

A Comparative Framing Analysis of the Red Mosque Incident in the Coverage of Local Right Wing and Western Print Media (June – Aug 2007)

Rohail Ahmed and Dr. Fatima Sajjad

Abstract

The purpose of this research is to analyze how a crucial incident of Pakistan's recent political history - the Red Mosque military operation of 2007 has been reported and narrated by selected Western and Local Right wing newspapers. How these media forums framed the news stories about the Red Mosque incident in their respective contexts. This study explains the news framing trends using framing analysis of Western and Pakistani Local Right wing media. At the first phase, Framing Analysis elucidates the language of the news stories of two factions through framing forms/tools which are based on rhetoric sense. Then, at second phase, comparative analysis technique elaborates the major frames of two newspapers. The study finds how various frames used by Pakistani Local Right wing media (The Daily Islam, The Daily Jasarat & The Takbeer Weekly) and selected Western media (The Guardian, The Washington Post & The Economist) to describe the story of the Red Mosque incident in 2007.

Keywords: Framing Analysis, Red Mosque incident, Extremism, Pakistani Media, Western Media.

Introduction

The U.S. led post 9/11 War on Terror left a lasting impact on multiple sections of Pakistani society. One sector which was most deeply affected by the multidimensional war was the traditional religious education in Pakistan. The Red Mosque and its affiliated seminaries were one of the most important institutions for religious education at the heart of Pakistani capital Islamabad. It was built in the early years of newly established capital of Pakistan. It had also long history in the perspective of Pakistani politics, Russo-Afghan war and War on Terror. Especially after 9/11 attacks, world and Pakistani society was also affected by the polarization. As the result of this change, one faction of Pakistani society had become opponent of the Red Mosque administration's ideas and actions, while the other faction supported them. Clash between the two groups brought a gory wave of terrorism in Pakistan. This situation became more severe after conducting a gory military action against the Red Mosque. In response of this stance, non-stoppable suicide bombings started across the country. So the Western and Pakistani Local Right wing print Media framed this situation with two different angles. They also presented a different picture of the Red Mosque siege and incident from each other.

The purpose of this study is to analyze how the Local Right wing and Western print media used conflicting frames to create and maintain divergent accounts of the Red Mosque incident. So this research uses Social Constructivism to explain the multiple

*Authors are Visiting Lecturer and Assistant Professor, Dept. of Political Science, University of Management and Technology (UMT), Lahore

realities of the Red Mosque incident. Here it presents the broader scenario of this incident through two different media groups. Each media group constructs its own reality on the basis of its pre conceived ideas and assumptions, and frames the Red Mosque incident accordingly. Then framing analysis technique presents the detailed analysis of news articles of both sides through Framing Forms/Tools (Metaphor, Jargon, Contrast, Spin and Story). Application of these Framing Forms/Tools assists the researcher to conclude the results.

Historical Background

The Red Mosque property was allocated during President Ayub's Government and then the mosque was constructed by CDA (Capital Development Authority) in 1965. After completion of the mosque, a request letter was written by an Islamabad-based religious organization IOAM (International Organization for the Administration of Mosques) to the Head of Jamia Binoria, Maulana Yousaf Binori for the appointment of a mosque's Imam. The name of Maulana Abdullah was finalized who would run the day-to-day affairs of the mosque. He was a fresh graduate from the Jamia Binoria. He accepted this offer and was appointed the Imam of Jamia Masjid at G-6/4, its renamed it as the Red Mosque (Dolnik & Iqbal, 2016).

During President Ayub's Government, Maulana Abdullah supported Mufti Mehmood who was the Head of JUI (Jamiat ul Ulma-e-Islam). Mufti Mehmood had substantial influence on the Government. Maulana Abdullah established close relations with the political leader who proved useful for him in future (Dolnik & Iqbal, 2016).

He also participated in the Anti-Ahmadiya Movement and was imprisoned four times for participation in the agitation. He was also part of the anti-Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto Movement to remove the Premier from the office (Dolnik & Iqbal, 2016).

The Red Mosque was also used for the recruitment of the Mujahideen, as well as it was also a meeting point of Pakistani intelligence agencies. During the 1980's, Mulana Abdullah established his relations with the military agencies, Afghan Mujahedeen and Politicians. Zia's Government was the golden period for Maulana Abdullah and the Red Mosque because Zia's government passed the rehabilitation grant of Rs.7.255 Million (Directive No.833, PC-1) in August, 1981, this amount changed the lot of the people. It was the result to the support that Mujahedeen during Afghan-Russia war used it as its base. (Dolnik & Iqbal, 2016).

Maulana Abdullah was also the founder of Jamia Faridia which was a seminary for male students in the posh area of Islamabad. The land was gifted by the Government of Pakistan during the Afghan War of 1979 to 1988 (Dolnik & Iqbal, 2016).

The period of 1990's was the era of influence making from the administrator of the Red Mosque. Maulana Abdullah created close links with Talibans and spy agencies. He established the Jamia Hafsa for female students in 1992. It was located adjacent to

A Comparative Framing Analysis of the Red Mosque Incident in the Coverage of Local Right Wing and Western Print Media (June – Aug 2007)

Red Mosque. After that, he was assassinated in 1998 in front of the Red Mosque (Dolnik & Iqbal, 2016).

Maulana had two sons namely Maulana Abdul Aziz and Abdul Rashid Ghazi. Maulana Abdul Aziz became Incharge of the Red Mosque and other seminaries after assassination of his father (Hussain, 2010).

Abdul Rashid Ghazi also joined his brother and performed his duties as Deputy of the mosque and seminary. He had master's degree in International Relations from Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad. Then he joined as officer in Education Ministry, afterwards he left this job and joined UNESCO (United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization) as Assistant Director. Suddenly, he left the UNESCO and became the part of Red Mosque Administration. Life of Ghazi Abdul Rashid was totally changed after meeting Osama Bin Laden in Kandhar, Afghanistan, 1998 (Dolnik & Iqbal, 2016 & Hussain, 2010).

Taliban Government was established in 1996 in Afghanistan. It was the right time for Maulana Abdullah Ghazi and Ghazi Abdul Rashid who went to Afghanistan to pay homage to Mullah Omer, declared himself as titular head namely Ameer ul Momneen which means Leader of all Muslims (Hussain, 2010 & Small, 2015).

At that time, they met Osama Bin Ladin whose personality appealed them immensely especially Ghazi Abdul Rashid was so impressed from Osama Bin Ladin (Small, 2015).

A strange event occurred during their visit of Afghanistan. During the meeting Osama Bin Ladin drank water and put the half empty glass on the ground, Ghazi Abdul Rashid picked up the glass left by the Osama Bin Ladin. Ghazi drank this water. Osama in surprise asked him: "Why did you drink it?"

He replied that God may make him like him . So this incident shows the deep spiritual affiliation of him with Osama Bin Ladin (Hussain, 2010)

After 9/11, the scenario was totally changed. Religious seminaries which were blue eyed of Pakistani intelligence agencies. Now, these seminaries watched with doubtful eyes because majority of them supported the Taliban and Al-Qaida. Both brothers inspired with Taliban style government in Afghanistan, so they started making radical demands - enforce the Sharia Law in the country using the platform of the Red Mosque. Abdul Rashid Ghazi, Maulana Abdul Aziz and their students especially women who were equipped with clubs started to make appearances on the nearby roads and roofs chanting slogans in favour of their demands (Abbas, 2007).

The struggle to enforce the Sharia law in the Red Mosque adjacent areas resulted in terror, violence, kidnapping and other unlawful activities ensued highlighted by the liberal media. But the Right Wing Media depicted an opposite picture of the Red Mosque incident (Charania, 2015).

Rohail Ahmed and Dr. Fatima Sajjad

Law enforcement agencies and the liberal media alleged that two protagonists of the Red Mosque were working to promote the ideology of the Al-Qaida, they also provided shelter to the Al-Qaida and Taliban terrorists. Western media also reported the connections of the two chief clerics with Taliban (Saini, 2009).

After giving plenty of warnings, the govt. started a military action against the Red Mosque clerics, students and adjacent seminary Jamia Hafsa from 3rd July, 2007 to 11th July, 2007. A lot of students were captured, wounded and killed by the security forces. Maulana Abdul Aziz was also arrested trying to escape from the siege in 'Burqa'. At the end of the Red Mosque siege, a lot of students and Abdul Rashid Ghazi himself were killed by the commando action namely Operation Silence of Pakistan Army (Abbas, 2007).

This incident got special coverage through international electronic and especially print media during the siege of the Red Mosque. National and international print media also published the articles and editorials about the Red Mosque incident. So the main purpose of this study is to understand 'How do the diverse accounts of the Red Mosque incident as presented by the local Right Wing and Western Print Media use conflicting frames to create and maintain divergence of Local Right Wing and broader Western public opinion on the issue?'

Furthermore, Pakistan became sharply divided into two opposite poles: one faction promoted liberal thoughts. They tended to fiercely oppose conservative religious groups. They propagated the notion that religious seminaries were involved in terrorism and violence. They wanted to eradicate them ruthlessly, but Right Wing faction having religious views, tended to think that the government and Western countries wanted to eliminate their religious traditions and their ethos were in danger. They saw government's policies with suspicion and opposed them fiercely. Red Mosque incident occurred in this tense atmosphere where religious right wing and liberal forces were already in conflict. The tragic incident happened in the capital city Islamabad, where according to estimate, hundreds were killed by law enforcement agencies in an operation carried out to cleanse the Red Mosque of potential terrorists and their alleged supporters (Saini, 2009).

This study also explains the significant importance about this incident which have left unforgettable signs on the history of Pakistan due to a gory clash, started between Pakistani security forces and students of the Red Mosque. As a result of this fight several hundred lives were lost. It is crucial to know about the news stories how they framed and influenced on its audience of both Local Right and Western print media?

A Comparative Framing Analysis of the Red Mosque Incident in the Coverage of Local Right Wing and Western Print Media (June – Aug 2007)

Table 1

Chronological Events of the Red Mosque (Dolnik & Iqbal, 2016)

Year	Description of Event
1960	Land was allocated for the Mosque (260' × 260' plot)
1974	Maulana Abdullah actively participated in the Anti-Ahmadiya Movement.
1979 – 1989	The Red Mosque was used to recruit the Mujahedeens.
August, 1981	Grant for rehabilitation of the mosque was approved.
1984	Grant for renovation of the mosque was given.
1996	Government of Islamic Emirate of Afghanistan (Under supervision of Taliban) was founded in Afghanistan after civil war.
1998	Maulana Abdullah was assassinated by unknown people.
2002	First written notice was issued to the Red Mosque by the CDA (Capital Development Authority) to vacate the encroached land.
March, 2004	The Red Mosque Administration issued a Fatwa against Pak Army.
July, 2005	The Security Agencies raided on the Red Mosque due to connections with the suicide bombings in London on 7 th July, 2005.
Jan, 2007	Students of Jamia Hafsa occupied the Children Library.
March, 2007	Students of Jamia Hafsa and Jamia Fardia visited the markets of CD's in the Islamabad and ordered to the shop owners to stop their business.
27 th March, 2007	A group of few students was forcefully shutdown a massage parlour as well as they kidnapped the staff of parlor in the Mosque.
6 th April, 2007	The Mosque Administration established Sharia courts.
18 th May, 2007	Jamia Hafsa students brought four police men as hostage in the mosque.
2 nd June, 2007	Nine people were captured from a massage parlour.
29 th June, 2007	Gen. Pervez Musharraf claimed that several suicide bombers are found in the mosque.
3 rd July, 2007	Army besieged the Red Mosque and its seminaries.
4 th July, 2007	The Govt. warned the students to surrender voluntarily.
5 th July, 2007	Maulana Abdullah was arrested, while escaping from the mosque.
6 th July, 2007	Allegations of firing on Musharraf's aeroplane were going towards the Red Mosque.
7 th July, 2007	A Colonel was killed during cross firing.
8 th July, 2007	Ch. Shujaat Hussain joined the negotiating committee.
10 th July, 2007	Negotiation was successful, Ghazi Abdul Rashid accepted all demands of the Government but Gen. Musharraf refused to accept this negotiation. Commando Action started in the mosque. Ghazi Abdul Rashid was killed by the commandos.

Research Question: How do the diverse accounts of the Red Mosque incident as presented by the local Right Wing and Western Print Media use conflicting frames to create and maintain divergence of Local Right Wing and broader Western public opinion on the issue?

Theoretical Framework of this Study

Social Constructivism focuses on common ideas, thoughts and assumptions of a society. The culture and history of a social group put deep impact on ideas and assumptions of its people and create social reality for them. Different incidents or events are seen from the lens of socially constructed reality (Vygotsky, 1978).

Media is the most vital component which constructs the social reality in contemporary era . Media frames the news stories in its own ways, so that it may create suspense and apprehension for the audience. In the case of the Red Mosque incident, both media groups framed the news stories according to their own official policies. The two media groups represented entirely opposite culture and language and they addressed completely different audience, so they framed the Red Mosque story according to their pre-conceived ideas , assumptions and culture .

Framing theory is the main component of this research. It helps to understand the hidden meanings of news stories. Framing analysis of this research covers the news stories of Local Right Wing and Western newspapers for a specific period. Framing analysis conducts through Language Forms (Metaphors, Jargon, Contrast, Spin and Stories) (Fairhurst & Sarr, 1996).

Methodology

The study relies on interpretative qualitative research which forms the essence of this thesis .The study deals with the " world of human experience" specifically social construction of reality, hence it follows the interpretative research paradigm. (Cohen & Manion, 1994). Main aim of the interpretative or descriptive study is to explain the social reality through the lens of human experience (Flick, 2009 & Bryman, 2004).

The Framing and Data Analysis Research Design

For this study, I have used Qualitative Inductive Framing Analysis Technique to elucidate the print media Frames of two different sides (Hallahan, 1999) about the Red Mosque bloodshed incident of July, 2007. These frames consist of textual analysis which exposes hidden meaning of the news reporting which puts deep effects on the reader (Borah, 2011). It is also compulsory for a leader to understand the symbols and words which are used to frame a specific event, gesture or picture (Fairhurst & Sarr, 1996). There are five kinds of Frames. Each one has own definition and typology according to specific situation. Definitions of the Frames written below for understandings (Semetko & Valkenburg, 2000):

A Comparative Framing Analysis of the Red Mosque Incident in the Coverage of Local Right Wing and Western Print Media (June – Aug 2007)

Table 2

Classification of Frames (Semetko & Valkenburg, 2000)

Sr. #.	Name of News Frames	Explanation
1.	Conflict Frame	These type of frames explains the conflict between entities (Groups, People, and Countries, etc).
2.	Human Interest Frame	Human Interest Frame presents deep thinking and emotional connectivity of someone about an event/issue.
3.	Morality Frame	This kind of Frame presents the issue, event or some problem in the sense of morality and religious beliefs.
4.	Economic Consequences Frame	Economic Consequences Frame elucidates the some event or incident in terms of positive or negative economic effects.
5.	Responsibility Frame	Responsibility Frame explains who should be held responsible for an incident/event or problem.

Textual Analysis Technique are borrowed from the book 'The Art of Framing: Managing the Language of Leadership' written by Fairhurst & Sarr (1996). In this book, he describes in detail various methods to make the frames on the five language forms. These forms has been defined below in a table format:

Table 3

Language Forms of Fairhurst & Sarr (1996)

List of Language Forms	Description
Metaphor	What kind of metaphors has been used to describe the events and happenings?
Stories (myths, legends)	What stories have been constructed?
Slogan, Jargon, catchphrase	An object frames through catchy words, slogan and jargon because these are more memorable for something else.
Contrast	An object described in same meaning as well as in opposite meaning.
Spin	To talk about an idea or concept which may produce positive and negative effect?

The abovementioned Language Form Box will be used to make the comparative framing analysis of the local Right Wing and Western newspapers' 'Emerging Frames'. Local Right Wing and Western Media frames have been brought in a table form. These will be explained one by one through Emerging Messages from both sides.

The concept of Matrix Style table has been taken from (Gorp, 2009). First column (Source Text) of this table records important textual material from the original data of newspapers/magazines. Next row of the first column contains the complete

information about a news article. For example, it is written as such: 20070704-TG-WN-1.

First four digits represents the year, next two numeric represent the month, then next two digits symbolize the date of an article. Characters TG stands for The Guardian which is name of the newspaper and WN constitutes World News which represents specific portion and name of a newspaper. While, the last digit tells about the total number of articles of a specific newspaper in the ascending order. Further, Bracketed data shows the name of the title (Newspaper/Magazine). Moreover, below of the Bracketed Data displays Original Text of newspapers/magazines.

Second column elucidates the relationship of the News Frames (Conflict, Human Interest, Morality, Responsibility and Economic Consequences Frames) with third column 'Frame (Name)'.

While third column of the Matrix Table extracts Frames, emerges from the news articles/stories. This is the essence of this study especially to make comparative analysis and findings.

Fourth column of Matrix Table explains the Language Forms (Metaphor, Contrast, Jargon, Catchphrases, Spin and Story) of a news article. This idea of textual analysis through Language Forms is borrowed from book *The Art of Framing* written by Fairhurst & Sarr in 1996.

Fifth Column of the table explains the Technical Devices which are borrowed from (Linstrom & Maraias, 2012). Technical Devices are main components of a newspaper which shows the seriousness and gravity of some news story. Headlines, Subheadings, Editorial, Articles, Photos and Paragraphs, etc are the main components of a news story. This study also observes News Stories, Editorials and Articles (Linstrom & Maraias, 2012).

Data Collection

Local Right Wing Newspapers:

The Daily Jasarat:

Daily circulation of The Daily Jasarat is about Thirty Thousand (Rana, 2008), but it is claimed by them that Daily Jasarat was the first newspaper in Urdu language which presented its online news services. It has been in publication since 1969 ("About Us," n.d.).

The Daily Jasarat has deep affiliation with Jamaat-e-Islami, Pakistan a Right-Wing religious cum political party. This organization was established on 26th August, 1941, and Maulana Muwdoodi was its founder. Jamaat-e-Islami also claims that it is the biggest/oldest organized Islamic political party in the Pakistan. ("Jamaat-e-Islami," n.d.).

A Comparative Framing Analysis of the Red Mosque Incident in the Coverage of Local Right Wing and Western Print Media (June – Aug 2007)

During the siege of Red Mosque, this newspaper framed the story of the Red Mosque prominently siding with the Administration and students of the besieged students. So it was apt to choose the Daily Jsrat, Karachi newspaper. This newspaper did not publish any full article on the Red Mosque during month of June, 2007, but published few news stories. During the month of July, 2007, a number of articles and editorial were published in this newspaper about the Red Mosque. After that, in the month of August, it published a few articles, editorials and news stories, so I selected the all articles/editorials from the month of July, 2007. These articles have a lot of importance for its content value.

The Daily Islam:

The Daily Islam is also published from Karachi under the supervision of Al-Rashid Trust which is a charity organization but this outfit was banned by the United Nations due to terroristic activities. A lot of publications publish under the supervision of Al-Rashid Trust ("Al-Rashid Trust," n.d.)

The Daily Islam also presents the staunch views of the Right Wing media. It also claims to sell One Lac & Ten Thousand copies (Rana, 2008).

It also did not publish sufficient material on the Red Mosque during the month of June, 2007. But aplenty of material on the Red Mosque was published during the month of July, 2007. So I have selected many articles/editorial from July, 2007. Few articles were also published during the month of August, 2007. Prominence of these articles was also less.

The Weekly Takbeer:

The Weekly Takbeer also publishes from Karachi. It also claims through official website that It is the biggest weekly published magazine of Pakistan. Circulation of this magazine is across Pakistan. ("Takbeer," n.d.) It publishes under the supervision of 'Ummat Group of Publications' which has Right Wing ideology (Rana, 2008)

Most of the Weekly Takbeer articles publish during the month of July, 2007. During the month of June and August, few articles and editorials was published.

Western Print Media:

The Guardian

The Guardian was launched in 1821 by John Edward. The aim of this newspaper is to promote liberal interests ("History of the Guardian," 2002). Daily circulation of the Guardian in the month of July, 2007 was Three Lac, Sixty-two Thousand, Three Hundred & Nine only. It also claims to pioneer first full colour newspaper of the United Kingdom. ("National Daily Newspaper Circulation July 2007," n.d.)

A lot of articles were published in the Guardian on the topic of Red Mosque during the months of June, July and August 2007. I searched through those articles/news stories through Key words 'RED MOSQUE' and 'LAL MASJID' directly from the official website of the Guardian. Then I copied them in a MS Word file.

The Economist:

The Economist magazine was created by the British man named James Wilson in 1843 in response to enhance free economy and boost the liberal thoughts. Presently, the weekly circulation of the Economist is more than 1.4 million copies across the world ("About us," n.d.)

I also explored these articles/news stories through Key words 'RED MOSQUE' and 'LAL MASJID' directly from the official website of the Economist. Then I copied them in a MS Word file.

The Washington Post:

The Washington Post is a United States of America based newspaper which is one of the largest circulated newspaper in the U.S.A. Total circulated copies of the Washington Post was Six Lac, Twenty-two Thousand, Seven Hundred & Fourteen Only in the 2008 ("PAID CIRCULATION: THEN AND NOW," n.d.) The Washington Post is known for extreme reporting regardless of any institution. For example, it exposed the Water Gate Scandal and some US Secret reports. It also observes liberal ideology ("Washington Post: a brief history", n.d.).

I also searched these articles/news stories through Key words 'RED MOSQUE' and 'LAL MASJID' directly from the official website of the Washington Post during specified period. Then I copied them in a MS Word file.

Table 4

Data Collection (Newspapers & Magazine wise Article Strength)

Newspapers& Magazines	No. of Selected Articles	Language of the Newspapers& Magazines
Daily Islam	7 Articles	Urdu
Daily Jasarat	7 Articles	Urdu
The Takbeer (Weekly)	3 Articles	Urdu
The Guardian	7 Articles	English
The Washington Post	7 Articles	English
The Economist (weekly)	3 Articles	English

Comparative Framing Analysis of The Local Right Wing and The Western Print Media

" How divergent are the frames used and overall message projected by Local right wing print media and Western print media?"

A Comparative Framing Analysis of the Red Mosque Incident in the Coverage of Local Right Wing and Western Print Media (June – Aug 2007)

This portion synthesizes the earlier discussion by comparing the two frames of Local right wing print media and Western print media together as well as it also explains contrast between them.

The Local right wing and the Western print media used the Conflict, Human Interest and Morality Frames to present the news stories according to own official policies. These frames have been taken and designed from newspapers which framed the same event from different angles and varied prospectus.

Repetitive frames have been converged from 'Divergent Frames and Their Emerging Messages' table. Only one Frame has been chosen from Framing Analysis Table due to similarities.

Table 5

Divergent Frames and Their Emerging Messages:

The Divergent Frames		Overall Emerging Message	
Local Right Wing Media Frames	Western Media Frames	Local Right Wing Media	Western Media
Fair demands of Red Mosque Students and Clerics	Islamist Extremism	Local Right Wing media claimed that the students and clerics have constitutional right to raise their voices for implementation of Islamic Sharia Law in the country.	While the Western Media called them as Extremists - Rebel and Outlaws.
Blame game by the Government	Armed Followers	Local Right wing media claimed that the government spreads false rumors against the followers of the clerics.	The Western media framed the followers as armed group equipped with weapons and bamboo sticks.
Public supported activities	Illegal Activities in the City by students	The Local Right wing media framed the students as heroes who stopped the illegal and unethical activities in the capital city with the public support.	The Western Media framed the activities of the students as illegal, unlawful rebellious and illegitimate.
Efforts of Ulma	Efforts for Negotiations	The Local Right wing media appreciated the negotiation between the two parties.	The Western Media also appreciated the negotiation, but wanted the Government to keep upper hand.
Non-presence of Terrorists.	Links between Red Mosque clerics, Al-Qaeda and	The Local Right wing media claimed that there was not any terrorists inside the Mosque. No connection	While the Western Media claimed that it was the safest place for terrorists to operate and

Rohail Ahmed and Dr. Fatima Sajjad

	Taliban.	between Red Mosque clerics, Al-Qaeda and Taliban	there was a strong link between Red Mosque clerics, Al-Qaeda and Taliban
Diversion the attention from Political issues	Usage of Red Mosque on Political Grounds	The Local Right wing media framed the Red Mosque incident as political interests of the Government.	The Western Media also claimed that the government was taking political mileage from this incident.
Government intentionally made the issue longer	Political Instability	Local Right wing media claimed international powers and liberal Pakistani, NGO's (Non-Governmental Organizations) and leaders were using this issue for their own interests.	The Western Media framed the Red Mosque incident as a cause of political instability.
Fair Demands of Red Mosque Students and Clerics	Taliban Style Campaign	The Local Right wing media claimed that Red Mosque Students and Clerics have constitutional right to make fair demands.	While the Western Media framed this notion of Local Right wing as Taliban Style Campaign of violence.
Baseless rumors by the Government	Women and Children as Human Shields	The Local Right wing media claimed that the government spread baseless rumors against the followers of the clerics.	The Western Media claimed that clerics and their students made hostages to the ladies and children and used them as human shield.
Conditional surrender	Conditional Surrender	The Local Right wing media framed the news that Ghazi Abdul Rashid was ready for surrender.	The Western Media also framed that Ghazi Abdul Rashid was ready to surrender on quite unacceptable conditions
Weapons for own Security Purpose	Mass of Weapons	The Local Right Wing media framed the news about a few weapons used by the students for security of the Mosque.	While the Western Media framed the stories about weapons as Red Mosque students had the pile of most modern weapons.
Pre-planned attack on Red Mosque	Hardcore Military Action	Attack on the Red Mosque was pre-planned to kill maximum number of students and their clerics.	The Western Media also framed this incident as gory and horrible.
Non-presence of Terrorists	Pakistan as a Nursery for the Terrorists	International Powers were trying to prove Pakistan as a Terrorist State.	The Western Media framed the Pakistan as a Nursery of Terrorists.
Intentionally	Musharraf and	The Government	Musharraf was not ready

A Comparative Framing Analysis of the Red Mosque Incident in the Coverage of Local Right Wing and Western Print Media (June – Aug 2007)

dissolution of dialogue	fair negotiation Policy	internationally dialogue Mosque.	halted to attack the	the lives-loss of soldiers.	to make dialogue due to Army
Escape of Abdul Aziz	Escape of Abdul Aziz	The Local Right Wing Media claims the escape of Abdul Aziz form Mosque due to an confidential call of by a government representative.		The Western Media framed the escaping of Abdul Aziz from the Mosque as a coward person who wants to save his life in any way.	

Some frames were not given by the Western Media, but the Local Right Wing media frequently used them in the newspapers. These frames are:

Table 6

Divergent Frames and Their Emerging Messages:

The Divergent Frames		Overall Emerging Message	
Local Right Wing Media Frames	Western Media Frames	Local Right Wing Media	Western Media
Dislocating or hidden dead bodies	Not Farmed	The Local Right Wing Media claimed that Government hid or dislocated the a lot of dead bodies of male and female students.	-
Defaming the Captured Students	Not Framed	The Government was dealing very harshly with captured students. This notion came under the violation of human ethics.	-

Detailed Comparative Analysis:

Comparative Analysis consists of ' Divergent Frames' which explain social realities. In simple words, we are living in a socially constructed world in which people know the world through their own experiences and knowledge about some incident or event. As well assumptions, knowledge and ideas give opportunities to all people to understand our social constructed world (Verenikina, 2010). Media also constructed the ideas and knowledge with own observations and official policies. These elements also help the audience to understand the social realities.

On the whole, the Local Right Wing media gave a lot of coverage to this incident, while the Western Print Media framed this incident during the first and half decade of the July, 2007. The Local Right wing Print media pointed out every bit and tiny thing about the Red Mosque, because it was a very important local issue. Comparatively the Western Print Media gave it much importance. But according to their own interest.

This study also compares the prescribed Frames from the Local Right Wing media to the Western media:

Extremism Vs. Basic Right of Freedom:

Local Right Wing Media constructed its reality about the its right to implement the Sharia Law in the country. Basically Islamic Provisions of Pakistani constitution and especially Objective Resolution provides surety to the people of Pakistan to make such laws which should have been relevant to Islam. So Red Mosque Administration and students protested for the implementation of Sharia Law across the country. While this notion was presented by the Western media as Islamic extremism and radicalism especially when Western media observed the agitation of female students who were laced with hoisted truncheon in the air. Everyone might have believed that violent gestures of the girls were not peaceful, and produced dangerous message to the public. They also labeled that the Red Mosque students and their clerics wanted to make a Theocratic State in Pakistan. Administration Red Mosque established the Sharia-law courts in the mosque and they also started to make decision in this court. So Western media framed this notion as initial step to make theocratic state. Western countries had already watched the experience of neighbor country Iran in 1979. At that time, Imam Khomeini became the spiritual leader of Iran after a Islamic revolution. This experience was too harsh for western countries. Then did not want another theocratic state in the Asia. Western media framed the actions of the Red Mosque administration and students as extremism and radicalism especially they want to do anything with forceful attitude.

Legal Vs. Illegal Activities:

Local Right wing media in comparison with the Western media elucidated the situation about illegal activities because:

There is a gigantic difference between Pakistani and Western societies. Usually every Muslim country makes such laws which are made on the principles of religion. Pakistani constitution also has Islamic provisions but Red mosque administrators interpreted them wrongly and they used violence and force to implement the Islamic Sharia which was wrong. Many Islamic Scholars also condemned the way of twin brothers. Western societies takes religion as separate entity from politics. So Western media framed the administrators as law violators, extremists and radicals. As well, Red Mosque used to recruit for Mujahideen during Afghan-Russia war. For that, Western media connected the Red Mosque and twin brothers with terrorists who made intentionally illegal activities to establish a theocratic state.

Usage of the Red Mosque for Political Interests:

Local Right wing media framed the Government which used the Red Mosque for political interests. The Government wanted to divert the attention of the people from the Judicial crisis and 12th May, 2007 incident of Karachi.

Judicial crisis was the main hurdle for President Pervez Musharraf because he sacked the Chief Justice from service but lawyers of the country started a movement against

A Comparative Framing Analysis of the Red Mosque Incident in the Coverage of Local Right Wing and Western Print Media (June – Aug 2007)

him. Lawyers wanted to restore the Chief Justice own but it might have become dangerous for President Musharraf because he had military background. So Pervez Musharraf intentionally made this issue (Red Mosque) longer for different political tactics. Incident of Karachi occurred on 12th May, 2007 was also part of this game.

Western Media also framed this situation as equal as Local Right wing media but it framed this situation slightly because Pervez Musharraf was the ally of West in War on Terror.

Efforts of Conciliation and Ghazi Abdul Rashid's Offer for Surrender:

Local Right wing media framed the hard efforts of the Ulama (Islamic Scholars) and Pakistani politician about restoration of dialogues between two parties during the siege of Red Mosque. Ghazi Abdul Rashid had been ready for conditional surrender and conditions might have accepted but at last time, President Pervez Musharraf refused to accept his conditions. Attitude of Pervez Musharraf showed that he was ready to eliminate them because a senior army officer (Colonel Ranked) had been killed during siege of the Red Mosque. So Army was ready to take revenge of its officer from them.

But the Western print media framed the efforts of negotiation in negative manners. Because it was in favour of political dialogue with political personalities. Western media assumes religion as separate entity from politics. So it did not like the involvement of Islamic Scholars. Western media was also in favour of peaceful dialogue with Ghazi Abdul Rashid but it was astonished on the action of General Pervez Musharraf.

Unnoticed Frames by Western Media:

Local Right wing pointed out the inhuman action of the government authorities about hidden/dislocating the dead bodies from the Red Mosque. They also blamed the government which wanted to hide the reality. As well Local Right media also presented the unethical activity of the Law enforced agencies which defamed the personality of captured students during detainment. The Law Enforcement agencies had taken off the shirts of the male students and tied their hands behind their bodies. Then they were paraded before the media. Such activities in the entire world are banned due to be unethical and illegal because detainees have also protected through Law of Tart or equivalent laws.

The Western print media did not frame unethical activities of the law enforced agencies. It was the serious matter but Western media was stopped entirely on such grievous unethical wrong doings.

Local Right wing print media and Western Print media tried to explained the social realities which were prevailed around the Red Mosque incidents. Social realities

constructs through ideas and assumptions. So both media groups constructed the reality according to own assumptions and presented before their audience.

Conclusion

The purpose of this study was to understand how different parties perceive a conflict. How their stories differ significantly and how the media is used to project one sided views through selective reporting.

This study attempted to examine various frames used by Pakistani Local Right wing media (The Daily Islam, The Daily Jasarat & The Takbeer Weekly) and selected Western media (The Guardian, The Washington Post & The Economist) to describe the story of the Red Mosque incident in 2007.

This study shows three significant findings in the description of the Red Mosque incident by the Framing Analysis of Pakistani Local Right wing media and the Western media. First, the Local Right wing media framed the protest of the Red Mosque students (Male & of Female) as if they have constitutional/primary right to make efforts for implementation of Sharia Laws. Because Pakistani constitutional Article No. 227 provides guarantee to the subjects of Pakistan, No law will be made in the country against the soul of Quran and Sunnah as well as all laws would be brought according to the injunctions of Islam. Furthermore, Pakistani constitution (Article 2, 2-A, 227, 228, 229 and 230) have numerous Islamic provisions which produce vigor and strength to the Local Right wing for implementation of the Islamic Sharia. So Local Right wing print media supported the students and administration of the Red Mosque. They initiated their agitation against the government for the process of Islamization in Pakistan.

On the other hand, the Western print media presented this agitation of the Red Mosque students as a Revolt or Extremism, especially when female students came out from Madrassa carrying batons. Then they brought out the batons as lethal weapons before the audience. Because the Western Media framed the contents of this incident according to their own assumptions. So Western media labeled (Extremists, Terrorists, Pro-Taliban, Pro-Al-Qaida and etc.) the Red Mosque Administration and their students. The Western media also used harsh and ruthless words to frame this event.

Secondly, this study also points out the extractions of two unique Frames ('Dislocating Dead bodies' & 'Defaming the Captured Students') from the Local Right Wing print media. It claims that Government dislocates the dead bodies of the students who were killed during the commando action. Because the Government wanted to give less casualties. The Government also smeared captured students during siege of the Red Mosque. Because they paraded the captured students who were shirtless as well as hands of the students were tied with their shirts before media But the Western Print Media did not present any frame either it could have defined aforesaid incidents during the Red Mosque incident.

A Comparative Framing Analysis of the Red Mosque Incident in the Coverage of Local Right Wing and Western Print Media (June – Aug 2007)

Thirdly, both media factions have contrary point of view. But they had equal stand on one point of 'peaceful negotiation between the Red Mosque Administration and the Government'. The Local Right wing media and the Western media paid special attention towards negotiation, so that they might have averted the gory fighting.

The Red Mosque incident in some ways represents the reactionary politics of Islamism against the dominant modern western political framework. The contrast between the accounts of two print media reveals how this conflict was not restricted to the incident - but it continues to prevail on a broader scale. In many ways, international media artifacts are part of this conflict as they describe only their part of the story and use different frames to justify their position.

In a conflicting situation, beliefs and perceptions of conflicting parties play a major role in defining the conflict. While their attitudes and behaviours determine escalation or de-escalation of conflict. In case of the Red Mosque incident, the conflict escalated because of the attitude of both parties which tended to favour imposition of their ideas and world views on the other by force. The conflict could have been de-escalated if the common desire for peaceful solution was given a better choice.

The prevailing conflict between reactionary Islamist forces and the hegemonic West can only be resolved when both parties show willingness to reduce the desire for control and dominate the other and expand their area of mutual agreement to seek peaceful solution to the problem.

References

- A mosque red with blood. (2007, July 05). *The Economist*. Retrieved February 11, 2017 from: <http://www.economist.com/node/9435066>
- Abbas, H. (2007). The Road to Lal Masjid and its Aftermath. *Terrorism Monitor*, 5 (14).
- About Us. (2017, 18 July). Retrieved July 18, 2017 from <http://www.jasarat.com/about-us/>
- About us. (2017, 20 June). Retrieved June 20, 2017 from <http://www.economist.com/help/about-us>
- Al Rashid Trust. (2017, 3 August). Retrieved August 03, 2017 from <http://web.stanford.edu/group/mappingmilitants/cgi-bin/groups/view/117>
- Al-Rashid Trust. (2017, 20 July). Retrieved July 20, 2017 from http://www.satp.org/satporgtp/countries/pakistan/terroristoutfits/Al-Rashid_Trust.htm
- Awam ko Kuch Na Bataya Jy. (2007, July 15). *The Daily Jasarat*, p.3.
- Baig, M. A. (2007, July 23). Kiya ye Fooj aur Awam ki Jang ha? *The Daily Jasarat*, p.3.
- Borah, P. (2011). Conceptual issues in framing theory: A systematic examination of a decade's literature. *Journal of Communication*, 61, 246-263.
- Bryman, A. 2004 (second edition), *Social Research Methods*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Burhan ke Kharji Hawaly. (2007, July 7). *The Daily Jasarat*, p.3.
- Charania, M. M. (2015). Re/Reading Female Political Subjectivity in Pakistan. In N. A. Naples & J. B. Bickham (Eds.), *Border Politics Social Movements, Collective Identities and Globalization* (120-150). New York: New York University Press.
- Cohen, L., & Manion, L. (1994). *Research methods in education*. London: Routledge.
- Dolnik, A., & Iqbal, K. (2016). *Negotiating the Siege of the LAL MASJID*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- Ejaz, M. (2007, July 8) Lal Masjid pr Hamla: Ittefaq ya Te Shuda Operation. *The Daily Jasarat*, p.3.
- Fairhurst, G. T., & Sarr, R. A. (1996). *The art of framing: Managing the language of leadership*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.
- Flick, U. (2009). *An introduction to qualitative research*. Sage.
- Fourie, P.J. (ed.) 2001. *Media Studies. Volume one: Institutions, Theories and Issues*. Lansdowne: Juta.
- Hallahan, K. (1999). Seven Models of Framing: Implications for Public Relations. *Jouranal of Public Relations Research Vol. 11*(3). Retrieved January 11, 2017 from <http://comphacker.org/comp/engl338/files/2012/08/framing-and-public-relations.pdf>
- History of the Guardian. (2017, 22 June). Retrieved June 22, 2017 from <https://www.theguardian.com/gnm-archive/2002/jun/06/1>
- Hussain, Z. (2007) *Frontline Pakistan: The Struggle with Militant Islam*. Lahore: Vanguard Books.

A Comparative Framing Analysis of the Red Mosque Incident in the Coverage of Local Right Wing and Western Print Media (June – Aug 2007)

- Hussain, Z. (2010) *The Scorpion's Tail*. New York: Free Press.
- Lal Masjid Tanazea aur Ulma ka do Took Mouqaf. (2007, July 6). *The Daily Islam*, p.3.
- Lal Masjid Tanazea pur Aman Tareeqy sy Hal Kia Jy. (2007, July 8). *The Daily Islam*, p.3.
- Linstrom, M, & Marais, W. (2012). QUALITATIVE NEWS FRAME ANALYSIS: A METHODOLOGY. *Communitas, Vol 17* pp. 21 - 38. Retrieved from: http://scholar.ufs.ac.za:8080/xmlui/bitstream/handle/11660/3650/comm_v17_n1_a9.pdf?sequence=3
- National daily newspaper circulation July 2007. (2017, 1 August). Retrieved from: <https://www.theguardian.com/media/presspublishing/table/0,,2147823,00.html>
- PAID CIRCULATION: THEN & NOW. (2017, 21 June). Retrieved June 21, 2017 from <http://adage.com/images/random/0309/4-1990s-030909.pdf>
- Rana, M. A. (2008). Jihadi Print Media in Pakistan: An Overview. *Conflict and Peace Studies*. Retrieved February 11, 2017 from <http://pakpips.com/downloads/pdf/200.pdf>
- Sahir, S. (2007, July 18). Lal Masjid ka Waqia: Drama ya Haqeeqat. *Takbeer*, p.24.
- Saini, S. K. (2009). Storming of Lal Masjid in Pakistan: An Analysis. *Strategic Analysis*, 33 (4), 553-565. DOI:10.1080/09700160902907092
- Semetko, H. A., & Valkenburg, P. M. (2000). Framing European politics: A content analysis of press and television news. *Journal of Communication*, 50(2), 93–109.
- Small, A. (2015). *The China Pakistan Axis; Asia's New Geopolitics*. London: C. Hurst & Co.
- The last battle. (2007, 10 July). *The Economist*. Retrieved February 11, 2017 from <http://www.economist.com/node/9449034>
- Verenikina, I. (2010). Vygotsky in Twenty-First-Century research. In J. Herrington & B. Hunter (Eds.), *Proceedings of World Conference on Educational Multimedia, Hypermedia and Telecommunications* (pp. 16-25). Chesapeake, VA: AACE Retrieved January 12, 2017 from <http://ro.uow.edu.au/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=2337&context=edupapers>
- Vygotsky, L. (1978). *Interaction between learning and development*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press. Retrieved April 02, 2017 from http://www.colorado.edu/physics/phys4810/phys4810_fa08/4810_readings/vygot_cha_p6.pdf
- Washington Post*: a brief history. (2017, 21 June). Retrieved March 22, 2017 from http://ccnmtl.columbia.edu/projects/caseconsortium/casestudies/147/casestudy/www/layout/case_id_147_id_1014.html
- Witte, G. (2007, 5 July). Radical Cleric in Pakistan Standoff Captured. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved February 17, 2017 from <http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2007/07/04/AR2007070400159.html>