of goal attainment theory and model are seen in organizational effectiveness of TSOs in Pakistan. Goal approach which is quite traditional, still have strong practical significance in TSOs working in education sector in Pakistan. Secondly, governance and strong integrated management practices can be associated with organizational effectiveness. If governance practices are aligned with rules and policies, board members are working effectively; congenial working relations exist between CEO and board members of any particular third sector organization in Pakistan, then it can be said that, that organization is effective (Herman & Renz, 2000). Organizational effectiveness of third sector organizations can be defined as achievement of goals, objectives and vision; strong integrated governance and management practices and trust of public (Singhal, 2015). Key dimensions which explain organizational effectiveness of TSOs in Pakistan are professionalism, social impact that any particular organization may have on society, employee and volunteer motivation and integration of systems (Forbes, 1998). Organizational effectiveness with reference to NGOs operating in primary education sector is again very diverse area to be explored. The study found certain indicators and parameters that define the effectiveness of such NGOs that included quality improvement; student-teacher ratio; strengthening of education sector; monitoring and evaluation of programs, projects, resources (human, capital), time frame, performance of teachers and students; training and development of teachers.

While summarizing the whole discussion, it can be concluded that no best definition is there to define organizational effectiveness of third sector organizations in Pakistan. This concept is interpreted by different people differently. However, according to the findings of the study, it can be said that those nonprofit organization working in education sector in Pakistan are termed as effective which are achieving their goals and objectives as stated in their mission and vision statements.

Recommendations

- There is a need to have integrated and indigenous frameworks and tools to measure effectiveness of third sector organizations at different functional areas in Pakistan.
- Government should have standard scrutiny criteria to measure effectiveness of third sector organizations working in different functional areas.

Defining Organizational Effectiveness of Third Sector Organizations in Pakistan: JRSP, Vol.58, No1 (Jan-March 2021)

- Government needs to frame certain rules and regulations such as standard operating procedures (SOPs) for specific type of third sector organizations which can be referred as benchmarks to evaluate organizational effectiveness of relevant organizations.
- There should be collaboration of third sector with government and private sector organizations for provision of public services like education specifically primary education. This will help in increasing credibility and goodwill of TSOs before public.

References

- Anheier, H. K. (2014). *Nonprofit Organizations Theory, Management, Policy*. London: Routledge.
- Arvidson, M., & Lyon, F. (2014). Social impact measurement and non-profit organisations: Compliance, resistance, and promotion. *VOLUNTAS: International Journal of Voluntary and Nonprofit Organizations*, 25(4), 869-886.
- Balduck, A., & Buelens, M. (2008). A Two-Level Competing Values Approach to Measure Nonprofit Organizational Effectiveness, "Working Papers of Faculty of Economics and Business": Ghent University, Faculty of Economics and Business Administration.
- Baruch, Y., & Ramalho, N. (2006). Communalities and distinctions in the measurement of organizational performance and effectiveness across for-profit and nonprofit sectors. *Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly*, 35(1), 39-65.
- Berkovich, I., & Foldes, V. (2012). Third sector involvement in public education: The Israeli case. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 50(2), 173-187.
- Cameron. (1986). Effectiveness as paradox: Consensus and conflict in conceptions of organizational effectiveness. *Management science*, 32(5), 539-553.
- Cameron. (2015). Organizational effectiveness. *Wiley Encyclopedia of Management*, 11, 1-4.
- Epstein, M. J., & Yuthas, K. (2017). *Measuring and improving social impacts: A guide for nonprofits, companies and impact investors*. San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler Publishers, Inc.
- Eyal, O., & Yarm, M. (2018). Schools in cross-sector alliances: what do schools seek in partnerships? *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 54(4), 648-688.
- Forbes, D. P. (1998). Measuring the unmeasurable: Empirical studies of nonprofit organization effectiveness from 1977 to 1997. *Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly*, 27(2), 183-202.
- Herman, R. D., & Renz, D. O. (1998). Nonprofit organizational effectiveness: Contrasts between especially effective and less effective organizations. *Nonprofit Management and Leadership*, 9(1), 23-38.
- Herman, R. D., & Renz, D. O. (1999). Theses on nonprofit organizational effectiveness. *Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly*, 28(2), 107-126.
- Herman, R. D., & Renz, D. O. (2000). Board practices of especially effective and less effective local nonprofit organizations. *The American Review of Public Administration*, 30(2), 146-160.
- Hossein, E., Ramezanehghad, R., Yosefi, B., Sajjadi, S. N., & Malekakhlagh, E. (2011). Compressive review of organizational effectiveness in sport. *Choregia: Sport Management International Journal*, 7(1), 5-21.
- Kolleck, N. (2016). Uncovering influence through social network analysis: the role of schools in education for sustainable development. *Journal of Education Policy*, 31(3), 308-329.
- Kolleck, N. (2019). The power of third sector organizations in public education. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 57(4), 411-425.
- Lakshmi, A. (2018). The Role of NGOs in Providing Non Formal Primary Education: A Case Study of Khammam District in Telangana. *International Journal of Research in Social Sciences*, 8(6), 210-219.
- LeRoux, K., & Wright, N. S. (2010). Does performance measurement improve strategic decision making? Findings from a national survey of nonprofit social service agencies. *Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly*, 39(4), 571-587.
- Miller-Grandvaux, Y., Welmond, M., & Wolf, J. (2003). Partnerships in education: Key findings on the role of NGOs in basic education in Africa. *Washington DC: USAID*.
- Osborne, S. P. (2010). *The new public governance: Emerging perspectives on the theory and practice of public governance*. New York: Routledge.
- Packard, T. (2010). Staff perceptions of variables affecting performance in human service organizations. *Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly*, 39(6), 971-990.

Defining Organizational Effectiveness of Third Sector Organizations in Pakistan: JRSP, Vol.58, No1 (Jan-March 2021)

- Pfeffer, J. (1982). *Organizations and Organization Theory*. Boston: Pitman.
- Rice, A. (Ed.). (2013). *The enterprise and its environment: A system theory of management organization*. London: Taylor and Francis.
- Scott, W. R., & Davis, G. F. (2017). *Organizations and organizing: Rational, natural and open systems perspectives*: Taylor & Francis Group.
- Shah, A. A. (Producer). (2018). Leadership and community mobilization for education access to marginalized communities: The case of an NGO in Sindh, Pakistan. *Institute for Educational Development, Karachi*. [Dissertation]
- Singhal, R. (2015). A Review of Organizational Effectiveness in NGOs. *Prabandhan: Indian Journal of Management*, 8(6), 7-16.
- Sowa, J. E., Selden, S. C., & Sandfort, J. R. (2004). No longer unmeasurable? A multidimensional integrated model of nonprofit organizational effectiveness. *Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly*, 33(4), 711-728.
- Speckbacher, G. (2003). The economics of performance management in nonprofit organizations. *Nonprofit Management and Leadership*, 13(3), 267-281.
- Tayşir, E. A., & Tayşir, N. K. (2012). Measuring effectiveness in nonprofit organizations: An integration effort. *Journal of Transnational Management*, 17(3), 220-235.
- Tsui, A. S. (1994). Reputational effectiveness: Toward a mutual responsiveness framework. In B. M. S. a. L. L. C. (eds.) (Ed.), *Research in organizational behavior* (Vol. 16, pp. 257-307). Greenwich, CT: JAI Press.
- Ulleberg, I. (2009). The role and impact of NGOs in capacity development. *From replacing the state to reinvigorating education*. Paris: International Institute for Educational Planning UNESCO.
- Vos, R. (2011). *Educational indicators: What's to be measured?* Washington, DC: Inter-American Development Bank.
- Yemini, M., Cegla, A., & Sagie, N. (2018). A comparative case-study of school-LEA-NGO interactions across different socio-economic strata in Israel. *Journal of education Policy*, 33(2), 243-261.
- Zollo, L., Laudano, M. C., Boccardi, A., & Ciappei, C. (2019). From governance to organizational effectiveness: the role of organizational identity and volunteers' commitment. *Journal of Management and Governance*, 23(1), 111-137.