
A Legacy in the Making: Zulfikar Ali Bhutto's Political Grooming of Benazir Bhutto

Imran Shahzad

Tauqir Ahmad Khan

At the outset of her autobiography, Benazir Bhutto asserted that she had no initial intention of entering politics, but rather, it was the prevailing circumstances that compelled her to engage in the challenging realm of political leadership. In addition, Fatima Bhutto, the niece of Benazir and the daughter of Murtaza Bhutto explicitly claimed in her book “Songs of Blood and Sword” that Zulfikar Ali Bhutto wanted to see her father as a political successor, implying that Benazir had usurped power. Similarly, during the second term of Benazir’s government, when Mir Murtaza Bhutto landed in Pakistan for the first time since the execution of his father, Nusrat Bhutto claimed that the real heir of ZA Bhutto was Murtaza Bhutto. This paper challenges these narratives and argues that Benazir Bhutto was, in fact, the chosen political successor of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto. The study demonstrates that Zulfikar Ali Bhutto identified Benazir’s potential for leadership and actively prepared her for a political role. He exhibited greater confidence in her abilities than in any of his other children. Evidence suggests that Zulfikar Ali Bhutto deliberately selected prestigious educational institutions for her and encouraged her involvement in student politics. Furthermore, he ensured Benazir’s exposure to critical political events, providing her with invaluable firsthand experience in electoral politics. This research employs a wide range of primary and secondary sources to substantiate the argument that Benazir Bhutto was meticulously groomed and trained by her father to assume his political legacy.

Keywords: Benazir, Bhutto, Legacy, Harvard, Oxford

Introduction

Benazir Bhutto's (hereafter Benazir) autobiography opens with the statement "I didn't choose this life, it chose me".¹ On several occasions, Benazir expressed that she had no intention of pursuing a political career, as her aspirations lay in joining Pakistan's Foreign Service upon completion of her education.² However, the sudden dismissal of her father's government on 5 July 1977, shortly after her graduation, followed by his arrest under the military regime of General Zia ul Haq, forced Benazir to step into the political arena. She believed that under normal circumstances, her life trajectory would have been markedly different and assumed she would never have entered politics.

Fatima Bhutto, the elder daughter of Mir Murtaza Bhutto and niece of Benazir claimed in her book "Songs of Blood and Sword" which was published in 2010, that the rightful political successor of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto (hereafter ZA Bhutto) was her father Murtaza Bhutto, not Benazir. Fatima argued that Benazir was only temporarily entrusted with the leadership of the Pakistan People's Party (PPP) because her father, Murtaza, had left Pakistan at ZA Bhutto's request. ZA Bhutto feared that the military regime posed a significant threat to his sons' lives. Fatima Bhutto also claimed in a traditional manner that in the Bhutto family the succession shifted to the male member of the family.

In 1993, during Benazir's second term as Prime Minister, Murtaza returned to Pakistan for the first time since his father's execution. His return ignited a fierce succession struggle between the siblings, with Murtaza openly asserting his claim to the leadership of the PPP. In this conflict, their mother, Nusrat Bhutto, sided with Murtaza, declaring him the legitimate heir to ZA Bhutto's legacy and asserting that Benazir had no rightful claim to lead the party.³

Several scholarships on Benazir also try to create the conception that Murtaza would be the political successor of ZA Bhutto if the situation remained normal. For example, Anna Suvorova, a Russian professor who is considered an authority on Benazir remarked:

"Had there not been a military coup in Pakistan and had her father remained at his post, Benazir would have quickly advanced her diplomatic career and might have either become ambassador to her beloved US, like Sherry Rehman, or minister of external affairs like Hina Rabbani Khar. Most likely, Zulfikar Ali Bhutto would have made his elder son his political successor while giving Benazir the freedom to lead a less risky and stressful life"⁴

Similarly, Jahangir Badar, a close friend of Benazir and a former General Secretary of the PPP, observed that Benazir had least interest in electoral politics during her days at Oxford and Harvard.⁵

Contrary to these claims, this paper argues that ZA Bhutto deliberately prepared Benazir for a political career, regardless of her personal inclinations. A close examination of ZA Bhutto's relationship with his children, particularly Benazir and Murtaza, reveals that he was deeply invested in grooming Benazir for leadership. Since her early childhood, Benazir was introduced to influential personalities and exposed to political ideas and events.

Benazir recalled that, at the age of six, her father would narrate stories about historical figures like Napoleon Bonaparte. At just eight years old, ZA Bhutto arranged for Benazir to meet the Chinese revolutionary leader Zhou Enlai. At the age of ten, he woke her in the middle of the night to share the shocking news of American President John F. Kennedy's assassination.⁶ Similar to Jawaharlal Nehru⁷, the first Prime Minister of India, ZA Bhutto wrote letters to his daughter Benazir on a range of national and international issues, even when she was still a schoolgirl and finding it challenging to fully comprehend the complexities of these subjects.⁸ For example, after attending the Non-Aligned Movement Summit, ZA Bhutto wrote Benazir a letter discussing the self-serving motives of superpowers within the United Nations and their impact on Third World countries.⁹ While the contents of the letter were likely difficult for her to fully grasp at the time, it clearly reflected ZA Bhutto's intention to politically nurture and prepare his daughter.

When ZA Bhutto's children were at home, discussions predominantly centred on political events and phenomena. This environment deeply influenced Benazir, fostering her political awareness from an early age. Unlike many children who gravitate toward sports, Benazir displayed a keen interest in politics and international affairs. At just fourteen, she officially became a member of the Pakistan People's Party.¹⁰

Politics at Harvard

Benazir's early education took her across various cities in Pakistan. She began her schooling in Karachi, then moved to Rawalpindi, later attended a boarding school in Murree, and finally returned to Karachi, where she completed her O Levels in 1968. ZA Bhutto was a progressive leader who strongly opposed confining women to the traditional roles within the four walls of their homes. Determined to break societal norms, he decided to

send Benazir to Radcliffe College, a part of Harvard University, for her undergraduate studies.

ZA Bhutto's decision was groundbreaking not only within the Bhutto family but also among the feudal elites of Pakistan. At the time, most feudal families, including those from Jatoi, Hala, Mazari, and Leghari clans, followed rigid practices of purdah and were reluctant to educate their daughters, let alone send them abroad. While it was rare for women from such families to receive even nominal education, ZA Bhutto defied this tradition. Amid criticism from his relatives, he sent a sixteen-year-old Benazir to Harvard, making her the first woman from the Bhutto family to attend a foreign university.

ZA Bhutto was very clear in his intention to prepare his daughter to assume a leadership role. He encouraged Benazir to actively participate in student politics and socio-political movements. Following her father's instructions, she actively participated in the Civil Rights Movements¹¹ and the labour rights protests of farm workers.¹² Benazir was also at the forefront of the budding environmental movement.¹³ as well as the election campaign of the US President and the women's rights movement.¹⁴ During her time at Harvard, a fierce nationwide protest against America's invasion in Vietnam was at momentum. Benazir also opposed the Vietnam War, and she was among those thousands of students who marched from Boston Common and in Washington, D.C. demanding to end this conflict.¹⁵ During the protests, she experienced her first encounter with tear gas as authorities deployed it to disperse the crowd. Benazir also actively engaged in campus politics, running for the position of Eliot Hall secretary.¹⁶

At Harvard, Benazir actively engaged in socio-political initiatives and humanitarian efforts, reflecting her early interest in public service. In 1970, when a devastating cyclone struck East Pakistan, causing widespread destruction and loss of life, she joined "SAVE," an international social welfare organization, to raise funds for the affected communities. Her commitment to this cause earned her recognition from the Asian Society, which invited her to address its assembly in honour of her outstanding contributions to social welfare.

During her time at Harvard, Benazir developed an interest in writing about international political issues. She famously penned a letter to the editor of *Life* magazine in response to an article that criticized the Egyptian government's construction of the Aswan Dam. In her letter, Benazir defended the project, highlighting its benefits to the Egyptian people. To her delight, the magazine published her response, marking a proud moment for her as a contributor to such a prestigious publication.

Benazir's close friends at Harvard and Oxford have the opinion that she was much inclined towards politics and that she had the approval of her father to join the socio-political activities. Peter W. Galbraith, a close friend of Benazir, revealed that Benazir had warmly participated in political affair during her stay at Harvard. He remarked "Her father regarded Benazir as his natural successor all along. She was a very sophisticated and intelligent undergraduate, and she has always shown great political skill."¹⁷

Annemarie Schimmel, a distinguished Professor of Indo-Muslim Culture remarked:

"She [Benazir] really tried to make the Harvard community aware of Pakistan--she was able to put it on the map.... I told her father that she was a great messenger for the country--that she was doing more for Pakistan in that way than anyone could."¹⁸

ZA Bhutto also wished that Benazir achieved political education from Harvard and chose political Science as her major subject. In her second year, when Benazir decided to take Psychology as a major subject, ZA Bhutto did not agree. He persuaded her towards Politics or International Relations as a major. Meanwhile, he wrote a secret letter to Mary Bunting, the president of Radcliff College, asking her to motivate Benazir to take Comparative Government as a major.¹⁹ Finally, Benazir had to follow the path carved by her father. She took Philosophy, Political Science, and Economics (PPE) as major subjects. Finally, Benazir earned the bachelor's degree in 1973.

Oxford's Years of Politics

Benazir initially had no intention of leaving the United States and aspired to continue her education there. She planned to pursue further studies at the Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy at Tufts University, located near Harvard.²⁰ However, ZA Bhutto had different plans for her. Concerned that an extended stay in the United States might lead her to establish deeper roots there, he decided to send her to the United Kingdom.²¹ ZA Bhutto urged Benazir to apply for a second undergraduate at Oxford University.²² In a letter, he emphasized that four years in one place was sufficient and that it was time for her to move forward.²³ Following her father's advice, Benazir reluctantly bid farewell to the United States, somewhat unhappily to begin her second undergraduate degree at Lady Margaret Hall, Oxford University.²⁴

Lady Margaret Hall, where Benazir spent three years studying, was established in 1878. It has the distinction of being the first women's college at Oxford University. The college was founded by Bishop Edward Talbot, a renowned Anglican bishop and named after the mother of 15th-century King Henry VII. The first principal of this college of Elizabeth Wordsworth, a prolific author and the great grandniece of the famous British poet William Wordsworth.²⁵

Benazir actively participated in the student politics during her second graduation. In her first year, she became a member of Oxford Union, a prestigious platform for student political discourse. She also contested elections for various positions including election to the treasurer's committee of Oxford Union which she won.²⁶ In 1974, Benazir was elected as the member of the Oxford Union Standing Committee.²⁷ During her final year of undergraduate study, Benazir contested the election of Oxford Union President but did not succeed. In the year 1976, she did her bachelor's in politics, Philosophy and Economics (PPE).

Although Benazir initially planned to come back to Pakistan, ZA Bhutto persuaded her to remain in England for another year. Benazir was too young to participate in the electoral politics of Pakistan. The minimum age for a member of the national assembly at that time was 25 years while she was 23 at that time. It was a better option that she would pursue to his study. ZA Bhutto convinced Benazir to seek admission to a postgraduate diploma in foreign affairs.²⁸ For a politician in-depth knowledge of foreign policy is crucial. During an interview, Benazir revealed that ZA Bhutto wanted his children to be better educated so that no one could accuse him of favouritism if he assigned them any public office.²⁹ Benazir studied International Law, Economics and Diplomacy for one year at St Catherine's College which helped her during her practical career.³⁰

Again, Benazir tried to become the president of the Oxford Union in 1976 with the approval of her father.³¹ On the eve of the election, ZA Bhutto wrote to her "You have to do your best, but the result must be accepted in good grace."³² This time she won the election by securing 329 votes against her opponent who bagged 265 votes. Her father was very happy over her success. He wrote "Overjoyed at your election as President of the Oxford Union. You have done splendidly. Our heartwarming congratulations on your great success, Papa"³³

The Oxford Debating Society was established in 1823 on the pattern of the House of Commons and served as a training ground for future political leaders.³⁴ The victory in the election of the Oxford Debating Society was not a small achievement. Several prominent figures have served as

presidents of the Oxford Union, including George Nathaniel Curzon, Viceroy of India; William Gladstone, Herbert Asquith, Edward Heath, and Boris Johnson—all of whom later became Prime Ministers of the United Kingdom.³⁵ Many other influential ministers and members of parliament have also held this prestigious position. Students from former British colonies were occasionally elected as presidents, and in 1965, Tariq Ali³⁶ became the first Pakistani student to achieve this honour.³⁷ In December 1976, Benazir earned the distinction of being the first Asian woman and the third woman globally to be elected president of the Oxford Union, marking a significant milestone in the Union's history.³⁸

The position of President of the Oxford Union carries international recognition. The president can correspond with heads of state and often secure opportunities for high-profile meetings. The heads of the state and renowned personalities considered it an honour to address the Oxford Debating Society or to have a meeting with its president.³⁹ One of Benazir's first acts as the newly elected president of the Oxford Union was to extend an invitation to Harold Macmillan, the former Prime Minister of the United Kingdom and Chancellor of the University of Oxford. Margaret Thatcher also invited Benazir on the cup of tea. Being a president, Benazir was invited to speak at a debate at Marlborough School in Wiltshire.⁴⁰

Like Benazir, Murtaza also went to Harvard and then Oxford. On the occasion of Benazir's election of the Oxford Debating Union, he was at Christ Church.⁴¹ There is no evidence that he was interested in politics or played any leading role in student politics.

Benazir earned her position through her exceptional ability and talent, coupled with the guidance of her father. Until March 1977, she served as President of the Oxford Union for three months, after which she was succeeded by her lifelong close friend, Victoria Schofield.⁴² Victoria's victory in the election was largely attributed to the support Benazir provided during the campaign.

Political Grooming by Z.A Bhutto

The vision of ZA Bhutto coupled with Benazir's education at prestigious universities of the world, played a pivotal role in her political grooming. Despite his hectic and busy life, ZA Bhutto devoted significant attention to Benazir's political training, clearly demonstrating his intention for Benazir to be his political successor.⁴³ Although ZA Bhutto had two other sons and a daughter, including his elder son Murtaza Bhutto, who was just a year younger than Benazir, it was Benazir who consistently accompanied her father to key events. ZA Bhutto focused more on Benazir's political

grooming than on his other children, preparing her for a prominent role in public life.

Our parents appointed Benazir as in charge of the house whenever were away, recalled Sanam Bhutto, the younger sister of Benazir.⁴⁴ ZA Bhutto had much more confidence in Benazir than any of his other children. When Benazir's parents went on an international trip, they appointed fourteen years Benazir as the in charge of the house.⁴⁵

Benazir accompanied her father to key national and international events, a testament to ZA Bhutto's dedication to her political training.⁴⁶ On 3 December 1971, a war between India and Pakistan broke out. The Indian army had the upper hand in East Pakistan because of the support of the Bengalis and of its outnumbered army. The Pakistan army was not in a position to sustain itself for a long time. Amid this situation, ZA Bhutto was dispatched to New York to present the case of Pakistan in the United Nations and seek support of the international world for a cease fire. Benazir received a message from ZA Bhutto to come to Pierre Hotel where he was staying. Many dignitaries visited the hotel to talk with ZA Bhutto over the situation of East Pakistan. Benazir gained first-hand experience in dealing with dignitaries.⁴⁷ She was working as a personal secretary of her father, and she attended all telephone calls coming from all over the world. ZA Bhutto tried to teach her how to play with power politics. Benazir wrote, "Interrupt the meetings, my father tells me. If the Soviets are here, tell me the Chinese are calling. If the Americans are here, tell me that the Russians are on the line or the Indians. And don't tell anyone who really is here. One of the fundamental lessons of diplomacy is to create doubt: never lay all your cards on the table"⁴⁸ Benazir, along with ZA Bhutto's official team, attended the United Nations Security Council session held on 15 December 1971 on the East Pakistan crisis.⁴⁹ For Benazir, it was her first opportunity to closely observe the dynamics of power politics and gain insight into the workings of international relations.

After the secession of East Pakistan, General Yahya Khan was compelled to resign on 20 December 1971.⁵⁰ ZA Bhutto took charge of the country amidst mounting challenges. One of the most pressing tasks before him was the release of the 90,000 Prisoners of War (POWs) held by India and to retrieve territory lost to Indian forces. Benazir accompanied her father when he toured India for negotiation with Indian Prime Minister Indra Gandhi and her team in July 1972.⁵¹ Benazir was part of her father's official delegation and attended every meeting concerning the release of war prisoners and the vacating of territory.⁵² Her presence in India attracted significant attention from the Indian media, which closely covered her every activity during the

visit. Obviously, it enhanced her confidence and skills in the art of diplomacy was beneficial for her in years to come when she stepped into the corridor of power at the end of 1988. During her visit, Benazir met with several prominent Indian leaders, including Indira Gandhi, the then Prime Minister of India, and her delegation. The Pakistani delegation worked tirelessly for several days, engaging in numerous discussions with the Indian delegation to reach a meaningful resolution. Both sides prepared various drafts, and extensive debates took place. This experience greatly enhanced Benazir's ability to handle issues of national interest with skill and diplomacy. While at Harvard, Benazir also met with Chairman Mao of China along with her father.⁵³ Six months later, Benazir was accompanying her father in his official tour to Rome, Geneva, Paris and London. Here Benazir closely observed the art of diplomacy and how the countries developed relations with each other.

On 14 August 1973, ZA Bhutto called Benazir to attend a historic ceremony in which the Constitutional Assembly adopted the unanimously passed constitution of 1973.⁵⁴ Next month, she accompanied her father on a state visit to the United States, where she met several key figures from President Nixon's administration. During the visit, she attended a dinner at the White House with her father, where she engaged in conversation with Richard Nixon, the US president and his famous long time Secretary of State Henry Kissinger. At the dining table, Kissinger, impressed by her intelligence and confidence, remarked to ZA Bhutto that his daughter was even more intimidating than he was.⁵⁵

ZA Bhutto specifically invited Benazir, who was then studying at Oxford, to attend the historic Second Summit of the Islamic Conference, scheduled for 22 February 1974. The Conference was held at Lahore and was hosted by ZA Bhutto. The conference was a historic event that spanned three days and was attended by numerous prominent foreign delegates and heads of Muslim states, including King Shah Faisal of Saudi Arabia, Sheikh Zayed of the United Arab Emirates, Muammar Qaddafi of Libya, Yasser Arafat of Palestine and the leader of Palestine Liberation Organisation, Anwar Sadat of Egypt, and Sheikh Mujibur Rahman of new established Bangladesh.⁵⁶ During the event, Benazir had the opportunity to meet with many of these leaders. Interestingly, when she later became Prime Minister, some of them, such as Muammar Qaddafi, Sheikh Zayed and Yasser Arafat, were still in power in their respective states. The interaction with the representatives of the Muslim world helped Benazir to understand the problems of the Muslim community.

Benazir returned to Pakistan on 25 June 1977, after completing her post-graduate diploma.⁵⁷ Her father, Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, wanted her to become involved in active politics. However, due to the constitutional requirement that candidates for the National Assembly must be at least twenty-five years old, she could not contest the elections, as she was only twenty-four. Instead, she was appointed to the Prime Minister's office, where she was tasked with preparing summaries of lengthy drafts for her father. Benazir had access to all files forwarded to the Prime Minister's office, and she diligently read and summarized their contents. This was no easy task, and ZA Bhutto often criticized her work, saying, "This is rubbish. It's like something from a high school graduate, not from a college student who has graduated from Harvard or Oxford,"⁵⁸ as she later recalled. Despite the criticism, Benazir continued this practical training for several days. However, just ten days after her return from Britain, the military seized control of the country and dismissed her father's government.⁵⁹ This marked the beginning of a long period of suffering and turmoil for Benazir, who was forced to enter the challenging and tumultuous world of politics at an early age.

Politics during ZA Bhutto's Captivity

ZA Bhutto announced to hold elections in March 1977. Pakistan National Alliance (PNA), an amalgamation of nine political parties of different backgrounds got together and formed electoral alliance against the PPP. In the general elections, ZA Bhutto's PPP achieved overwhelming victory and secured 155 seats out of 192 total contested seats.⁶⁰ However, the PNA refused to accept the outcomes of the elections and accused ZA Bhutto of massive rigging in the elections.⁶¹ The PNA started a nationwide mass movement demanding ZA Bhutto's resignation and re-election. Finally, the military intervened and imposed martial law on 5 July 1977. The Military regime of Zia ul Haq initially kept ZA Bhutto in protective custody but later booked him in a murder case as an accomplice. It was obvious that the military regime wanted to get rid of ZA Bhutto by eliminating him.

Since the time when the ZA Bhutto's government was toppled and until his execution on 4 April 1979, none of his children was as active in the political spectrum as Benazir was. Benazir's brothers Murtaza Bhutto and Shahnawaz Bhutto remained outside the country and never came to Pakistan during the lifetime of their father.⁶² Sanam Bhutto, the youngest daughter of ZA Bhutto either remained outside the country or did not make any effort for the release of her father. One could arguably claim that ZA Bhutto's children left the country because of the fear that the military

regime would also arrest them or secretly kill them. But Benazir had been facing the same threats which one could speculate about the other children of ZA Bhutto. During this period of almost two years, only Benazir was in the playing field to face the wrath of the military regime. She mobilized the masses against the military regime, travelling across the country to garner support for the release of her father. She made efforts to organise the party and protect it from any spilt. ZA Bhutto was much impressed by the politics and courage of Benazir.⁶³ She was the *de facto* Chairperson of the PPP during the lifetime of ZA Bhutto. After the execution of ZA Bhutto, the PPP accepted her as a co-chairperson partly because of the implicit assent of her father and partly due to her struggle to save the life of her father. She deserved for this position as none of the PPP leaders gave stiff resistance to Zia ul Haq's regime as Benazir did. Most of the PPP stalwarts left the party or remained silent during testing time. Benazir, however, remained steadfast against the military regime before and after the execution of ZA Bhutto. There is a little evidence of significant political roles played by ZA Bhutto's other children.

Conclusion

The political grooming of Benazir began during her childhood, inspired and guided by her father who was a prominent politician. Through deliberate decisions and actions, ZA Bhutto prepared Benazir to inherit his political legacy. Unlike his other children, ZA Bhutto placed greater confidence in Benazir's abilities, entrusting her with significant responsibilities and exposing her to key political events. Her early education at prestigious institutions such as Harvard and Oxford was carefully chosen by her father to ensure she gained a strong foundation in politics and international affairs. The subjects she studied—Philosophy, Politics, and Economics (PPE)—were selected under ZA Bhutto's influence, further demonstrating his intention to groom her for leadership.

Benazir's presence at pivotal moments in ZA Bhutto's career, including negotiations with Indira Gandhi, the 1974 Islamic Summit Conference, and discussions at the United Nations, provided her with firsthand experience in diplomacy and governance. Even during his imprisonment and eventual execution, ZA Bhutto relied on Benazir to mobilize the PPP, reinforcing her position as his political successor.

Benazir accompanied her father to every important political event but one could hardly find any other children of ZA Bhutto at this occasion. This also demonstrates that ZA Bhutto wanted to choose Benazir her successor. When ZA Bhutto's government was dismissed and he was put behind bars,

only Benazir existed in the playing field. Through her brilliance and commitment, she proved to be the true successor of ZA Bhutto. When ZA was hanged it was Benazir who came to lead the party. Benazir proved that the decision of her father was right. She gave stiff resistance and refused to bow before the military regime. Finally, all these sufferings bore fruit, and the PPP came into power after the death of Zia ul Haq in 1988 while Benazir was elected prime minister just at the age of 35.

Notes and References

¹ Benazir Bhutto, *Daughter of the East: An Autobiography* (London: Simon & Schuster, 2008), xi.

² Benazir Bhutto, *Daughter of the East*, 71.

³ Ayesha Jalal, *The Struggle for Pakistan: A Muslim Homeland and Global Politics* (London: The Belknap Press, 2014), 203.

⁴ Anna Suvorova, *Benazir Bhutto: A Multidimensional Portrait* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2015), 125.

⁵ Jahangir Baddar, "Political Leadership: A Case Study of Benazir Bhutto" (PhD diss. University of the Punjab, Lahore, 2013), 6.

⁶ Benazir Bhutto, *Daughter of the East*, 33.

⁷ Jawaharlal Nehru authored a series of letters on world history addressed to his teenage daughter, Indira Gandhi, during his imprisonment. These letters were later compiled and published as a book titled *Glimpses of World History*. Comprising 196 letters, the book is regarded as a significant contribution to the literature on world history, distinguished by its comprehensive and engaging narrative. It has since seen multiple editions, reflecting its enduring relevance and popularity.

⁸ While imprisoned, Zulfikar Ali Bhutto continued to write letters to his daughter Benazir, many of which were later compiled and published in book form. In contrast, he wrote only a few letters to his other children, reflecting his deep affection for Benazir and his deliberate efforts to groom her for a political career. This selective correspondence underscores Bhutto's intention to prepare Benazir for a leadership role, shaping her understanding of political and social dynamics.

⁹ Benazir Bhutto, *Daughter of the East*, 33.

¹⁰ Sheikh Muhammad Ali, *Benazir Bhutto: A Political Biography* (Karachi: Orient Book Publishing House, 2000), 34.

¹¹ Benazir Bhutto, *Daughter of the East*, 43. The civil rights movement, active in the United States from 1954 to 1968, was a significant social and political campaign aimed at dismantling institutionalized racial segregation, systemic discrimination, and the disenfranchisement of African Americans.

¹² These protests sought to improve the working conditions, wages, and rights of agricultural laborers, many of whom were migrant workers subjected to exploitative treatment, substandard remuneration, and hazardous working environments.

¹³ The primary goal of this movement was to exert pressure on the government to address critical environmental issues, including air and water

pollution, the management of toxic waste, and the conservation of natural resources.

¹⁴ Benazir Bhutto, *Daughter of the East*, 43

¹⁵ Aditi Balakrishna, "Classmates Remember Strong-Willed and Patriotic Bhutto Politics." *The Harvard Crimson*, December 28, 2007,

<https://www.thecrimson.com/article/1989/6/8/behind-pinkie-bhuttos-passion-for-politics>.; Owen Bennett Jones, *The Bhutto Dynasty: The Struggle for Power in Pakistan* (London: Yale University Press, 2020), 123.

¹⁶ Owen Bennett Jones, *The Bhutto Dynasty*, 44.

¹⁷ Madhavi Sunder, "Behind Pinkie: Bhutto's Passion for Politics." *The Harvard Crimson*, June 8, 1989.

<https://www.thecrimson.com/article/1989/6/8/behind-pinkie-bhuttos-passion-for-politics>.

¹⁸ Ibid.

¹⁹ Claudia Dreifus, and Clyde Haberman, *Interview* (New York: Seven Stories Press, 1997), 118.

²⁰ Sheikh Muhammad Ali, *Benazir Bhutto*, 40.

²¹ Ibid.

²² Benazir Bhutto, *Daughter of the East*, 59.

²³ Sheikh Muhammad Ali, *Benazir Bhutto*, 66.

²⁴ Benazir Bhutto, *Daughter of the East*, 60.

²⁵ Anna Suvorova, *Benazir Bhutto*, 119.

²⁶ Victoria Schofield, *The Fragrance of Tears: My Friendship with Benazir Bhutto* (London: Apollo Book, 2020), 21

²⁷ Ibid, 22.

²⁸ Anna Suvorova, *Benazir Bhutto*, 118.

²⁹ Ibid.

³⁰ Benazir Bhutto, *Daughter of the East*, 63.

³¹ Ibid, 63.

³² Ibid.

³³ Victoria Schofield, *The Fragrance of Tears*, 26.

³⁴ Katherine M. Doherty and Craig A. Doherty, *Benazir Bhutto* (New York: Watts, 1990), 30.

³⁵ Anna Suvorova, *Benazir Bhutto*, 120.

³⁶ Tariq Ali is a famous left leaning historian and play writer. He is the grandson of Sir Sikandar Hayat, the former Premier of the United Punjab. Tariq is settled in the USA, and he writes for different newspapers and journals.

³⁷ Anna Suvorova, *Benazir Bhutto*, 120.

³⁸ Ibid, 120. Geraldine Jones was the first woman to be elected as the president in 1968. She was followed by Susan Kremer was elected as the Oxford union

president in 1971. Susan was later elected as a member of the British parliament.

³⁹ Victoria Schofield, *The Fragrance of Tears*, 26

⁴⁰ Marlborough is one of the oldest boarding institutions in the United Kingdom. According to School Index 2024, it is among the 150 top private schools in the world.

⁴¹ Victoria Schofield, *The Fragrance of Tears*, 26

⁴² *Ibid.*

⁴³ Saeed Shafqat, "Pakistan under Benazir Bhutto," *Asian Survey* 36, no. 7 (July 1996): 655.

⁴⁴ Sanam Bhutto, interview by Muniza Jahangir, *Geo TV*, 27 December 2008.

⁴⁵ *Ibid.*

⁴⁶ Dreifus, Claudia, and Clyde Haberman, *Interview*, 118.

⁴⁷ Benazir Bhutto, *Daughter of the East*, 50.

⁴⁸ *Ibid.*, 57.

⁴⁹ Roedad Khan, *Pakistan: A Dream Gone Sour* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 1997), 49.

⁵⁰ Shahid Javed Burki, *Pakistan Under Bhutto* (London: The Macmillan Press, 1980), 69.

⁵¹ Benazir Bhutto, *Reconciliation: Islam Democracy and the West* (London: Simon and Schuster Ltd., 2008), 175.

⁵² Salmaan Taseer, *Bhutto: A Political Biography* (London: Ithaca Press, 1980), 137.

⁵³ Katherine M. Doherty and Craig A. Doherty, *Benazir Bhutto*, 29.

⁵⁴ Corinne J. Naden, *Benazir Bhutto: Leading Woman* (New York: Marshall Cavendish Benchmark, 2011), 33.

⁵⁵ Benazir Bhutto, *Daughter of the East*, 66.

⁵⁶ Christophe Jaffrelot, *Pakistan at the Crossroads: Domestic Dynamics and External Pressures* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2016), 306.

⁵⁷ Benazir Bhutto, *Daughter of the East*, 79.

⁵⁸ Owen Bennett, *The Bhutto Dynasty*, 126.

⁵⁹ General Khalid Mahmud Arif, *Working with Zia: Pakistan's Power Politics 1977-1988* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 1995), 1.

⁶⁰ Anwar H. Syed, *The Discourse and Politics of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto* (London: The Macmillan Press, 1992), 226.

⁶¹ M.R. Kazmi, *A Concise History of Pakistan* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2009), 230.

⁶² Tariq Ali, *The Duel: Pakistan on the Flight Path of American Power* (London: Simon and Schuster, 2008), 167.

⁶³ Owen Bennett, *Bhutto Dynasty*, 127.