

Ayyaz Gul\*  
Nyla Umar Mubarik,\*\*  
Ghulam Mustafa\*\*\*

## **EMOTIONS, HISTORY, AND HISTORY OF EMOTIONS IN PUNJAB: A HISTORIOGRAPHICAL SURVEY**

### **Abstract**

*By defining 'emotion', this research papers represents a historiographical survey of emotions in history. It highlights the definitional differences regarding 'emotion' among psychologists, neuroscientists, anthropologist, philosophers, and historians. By taking leads from emotions historians, this study defines the 'history of emotions' and unveils the history of the history of emotions. Moreover, it tries to examine the differences between historical psychology, psychohistory and history of emotions. It also discusses the contemporary themes and perspectives in history of emotions as newly emerging field in the current historical debate.*

**Key Words: Emotions, History, History of Emotions, Historical Psychology, Psychohistory**

The history of emotions is one of the new genres and rapidly growing fields in a contemporary historical debate. It talks about the role of cultural-historical context in the formation and experience of emotions. Although emotions are considered deeply personal, they have strong connections with others or to given environment. One of the key questions in this regard is, how emotions are valid for history? Emotions are valid for history, because, they are because of something (event) and because of someone (person). The biological substratum also cannot be overlooked in doing the history of emotion, because, they are embedded in the brain. Moreover, it also deals with the process through which ethos and mentality is shaped by some particular culture and the investigations of human feelings have revealed that emotions have broad social and political implications.

This research paper is divided into five sections such as defining emotion, defining history of emotions, historians and history of emotions, historical psychology, psychohistory and history of emotions, and contemporary themes and perspectives in history of emotions. By taking cues from multidisciplinary approach, first section tries to define emotion. Second section tries to define history of emotions. The brief evolution of the study of emotions in history by historian in different

---

\* Ayyaz Gul, Lecturer, G.C. University, Lahore, Pakistan.

\*\* Nyla Umar Mubarik, Ph. D. Scholar, Department of History and Pakistan Studies, University of the Punjab, Lahore.

\*\*\* Ghulam Mustafa, Ph. D. Scholar, Department of History and Pakistan Studies, University of the Punjab, Lahore.

time and space is given in third section. Fourth section deals with the disciplinary differences between historical psychology, psychohistory and history of emotions. Last section sheds light on the contemporary themes and perspectives of history of emotions. This study primarily comprises on secondary sources. In order to define the term 'emotion', some sources from life sciences are used. But most of historian works are used as rest of the secondary sources to trace emotions in history and to explore history of the history of emotions. Moreover, some extracts from online available interviews of contemporary scholars working on the history of emotions are also taken as a source of reference.

'Emotion' is an elusive and ambiguous term. Despite continuous conferences, books, journal, and theories, there is no consensus among psychologists, neuroscientists, historians, and philosophers regarding this term.<sup>1</sup> In the west, by the second half of the nineteenth century, the disciplines such as philosophy and theology defined thinking about emotion, but from 1860 onwards together with medicine, rhetoric, and literature, experimental psychology and neuroscience became more dominant to define emotion.<sup>2</sup> From 1892 to 1980, experiment psychologist counted ninety-two different definitions of emotion.<sup>3</sup> American psychologist, William James (1842-1910) was the first to use the word emotion in his essay titled "What Is an Emotion?" which appeared in 1884.<sup>4</sup> Some psychologist argues "everyone knows what an emotion is until asked to give a definition".<sup>5</sup> Moral psychologist, Michael Stocker says "Emotions are emotionally held thoughts."<sup>6</sup> Interestingly, emotion is also defined as "fluid and fleeting thing that like the wind comes and goes, one does not know how".<sup>7</sup> From a historian's point of view, it can be traced back to classical antiquity. Emotions are as old as a human being. The emotions of the past were not parts of civilized life, however they were fundamental to its existence.<sup>8</sup> Emotions are sometimes hidden in the text which historians use.<sup>9</sup> While explaining 'emotion', a British historian, Thomas Dixon opines that although the word 'emotion' is a key word in modern psychology, it is still in crisis.<sup>10</sup>

Classical Greek philosophers such as Plato (424-348) and Aristotle (384-322 Bc), medieval philosopher such as Saint Augustine (354-430), early modern philosophers such as Baruch de Spinoza (1632-1677), Rene Descartes (1596-1650), and modern philosophers such as Thomas Hobbes (1588-1679), John Locke (1632-1704), Jean-Jacques Rousseau (1712-1778), and Immanuel Kant (1724-1804), expressed their ideas about 'emotion'. Plato was first to use the term pathos in Greek for emotion. His pupil, Aristotle described the pathos (pl.pathe) as follows:

The emotions are all those affections which cause men to change their opinion in regard to their judgments, and are accompanied by pleasure and pain; such are anger, pity, fear, and all similar emotions and their contraries.<sup>11</sup>

Being influenced by the Christian writing of emotions,<sup>12</sup> Saint Augustine explains "what is important here is the quality of a man's will. For if the will is preserved, the emotions will be perverse; but if it is righteous, the emotions will be not only blameless but praiseworthy".<sup>13</sup> One of the famous philosophers of modernity and founder of dualism, Descartes involves a contrast between reason and emotion.<sup>14</sup> The monist,<sup>15</sup> Spinoza, who often considered the opposite of Descartes, believed in

a single divine substance which led him to conclude that feeling and soul as two sides of the same reality,<sup>16</sup> and divides feelings (emotions) actions which have their origin within us and passions which are external.<sup>17</sup> While defining the terrible state of nature, Hobbes opines, “no Arts; no Letters; no Society; and which is worst of all, continual fear, and danger of violent death; and life of man, solitary, poore, nasty, brutish, and short”.<sup>18</sup> Contrary to Hobbes, Lock says that feelings are “string of musical instrument” which tries to bring harmony in nature.<sup>19</sup> By taking an individual in an ideal state of nature, Rousseau writes in his novel *Emile* (Eng.1763), “the man who has lived the most is not he who has counted the most years but he who has most felt life”.<sup>20</sup> The Enlightenment driven separation between reason and feeling was amply expressed by Kant. He subdivides into affects and passions. He defines emotions beyond the control of reason and thus disconnects it from any kind of ethics.<sup>21</sup>

The historians of emotion always need a working definition of emotions. Jan Plamper suggests four aspects draft a working definition for the history of emotions. The first and foremost thing which one needs to evaluate is the role of imagination to form emotions, because, as compared to life sciences and other disciplines, the history of emotions advocates a greater role of an imaginary sphere. Secondly, while contextualizing the object of investigation, by examining local and historical ideas about feelings and physicality, one need to be clear about the relation between body and emotion. Thirdly, one should consider the emotional element of judgment or evaluation. Lastly, it would be great to develop a position upon the relation of emotion to morality.<sup>22</sup> In other words, the history of emotions is a way of looking or the way through emotions were structured and popularized, articulated, and how they were expressed in different historical periods. How emotions affected the historical change and vice-versa and how people felt, what were their sensations, and socio-cultural impact of the emotions. It is a way in which people experienced and expressed their feelings and how they categorized their feelings, and how those feeling interacted with each other.

### **Historians and the History of Emotions**

Prior to 1900, as it is presently understood, there is a weak systematic treatment of the historiography of emotions. Notwithstanding, this lack of study, there some historians threads which lead to knit a sketch of the study of emotion before Lucien Febvre (1878-1956). For example, Athenian historian, Thucydides (454-c.399BC) opines that in the past, emotion was one of the main impulses behind human actions. While writing about the Peloponnesian War between 431 and 404 Bc, he described that fear and other powerful feelings led Athenians and Spartans to war.<sup>23</sup> Another Greek historian, Polybius (c.200-c.120 Bc) discussed emotion as a main motivating force behind decision makings and actions.<sup>24</sup>

Later on, two art historians such as Karl Lamprecht (1856-1915) and Aby Warburg (1866-1929) also wrote about emotions. By borrowing emotions from psychology and anthropology, Lamprecht wrote an easy ‘What is Cultural History?’ appeared in 1897. He advocates that the achievements of modern psychology for the science of the laws of inner life can be enriched through historical explanation.<sup>25</sup> Warburg, the contemporary of Lamprecht in 1880, introduced the term *Pathosformel* in the field of art history, characterized

emotionally charged facial expressions and gestures in painting and sculpture.<sup>26</sup> In 1919, a Dutch historian, Johan Huizinga (1872-1945) being interested in child-like emotions wrote *The Autumn of the Middle Ages* in the wake of the horrors of the First World War.<sup>27</sup>

The historical inquiry into emotions started in the 1920s. French historian and one of the main exponents of ‘Annals School of History’, Lucien Febvre (1878-1956), was the first to explore the relation between history and emotions. In this regard, his essay appeared in 1938 entitled *Histoire et psychologie* (History and Psychology), in which he says “The task is, for a given period, to establish a detailed inventory of the mental equipment of the men of the time, then by dint of great learning, but also of imagination, to reconstitute the whole physical, intellectual and moral universe of each preceding generation.”<sup>28</sup> By writing this essay, he gave various leads to a historian to investigative techniques that would make it possible “to reconstitute the emotional life of the past.”<sup>29</sup> Furthermore, he called on historians to place emotions at the centre of their respective works and encouraged them to overcome any insecurity concerning the discipline of psychology when exploring feelings of the past.<sup>30</sup> He suggested to see human psychology not as constant or universal but as fluid and historically contingent.<sup>31</sup>

The foundational framework for Febvre’s new interpretation of history had already been set by Marc Bloch (1886-1944).<sup>32</sup> In his classical work *The Historian’s Craft*, he argued that “historical facts are, in essence, psychological facts. Normally, therefore, they find their antecedents in other psychological facts.”<sup>33</sup> The historian's task is to uncover the implicit meanings of collective behavior. Thus, Febvre and Bloch works provided fundamental and strong assumptions for imaginative interrogation of historical facts that would as Febvre wrote, “make mute things talk.”<sup>34</sup> Another annals historian, Fernand Braudel’s (1902-1985) study of *The Mediterranean World in the Age of Philip II*, by describing the connection between capitalism and material life argues about the role of emotions in decision-making or possibilities of their actions.<sup>35</sup> Moreover, some other French annals historians such as Philippe Ariès (1914-1984) medievalist historian of family and childhood and Roger Chartier (b.1945), a historiographer studied passions of earlier generations.<sup>36</sup> Annals historians such as Febvre, Bloch, and Braudel, Ariès, and Chartier writings shifted the study of history from high politics and kings into the ordinary peoples, craftsmen, and peasants. Moreover, they studied society, economy, environment, demography and mentalities and thus they were first to take feelings into account.<sup>37</sup>

### **Historical Psychology, Psycho-history and the History of Emotions**

The term ‘historical psychology’ was coined by historical psychologist Norbert Elias (1897-1990) through his famous work *The Civilizing process: The history of manners* written in German language while he was in England as a refugee from the Nazis. He used it to describe the historical study of “the order underlying historical change.” He was chiefly concerned with “the specific process of psychological ‘growing up’” in Western societies. In a study of customs ranging from blowing one’s nose to table manners and bedroom behaviour, he was inspired by psychoanalysis, sought above all the relation of conscious to unconscious impulses, concluding that the “civilizing process” involved the

progressive repression of emotion in favour of intellectual activity.<sup>38</sup> While describing the relation between human emotions and historical processes he says,

The formation of feelings of shame and revulsion and advances in the threshold of repugnance are both at once natural and historical processes. These forms of feeling are manifestations of human nature under specific social conditions, and they react their turn on the socio-historical process as one of its elements ... So far as the psychological functions of humans are concerned, natural and historical processes work indissolubly together.<sup>39</sup>

There are few analogies in Elias and Febvre such as both suggest that feelings are subject to historical transformation; both propose the use of psychology in history, and both consider that a history of emotions must make use of the depiction of feelings in paintings.<sup>40</sup> A veteran in the history of France from 1848 to 1945 and Elias of his time,<sup>41</sup> British historian Theodore Zeldin (b.1933), talks about six passions which include: anxiety, ambition, anger, love, taste and pride.<sup>42</sup> In the 1960s and 1970s, historical psychologist Zevedei Barbu (1914-1993) and French historian, Robert Mandrou (1921-1984) popularized the term 'historical psychology'.<sup>43</sup>

During the 1970s, the psychoanalytic<sup>44</sup> intertwined in the historical study of emotion took shape in form of 'psychohistory'. The Oxford Dictionary defines 'psychohistory' as "the interpretation of historical events with the aid of psychological theory".<sup>45</sup> It developed quite separately from the works of Zeldin, Elias, and Febvre, by its champions such as American historian Peter Gay (1923-2015),<sup>46</sup> Social Scientist Lloyd deMause (b.1931),<sup>47</sup> and German historian Peter Loewenberg (b.1933).<sup>48</sup> Despite the divergent approaches to the study of psychohistory or psychologising history, they agreed upon the importance of emotions in history. In its American context, psychohistory was commenced in 1957. William L. Langer (1896-1977), a former head of the Department of History, Harvard University, in his Presidential Address to the American Historical Association, put forward to the members of the profession that their "next assignment" involved the "urgently needed deepening of our historical understanding through exploitation of the concepts and findings of modern psychology."<sup>49</sup>

### **Contemporary Themes and Perspectives in the History of Emotions**

American historians such as Peter Nathaniel Stearns, Kenneth Lockridge, Barbara H. Rosenwein provided new approaches to study emotions in history. Peter N. Stearns's history of jealousy in America, Lockridge's study of gender and rage in the eighteenth century, and Rosenwein's *Anger's Past: The Social Uses of an Emotion in the Middle Ages*, and in Peter N. Stearns and Jan Lewis's *An Emotional History of the United States*, represented emerging historical approaches to the study of emotions, ranging from anger to sadness and jealousy<sup>50</sup> as an admixture of literary and social history, sociological and psychological perspectives, and the utilization of "thick description" to disclose precisely contextualized "deep structures" alongside the traditional practice of historiography as the means of narrating historical change.

In the mid-1980s, works on the history of emotions expounded a variety of approaches and the possibilities which were inherited in a blend of theoretical and disciplinary standpoints in unearthing notions of self and particularly emotional life, in the past.<sup>51</sup> The founding editor of the 'Journal of Social History' Peter N. Stearns, and Peter Zisowitz Stearns, a psychiatrist and historian accelerated a major advance in the history of emotions. By drawing a sharp distinction between the emotional norms and individual experience of emotions, they put more emphasis on the former. They coined the term 'emotionology' which means "collective emotional standards of a society."<sup>52</sup> They explained it as follows:

The attitude and standards that a society, or a definable group within a society, maintains toward basic emotions and their appropriate expression; ways that institutions reflect and encourage these attitudes in human conduct.<sup>53</sup>

The Stearns have advocated that 'emotionology' is detectable in a wide range of sources such as "manuals of military discipline, medical writings, from all essays about emotion, courtship behaviour, division of labour in the family, treatments for mental illness, sermons on family life, and other indicators of thought and behaviour."<sup>54</sup> They regarded emotions and emotionology as diverse analytical entities, but mutually related and thought that history of emotions as an extension of social history.<sup>55</sup> Moreover, for them, one of the main tasks of the historian is to assess emotional experience against the backdrop of emotional standards so that he/she can estimate the extent to which emotional life was articulated by those standards, separated from them, or contributed to their time to time transformation.<sup>56</sup>

In the early 1990s America, a new shift to deal with emotions through result drawn from life sciences started. By making a particular use of cognitive psychology, an American historian, and anthropologist, William M. Reddy drew ideas from life science in his work on emotions. He applied these ideas to the history of eighteenth century France especially terror during the French Revolution 1789, in his famous work, *The Navigation of Feeling: A Framework for the History of Emotions*.<sup>57</sup> For him intellectual history is critical to emotions history rather than antithetical to it.<sup>58</sup>

The epoch-making event of 9/11 in the United States of America was a sudden wake-up call for the study of the history of emotions. Through a tsunami of communication, negative emotions such as fear, hate, and disgust were aired not only in the USA but all over the world. History in 'e-motions',<sup>59</sup> through electronic media which includes text, blogs, and emails, triggered a boom in the study of the history of emotions. The book under review is the study of thematic and methodological aspects of the history of emotions before and after 9/11. It is pertinent to note that in this division of before and after, the most common feature is that it begins with the study of negative emotions. Febvre suggests that early studies of emotions deal with negative emotions such as 'the history of fear, the history of the hate, and the history of cruelty'.<sup>60</sup>

In 2002, medievalist historian, Barbara H. Rosenwein's article appeared in which he cemented historical research on emotions and challenged what she called Huizinga and Elias's 'grand narrative' of the history of emotions: that "the history of emotion in the West is the history of increasing emotional restraint."<sup>61</sup> She

presented the idea of ‘emotional communities’ as an alternative to grand narrative. She contested that

These are precisely the same as social communities—families, neighbourhoods, parliaments, guilds, monasteries, parish church memberships—but the researcher looking at them seeks above all to uncover systems of feeling: what these communities (and the individuals within them) define and assess as valuable or harmful to them; the evaluations that they make about others' emotions; the nature of the affective bonds between people that they recognize; and the modes of emotional expression that they expect, encourage, tolerate, and deplore.<sup>62</sup>

Later in 2006, she explained the idea of ‘emotional communities’ in her work, *Emotional Communities in the Early Middle Ages*. She advocated that emotional communities are like a group of persons who share the same norms about the expression of feelings, assessing the same feelings.<sup>63</sup> She argues that geographically emotional communities form a large circle and with some smaller circle. Former represents the overarching emotional community knitted together by some fundamental assumptions such as goals, values, feeling and accepted modes of expression and later represents the subordinate emotional communities within the larger one by revealing its possibilities and limitations.<sup>64</sup>

Ute Frevert, a German historian and current executive director of the Centre for the History of Emotions at the [Max Planck Institute for Human Development](#), opened various new avenues in the field of the history of emotions.<sup>65</sup> In her work, *Emotions in History: Lost and Found* (2013) she investigates the historicity of emotions. This study seeks to explore the ways that brought emotions to the fore of public interest and debate. It also explores that how emotions influence human behaviour in a given situation and seem to be of the utmost significance to societies which are preoccupied with everything “neuro.” Moreover, it discusses that emotions have become an important object of continuous individual and social manipulation since the term “emotional intelligence” emerged.<sup>66</sup> Her article, ‘Wartime Emotions: Honour, Shame and the Ecstasy of Sacrifice’ appeared in 2014 in which during the First World War, she investigated the essential role of public honour and shame in private and public life, in domestic and foreign relations, in propaganda and in routine life. This article also explores the practices of public shaming and the strong devotion to sacrifice of oneself and his/her beloved ones and uncovers the roots of these decidedly gendered concepts of honour and shame in the moral economy of nineteenth-century Europe’s power politics.<sup>67</sup>

[Max Planck Institute for Human Development](#)’s ‘Centre for the History of Emotions’ works closely with scholars of history. By exploring the history of the body, education and in the connection between emotions and power, it focuses on the modern history of emotions, chiefly in Europe and South Asia. A Series of multi-authored historical monographs on role of emotions in history include: *Emotions in History: Lost and Found* (2013), *Emotional Lexicon: Continuity and Change in the vocabulary of Feeling 1700-2000* (2014), *Leaning How to Feel: Children Literature and the History of Emotional Socialization, 1870-1970* (2014), *Civilizing Emotions: Concepts in Nineteenth-Century Asia and Europe* (2015), brought a fundamental change in the study of emotions in history.

Since the late seventeenth century to the twentieth century, Emotional Lexicon (2014) is a novel cultural history of terms of emotions found in English, French and German language encyclopaedias. It deals with some of the fundamental questions related to emotions such as "are emotions in the mind or in the body? Can we "read" another person's feelings in their face? Do animals have feelings? Are men less emotional than women? Can emotions be "civilized"? Do groups feel together? Do our emotions connect us with others or create distance?" It also analyses European discourses in science and in broader society regarding passions, sentiments, affects, and emotions.<sup>68</sup>

Learning How to Feel (2014) traces the ways in which children and youth not only learn how to state emotions which are considered to be pre-existing but in fact how to feel. During 1870 to 1970, by studying children's literature and advice manuals it accesses the training practices and learning processes for a broad range of emotions and it reveals how children were made available with emotional learning tools through their syllabus to navigate their emotional lives. It covers a broad array of political and socio-cultural milieus in Europe, Canada, the USA, and India.<sup>69</sup>

Civilizing Emotions (2015) by exploring the origin and evolutions of the concepts such as civility and civilization at the start of twenty-first century's political debate, adds a level of self-reflexivity to the current debate. As contrary to previous histories, it advocates a global perception, underlining the role of civility and civilization in the formation of a new and hierarchical global order in the era of high imperialism and its entanglements with the expansions in different European and Asian countries. In the nineteenth century, emotions played a significant role in the creation of a new global order. Moreover, Civilizing Emotions not only investigates that why and how emotions were an asset in civilizing peoples and societies, but also the creation and ascription of emotions to different societies and social groups. This study is a significant contribution to the history of emotions, to the history of concepts and to global history, which first time brought together in contemporary historical debate.<sup>70</sup>

John Corrigan, an American professor of Religion and Professor of History and one of the main exponents in the academic study of religion and emotion and in the field of the spatial humanities. He argues in his book *Business of the Heart: Religion and Emotion in the Nineteenth Century* that in the wake of the 1857 market crash in America, the "Businessmen's Revival" was also religious revival. By exploring the religious history of Boston in the 1850s, he gives a creative and broad interpretive study of the revival's importance. He uses this revival as a central point for explaining a spectacular range of phenomena in American cultures such as the business history of Boston, education, family life, the history of the theatre and public demonstration, and chiefly, ideas about emotion during nineteenth century. It uses relatively unexplored sources such as public records, diaries, and correspondences to evaluate emotional experiences of individuals. By using these sources, he demonstrates that Protestants saw emotion as a commodity and conceptualized their relations with people and God as transactions of emotion governed by like business contracts. By entering into this new relationship, they were actually conducting the "business of the heart." This book added a new



chapter in the study of the history of religion and emotions and it is a significant contribution to unveiling the links between religion and emotions.<sup>71</sup>

**Thomas Dixon**, a British historian of emotions and director of the Centre for the History of the Emotions, at Queen Mary, University of London, discusses the British history of weeping in his recent book *Weeping Britannia: Portrait of a Nation in Tears* (2015). This work highlights and discovers the British's religious and cultural history of articulating and interpreting tears which were relatively ignored by the rise of a stoical inhibited British empire in the late nineteenth century. By using history to explore a new perspective regarding the changing nature of Britishness over time, it is a repository of tears and a philosophical handbook. It also provides leads to understanding ever-shifting ways in which British utters and understands their emotional lives. It not only describes the tears of some of the most prominent figures in British history which ranges from Oliver Cromwell to Margaret Thatcher but also explores the tearful micro-histories which contributes to a broad picture of relative emotional ideas and expression over the centuries by touching many other attracting areas of the British history. By exploring the histories of various cultures such as the British cinema, theatre, music, literature and painting, it discover how and why people expressed tears for arts, sentimental paintings, and novels of the eighteenth century, and for the romantic music of the nineteenth century and while listening to pop music in the twentieth century.<sup>72</sup>

The primary focus of historians working on history of emotions has been remained largely hitherto within Western context. With reference to history of emotions South Asian history such as Punjab is a virgin territory. The religious, political, and socio-cultural exploration of emotions including their formation, regulation, and performance is a methodologically rich field. So, the lens of emotions history could be extended to colonial Punjab where the question of identity remained the perplexing one for Muslim communities. Muslim communities such as Shia community and Shrine-based community in colonial Punjab tried to construct and preserve their identity through emotions such as grief and happiness. Shia community used grief and shrine-based community through happiness tried to construct and preserve Muslim identity.

Grief and happiness were evoked through devotional literature and devotional rituals in colonial Punjab. Devotional literature such as the commentaries of Prophet's traditions, historical events related to personalities, by the contemporary scholars promoted grief among Shias. Among the Shrine-based community devotional literature called *milad* literature regarding the celebration of the birthday of Prophet, promoted happiness. Apart from other political and economic interests, devotional rituals of observing various religious practices during the month of Muharram and celebration of *mela* (festive activity) at Chishti Sufis shrines were also based on the expression of weeping and happiness. Places of grief and happiness such as *imambargah* and *khanqah* (shrine) were used to articulate and intensify grief and happiness. This kind of the study of emotions will propose new ways and methods to interpret formation, preservation, and expression of emotions. So, there is a need to write the history of colonial Punjab through the glass of emotions.

## **Conclusion**

The study reveals that the history of emotions is passing through its Renaissance period. There are many psychologists, neuroscientist, anthropologists and historians are trying to explore the multiple meaning of emotions in their respective fields. From this research paper, it appears that the term 'emotion' has multiple meanings. Therefore, it suggests that historians working on the history of emotions should have a working definition of emotions. By tracing the classical and contemporary historian's works, it also contests that with respect to different time and space, the history of emotions also has a history. It retraces the works of historians regarding the role of emotions in history and through interpreting contemporary themes and perspectives in history of emotions; it opens new horizons for the study of emotions in history.

## References

- 
- <sup>1</sup> Carroll Izard, 'The Many Meanings/Aspects of Emotion: Definitions, Functions, Activation, and Regulation', *Emotion Review*, 2, (2010), pp. 363–370, here pp.367-368
- <sup>2</sup> Jan Plamper, *The History of Emotions: An Introduction*, trans. Keith Tribe, (UK: Oxford University Press, 2015),pp.9-10
- <sup>3</sup> Paul R. Kleinginna Jun. and Anne M. Kleinginna, 'A Categorized List of Emotion Definitions, with Suggestions for a Consensual Definition', *Motivation and Emotion*, 5/4 (1981), 345-379
- <sup>4</sup> William James, 'What Is an Emotion', *Mind*, 9/34 (1884), pp.188-205
- <sup>5</sup> Beverley Fehr and James A. Russell, 'Concept of Emotion Viewed from a Prototype Perspective', *Journal of Experimental Psychology: General*, 113/3 (1984), pp.464-486, here p.464
- <sup>6</sup> Michael Stocker, 'Emotional Thoughts', *American Philosophical Quarterly* 24 (1987): 59
- <sup>7</sup> Stewart R. Roberts, 'Nervous and Mental Influences in Angina Pectoris', *American Heart Journal*, 7/1 (1931), pp. 21-35, here p.23
- <sup>8</sup> Barbara H. Rosenwein; Worrying about Emotions in History. *American Historical Review* 2002; 107 (3): 821-845. Here p. 823
- <sup>9</sup> Jan Plamper, 'The History of Emotions: An Interview with William Reddy, Barbara Rosenwein and Peter Stearns, *History and Theory*, Vol. 49, No. 2 (May 2010), pp. 237-265. Here,p.250
- <sup>10</sup> For meaning, categories, concepts, and connotations regarding 'emotion' see, Thomas Dixon, "Emotion": The History of a Keyword in Crisis, *Emotion Review* Vol. 4, No. 4 (October 2012) 338–344
- <sup>11</sup> Aristotle, *The 'Art' of Rhetoric*, trans. John Henry Freese (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1959),p.173
- <sup>12</sup> For Christians writing about emotion see, Barbara H. Rosenwein, *Emotional Communities in the Early Middle Ages*, p.46-50
- <sup>13</sup> Augustine, *The City of God*, ed. and trans. R.W Dyson (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998), p.590
- <sup>14</sup> For more details about Rene Descartes contrast between reason and emotion see, Jan Plamper, *The History of Emotions: An Introduction*, trans. Keith Tribe, (UK: Oxford University Press, 2015),pp.17-18
- <sup>15</sup> Monist means the person who believes in monism which is an antithesis of dualism.
- <sup>16</sup> Jan Plamper, *The History of Emotions: An Introduction*,p.19
- <sup>17</sup> *Ibid*.p.20
- <sup>18</sup> Thomas Hobbes, *Leviathan*, ed. Richard Tuck (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 19960, p.89
- <sup>19</sup> Gardiner, Metcalf, and Beebe-Centre, *Feeling and Emotion: A History of Theories*, Volume 4, (Greenwood Press, 1937), p.212
- <sup>20</sup> Jean Jacques Rousseau, *Emile*, trans. And Ed. Christopher Kelly and Allan Bloom (Lebanon: Dartmouth College Press, 2010), p.167
- <sup>21</sup> Jan Plamper, *The History of Emotions: An Introduction*p.24
- <sup>22</sup> For more details see, Jan Plamper, *The History of Emotions: An Introduction*, trans. Keith Tribe, (UK: Oxford University Press, 2015),p.39

<sup>23</sup> Jan Plamper, *The History of Emotions: An Introduction*, p.43

<sup>24</sup> *Ibid.* p.44

<sup>25</sup> Jan Plamper, *The History of Emotions: An Introduction*, p.45

<sup>26</sup> For more details see, Aby Warburg, 'Durer and Italian Antiquity (1905), in *The Renewal of Pagan Antiquity: Contribution to the Cultural History of the European Renaissance*, trans. David Brett (Los Angeles: Getty Research Institute for the History of Arts and the Humanities, 1999), pp 553-8

<sup>27</sup> The English translation of his work first published in 1924 and later in 1996.

<sup>28</sup> Lucien Febvre, 'History and Psychology', in *A New Kind of History and Other Essays*, ed. Peter Burke, trans. K. Folk (New York, 1973), p.9. The essay was originally published in 1938. For the discussion of the role of the Annals school in the emergence of the study of popular culture (with valuable references to the issue of emotion) see Stewart Clark, 'French Historians and Early Modern Popular Culture', *Past and Present* 10 (1983), 62–99.

<sup>29</sup> Lucien Febvre, 'Sensibility and History: How to Reconstitute the Emotional Life of the Past', in *A New Kind of History and Other Essays*, 12–26.

<sup>30</sup> Jan Plamper, *The History of Emotions: An Introduction*, pp.40-41

<sup>31</sup> [Susan J. Matt](#), [Peter N. Stearns](#), ed. *Doing Emotions History* (University of Illinois Press, 2013), p. 3

<sup>32</sup> His study of popular belief in the cure of scrofula by the king's touch in medieval and early modern times was predicated on the notion that "the miracle of scrofula is incontestably bound up with a whole psychological system." See, Marc Bloch, *The Royal Touch*, trans. J.E. Andersen (New York, 1961), 29. First published in 1923.

<sup>33</sup> Marc Bloch, *The Historian's Craft*, trans. Peter Putnam (New York, 1973), p.194.

<sup>34</sup> Febvre, "A New Kind of History," in *A New Kind of History and Other Essays*, (New York, 1973), p.34; Johan Huizinga, *The Waning of the Middle Ages* (London, 1924)

<sup>35</sup> Not only were events, or actions (*histoire événementielle*), to be distinguished from the historical structures that limited and controlled events (*histoire de la longue durée*), but actors themselves were considered to be imprisoned within those structures and thus determined in their possibilities. For more details see, [John Corrigan](#), *Business of the Heart: Religion and Emotion in the Nineteenth Century* (University of California Press, 2001), p.270

<sup>36</sup> Philippe Ariès, [Centuries of Childhood. A Social History of Family Life](#), trans. Alfred A. Knopf (Vintage Books, 1962) Roger Chartier, [History of Private Life, Volume III: Passions of the Renaissance](#) (Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1993)

<sup>37</sup> Jan Plamper, *The History of Emotions: An Introduction*, p.40

<sup>38</sup> Norbert Elias, *The Civilizing process: The history of manners*, trans. Edmund Jephcott (New York, 1978). First published 1939

<sup>39</sup> Norbert Elias, *Civilizing Process, The history of manners*, trans. Edmund Jephcott (New York, 1978), p. 135

<sup>40</sup> Jan Plamper, *The History of Emotions: An Introduction*, p.51

<sup>41</sup> *Ibid.* p.52

<sup>42</sup> For more details see, Theodore Zeldin, 'Personal History and the History of Emotions', *Journal of Social History*, 15/3 (1982), pp.339-47; and Theodore Zeldin, *An Intimate History of Humanity* (New York: Harper Collins, 1994)

<sup>43</sup> Zevedei Barbu, in a book dedicated to Febvre, argued that historical psychology differed from anthropology in that the former studied “the variations of the human mind on a vertical line, or the changes that have occurred in the mental structure of groups of individuals as a result of the development in time of their culture as a whole”, *Problems of historical psychology* (New York, 1960), p.5. Robert Mandrou, *Introduction to Modern France: An essay in historical psychology*, trans. R.E. Hallmark (New York, 1975).

<sup>44</sup> Freud's psychoanalytical theories or of relating or to incorporating the methods and theory of psychiatric treatment originated by Sigmund Freud (1856-1939).

<sup>45</sup> <https://en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/psychohistory>, accessed on 23.05.2017, at 16:02 PM

<sup>46</sup> Peter Gay, *The Bourgeois Experience: Victoria to Freud*, Vol.5, (New York: Oxford University Press, /Norman, 1984-1998)

<sup>47</sup> Lloyd deMause, ‘The Evolution of Childhood’, in deMause (ed), *The History of Childhood* (New York: Harper & Row, 1974), pp.1-73, esp.pp.49-50; Lloyd De Mause, who wrote that “psychohistory reduces all of its subject matter to ‘psychological motives’” so that “narrative history describes sequences of historical events; psychohistory discovers laws of historical motivations.” Lloyd DeMause, *Foundations of Psychohistory* (New York, 1982),

<sup>48</sup> Peter Loewenberg, Emotion und Subjektivität: Desiderata der gegenwärtigen Geschichtswissenschaft as psychoanalytic her Perspektive,” in P. Nolte, M. Hertling, F.M. Kuhlemann, and H.W. Schmuhl, eds., *Perspetiven der Gesellschaftsgeschichte* (München: Verlag C.H. Beck, 2000), pp. 58–78.”

<sup>49</sup> William L. Langer, “The Next Assignment,” *American Historical Review* 63 (1958), 284–85

<sup>50</sup> [Susan J. Matt](#), [Peter N. Stearns](#), ed. *Doing Emotions History* (University of Illinois Press, 2013), p. 3

<sup>51</sup> John Corrigan, *Business of the Heart: Religion and Emotion in the Nineteenth Century* (University of California Press, 2002), p.273

<sup>52</sup> ”The concept of emotionology is necessary, quite simply, to distinguish between professed values and emotional experience” (Stearns and Stearns, “Emotionology,” 824). Criticism of the Stearns’ approach is in John E. Toews, "Cultural History, the Construction of Subjectivity, and Freudian Theory: A Critique of Carol and Peter Stearns' Proposal for a New History of Emotions," *Psychohistory Review* 18 (1990), 303–18. See also Peter N. Stearns, "Historical Analysis in the Study of Emotion," *Motivation and Emotion* 10 (1986), 185–93.

<sup>53</sup> Peter N. Stearns and Carol Z. Stearns, *Emotionology: Clarifying the History of Emotions and Emotional Standards*, *The American Historical Review*, Vol. 90, No. 4 (Oct., 1985), pp. 813-836, here 813

<sup>54</sup> John Corrigan, *Business of the Heart*, pp.273-274

<sup>55</sup> Jan Plamper, *The History of Emotions: An Introduction* ,p.57-8

<sup>56</sup> John Corrigan, *Business of the Heart*, p.274

<sup>57</sup> [William M. Reddy](#), *The Navigation of Feeling: A Framework for the History of Emotions*, (Cambridge University Press, 2001)

<sup>58</sup> Barbara H. Rosenwein, ‘Worrying about Emotions in History’, *American Historical Review* 2002; 107 (3): 821-845. Here p.839

<sup>59</sup> For more details see, VALATSOU, Despoina. History, our own Stories, and Emotions Online., [S.l.], v. 8, p. 108-116, may 2009. ISSN 2241-2816. Available at: <<https://ejournals.epublishing.ekt.gr/index.php/historein/article/view/2133>>. Date accessed: 24 may 2017. doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.12681/historein.43>.

<sup>60</sup> Jan Plamper, *The History of Emotions: An Introduction*, p.42

<sup>61</sup> Barbara H. Rosenwein, 'Worrying about Emotions in History' *American Historical Review* 2002; 107 (3): 821-845. Here p. 827

<sup>62</sup> Ibid. p. 828

<sup>63</sup> Barbara H. Rosenwein, *Emotional Communities in the Early Middle Ages* (USA: Cornell University Press, 2006),p.2

<sup>64</sup> Ibid.,p.24

<sup>65</sup> In January 2008 a new research center was inaugurated at the Max Planck Institute for Human Development in Berlin. Under the budget that emotions are important to and in human development, the Centre for the History of Emotions set out to explore a new but flourishing working field. The Centre is in a privileged position to explore this continent with the support of the generous funding of the Max Planck Society which allows scholars (pre and postdoctoral) to carry out basic research in ideal working conditions. For more details about the objectives, areas, and lines of research of the Centre, as well as the impact and new horizons of research see, Frevert, U. (2014). The modern history of emotions: A research center in Berlin. *Cuadernos de Historia Contemporánea*, 36, 31-55. doi:10.5209/rev\_CHCO.2014.v36.46681

<sup>66</sup> Ute Frevert, *Emotions in History: Lost and Found* (Central European University Press, 2013)

<sup>67</sup> Frevert, U. (2014). Wartime emotions: Honour, Shame, and the ecstasy of sacrifice. In U. Daniel, P. Gatrell, O. Janz, H. Jones, J. Keene, A. Kramer, & B. Nasson (Eds.), *1914-1918-online: International Encyclopedia of the First World War*. Berlin: Freie Universität Berlin. doi:10.15463/ie1418.10409

<sup>68</sup> Ute Frevert et al, *Emotional Lexicon: Continuity and Change in the Vocabulary of Feeling 1700-2000* (UK: Oxford University Press, 2014)

<sup>69</sup> Ute Frevert et al, *Learning How to Feel: Children's Literature and the History of Emotional Socialization, 1870-1970* (UK: Oxford University Press, 2014)

<sup>70</sup> For details see, Margrit Pernau et al, *Civilizing Emotions: Concepts in Nineteenth-Century Asia and Europe*. (U. K: Oxford University Press, 2015)

<sup>71</sup> For details see, [John Corrigan](#), *Business of the Heart, Religion and Emotion in the Nineteenth Century* (University of California Press, 2001)

<sup>72</sup> For details see, Thomas Dixon, *Weeping Britannia: Portrait of a Nation in Tears* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015)